

©Copyright 2012

Sachi Schmidt-Hori

Hyperfemininities, Hypermasculinities, and Hypersexualities
in Classical Japanese Literature

Sachi Schmidt-Hori

A Dissertation

submitted in partial fulfillment of the
requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

University of Washington

2012

Reading Committee:

Paul S. Atkins, Chair

Davinder L. Bhowmik

Tani E. Barlow

Kyoko Tokuno

Program Authorized to Offer Degree:

Department of Asian Languages and Literature

University of Washington

Abstract

Hyperfemininities, Hypermasculinities, and Hypersexualities
in Classical Japanese Literature

Sachi Schmidt-Hori

Chair of the Supervisory Committee:

Associate Professor Paul S. Atkins

Asian Languages and Literature

This study is an attempt to elucidate the complex interrelationship between gender, sexuality, desire, and power by examining how premodern Japanese texts represent the gender-based ideals of women and men at the peak and margins of the social hierarchy. To do so, it will survey a wide range of premodern texts and contrast the literary depictions of two female groups (imperial priestesses and courtesans), two male groups (elite warriors and outlaws), and two groups of Buddhist priests (elite and “corrupt” monks). In my view, each of the pairs signifies hyperfemininities, hypermasculinities, and hypersexualities of elite and outcast classes, respectively. The ultimate goal of

this study is to contribute to the current body of research in classical Japanese literature by offering new readings of some of the well-known texts featuring the above-mentioned six groups. My interpretations of the previously studied texts will be based on an argument that, in a cultural/literary context wherein defiance merges with sexual attractiveness and/or sexual freedom, one's outcast status transforms into a source of significant power. In this type of context, the conventional idea of power (i.e. wealth, high social status, lineage) may be ignored or even perceived negatively. Consequently, certain literary constructs—such as a sexual entertainer juxtaposed with a deity, an attractive bandit forgiven for his crime, or a promiscuous monk revered as a sage—should not be reduced to idiosyncrasies or paradoxes. Rather, these figures should be better understood as a manifestation of prestige possessed by the marginal persons with particular charm and appeal.

TABLE OF CONTENTS

	Page
Introduction	1
Chapter 1: Hyperfemininities of Royal Priestesses and Courtesans	20
I. Introduction	20
II. Historical Context of the <i>Saiō</i> System	22
III. <i>Saiō</i> Portrayed in Heian Vernacular Tales	30
IV. <i>Saiō</i> Portrayed in Kamakura Vernacular Tales	41
V. Sex Trade and Courtesans in Premodern Japan: An Overview	45
VI. Portrayals of <i>Yūjo</i> in Chinese-Style Prose and Vernacular Tales	48
VII. Portrayals of <i>Yūjo</i> in Noh Drama.....	54
VIII. Conclusion	85
Chapter 2: Hypermasculinities of Warriors and Outlaws	87
I. Introduction	87
II. Historical Context of the Emergence of the Military Class	88
III. Hypermasculinity within Heian Vernacular Tales	94
IV. Fragmentary Images of Warriors: East vs. West	104
V. Yoshitsune: The Amalgamation of East and West	114
VI. Hypermasculinity of Outlaws: An Overview	121
VII. Criminals and Criminal Acts Portrayed in Buddhist Didactic Stories.....	125
VIII. Criminals and Criminal Acts Portrayed in Secular Anecdotal Tales	134
IX. Conclusion	148
Chapter 3: Hypersexualities of Buddhist Priests	150
I. Introduction	150
II. The Development of Buddhist Vinaya Celibacy Precept In Premodern Japanese Context	153
III. Historical and Cultural Backgrounds of the <i>Chigo</i> System	164
IV. Portrayals of Buddhist Monks in Love with <i>Chigo</i>	177
V. Transcending the Celibacy Precepts: Poetics and Aesthetics Of Ikkyū Sōjun	192
VI. Conclusion	206
Conclusion.....	211
Bibliography	217

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to express my deepest gratitude to my dissertation committee members. I would especially like to thank Professor Paul S. Atkins, the committee chair and my academic adviser, for the countless hours he spent on teaching, guiding, and encouraging me.

This dissertation would not have been materialized without the support of my husband and best friend, Roy Schmidt.

DEDICATION

To Roy.

INTRODUCTION

The current study is an attempt to elucidate the complex interrelationship between gender, sexuality, desire, and power through delving into how premodern Japanese texts represent the gender-based ideals of women and men at the topmost as well as outside of social hierarchy. To do so, in the following chapters, I will survey a wide range of premodern texts and contrast the literary depictions of two female groups (imperial priestesses and courtesans), two male groups (elite warriors and outlaws), and two groups of Buddhist priests (elite and “corrupt” monks). In my view, each of the pairs signifies hyperfemininities, hypermasculinities, and hypersexualities of elite and outcast classes, respectively. By hyperfemininity/hypermasculinity, I mean exaggerated and (normally) idealized gender stereotypes that are similar to the concept of womanliness/manliness, while I label the sexual acts of presumably celibate Buddhist priests as hypersexuality.¹

I propose that analyzing the portrayals of these particular figures will provide us with a telling picture of how gender and sexuality intertwine with power and desire in the literary productions of vernacular tales, Chinese-style poetry, *noh* plays, anecdotal tales, martial epics, religious tales, *waka* poetry, and

¹ While the terms “femininity” and “masculinity” at times signify exaggerated gender characteristics of women and men, respectively, in this dissertation, they simply refer to “female-ness” and “male-ness,” in an attempt to make possible expressions such as “feminine masculinity” and “masculine femininity.”

so on. By offering not only the contrast between elites and outcasts within the same category but also comparisons between female and male gender ideals as well as between laymen and Buddhist priests, this study will be particularly comprehensive.

The ultimate goal of this study is to contribute to the current body of research in classical Japanese literature by offering new readings of some of the well-known texts featuring the above-mentioned six groups. Generally speaking, scholarly works dealing with people of marginal status tend to express the authors' personal opposition towards a social transgression associated with the particular outcast group. In the case of scholarly works that handle the sexual entertainments of premodern Japan, for example, most authors convey disapproval of prostitution (usually in the modern context) for two major reasons—compassion for the victims of human trafficking; and detestation for the women who would engage in the commercial sex trade. For instance, Saeki Junko states in *Yūjo no bunkashi*:

I assume that the images of courtesans appearing in literature would be very distant from the cruel lives of actual courtesans. Even their tragedies are beautified and consumed....I hope I will not be mistaken—I did not write this book because I wanted to argue that we should bring back the way sacred sexuality [of courtesans] was once embodied to the present.²

On the other hand, my interpretations of the previously studied texts will be based on an argument that, in a cultural/literary context wherein defiance merges with sexual attractiveness and/or sexual freedom, one's outcast status

² Saeki Junko, *Yūjo no bunkashi: Hare no onna tachi* (Tokyo: Chūkō shinsho, 1987), pp. 243-244.

transforms into a source of significant power. In this type of context, the conventional idea of power (i.e. wealth, high social status, lineage) may be perceived as irrelevant or even negatively. Consequently, literary constructs such as a sexual entertainer juxtaposed with a deity, an attractive bandit forgiven for his crime, and a promiscuous monk revered as a sage, should not be reduced to idiosyncrasies or paradoxes. Rather, these figures should be better understood as a manifestation of prestige possessed by the marginal people with particular charm and appeal and appreciated by the creators of the texts and generations of readers .

The texts I will examine in depth for this dissertation come from the period between the tenth and fifteenth century. This period covers diverse historical terrains from the efflorescence of the Heian court culture, emergence of the first military government (shogunate), the triumvirate of the court, shogunate, and powerful Buddhist institutions, and the rise of provincial feudal lords. While it is beyond the scope of this study to summarize such long and heterogeneous times, below I will lay out the basic historical context by presenting a brief overview of gender, sexuality, and body politics of Nara, Heian, medieval, and early modern Japan.

An Overview: Nara Period (710-784)

According to *Kojiki* (712), one of the collections of Japanese mythology, the origin of Japan and its people goes back to a pair of sibling deities, Izanagi, the male god, and his sister/wife Izanami, when they decided to create the country

by making love to each other. The first two births failed, however, because the female spoke first after the lovemaking, resulting in the “leech child” and “foam island.” Only after they tried again with Izanagi being the one to speak first, they succeeded in producing the numerous islands of Japan.³ Subsequently, Izanami gave birth to their offspring, and each of these gods was in charge of a realm of nature. When she delivered the god of fire, however, her genitals became severely burnt, leaving the mother critically ill. At this time, her vomit, urine, and feces all turned into deities. Eventually, Izanami died from the wound and Izanagi took over the mission of giving birth to his children out of various parts of his body, including his genitals.⁴ This portion of Japan’s mythology is overshadowed by a rather misogynistic idea that a woman must submit herself to a man. Even when Izanami plays the crucial role of creating the country and deities, it becomes apparent that Izanagi can easily do the same, essentially nullifying the most valuable female faculty in the ancient world. Also, the direct and frequent references to the genitals and excretion of gods in the *Kojiki* are remarkable, considering such references are normally limited to the context of vulgarity, grotesque, or humor in classical Japanese literary tradition.

Another noteworthy aspect of the *Kojiki* is the gender-crossing of two of the best-known mythological figures, the sun goddess Amaterasu and Yamato the Brave. When her boisterous sea god brother, Susano-o, was going to pay a

³ See SNKBZ 1, pp. 31-40.

⁴ Ibid., pp. 43-44.

visit to Amaterasu in heaven, she prepared to defend her realm by changing her hairstyle to that of a man's (*mizura*) and arming herself with weapons:

"It is certainly not with any good intentions that my brother is coming up. He must wish to usurp my lands." So, undoing her hair, she wrapped it in hair bunches. She wrapped long strings of myriad *magatama* beads in the hair bunches on the left and right of her head, on the vine securing her hair, as well as on her left and right arms. On her back she bore a thousand-arrow quiver; at her side she strapped a five-hundred-arrow quiver and also put on a magnificent bamboo arm-cover. Shaking the upper tip of her bow, stamping her legs up to her very thighs into the hard earth, and kicking the earth about as if it were light snow, she let out a tremendous war cry and stamped her feet with fury.⁵

In the original, the part that Philippi translated as "tremendous war cry" reads as "*itsu no o to takebu*," which literally means "to scream as a fierce man."⁶ Therefore, by transforming her appearance into that of a male, the gender of the sun goddess seems to have also transformed into what one may call "masculine femininity." While fierceness of women is a recurrent theme in classical Japanese literature, it is almost always fueled by jealousy and it is embodied by a supernatural phenomenon such as the woman's spirit possession or turning into a monster. Therefore, the masculine femininity of Amaterasu is rather exceptional.

In contrast, the stunning beauty of Yamato the Brave, who tricks his enemies into believing that he is a gorgeous maiden and slashes them, however,

⁵ Donald Philippi, trans., "Kojiki," in Haruo Shirane, ed., *Traditional Japanese Literature: An Anthology, Beginning to 1600* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2007), p. 27.

⁶ SNKBZ 1, p. 57.

can be considered as an early example of the “feminine masculinity” of noblemen commonly observed in Heian court literature.⁷

In the tradition of ancient *waka* (Japanese-style poem/song), on the other hand, we can observe the ideal body image of men and women: an underdeveloped androgynous physique, or what Takeda Sachiko calls “borderless aesthetics.”⁸ For instance, Japan’s oldest extant *waka* anthology, *Man’yōshū*, includes a poignant *chōka* (long song) attributed to an anonymous old bamboo cutter (16:3791). In this *chōka*, the old man laments the fact that he is no longer the handsome young man with a “curvy waist like a bee (*sugaru no gotoki koshiboso*).”⁹ While a slender waist that contours a curve between the chest and hip represents an ideal body type for women, this was also considered to be attractive for men.¹⁰ Furthermore, in a different *chōka* of the same anthology (9:1738), Takahashi no Mushimaro describes the legendary beauty known as Tamana of Kamitsufusa, using the above expression “curvy waist like a bee” as well as another common phrase to praise a woman’s body: “flat and wide chest” (*munawake no hiroki*).¹¹ Based on these stock phrases, Takeda points out that during the Nara period, an androgynous, underdeveloped body was

⁷ Ibid., p. 219.

⁸ Takeda Sachiko, “Dansō, josō: Sono Nihon-teki tokuchō to ifukusei,” in Wakita Haruko and S. B. Hanley, eds. *Jendaa no Nihonshi jō: Shūkyō to minzoku,shintai to seiai* (Tokyo: Tokyo Daigaku Shuppankai, 1994, 1996), p. 226.

⁹ See SNKBZ 9, pp. 92-96.

¹⁰ Takeda, “Dansō, josō,” p. 226-227.

¹¹ See SNKBZ 7, p. 413.

considered ideal for both men and women.¹² Considering the above observations, it is quite apparent that the attractiveness of women and men had little to do with women's voluptuous sexuality or men's muscular physiques during the Nara period. This tendency, especially for men, largely continues throughout the Heian period.

Heian Period (794-1185)

Compared to the Nara period, when a husband and a wife often lived in two separate residences (duolocal marriage) and a married woman had sexual freedom outside of the marital relationship, the sexuality of women in the elite class became increasingly restricted by the patriarchal family system during the Heian era.¹³ For instance, in the early part of the Heian period, uxorilocal marriages (husband living in the wife's family) became common. This means that a man must receive permission to marry a woman from her father, essentially giving the father control of the sexuality of the prospective wife of the man.

Furthermore, a man was able to divorce his wife, should she become involved in an extramarital affair, although the men in the ruling class commonly had multiple formal wives and informal lovers. Within *The Tale of Genji* (ca. 1000), the hero, Hikaru Genji, had three official wives—those with whom he

¹² Ibid., p. 228.

¹³ Fukutō Sanae, *Heianchō onna no ikikata: Kagayaita josei tachi* (Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 2004), pp. 66-68.

shared the “third-night rice cakes”—Aoi, Murasaki, and the Third Princess.¹⁴ Although Aoi was Genji’s first official wife, because she died young, Murasaki was his sole official wife for many years. In the meantime, she tolerated Genji’s incessant love affairs with various women, one of which even resulted in the birth of Genji’s daughter. Nevertheless, Genji’s unexpected marriage to the Third Princess was a fatal blow to Murasaki—quite literally, as she became critically ill from a broken heart and soon died. This was because the princess’s status as the newest official wife greatly threatened her position and in effect shuttered her dignity.

That being said, a nobleman’s amorous nature was far from a taboo during this time period. Rather, being *irogonomi* or “connoisseur of love” was a praise given to men (and sometimes women) and considered an emblem for cultural sophistication. According to Nakamura, acquiring this status was not an easy task, as a bona fide *irogonomi* man must have significant experience with women both in quantity and quality (i.e. women with varying ages, classes, and levels of attractiveness), possess such qualities as playfulness, audacity, elegance, sensibility, as well as superb talents in poetry and music.¹⁵ One of the earliest extant tales featuring *irogonomi* noblemen is *The Tale of Bamboo-Cutter* (ca. ninth century) in which all of the five most renowned *irogonomi* noblemen of the time attempted to win the heart of the beautiful Lady Kaguya.¹⁶ *The Tales of*

¹⁴ Ibid., p. 74.

¹⁵ Nakamura Shin’ichirō, *Irogonomi no kōzō: Ōchō bunka no shinsō* (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1985), pp. 20-54.

¹⁶ See SNKBZ 12, p. 20.

Ise of Ariwara no Narihira, *The Tale of Takamura* of Ono no Takamura, and *The Tale of Heichū* of Taira no Sadafun are all semi-fictional love adventures of historical *irogonomi* poet-noblemen. The epitome of *irogonomi* in Heian literature, however, may be the Rokujō Mansion of Genji, where his wives, concubines, daughters, and ladies-in-waiting shared his enormous, gorgeous estate, as if collectively creating the utopia of all Heian noblemen.

Aside from official marriages among elites, love affairs could be spontaneous and casual. Aristocratic men and women often selected their potential lovers based on reputation and their skills in poetry, never knowing what they exactly look like until the morning after their first rendezvous. People in the lower class, however, were able to begin their courting process after a physical encounter. A good illustration of this is a short story titled “Hodohodo no kesō” (Love according to social standing), included in *The Tales of the Riverside Middle Counselor* (ca. mid-eleventh century). In this story, a pageboy of a courtier spotted a beautiful young girl servant of a noblewoman during the Kamo Festival and immediately approached her:

[He] handed her a branch of plum bearing many fruits, adorned with hollyhocks [aoi], and with the following poem attached to it:

I hope that my love to you

May bear fruits like this branch of plums.

And that I could see the roots

Of the adoring hollyhocks.

(*I hope to see myself sleeping with you the day we meet*)¹⁷

To this bold move, the girl responds with a witty poem, indicating she has no intention to sleep with him anytime soon. Nonetheless, soon after this, they become lovers. A direct reference to sleeping together is something rare even in the poems of *irogonomi* playboys. This short story may well exemplify the class-based differences in aesthetics and courting customs of the Heian period.

Medieval Period (1185-1600)

Based on the periodization convention, the golden age of the elegant court culture, Heian era, ended with the emergence of the first military government, Kamakura shogunate, and the rise of the warrior class. With this, the aesthetics and virtue of *irogonomi* necessarily transformed during the medieval period. Nakamura observes the residue of *irogonomi* in the love poems compiled in the *Shin kokin wakashū* (*New Collection of Ancient and Modern Poems*; 1205) as “artificial recreation of the sensibility of the Heian court culture,” in which the poet composed love poems by putting him/herself in the “illusion of *Genji*-esque world, rather than describing what is in front of the poet.”¹⁸ Nakamura argues that this restrained expression of love and sexuality extends to vernacular tales, such as *Koiji yukashiki taishō* (*The general with an elegant way of loving*; ca. early

¹⁷ See SNKBZ 17, p. 424. This poem relies on two sets of homophonous words: *aoi* (“hollyhocks” and “the day we meet”) and *ne* (“root” and “sleeping”).

¹⁸ Nakamura, *Irogonomi*, pp.178-188.

fourteenth century) and a well-known *zuihitsu* literature, *Essays in Idleness* (ca. 1330).¹⁹

One of the significant aspects of medieval sexuality is the prevalence of male-male love, especially one between an adult and adolescent, within the elite class, namely, among aristocrats, warriors, and Buddhist monks. Fujiwara no Yoritada (1120-1156), a powerful courtier from the late Heian era, and Jien (1155-1225), an elite Tendai monk of the early Kamakura period, are two examples of historical figures who openly discussed their affairs with multiple male lovers in their writings.²⁰ As for the homosexuality of the samurai class, Gary P. Leupp suggests that the all-male environment of the battlefield, the military values that emphasize solidarity with peers, obedience to authority, and masculine physiques may have all contributed to developing a distinct male-male love tradition among the military class.²¹

In contrast, direct references to same-sex eroticism between two women is extremely rare in premodern Japanese literature. Female-female sexuality was so unusual to the extent that, according to Kuroda Hideo, the author of *Tengu no sōshi emaki* (Tales of goblins with illustrations; thirteenth century) threw in an illustration of two nuns—one putting an arm around the other's shoulder—to visually signify the corrupted nature of the followers of the Ji Buddhist School. Kuroda argues that, in order to emphasize the degeneration of

¹⁹ Ibid., pp. 182-189.

²⁰ Ibid., pp.126-128. The pederasty of Buddhist monks will be examined in Chapter 3.

²¹ Gary P. Leupp, *Male Colors: The Construction of Homosexuality in Tokugawa Japan* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995), pp. 47-48.

morals among the Ji School, an illustration of a monk with a male or a female lover would have been too mainstream to function as satire.²²

Compared to the previous times, it seems that expression of heterosexual love and eroticism tend to be more restrained in the realm of medieval high culture such as *waka* and *noh* theater. Nevertheless, commoners' general attitude towards sexuality appeared rather lax in the eyes of Christian missionaries, as the sixteenth-century Portuguese missionary Luis Frois (1532-1597) reported that, in Japan, women's sexuality was largely free and a woman was never sanctioned for not being a virgin.²³

Edo Period (1603-1867)

In 1603, the victor of the Battle of Sekigahara, Tokugawa Ieyasu (1542-1616), founded the Edo Shogunate in modern-day Tokyo. For the next two-and-a-half centuries, Japan enjoyed relative political stability and the blossoming of early modern culture, often characterized with playful, hedonistic view of the world known as *ukiyo* or "floating world." The most representative literary genre of this world-view is *ukiyo zōshi* or "books of floating world," created by the famous poet-turned-author Ihara Saikaku (1642-1693). He wrote *The Life of Sensuous Man* (*Kōshoku ichidai otoko*) in 1682, of which the main character, Yonosuke, is virtually a parody of the Heian *irogonomi* heroes, Ariwara no Narihira and Hikaru

²² Kuroda Hideo, *Sugata to shigusa no chūseishi: Ezu to emaki no fūkei kara* (Tokyo: Heibonsha, 2002), pp. 28-36.

²³ See Hotate Michihisa, *Chūsei no onna no isshō: Kizoku, ryōshu, hyakushō, genin no onna-tachi no unmei to jinsei* (Tokyo: Yōsensha, 2010), p. 154.

Genji, as the term *kōshoku* in the title is the Sinified synonym of *irogonomi*. With the great success of this book, Saikaku published a series of books titled with *kōshoku*: *The Life of a Sensuous Woman* (*Kōshoku ichidai onna*), *Five Women who Loved Love* (*Kōshoku gonin onna*), and *Son of a Sensuous Man* (*Kōshoku nidai otoko*).

One of Saikaku's contemporaries is the renowned playwright, Chikamatsu Monzaemon (1653-1725). His puppet theater play *The Love Suicides at Sonezaki* (1703), an adaptation of an actual double suicide of an Osaka courtesan and a shop clerk, was an immense commercial success that it revived the finances of the theater to which Chikamatsu belonged.²⁴ In 1720, Chikamatsu wrote another puppet theater play on double suicide between a courtesan and a merchant: *The Love Suicides at Amijima*. This production prompted a series of real-life incidents of double suicides, resulting in the 1723 official prohibition of the dramatizing of love suicides. Even outside of theatrical arts, courtesans were frequently featured heroines of literary texts and visual arts, functioning as the female counterpart of *irogonomi* or "professionals of love".

Despite the occasional censorship by the government, the Edo period saw upsurge of literary and theatrical productions of which the main theme pertained to love, sexuality, and eroticism. Furthermore, Motoori Norinaga, the eighteenth-century *kokugaku* (national learning) scholar "rediscovered" the aesthetics of *Genji*, represented by the key phrase *mono no aware* (pathos of things), and

²⁴ Haruo Shirane, ed., *Early Modern Japanese Literature: An Anthology, 1600-1900* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2002), p. 239.

posited it as the center of native Japanese sensibility. According to Norinaga, *mono no aware* is founded upon the archetypical traits of women, rather than so-called masculine qualities, such as resolution, strength, and detachment, all of which were highly valued in the tradition of samurai culture.²⁵ Norinaga writes in his *Shibun Yōryō* (1763):

The true heart (*makoto no kokoro*) of an individual is usually like that of a woman or a child: immature and weak (*oroka*). The true heart is not masculine, firm, or resolute: such attitudes are mere decoration. When one delves to the bottom of the heart, even the most resolute person is no different from a woman or a child. The only difference is that one hides that true heart out of embarrassment and the other does not.²⁶

Despite Norinaga's motivation to elevate the status of native Japanese literature vis-à-vis the Chinese-influenced genres, it is noteworthy that an influential scholar was able to openly praise a fictional tale that largely revolves around the love affairs of a man of imperial lineage as an essence of Japanese culture. This was a freedom not given to scholars of the early twentieth century Japan under the radical militarization of the nation and deification of the emperor.

Methodology of the Study

Through my preliminary research of a limited number of texts, I identified a link between favorable depictions of socially transgressive acts and gender-based

²⁵ Haruo Shirane, *The Bridge of Dreams: A Poetics of the Tale of Genji* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1987), p. 31.

²⁶ Quoted by Shirane. *Ibid.*, p. 31.

ideals and defiance. As stated above, I regard such aestheticized transgressions of courtesans, outlaws, and *hakai-sō* (unruly monks) as representations of hyperfemininity, hypermasculinity, and hypersexuality, respectively. To verify this tendency with a larger corpus of examples, this study will survey primary texts from Heian (794-1185), Kamakura (1185-1333), and Muromachi (1333-1573) periods of various genres.

Based on the findings of my preliminary study, I hypothesized that the positive treatment of the three outcast groups can be explained by the notion of *covert prestige*. This was originally theorized by the founding father of sociolinguistics, William Labov, in his groundbreaking study of the New York English speech communities, documented as *The Social Stratification of English in New York*. He writes:

The preponderance of some stigmatized speech forms among male speakers, despite their clear recognition of the social significance assigned by pressure from above, reinforces the suggestion that masculinity is unconsciously attributed to the unmodified native speech pattern of the city, as it is used by men. Thus the pressure exerted in conformity with the socio-economic hierarchy is counterbalanced by a cultural tradition which we have described as pressure from below. The exact description of the covert values associated with the native speech pattern is one of the unfinished tasks which remain for future studies.²⁷

²⁷ William Labov, *The Social Stratification of English in New York* (Washington, DC: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1966), p. 340.

The notion that Labov observed and noted as “pressure from below” and “covert values” in *Social Stratification* (originally his dissertation) was later refined as the concept of “covert prestige,” in his article.

[T]he socio-economic structure confers prestige on the middle-class pattern associated with the more formal styles. [But] one can't avoid the implication that in New York City we must have an equal and opposing prestige for informal, working-class speech—a covert prestige enforcing this speech pattern. We must assume that people in New York City want to talk as they do, yet this fact is not at all obvious in any overt response that you can draw from interview subjects.²⁸

Since then, a number of studies have confirmed Labov's discovery on the seemingly contradictory linguistic behavior of male vernacular speakers in different speech communities.²⁹ Furthermore, in more recent scholarship, sociolinguists have elucidated that the evaluation of a given linguistic form can vary depending on the identities and backgrounds of the informants, which can also change over time.³⁰ The current study, however, takes the position that symbolic meanings attached to the literary constructs of distinct groups of people are largely static across time (and often class boundaries) within a given culture.

²⁸ William Labov, “Hypercorrection by the Lower Middle Class as a Factor in Linguistic Change,” in William Bright, ed. *Sociolinguistics: Proceedings of the UCLA Sociolinguistics Conference, 1964* (The Hague: Mouton, 1966), p. 183.

²⁹ For instance, Peter Trudgill, “Sex, Covert Prestige and Linguistic Change in the Urban British English of Norwich” *Language in Society*, 1, no. 2 (1972), pp. 179-195.

³⁰ See Alicia Beckford Wassink and Judy Dyer, “Language Ideology and the Transmission of Phonological Change: Changing Indexicality in Two Situations of Language Contact,” *Journal of English Linguistics*, Volume 32, Number 1 (March 2004), pp. 3-30.

Therefore, my adaptation of the Labovian framework of prestige in this dissertation is quite dissimilar to how it is utilized in the field of sociolinguistics today.

At any rate, in modern English, the word “prestige” rarely refers to the original meaning of “deceit” or “illusion” from the Latin word *praestigia*, but rather means “impressive or overawing influence, glamour; influence or reputation derived from achievements, associations, or character, or (esp.) from past success; a person's standing in the estimation of others” (*Oxford English Dictionary*), most often associated with being upper class, wealthy, famous, and powerful. The three interrelated forms of *symbolic capital*—economic, cultural, and social—which were famously conceptualized by the French sociologist Pierre Bourdieu (1930-2002), are analogous to a meticulously categorized *unmarked* or *overt* prestige.³¹

The most remarkable contribution made by the sociolinguists to the fields of humanities in general is their explication for the paradoxical human behavior (i.e. men's desire to sound lower-class) with an alternative set of standards—rather than with subversion of the norm—which Labov aptly named “covert prestige.” Combined with its conventional counterpart, in my dissertation, I will call this analytical framework the *bifacial structure of prestige* and apply it to the representations of hyperfemininities, hypermasculinities, and hypersexualities observed in literary texts.

³¹ Pierre Bourdieu, *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste*, Richard Nice, trans. (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1984).

Organization of The Dissertation

In this dissertation, each body chapter essentially bears the same organization. It opens with an overview of relevant historico-cultural context for the ruling class cohort linked with hyperfemininity (Chapter 1), hypermasculinity (Chapter 2), and hypersexuality (Chapter 3). Next is a survey of literary depictions of each elite group and my analysis thereof, with sexual attractiveness and gender ideal being the focal concepts for Chapters 2 and 3. As for Chapter 4, I will look into the depictions of Buddhist priests who have sexual relationship with adolescent temple acolytes. This particular group has attracted a surge of scholarly attention in recent years. While many scholars approach the priest-acolyte relationship from an ethical viewpoint, my focus here will be to examine how such a practice—breach of the celibacy precept—was perceived by their contemporaries. In the second half of a chapter, an outcast group within the same “category” is discussed in a similar organization. Below is a chart illustrating the arrangement of the three body chapters.

	Overt Prestige	Covert Prestige
Chapter 1	Hyperfemininities	
	Imperial Priestesses	Courtesans
Chapter 2	Hypermasculinities	
	Aristocratic Warriors	Outlaws
Chapter 3	Hypersexualities	
	Elite Priests	<i>Hakai-sō</i> (Ikkyū)

Considering the fact that literacy, paper, and ink were all luxuries of privileged people, the current study will attempt to argue that the mainstream of premodern Japanese society is far from a simple hierarchical society based solely upon socio-economic classes. Rather, to borrow the aforementioned

concept of Pierre Bourdieu, those who lived on the margin of society did occupy certain cultural capital, and it appears to seep through a wide range of texts, again, created by the ruling class.

In the following discussions of the three elite groups and three marginal groups, a number of phenomena in regards to gender, human desire, and prestige may resonate with the sensibility of a reader who has never read Japanese literature, let alone its premodern repertoire. For instance, in the next chapter, we will compare and contrast the hyperfemininities of imperial priestesses (also known as the “Ise/Kamo Virgins” in English scholarship) and courtesans depicted in vernacular tales, Chinese-style prose, and noh plays. Through this comparison, I hope to present an alternative view towards what feminist scholars frequently refer to (and denounce) as the patriarchal construct of “virgin/whore paradigm” and “contradictory femininity” of modern women despite the differences in time and place of the women at stake. Ultimately, it is my hope that this study can offer a new interpretation of gender, sexuality, and power beyond the scope of premodern Japanese literature.

CHAPTER 1: HYPERFEMININITIES OF ROYAL PRIESTESSES AND COURTESANS

I. Introduction

The current chapter will examine the representations of royal priestesses (*saiō* 斎王) and courtesans (*yūjo* 遊女) as depicted in literary texts composed from during the periods of the mid-Heian to the end of the Muromachi era.³² At first glance, Shinto priestesses of royal lineage and sexual entertainers may appear to be as different as two groups of women could ever be. Nevertheless, these women are curiously interrelated, epitomizing the two apexes of hyperfemininity.

On the one hand, the imperial maidens who serve the Shinto deities at Ise and Kamo Shrines symbolize the overt prestige of hyperfemininity via their chastity and the sacrality of their role. Furthermore, their “unattainable” status makes them particularly desirable. That is to say, the status of *saiō* as a “sacred

³² For the historical development of the appellation “*saiō*,” see Emura Hiroyuki, *Ise saigū no rekishi to bunka* (Tokyo: Hanawa Shobō, 2009), pp. 123-42. According to convention, scholars across fields generally refer to the Ise Shrine priestess as *saigū* 斎宮, to the Kamo Shrine priestess as *saiin* 斎院, and refer to both as *saiō*. In this dissertation, I will follow this practice when I use the titles in Japanese. Premodern Japanese terms for the women who made their living via the sex trade include *yūjo*, *yūkun* 遊君, *asobi* 遊び, *ukareme* 浮かれ女, *keisei* 傾城, and *tsujigimi* 辻君, of which I will predominately use the first term due to its high rate of occurrence. Other groups of women who engaged in the sex trade as a secondary function of their occupation (e.g., *shirabyōshi* dancers 白拍子, *kugutsu* puppeteers 傀儡, and traveling storytellers) are excluded from the category of *yūjo* in this dissertation. For the English translation of *yūjo*, “courtesans” is mainly used.

virgin” can only be sustained as long as no one sexually attains her, which creates the man’s dilemma of desiring something that would vanish as soon as he achieves it. Simultaneously, *saiō* possess another obvious marker of overt prestige: supreme nobility. In this light, *saiō* and former *saiō* are some of the most exquisite female characters in Heian vernacular tales, such as Yasuko of *The Tales of Ise*, Akikonomu and Asagao of *The Tale of Genji*, and Princess Genji of *The Tale of Sagoromo*.

During the Kamakura period (1185-1333), however, negative depictions of fictional *saiō* become quite prevalent within the Heian-style courtly tales known as “archaic tales” (*giko monogatari*). In these tales, the mysterious charm of the “sacred virgin” was replaced by the image of a lady who passed her prime as a maiden without ever acquiring the techniques of love due to her service for a god. Some scholars explain this drastic shift of images as the reflection of the historical decline of the imperial family and/or of women in general. Nevertheless, I would argue that it is rather the manifestation of the other (negative) side of their overt prestige, as such unfavorable depictions of *saiō* and former *saiō* in Kamakura vernacular tales are predominantly about their sexuality, not about their economic or political status.

While *yūjo* are the women who are often depicted as bemoaning their status as “deeply sinful” (*zaigō fukaki mi*), they are simultaneously idealized heroines of several noh plays, including *Senju*, *Yuya*, *Hanjo*, and *Eguchi*. The *yūjo* embodies hyperfemininity that is closely related to the notion of *iki* 粋, a type of aesthetics and cultural sophistication composed of coquetry, brave composure,

and resignation, according to the philosopher Kuki Shūzō (1888-1941)³³

Furthermore, much like the case of royal priestesses, courtesans' desirability can be supported by their structural unattainability: A man's sexual encounter with a courtesan is by definition mediated by a reward, making a courtesan unattainable, as she is no longer a courtesan once she belongs to a man without the trade between sex and compensation.

In the next section, I will provide a basic historical context of the *saiō* system to illustrate its origin and development, though scholars have not reached a consensus about many issues surrounding the imperial priestesses. Section III will survey literary depictions of *saiō* within Heian narratives, which will be followed by a survey of Kamakura vernacular tales (Section IV). Beginning in Section V, I will switch the focus to courtesans, first by providing an overview of previous research, particularly historical studies in regard to the perceptions the female sexual entertainers. Then, in the following sections, I will survey depictions of *yūjo* in a Chinese-style prose and vernacular tales (Section VI) and *noh* plays (Section VII).

II. Historical Context of the *Saiō* System

In the fields of history and religious studies, a great deal of effort has been expended illuminating the lives of historical imperial maidens who were stationed at the Ise and Kamo Shrines as *saiō*. In Western scholarship, historian Robert S.

³³ Kuki Shūzō, "Iki no kōzō," in *Kuki Shūzō zenshū*, bekkan, eds., Amano Teiyū, et al. (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1982), pp. 57-62.

Ellwood published “The Saigū: Princess and Priestess” in 1967.³⁴ This was followed by the full English translation of a Heian book of rites called *Engi-shiki* (*Procedures of the Engi Era*, Books I-V, tenth century) in 1970, of which the fifth volume meticulously stipulates the duties of the Ise priestess.³⁵ Besides *Engi-shiki*, we are able to envision fractions of imperial priestesses’ lives from Japan’s official historical records, including *Kojiki* (712), *Nihon shoki* (720), and *Shoku Nihongi* (797); a small corpus of extant court documents and chronicles; and *waka* poems composed by *saiō* and their attendants.³⁶ Nonetheless, for the

³⁴ Robert S. Ellwood, “The Saigū: Princess and Priestess,” *History of Religions*, Vol. 7, No. 1 (1967), pp. 35-60.

³⁵ Elicia Gressitt Bock, trans., *Engi-Shiki: Procedures of the Engi Era*, Books I-V (Tokyo: Sophia University, 1970).

³⁶ The most renowned priestess-poet is Emperor Murakami’s daughter, Princess Senshi (964-1035), known by her honorific sobriquet *Ō-saiin* who has the record of serving the Kamo Shrine for the longest period of time, for fifty-seven years over five imperial reigns (according to Iwasa Miyoko, *Naishinnō monogatari* [Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 2003], p. 111, the reading *Dai-saiin* is inaccurate). She has three private *waka* anthologies: *Ō-saiin saki no gyoshū* (The first anthology of the Great Priestess), *Hosshin wakashū* (An anthology of religious awakenings), and *Ō-saiin gyoshū* (An anthology of the Great Priestess), compiling works of her own and poems composed by her attendants. A full English translation of *Hosshin wakashū* is available: Edward Kamens, trans. *The Buddhist Poetry of the Great Kamo Priestess: Daisaiin Senshi and Hosshin Wakashū* (Ann Arbor: Center for Japanese Studies, University of Michigan, 1990). According to one legend, Senshi supposedly suggested to Empress Shōshi that she have a lady-in-waiting create an interesting story, which resulted in the birth of Murasaki Shikibu’s *Tale of Genji*.

majority of these women, the details of their lives are largely unknown, including the pronunciations of their names.³⁷

Beginning with Toyosukiiri-hime during the reign of the prehistoric emperor Sujin (also Sūjin; n.d.), the first nine Ise priestesses are legendary and their existences are uncertain.³⁸ The first historical Ise priestess is Princess Ōku, a daughter of Emperor Tenmu (r. 673-686), installed in the same year as her father's enthronement.³⁹ Following Ōku, sixty-four more *saigū* were installed to serve the Sun Goddess Amaterasu for the next six centuries, until the practice came to an end with Princess Shōshi during the reign of Emperor Godaigo (r. 1318-1339).⁴⁰ In principle, a new priestess was selected by divination soon after

³⁷ The current convention is to pronounce the princess's names based on the Chinese readings of the characters unless the Japanese readings are known (Iwasa, *Naishinnō*), p. 4.

³⁸ Emura Hiroyuki, *Ise saigū to saiō: Inori o sasageta kōjo-tachi* (Tokyo: Hanawa Shobō, 2004), p. 4.

³⁹ According to *Nihon shoki* (SNKBZ 3, p. 315), Prince Ōama (later Emperor Tenmu), on his way to Mino, dedicated a prayer to Amaterasu during the time of the Jinshin War (672), although the purpose is not specified in the text. *Fusō ryakki*, a chronicle compiled during the late Heian period, however, states that Ōama asked for divine aid to triumph over his enemy and nephew, Prince Ōtomo, and promised that he would resume the *saigū* system, which had been suspended for the previous five reigns (cited by Emura Hiroyuki, *Ise saigū no rekishi to bunka* [Tokyo: Hanawa Shobō, 2009], p. 18).

⁴⁰ Iwasa, *Naishinnō*, pp. 17-21. A list of the seventy-five Ise priestesses and their basic information, including the names, relationships to the reigning emperors, and lengths of service, can be found in *Saigū-ki* (A record of *saigū*; late Kamakura period), included in *Gunsho ruijū* 4, pp. 1-3.

the enthronement of an emperor, out of a pool of his unmarried daughters, granddaughters, and nieces. Once appointed, she spent over three years in a purification period: the first two years at the Shosai-in (first abstinence house), followed by another year at the Nonomiya (country shrine). Upon settling in her vast compound (also called Saigū) outside the shrine precinct, the priestess was allowed to leave the site only three times a year, namely, during the Harvest Festival in the ninth month and the two “Monthly” Festivals (*tsukinami-sai*) in the sixth and twelfth month. In other words, except for these occasions when she traveled approximately ten kilometers to the main shrine, she lived in seclusion until her duty was completed when the reigning sovereign abdicated or died.⁴¹

The institutionalization of the Kamo priestess (*saiin*), on the other hand, began in 810, after Emperor Saga (r. 809-823) suppressed a rebellion masterminded by the previous sovereign’s (Emperor Heizei) favorite concubine, Fujiwara no Kusuko. As a token of gratitude for divine favor, Saga dedicated his own daughter Uchiko as the first royal priestess at the Kamo Shrine.⁴² This tradition lasted for approximately 400 years until the thirty-fifth *saiin*, Reishi, during the reign of Emperors Tsuchimikado (r. 1198-1210) and Juntoku (r. 1210-

⁴¹ Ellwood, “The Saigū,” pp. 35-6. Besides the reigning emperor’s abdication or death, a *saigu* was released from her duties if she violated the code of conduct, became ill, or lost a parent.

⁴² The beginning of *Kamo saiin-ki* from the late Kamakura period states, “Emperor Saga and Emperor Heizei did not share deep fraternal affection. Therefore, [Saga] wished to especially build an abstinence house and had his princess Uchiko to attend there.” See *Gunsho ruijū* 4, p. 3.

1221).⁴³ While the duties of the Kamo *saiin* were fundamentally the same as those of the Ise *saigū*, there were some differences between the two posts. First, as the system began irrespective of the enthronement of Emperor Saga, Kamo priestesses' appointment periods were not determined by the emperors' reigns, allowing many of them to serve their positions for decades. Second, since the Kamo Shrine was dedicated to a guardian deity of the Heian capital, a *saiin* was thought to be a local priestess of the capital, unlike *saigū*, who served an ancestral god of the entire country, Amaterasu.⁴⁴ In relation to this point, Kamo priestesses underwent only one or two years of purification period, "probably because the *Saiin* [the compound] was not regarded as a sacred realm that was completely detached from the secular world [unlike Ise]."⁴⁵ Lastly, due to the vicinity to the capital, many courtiers visited the *saiin*'s compound, creating a literary salon and producing great poetic talents such as Princesses Senshi (see Note 35), Baishi (1039-1096) and Shokushi (1149-1201).⁴⁶

Among the many obscurities surrounding the imperial priestesses, the Ise *saigū*'s symbolic role is the subject of an ongoing debate among scholars. That is to say, while *Kōtai jingū gishiki-chō* (A manual for the rituals of imperial shrines; 804) describes the role of the first *saigū*, Toyosukiiri-hime, as *mi-*

⁴³ *Kamo saiin-ki* lists the names of all the Kamo priestesses and information about them, some more detailed than others (*Gunsho ruijū* 4, pp. 3-9).

⁴⁴ Emura, *Ise saigū no rekishi to bunka*, p. 98.

⁴⁵ Tatsunami Sadako, "Ise saiō-sei no sōshi," in *Ōchō bungaku to saigū, saiin*, ed., Gotō Shōko, *Heian bungaku to rinsetsu shogaku* 6 (Tokyo: Chikurinsha, 2009), p. 28.

⁴⁶ Iwasa, *Naishinnō*, pp. 81-83.

tsueshiro (“one who supports the god like a cane”), there are generally two different approaches to interpreting this term.⁴⁷ One is that the *saigū* becomes the wife of Amaterasu, the deity enshrined at the Ise, “according to a logic of marital alliance in which the *kami* is perceived like a powerful lord who must be won over through blood ties (or their symbolic equivalent). Thus, the *saigū* becomes both a hostage and an intercessor.”⁴⁸ The obvious challenge to this theory is that Amaterasu is generally regarded as a female god. However, according to Tanaka Takako, Amaterasu’s gender became increasingly ambiguous during the medieval period. To illustrate this idea, she gives the example of *Tsūkai sankei-ki* (A record of Tsūkai’s pilgrimages) by the Daigo-ji priest Tsūkai (1234-1305). In this journal, he mentions a strange story he heard from some Shinto priests at the Ise Shrine:

The *saigū* is a person who is comparable to the royal consort of the *kami*. Because the *kami* comes to see her every night, some say that every morning, snake scales [fallen from the god’s body] can be found under her bed. I don’t know whether this is true or not. Commoners deny that it’s a true story.⁴⁹

Tanaka notes that the idea that the Ise deity is in the form of a serpent was quite prevalent during the medieval period, and the above anecdote is influenced by

⁴⁷ See *Kōtai jingū gishiki-chō* in *Gunsho ruijū* 1, p. 3.

⁴⁸ Bernard Faure, *The Power of Denial: Buddhism, Purity, and Gender* (Princeton: Princeton University Press: 2003), p. 297. Saeki Junko also regards the virginity of *saiō* necessary because their role was to have “virtual sexual relationships (*jishshitsuteki seikōshō*)” with the gods (*Yūjo no bunkashi*, p. 17).

⁴⁹ Tanaka Takako, *Seinaru onna: Saigū, megami, Chūjō hime* (Tokyo: Jinbun Shoin, 1996), p. 105.

the “marriage with a god” plot pattern, best known from the legend of Mt. Miwa included in the *Kojiki*.⁵⁰ She continues,

In [the ancient period], the term *kami tsuma* [the god’s wife], which referred to the *saigū*, simply meant a symbolic wife, but she began to be regarded as someone who actually has a sexual relationship with a god—as he visits in the form of a snake.⁵¹

Tanaka also points out that *Shintōshū* (ca. 14th century) treats Amaterasu’s gender as male, stating that Izanagi and Izanami “gave birth to one female, three males. Those three males were the Sun God, the Moon God, and Susano-o. The one female was Hiruko (the leech child).”⁵² In addition, she mentions the Tendai priest Jien’s (1155-1225) *Biseibetsu*⁵³ and a medieval treatise on the *Kokin wakashū* titled *Kokin waka kanjō no maki*⁵⁴ as examples of texts that treat Amaterasu’s gender as ambiguous.⁵⁵

⁵⁰ See NKBT 1, pp. 181-183. In this legend, Lady Living Spirit Medium becomes pregnant without being married. Her astonished parents ask her who the father of the baby is. Lady Living Spirit Medium tells them that a lovely young man, whose name she does not know, has been visiting her nightly. That night, the parents make their daughter sew a long string onto the hem of the man’s clothing. The next morning, they discover that the thread has passed through the keyhole, leaving three loops (*miwa*), extending to the shrine of a serpent deity on Mt. Miwa.

⁵¹ Tanaka, *Seinaru onna*, p. 105.

⁵² Kondō Yoshihiro, ed., *Shintōshū*, Tōyō Bunko-bon 9 (Tokyo: Kadokawa Shoten, 1959, 1978), pp. 15-16.

⁵³ The composition and the meaning of the title are unknown. Misaki Ryōshū speculates that the first part of the title *bisei* or *bhiṣe* (Sk.) is an abbreviation of the Sanskrit term *abhiṣeka*, which means “initiation rites,” while the last character *betsu* simply indicates “an additional volume” to Jien’s other book *Bisei* (*Taimitsu no riron to jissen* [Kyoto: Sōbunsha, 1994], p.124-125).

⁵⁴ Also known as *Kokin hidenshō*. Author and composition are unknown.

On the other hand, some scholars explicate the role of *saigū* without disambiguating the gender of the sun goddess. Ueno Chizuko, for instance, argues that the Ise priestess is Amaterasu's symbolic avatar rather than a wife of the deity.⁵⁶ Kuratsuka Akiko proposes a theory that the *saigū* is a residue of the female part of the ancient ruling system known as the *hime-hiko sei* with a pair of one female (*hime*) and one male (*hiko*) leaders with shamanic powers. According to this hypothesis, when the Chinese *ritsuryō* system was imported to Japan and became the model of a "nation" with a centralized government, one lineage of the *hiko* came to monopolize political power and ruled as the emperor, whereas the shamaness was symbolically exiled to the periphery (i.e., Ise) to serve the ancestral deity of the imperial family.⁵⁷

Whether *saiō* is a surrogate wife of a male divinity, an avatar of a female deity, or a symbolic successor of an ancient female ruler, female sex and gender are the most integral part of her being, and this heightened female sexuality is reflected upon the way royal priestesses are constructed in literature. In the following sections, I will examine how the hyperfemininity of (former) *saiō* is embedded in their literary depictions and how the focus of their personae shifted from "highly desirable" to "ambivalent" over the transition from the Heian to medieval period.

⁵⁵ Tanaka, *Seinaru onna*, pp. 106-109.

⁵⁶ Ueno Chizuko, "'Gaibu' no bunsetsu: Kiki no shinwa rinrigaku," in *Kami to Hotoke: Bukkyō juyō to shinbutsu shūgō no sekai*, ed., Sakurai Yoshirō, *Taiei Bukkyō to Nihonjin 1* (Tokyo: Shunjūsha, 1986), p. 291.

⁵⁷ Kuratsuka Akiko, *Fujo no bunka* (Tokyo: Heibonsha, 1994), pp. 300-302.

III. *Saiō* Portrayed in Heian Vernacular Tales

The most famous historical royal priestess who also appears in vernacular tales (*monogatari*) is Princess Yasuko (also Tenshi and Yasurakekiko; 848-913), a daughter born to Emperor Montoku (r. 850-858) and his junior consort Ki no Shizuko. Yasuko is thought to be the model of the *saigū* in Section 69 of *The Tales of Ise*, in which she has a night's liaison with the tale's *irogonomi* hero, Ariwara no Narihira (825-880).⁵⁸ A summary of this story based on Helen Craig McCullough's 1968 translation is as follows.⁵⁹

Once a man went to the province of Ise as an imperial huntsman. The Ise Virgin attentively looked after his needs, as her mother told her to. On the night of the second day, the man suggested that they might become better acquainted. The Virgin was not unwilling, but with so many people about, it was impossible to arrange a meeting in private. However, because the man had been lodged rather close to the Virgin's own sleeping chamber, the Virgin went to his room. When he saw her by the faint light of the moon, he led her joyfully into the bedchamber. They spent a fleeting time together, but before they exchanged a vow, she was gone. The next morning, the man received a poem by the priestess:

<i>Kimi ya koshi</i>	Did you, I wonder, come here,
<i>ware ya yukikemu</i>	or might I have gone there?
<i>omōezu</i>	I scarcely know...

⁵⁸ Narihira's tête-à-tête with the Ise priestess in this section has been suggested as the origin of the title, *Ise monogatari*.

⁵⁹ Helen Craig McCullough, trans., *Tales of Ise: Lyrical Episodes from Tenth-Century Japan* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1968), pp. 115-157. For the full text of Section 69 in Japanese, see SNKBZ 12, pp. 172-174.

<i>yume ka utsutsu ka</i>	Was it dream or reality—
<i>nete ka samete ka</i>	Did I sleep or wake? ⁶⁰

In reply, the man sent:

<i>Kakikurasu</i>	I too have groped
<i>kokoro no yami ni</i>	in utter darkness.
<i>madoiniki</i>	Can you not determine tonight
<i>yume utsutsu to wa</i>	which it might have been—
<i>koyoi sadameyo</i>	whether dream or reality? ⁶¹

Without another chance to see the priestess, however, the man was to leave for Owari Province. As dawn approached, she sent him a farewell cup of wine with a poem inscribed on the saucer:

<i>Kachibito no</i>	Since ours was a relationship no deeper
<i>wataredo nurenu</i>	than a creek too shallow
<i>e ni shi areba</i>	to wet a foot-traveler's garb...

Since the last two lines were missing, he supplied:

<i>mata Ōsaka no</i>	I shall surely again cross
<i>Seki wa koenan</i>	Ōsaka Barrier

The priestess was the one who served during the reign of Emperor Seiwa; she was a daughter of Emperor Montoku and a sister of Prince Koretaka.⁶²

⁶⁰ *Kokinshū*, no. 645, anonymous (SNKBZ 11, p. 253). The comment preceding the poem (*kotobagaki*) reads, "When Narihira went to Ise Province, he furtively met with a lady who was said to be the priestess. The next morning, as he was longing for her, someone brought this to him."

⁶¹ *Kokinshū*, no. 646, Ariwara no Narihira (SNKBZ 11, p. 253).

⁶² Prince Koretaka is Narihira's lord, as Section 82 illustrates (SNKBZ 12, pp. 183-186).

The historian Tsunoda Bun'ei, an advocate for treating Section 69 as a factual incident, describes this love affair as “a fleeting, beautiful rendezvous.”⁶³ Iwasa describes imperial priestesses as “untouchable noble ladies veiled in mystery. They inevitably entice amorous gentlemen’s curiosity and become the target of their longing,” and says that “even a playboy like Narihira had no means to maintain his composure knowing that the mysterious forbidden lady was nearby.”⁶⁴ Imō Yoshinobu states that Section 69 “truly dramatically describes the dazzling one-night love affair” between Narihira and Yasuko, in which the woman is portrayed as “extremely passionate and expressive of her feelings for the man... indulging herself in the forbidden love.”⁶⁵ This romantic view of Yasuko and Narihira’s love affair derives from the hyperfeminine images of *saiō*,

⁶³ Tsunoda Bun'ei, *Murasaki Shikibu to sono jidai* (Tokyo: Kadokawa Shoten, 1967), p. 480.

Based on *Kokinshū*, various chronicles, and anecdotal tales, Tsunoda concludes that the secret affair probably occurred in either the ninth or tenth month of Jōgan 7 (865), ten months before the birth of Takashina no Morohisa. Tsunoda cites a passage from Ōe no Masafusa’s *Gōke shidai* (also *Gōshidai*) that mentions Morohisa’s lineage: “The middle captain (Narihira) and the *saigū* had an illicit affair and this resulted in the birth of Morohisa. Therefore, members of the Takashina are yet to visit the Ise (fearing for the wrath of the Ise deity), p. 482. More recent scholarship generally treats Section 69 as an adaptation of a Tang Chinese short story called *Yingying zhuan* (A legend of Yingying). See, for example, Ding Li, *Ise monogatari to sono shūhen: Jendā no shiten kara* (Tokyo: Kazama Shobō, 2006), pp. 272-290.

⁶⁴ Iwasa, *Naishinnō*, p. 45 and p. 47 respectively.

⁶⁵ Imō Yoshinobu, “*Ise monogatari no saigū-zō*,” in *Ōchō bungaku to saigū, saiin*, ed., Gotō Shōko, *Heian bungaku to rinsetsu shogaku* 6 (Tokyo: Chikurinsha, 2009), p. 323.

associated with enchanting beauty, mystifying sacrality, and refinement, as summarized in the following statement:

When imperial messengers came to the faraway Ise, the imperial priestess hosted the guests. Ise was the beginning of the eastern land... and a center of civilization similar to that of the capital.... Some of the messengers must have felt familiar comfort in the splendid compound, while others must have felt tremendous awe, yearning, and romantic feelings towards the mistress of the mansion.... We can imagine that, to the ordinary courtiers, the life of a *saiō* was veiled in mystery, and for those secular people, the dedication of her life to the god itself was enough to create a tale. Therefore, [Section 69] was born out of the mysterious and noble images of *saigū* and some historical facts.⁶⁶

Such exquisite images of *saiō* continued to be projected onto the two priestesses portrayed in *The Tale of Genji* (ca. 1000), Akikonomu and Asagao, and they captivate the hero over many years.⁶⁷

Born with a royal pedigree, divine beauty, and supreme sensibility, Hikaru Genji is the most idealized male protagonist of all Japanese tales. His incessant thirst for a new lover was driven by the deepest, surreptitious yearnings for his very own stepmother, Empress Fujitsubo, with whom he had an illegitimate son (i.e., the future Emperor Reizei). Indeed, he had an inclination to be “[s]educated

⁶⁶ Hara Makiko, “*Ise monogatari* rokujūku-dan kō,” in *Ōchō bungaku to saigū, saiin*, ed. Gotō Shōko, *Heian bungaku to rinsetsu shogaku* 6 (Tokyo: Chikurinsha, 2009), p. 355.

⁶⁷ Although one more *saiin* is mentioned in the “Heartvine” chapter, who is “His Eminence’s [Emperor Kiritsubo] third daughter by the Empress Mother [the Kokiden lady],” her character is not developed in the story (Royall Tyler, trans., *The Tale of Genji* [New York: Penguin Books, 2003], p. 166).

...by strange complications,”⁶⁸ and his arousal by the young Ise priestess (the future Akikonomu, consort to Emperor Reizei) was no exception. That is to say, not only was she untouchable due to her role as “sacred virgin,” but she was also the daughter of the late crown prince (Genji’s uncle) and his former older lover, the Rokujō Haven. While Rokujō was never one of Genji’s favorites, difficulties between the two escalated following the famous “carriage battle” in the “Heartvine” chapter.⁶⁹ The jealous Rokujō’s living spirit wandered out of her body and eventually killed Genji’s wife, Aoi. Out of excruciating guilt and shame, Rokujō decided to retreat to Ise along with her daughter, the newly appointed *saigū*.⁷⁰

⁶⁸ Ibid., p. 197. The original reads: *kōyō ni tameshi ni tagaeru wazurawashisa ni, kanarazu kokoro kakaru on-kuse nite* (SNKBZ 21, p. 92).

⁶⁹ In this dissertation, Tyler’s translation is used for the main text. However, the chapter titles are based on Edward Seidensticker’s 1976 translation due to current convention.

⁷⁰ The “carriage battle” (*kuruma arasoī*) is one of the pivotal scenes of Part I. During the Kamo Festival procession, grooms of Aoi (Genji’s principal wife) and those of the Rokujō Haven, who was there incognito, fight over a viewing spot, resulting in the complete destruction of Rokujō’s carriage. This unbearable public humiliation causes her spirit to possess Aoi and torment her to death. It has been suggested that Rokujō’s accompanying her daughter to Ise is modeled after Consort Kishi/Yoshiko (929-985), one of the Thirty-Six Poetry Immortals, commonly known as Saigū no Nyōgo (Imperial Consort Saigū). After retiring from the post of Ise priestess, she married Emperor Murakami (r. 946-967) and bore Princess Kishi/Noriko (949-986). When the daughter was selected to become a *saigū*, Kishi/Yoshiko accompanied her to Ise in 977. See, for example, Emura, *Ise saigū no rekishi to bunka*, Part II, Chapter 2.

In contrast to Rokujō, whose ghost continuously torments Genji and his wives in the story after her death, Akikonomu is depicted as a lady without flaws, beginning with her extraordinary beauty. During the farewell ceremony at the imperial palace in the “Sacred Tree” chapter, Emperor Suzaku (Genji’s older half-brother) wept at having to send away such a lovely maiden to the remote Ise:

The High Priestess was fourteen. She was pretty already, and her mother’s careful grooming had given her a beauty so troubling that His Majesty’s heart was stirred.

He shed tears of keen emotion when he set the comb of parting in her hair.⁷¹

The word “troubling” in this quote is *yuyushi*, which is repeated later in the “Channel Buoys” chapter to re-describe Akikonomu’s divine beauty, as in “[Suzaku] had never forgotten the Ise Priestess’s almost disturbing [*yuyushi*] beauty at that solemn farewell ceremony in the Great Hall of State.”⁷² Yoda Mizuho points out that the word *yuyushi* is “associated with the rather inauspicious notion that things or people are so superb that a deity will take them into the divine realm. While it was not a common word to describe ordinary female beauty, *yuyushi* is used here repeatedly to illustrate the otherworldly beauty of the god’s wife...”⁷³

Upon Suzaku’s abdication, Rokujō and her daughter returned to the capital after six years. In the “Channel Buoys” chapter, the terminally ill Rokujō, now a nun, was reunited with her former lover. From her death bed, she pleaded

⁷¹ Tyler, *Genji*, p. 197. For the original, see SNKBZ p. 93.

⁷² Ibid., p. 296.

⁷³ Yoda Mizuho, “Akikonomu chūgū,” in *Monogatari o orinasu hitobito*, eds., Imai Takuji, et al., *Genji monogatari kōza* 2 (Tokyo: Benseisha, 1991), p. 174.

with Genji to take care of her daughter, with the condition that he behave towards her purely as a father. In the midst of their conversation, however, Genji spotted the young lady between the curtains and became immediately intrigued by her presence:

With the standing curtain swept casually aside this way, he could see straight through to her. Chin in hand, she seemed very sad. By this faint light she looked extremely attractive. The way her hair fell across her shoulders and the shape of her head had great distinction, but she was still charmingly slight, and Genji felt a sharp surge of interest, although after her mother's speech he thought better of it.⁷⁴

A few days later, Rokujō passed away. Genji consequently invited Akikonomu to his mansion as an adoptive daughter, rather than as a lover, though Genji would continue to woo her in the “A Rack of Cloud” chapter, saying: “I shall be very sorry if you can offer me no word of sympathy” (*aware to dani notamawasezu wa, ika ni kainaku haberamu*), which is a stock expression used when a man begs for a woman's pity during a courtship.⁷⁵

Haruo Shirane compares the three “pseudo-daughters” of Genji—namely, Akikonomu, Murasaki, and Tamakazura—and points out that Akikonomu is the only one who has the poise and strength to redirect Genji's advances:

⁷⁴ Ibid., p. 294.

⁷⁵ Kufukihara Rei, “Akikonomu chūgū,” in *Ōchō bungaku to saigū, saiin*, ed., Gotō Shōko, *Heian bungaku to rinsetsu shogaku* 6 (Tokyo: Chikurinsha, 2009), p. 367. For the original, see SNKBZ 21, p. 460. The translation is by Tyler (*Genji*, p. 359). Kufukihara points out that the phrase “*aware to dani notamawaseba*” is also used by Kashiwagi in the “New Herbs Part II” chapter during his secret visit to Genji's young new wife, the Third Princess (p. 367).

Genji keeps his word [with Rokujō], adopts [Akikonomu], and successfully marries her to the Reizei emperor. But when Akikonomu returns to the Nijō-in in “Usugumo” (“A Rack of Cloud”) Genji is unable to restrain himself and hints that he has far more than paternal affection for her. In contrast to Murasaki, Akikonomu manages to hold Genji in check and diverts the conversation to more benign topics such as the four seasons.⁷⁶

All in all, Murasaki Shikibu depicts Akikonomu as an unblemished lady worthy of the highest prestige as a *saigū*-turned-consort and none of the downfalls many of Genji’s women experienced, including his favorite Murasaki. Similarly, the other priestess of the story, Princess Asagao, who served the Kamo Shrine for several years, is portrayed as a woman of supreme exquisiteness and strength, who does not succumb to Genji’s tenacious courting. Shirane contrasts Asagao and Murasaki as follows:

Like the Asagao lady, Murasaki is the daughter of a prince, but her mother, now deceased, was a secondary wife. Murasaki is consequently never referred to as a princess, as Asagao is. Nor would she ever be honored with the post of *sai-in*...

[T]he Asagao princess is a perfect social match for the highborn hero. If Genji were to succeed with her, as he seems intent on doing, Murasaki’s position would be

⁷⁶ Shirane, *Bridge of Dreams*, p. 94. Of the three adoptive daughters, Genji marries Murasaki and he almost crosses the parent-child line with Tamakazura. For instance, in “The Typhoon” chapter (*Nowaki*), Genji’s son Yūgiri witnesses his father and Tamakazura embracing: “It took him [Yūgiri] aback to see Genji clearly flirting with her [Tamakazura], and he was fascinated. He is supposed to be her father, he thought, but she is much too old for him to take in his arms! The startling strangeness of the scene kept him watching despite his fear of discovery. She was hidden behind a pillar and looking a little away from Genji, but he drew her toward him, and her hair spilled forward like a wave” (Tyler, *Genji*, p. 492).

seriously undermined. Though the threat never materializes, the Asagao lady's sudden appearance serves as a reminder that Murasaki's position is completely dependent on Genji's continued but uncertain devotion.⁷⁷

In other words, both Akikonomu and Asagao remained unattainable for Genji and thus maintained their purity and sacrality originally gained as royal priestesses earlier in the tale. Nonetheless, during the post-*Genji* era, more and more *monogatari* depicted former *saiō* as old maids with no sexual appeal. *The Tale of Sagoromo* (ca. late eleventh century) is a *monogatari* that features both types of priestess.

The *Sagoromo* was written towards the end of the Heian period, by Senji, a wet nurse and lady-in-waiting to the Kamo priestess Baishi (commonly known as the Rokujō *saiin*).⁷⁸ The hero of this tale is Sagoromo, a grandson of the former emperor who has physical beauty, status, and talents that are reminiscent of Hikaru Genji. Much like the hero of the *Genji*, Sagoromo repeatedly found himself in unfulfilling, tragic love affairs, because his true love, Princess Genji, became the new Kamo *saiin*. As Charo B. D'Etcheverry notes:

[t]he hero, Sagoromo, pines for this heroine throughout the twelve-year span of the narrative, worrying first that she will marry the crown prince and then, when she suddenly becomes Kamo priestess, that he will lose her forever to the gods. Despite her constant rebuffs, Sagoromo continues to be obsessed with the princess, even after he discovers a virtual look-alike and, upon his stunning elevation to emperor, makes that woman his empress. This element of the narrative, as its heroine's

⁷⁷ Ibid., p. 110.

⁷⁸ See Gotō Shōko's commentary in SNKBZ 29, pp. 307-309.

sobriquet suggests, is a fairly insipid variation on Genji's love for Fujitsubo 藤壺, complete with quasi-incestuous and subversive overtones but lacking the encounter that gives them force.⁷⁹

Perhaps because the author, Senji, was very familiar with the life of a royal priestess due to her own occupation, as many as five current or retired *saiō* appear as characters in this tale. Of these five women, Princess Genji and the First Princess (one of Sagoromo's wives) reveal a staggering contrast in their depictions. First, Princess Genji's physical attractiveness is repeatedly emphasized throughout the narrative:

How perfect the extravagance of [this farewell ceremony] would have looked at an imperial banquet. Before the princess's curtain were piles of magnificent fabrics and robes in an assortment of colors, which made for a rather overwhelming view. Yet, the gorgeous attire she wore did not overpower the beauty of the princess.... The way she was peeking at the ladies-in-waiting between the gaps of the curtains was simply dazzling. It is no surprise that the Kamo deity would never want to let her go, let alone General Sagoromo.⁸⁰

In contrast to Princess Genji's fresh, youthful charm, the appearance of the First Princess, in her early thirties, is depicted in quite an unflattering way:

The Horikawa minister [Sagoromo's father] arranged an opportunity to ask the emperor to allow the First Princess [the emperor's younger sister] and Sagoromo to marry.... The emperor thought to himself, "The princess would be ashamed of her appearance, which reached its peak some time ago. Even though she is the highest-

⁷⁹ Charo B. D'Etcheverry, "Out of the Mouths of Nurses: *The Tale of Sagoromo* and Midranks Romance," *Monumenta Nipponica*, Vol. 59, No. 2 (Summer, 2004), p. 155.

⁸⁰ SNKBZ 29, p. 282.

ranked princess, if Sagoromo were unsatisfied with her appearance, I would feel terribly sorry for her. I have heard that the cloistered emperor's princess [one of Sagoromo's lovers] was a stunning beauty, but the Kamo priestess's [Princess Genji] gorgeousness would probably be even more superior. It seems that Sagoromo has remained unmarried all this time because he was waiting for someone who could surpass these two ladies...."⁸¹

Despite some reluctance among members of the First Princess's family and Sagoromo's unwillingness, the two eventually married, marking the beginning of a long-standing tragedy. When Sagoromo visited his wife's chamber, for instance, the attendants found the disparity between Sagoromo's supreme beauty and the princess's fading attractiveness so unbearable that they went so far as to avoid eye contact with their master and mistress.⁸² The Princess, whom the narrator describes as "trailing silky, fine hair for about two feet, but the ends were becoming too thin"⁸³ and "looking unappealing when she was dressed in rather sober colors,"⁸⁴ is fully aware of her loveless marriage. For the rest of the story, the former Kamo Priestess and her husband, who continued to long for the current Kamo Priestess, grew farther and farther apart from each other. These ambivalent constructions of royal priestesses (i.e., desirable yet unattainable; attainable yet undesirable) observed in the *Sagoromo* begin to shift

⁸¹ SNKBZ 30, pp. 88-89.

⁸² Ibid., p. 111.

⁸³ Ibid., p. 115.

⁸⁴ Ibid., p. 115.

towards unequivocally negative ones within the Kamakura “archaic tales,” as we shall see in the next section.

IV. *Saiō* Portrayed in Kamakura Vernacular Tales

During the Kamakura period (1185-1333) the political power of the aristocrats was gradually replaced by that of the rising military class. Yet, courtly tales with Heian-style diction and plots imitative of *The Tale of Genji* continued to be produced during this period, demonstrating the aristocrats’ incessant yearning for the glorious past.⁸⁵ These so-called *giko monogatari* (archaic tales) tend to cover generations of a family (hence the number of characters and complexity of the plot tend to be great), and current or retired *saiō* are very common characters.

As discussed above, *The Tale of Sagoromo*, which was written towards the end of the Heian period, delineated the present Kamo *saiin* (Princess Genji) and the former *saiin* (the First Princess) in completely different terms. This appears to be indicative of a transition from a time in which royal priestesses’ desirable traits were emphasized (i.e. Yasuko, Akikonomu and Asagao) to a time wherein their unfavorable images began to be projected more vividly onto them in narratives.

In fact, Tanaka’s survey of various Kamakura tales confirms this tendency of a seemingly declining desirability of *saiō*. In her study, she focuses on the representations of princesses in general, but many are also former priestesses,

⁸⁵ Donald Keene, *Seeds in the Heart: A History of Japanese Literature* Vol. 1 (New York: Columbia University Press, 1993), pp. 789-791.

and with the exceptions of a few who are reminiscent of the unattainable Princess Genji, all fall into the undesirable First Princess's category. In *Iwade shinobu monogatari* (A tale of unspoken yearning; early thirteenth century), the former *saiin* became pregnant after having sex with one of the central male characters, the middle captain. A critical tone in the narrator's voice can be found in passages such as, "I must say, her relationship with the middle captain was surprising, considering that she would be turning thirty after the New Year. She was pale, old-fashioned, and did not possess any particular charming points, but one could say she did have a serious, sincere atmosphere."⁸⁶ In another story, titled *Koiji yukashiki taishō* (The captain of the elegant way of love; ca. late thirteenth century), one of the principal characters, Middle Captain Hayama, caught a glimpse of the Ise priestess who has just returned to the capital upon completing her duty, and falls in love. Tanaka analyzes his motivation: "[i]t is not exaggerating to say that his obsession with the former *saigū* is mostly based on sheer curiosity about a sacred woman."⁸⁷ In fact, in the scene wherein Hayama first meets the former *saiin* along with her younger half-sister, the narrator does

⁸⁶ *Iwade shinobu monogatari*, cited in Tanaka (1996), p. 159. An annotated text of this tale is available: Ōgi Takashi, ed., *Iwade shinobu monogatari: Honbun to kenkyū* (Tokyo: Kasama Shoin, 1977).

⁸⁷ *Ibid.*, p. 159. Similarly, Katsumata Shiori states that "this infatuation of Hayama certainly originates from his 'illusion of the *saigū*' [*saigū gensō*]. He is fantasizing about the return of a beautifully matured princess from the remote Ise." See Katsumata Shiori, "Kōki monogatari ni okeru saiō no henbō," in *Ōchō bungaku to saigū, saiin*, ed., Gotō Shōko, *Heian bungaku to rinsetsu shogaku* 6 (Tokyo: Chikurinsha, 2009), p.613.

not hesitate to state, “When it comes to flowery, dazzling beauty, the Second Princess [the younger sister] was a better fit for this description. The former *saigū* was not as physically attractive as her sister...”⁸⁸ Hayama after all married the older sister, but his heart became preoccupied with a new lady immediately after their wedding.

In another narrative, *Kaze ni momiji* (Crimson leaves in the wind; ca. fourteenth century), the retired Ise *saigū* is a devout nun trying to make up for all the Buddhist rites she missed while she was in Ise. In contrast to her stoic appearance, however, once she laid her eyes on the handsome minister of the center, she fell hopelessly in love. Behind her back, the hero and his male lover found amusement in criticizing her unsightliness.⁸⁹

Tanaka’s explanation of this trend is composed of the following two points: First, the Kamakura period was no longer “in need of *saiō*’s sacred/shamanic powers,” and the vulgar portrayals of the priestesses reflect this shift.⁹⁰ Second, women’s status during the Kamakura period declined due in part to the installment of the patriarchic family system, wherein female members of the

⁸⁸ *Koiji yukashiki Taishō*, cited in Tanaka, *Seinaru onna*, p. 160. A typeset text is included in Ichiko Teiji and Misumi Yōichi, eds., *Kamakura jidai monogatari shūsei* 3 (Tokyo: Kasama Shoin, 1990), pp. 223-346.

⁸⁹ *Kaze ni momiji*, cited in Tanaka, *Seinaru onna*, pp. 161-162. A typeset text is included in Ichiko Teiji and Misumi Yōichi, eds., *Kamakura jidai monogatari shūsei* 2 (Tokyo: Kasama Shoin, 1989), pp. 439-507.

⁹⁰ Tanaka, *Seinaru onna*, p. 124. To be more precise, Tanaka’s theory argues that all imperial ladies once had sacred/shamanic powers (pp. 127-129).

imperial household also became subordinated to the patriarch of the family or the emperor. Simultaneously, during the medieval period, women began to marry into the husbands' family. As a result, unmarried women and women who passed their marriageable ages began to be increasingly stigmatized, including retired *saiō*.⁹¹

Although degeneration of imperial eminence and the decline of women's status during the medieval period are historically valid points, negative portrayals of former priestesses in *giko monogatari* may not be the result of these factors, precisely because the negativity lies in the women's sexual desirability rather than their political or financial standing. Therefore, it is more reasonable to view the unfavorable depictions of *saiō* in various tales as the surfacing of the negative side of the royal priestesses' hyperfemininity. In a culture that highly regards skills in the art of love, the status of a sacred virgin cannot be separated from that of an unskilled lover or an old maid.

As the scheme below illustrates, *saiō* and *yūjo* are two groups of women that exhibit a mirroring structure, as the first group is associated with positive traits in the light of overt prestige, while their negatives surface in the light of covert prestige. Conversely, courtesans engender negative images when the focus is placed on their public, overt side, yet the favorable characteristics are pronounced when their covert side is focused on. By switching our gears to courtesans in the following sections, the intrinsically bifacial construction of prestige will become clearer.

⁹¹ Ibid., pp. 150-157.

	Overt Prestige	Covert Prestige
Imperial Priestess	+ mysterious, sacred, noble unattainable	-ignorant about love, no longer desirable
Courtesan	- sinful, lowly	+ savoir-faire of love, alluring, unattainable

V. Sex Trade and Courtesans in Premodern Japan: An Overview

In my analysis, *yūjo* are the group of women who co-occupy the apex of hyperfemininities along with the imperial priestesses. However, unlike their “overtly prestigious” counterpart, or the noble maidens selected by divination to earn the title of *saigū* or *saiin*, the question of who should be categorized as courtesans is far more complex. For instance, in her tellingly titled book, *Selling Songs and Smiles: The Sex Trade in Heian and Kamakura Japan*, historian Janet R. Goodwin conflates *asobi* (*yūjo*), female puppeteers (*kugutsu*) and *shirabyōshi* dancers as “sexual entertainers,” based on her working definition of a prostitute as “one who engages in sex with multiple partners for compensation that provides at least a partial living.”⁹² Although it is true that *kugutsu* and *shirabyōshi* dancers (and probably many other kinds of working women) often engaged in sexual relations with their patrons, their primary “job description” was not the sex trade. In other words, female puppeteers or *shirabyōshi* dancers would have been regarded as who they were, even if they had not participated in the sex trade. On the other hand, being a *yūjo* automatically meant that she had

⁹² Janet R. Goodwin, *Selling Songs and Smiles: The Sex Trade in Heian and Kamakura Japan* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2006), pp. 1-2.

sex with her patrons, despite her secondary role as a musician and dancer. For this reason, despite the overlaps of the three occupations and the fact that many scholars other than Goodwin do conflate them, it may not be methodologically ideal to treat them as if they belonged to a single category of profession. In addition, Goodwin's definition of a prostitute is problematic in that having multiple partners and making a living are not essential parts of the sex trade. Therefore, for the purpose of disambiguating this issue, the current study will solely deal with *yūjo*, whose primary job description is the sex trade, and I will define the sex trade as a sex-reward transaction between: 1) a party who identifies her/himself and is identified by the recipient of the service as the provider of the sexual service; and 2) a party who identifies him/herself and is identified by the provider of the service as the compensator of the service. Unless there is this mutual agreement between the two parties, a sexual encounter between an individual who makes a living as a courtesan and another individual could be a love affair, a rape, or trickery.

Another challenging issue in the field of premodern Japanese history is the social status of courtesans. Goodwin writes:

Scholars fall roughly into two camps: those who see the women as marginalized and exploited, even when they maintained relationships with men of power, and those who argue that they were integrated into society and included women of wealth, power and recognized position. Both camps generally concur that the women's status fell sometime between the mid-Kamakura and early Muromachi ages, but they disagree on timing and particulars.... However, the image of the trade as illicit and the women themselves as transgressors began to affect social policy beginning in

the Kamakura period.... [B]y the thirteenth century negative judgments began to generate action, including restrictions on certain sex-related occupations and limits on the inheritance rights of sexual entertainers.⁹³

While stating that medieval society was particularly concerned with people's relative ranks of birth, Kuroda Toshio cautions us about the complexity, plurality, and fluidity of what is called "status" (*mibun*), which is composed of numerous aspects including socioeconomic class, occupation, ethical or religious status, legal status, and so on.⁹⁴ For Kuroda, the status of *yūjo* was similar to that of peddlers, urban migrants (*toshi yūmin*), an outcast group called *hinin* 非人, (lit. "non-persons") who were believed to possess special powers to cleanse defilement, as well as beggars, who were simultaneously oppressed by society yet exempted from the central ruling system.⁹⁵ Amino Yoshihiko, another influential medievalist, also suggests a close relationship between "non-persons" and courtesans in his book titled *Chūsei no hinin to yūjo* (Non-persons and courtesans in the medieval period).⁹⁶ According to Amino, these two groups are similar in two aspects: First, they are similar in that they played important roles in the sacred realm as sacred beings (*seinaru mono*), since non-persons were believed to have a power to cleanse defilement brought by death, and courtesans shared their heritage with shamanesses; and second, the sacrality of

⁹³ Goodwin, *Songs and Smiles*, p. 4.

⁹⁴ Kuroda Toshio, "Chūsei no mibun-sei to hisen kannen," in *Nihon chūsei no kokka to shūkyō* (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1975), p. 351.

⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, pp. 366-367.

⁹⁶ Amino Yoshihiko, *Chūsei no hinin to yūjo* (Tokyo: Akashi Shoten, 1994).

non-persons and courtesans diminished after the late 16th century and became subject to prejudice and discrimination.⁹⁷

Historians primarily rely on such evidence as civil and criminal laws, court documents, and tax and inheritance records to determine the social standing of courtesans, without taking courtesans' sexuality into account as a token of prestige. Nevertheless, in the areas of art and literature, a courtesan and a non-person (or a peddler, a beggar, and so on) would project completely different images, while a courtesan and a royal priestess, who would have little in common with each other in terms of legal rights and financial standing, would project similar images based on their hyperfemininities. With this in mind, the following sections will survey depictions of courtesans in various narratives and *noh* plays in order to cast a different light on the status—from cultural, ethical, religious, and aesthetic viewpoints—of those women who engaged themselves in the sex trade.

VI. Portrayals of *Yūjo* in Chinese-Style Prose and Vernacular Tales

Among the various Heian courtiers' accounts of courtesans, Ōe no Masafusa's (1041-1111) Chinese-style prose *Yūjoki* (A record of *yūjo*) is the best-known and most detailed. The following summary is composed of unaltered excerpts from Goodwin's translation:

⁹⁷ Ibid. Part I (pp. 25-116) is devoted to non-persons and Part II (pp. 181-231) to female entertainers including *yūjo*, *kugutsu* and *shirabyōshi* dancers.

Heading westward one day's journey down the Uji River from the port of Yodo in Yamashiro, one reaches the place called Kaya. All those who travel back and forth along the San'yō, Sakai, and Nankai highways must follow this route....

Upon reaching Settsu province, one arrives at places such as Kamusaki and Kashima, where gates are lined up and doors are arranged in rows, leaving no place between dwellings. There, female entertainers [*utame* 倡女] have banded together; they pole their skiffs out to meet incoming boats and solicit men to share their beds. Their voices halt the clouds floating through the valleys, and their tones drift with the wind blowing over the water. Passersby cannot help but forget their families. The ripples spray like flowers among the reeds along the shore, and the boats of old fishermen and peddlers line up stem to stern, almost as if there's no water in between.... They are all reincarnations of Kushira [the black cuckoo of India, which has a splendid voice] or Sotoori-hime [a famous beauty who appears in the *Kokin wakashū* preface].... Some men make these women their wives and mistresses and love them until death. Even wise men and princes are not exempt....

The *asobi* skillfully seduce men's hearts, just as in times of old.... [Fujiwara no Michinaga, 966-1027] made love to Shō Kannon...[Fujiwara no Yorimichi, 990-1074] favored Naka no kimi.... People called the *asobi* immortals—these were the most extraordinary events of the age....

Payment for the women's services is known as *danshu*. When it comes time to distribute the earnings, the women lose all sense of shame and become incredibly quarrelsome.... Even though one can read the essay by the scholar Gō [Ōe no Yukitoki], I thought I'd set down some additional details here.⁹⁸

⁹⁸ Goodwin, *Songs and Smiles*, pp. 18-20. For the original text, see *Kodai seiji shakai shisō*, *Nihon shisō taikēi* 8 (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1979), pp. 153-156.

As Goodwin points out, Masafusa, who is deemed to be a patron himself, portrays the *yūjo* as beautiful artists and enchanters, without an indication of harsh critical judgments. Even though he mentions that the women behave inelegantly when it comes to the time to share their rewards, Masafusa's tone of voice by no means suggests contempt for lowly women. Perhaps, such behaviors of the *yūjo* could even come off amusing and charming in the eyes of a nobleman like Masafusa, who rarely catches a glimpse of women's strong emotions at the court. This type of romanticizing accounts of courtesans can be observed in a mid-rank aristocratic lady's diary as well.

As a young girl, the author of *The Sarashina Diary* (eleventh century), simply known as the Daughter of Sugawara no Takasue, once encountered three *yūjo*—one in her fifties, one in her early twenties, and one in her teens—when she was lodging at the foot of Mt. Ashigara. She recalls that “[t]heir hair... was extremely long, hung beautifully over their foreheads; they all had fair complexions and looked attractive enough to serve as waiting-women.”⁹⁹ She continues:

Our party was charmed by their appearance and even more impressed when they started singing, for they had fine, clear voices that rose to the heavens. The women were invited to join us. One member of our group remarked that the singers in the western provinces were no match for these performers, whereupon they burst out into a splendid song, “Should you compare us with those of Naniwa...” Yes, they

⁹⁹ Ivan Morris, trans. *As I Crossed a Bridge of Dreams: Recollections of a Woman in Eleventh-Century Japan* (New York, The Dial Press, 1971), p. 47. For the original text, see SNKBZ 26, p. 287.

were really pretty to look at, and their beautiful singing ended far too soon. We were all so sad to see them disappear in those fearful mountains that we wept as they walked away. I, being young and impressionable, was particularly moved by the scene and, when the time came, did not want to leave the shelter of our hut.¹⁰⁰

Many years later, on another occasion, the author came across a courtesan when she visited Takahama in Izumi Province. Late at night, while traveling on her boat, she heard the sound of oars. Her crew noticed it was a skiff of a courtesan, so they told her to come closer: “By the distant light of the flares I could see the woman standing there in an unlined dress with long sleeves, hiding her face with a fan as she sang for us. It was a very moving night.”¹⁰¹ Much like Masafusa, the Daughter of Takasue praises the courtesan’s alluring beauty and enchanting voice. It is also important to note that the *yūjo* whom she encountered in the mountain had a clear visual marker as courtesans, that is, the very long untied hair. This indicates that they were not afraid of being the target of discrimination or hatred by non-customers while traveling, and that they were not ashamed of their occupation.

On the other hand, an example of slightly critical judgment towards courtesans can be found in a short passage from *The Tale of Genji*. In the “Channel Buoys” chapter, Genji witnessed a group of *yūjo* on a boat on his way to the Sumiyoshi Shrine:

All along the way he enjoyed the pleasures of the journey, to ringing music, but his heart was still with [Lady Akashi] after all. Singing girls crowded to his processions,

¹⁰⁰ Ibid., pp. 47-48. For the original text, see SNKBZ 26, p. 287-288.

¹⁰¹ Ibid., p. 115. For the original text, see SNKBZ 26, p. 352.

and all the young gallants with him, even senior nobles, seemed to look favorably on them, but not Genji, for he thought, Come now, all delight, all true feeling spring from the quality of one's partner, and a little frivolity, even playfully meant, is quite enough to put one off. Their airs and graces served only to turn him away.¹⁰²

Genji, the man who best knows the emptiness of frivolous, fleeting love found the sight of girls soliciting a night's pleasure disagreeable, since he was at this point deeply in love with Lady Akashi. While he knew that his love was far loftier than the one-night affairs that his entourage and the courtesans were going to engage in, his heart was crushed by the fact he had left his pregnant lover behind in the deserted Akashi when he was released from exile.¹⁰³ Therefore, Genji's judgment towards *yūjo* in this scene may not be generalized as his overall attitude towards courtesans or the sex trade. Even if he did frown upon the sex-money exchange, Genji was only critical about the frivolity of prostitution, and he was by no means indicating the women were sinful, immoral, defiled, lewd, or base.

When it comes to the sinfulness of courtesans, *Hōnen Shōnin eden* (Legends of Reverend Hōnen with illustrations) from the early fourteenth century

¹⁰² Tyler, *Genji*, p. 292.

¹⁰³ Lady Akashi had been Genji's sole lover during his two-year exile in Suma and Akashi. When Emperor Suzaku decided to bring Genji back to the capital, the pregnant Akashi had to be left behind. On the day of his pilgrimage to the Sumiyoshi Shrine, Genji learns that Lady Akashi was also on her way to Sumiyoshi, but she felt too discomfited to proceed after seeing the lavish boats of Genji and his entourage.

is well known. It describes an account of Hōnen's (1133-1212; the founder of Pure Land Buddhism) encounter with a *yūjo*:

When Hōnen arrived at the Muro station in Harima province, his boat was approached by a *yūjo* riding a skiff.¹⁰⁴ She said, "I came to have an audience with the renowned Reverend Hōnen. Out of all the means of making a living, how was I born into this sinful profession? This must be a karmic retribution for the sins I committed in my previous life. Is there a way to salvation?" Hōnen replied, "Indeed, making a living as you do accumulates sin, and I can hardly imagine what great karmic retribution awaits you. If you can afford to abandon your occupation, I would urge you to do so. However, if your faith is not strong enough to starve yourself, just invoke the holy name of Amida Buddha. Amida made a vow to save all sinners like yourself, so if you entrust yourself in his vow, you shall be reborn in the Pure Land." The *yūjo* cried tears of bliss. The reverend Hōnen told others that she would attain rebirth in the Pure Land. Some time later, when the priest was passing by Muro again, he asked the people about the courtesan he had met. The villagers told him that she secluded herself in a mountain village to devote herself to the *nenbutsu*, and soon after she was reborn in the Pure Land.¹⁰⁵

Goodwin uses this and a very similar story included in Kamo no Chōmei's (1153?-1216) *Hosshinshū* (A Collection of religious awakenings) as examples of Buddhist tales that "point specifically to *asobi* as prostitutes, portraying them as

¹⁰⁴ Although the text mentions only one courtesan, the accompanying picture illustrates three courtesans on a skiff. Also, the picture vividly depicts the faces of delighted laymen on Hōnen's boat, much like Genji's entourage, but the text does not mention anyone's reactions except for those of the priest himself.

¹⁰⁵ *Hōnen shōnin eden*, cited in Nakai Shinkō, *Hōnen eden o yomu* (Kyoto: Shibunkaku Shuppan, 2005), pp. 112-113.

obstructions to the religious practice of both monks and laymen. Using terms such as *zaigō omoki mi*, *tsumi fukaki mi*, and *zaigō fukaki mi*—a body burdened with or immersed in sin—the tales depict *asobi* as those whose lives are encumbered by their transgressions.”¹⁰⁶ Although I will come back to this type of *yūjo*’s self-remorse as rhetoric later, for now, suffice it to say that *Hōnen shōnin eden* is as harsh as a depiction of a *yūjo* can be in premodern Japanese literature.

VII. Portrayals of *Yūjo* in Noh Drama

The Tales of the Heike (thirteenth century) is Japan’s paramount and most influential martial epic, centering upon the rise and fall of the Taira during the time of the Genpei War (1180-1185), which is embedded in a larger Buddhist context colored by the laws of impermanence (*mujō*) and karmic retribution (*inga ōhō*). Within the grand-scale narratives that surround struggles among powerful male figures such as Taira no Kiyomori (1118-1181), Retired Emperor Go-Shirakawa (1127-1192; r. 1155-1158), and Minamoto no Yoritomo (1147-1199), a few female characters strike the reader with lasting impressions, as Elizabeth Oyler writes:

Many of the *Heike monogatari*’s 平家物語 most complex and important roles are filled by female characters. They represent the home that is abandoned as men leave for war, and their stories of loss and longing are among the tale’s most moving. Yet because they are the ones who remain to tell the tales, to pray for the dead, and to

¹⁰⁶ Goodwin, *Songs and Smiles*, p. 115.

make sense of a world that has been turned upside down by war, they also are entrusted with the vital task of turning event into history.¹⁰⁷

One such memorable female character is Senju no mae, a beautiful daughter of a brothel keeper and courtesan, who appears in the eponymous chapter of the Kakuichi-bon variant. Minamoto no Yoritomo sent her to a captured foe, Taira no Shigehira (1156-1185; the youngest son of Kiyomori), so that he would be able to spend the last few days of his life as pleasantly as possible. Yoritomo entrusted Shigehira to the care of an officer of the second rank, Kanō Munemochi of Izu Province. Munemochi gently looked after the general by having a bath prepared and Senju—“a white-skinned, graceful, pretty lady-in-waiting about twenty years old, wearing a figured bath apron over a tie-dyed singlet”—attended him while he bathed.¹⁰⁸ Later that night, Senju, Shigehira, and Munemochi enjoyed themselves by pouring saké for one other and playing music. In contrast to his reputation as a grave sinner who had burned down the Nara temples, Shigehira’s musical talents, wit, and elegant demeanor deeply moved Senju and everyone else present. Shigehira, as well, thought to himself about Senju, “It is a pleasant surprise to discover such refinement in the eastland.”¹⁰⁹ The man and woman shared a strong attraction for each other, but without exchanging a vow, they said farewell. Upon hearing

¹⁰⁷ Elizabeth Oyler, “Giō: Women and Performance in *the Heike monogatari*,” *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies*, Vol. 64, No. 2 (2004), p. 341.

¹⁰⁸ Helen Craig McCullough, trans. *The Tale of the Heike* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1988), p. 339.

¹⁰⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 340.

of Shigehira's execution, Senju became a nun in order to pray for his salvation until her own death. When her time finally came, she was said to have been reborn in the Pure Land.

In the tradition of Heian and medieval Japanese literature, physical beauty, cultural sophistication, and attaining rebirth in the Pure Land (*ōjō* 往生) are the three greatest qualities to have, especially for women, and those who possess all three can be deemed exceptionally exquisite characters.¹¹⁰ Within *The Tale of the Heike*, the heroine of “the Initiates’ Book,” the imperial consort Kenrenmon-in,

¹¹⁰ Heian and medieval literary figures known for their superb physical beauty and elegance include Narihira in the *Ise*, Genji, Sagoromo, and Minamoto no Yoshitsune in the *Gikeiki*, though none of them are depicted as having been reborn in the Pure Land (some medieval legends depict Narihira as a bodhisattva of song and dance, however). Also, according to my survey of four anthologies of *ōjō* stories, namely, *Nihon ōjō gokuraku-ki* (A record of Japan's stories on *ōjō* and the Pure Land, compiled by Yoshishige no Yasutane, 985-987), *Zoku honchō ōjō-den* (Legends of *ōjō* in Japan, continued, compiled by Ōe no Masafusa, 1101-02), *Honchō shinsen-den* (Legends of saints of Japan, compiled by Ōe no Masafusa, early twelfth century), and *Shūi ōjō-den* (Gleanings of *ōjō* legends, compiled by Miyoshi Tameyasu, early twelfth century), which are all included in Inoue Mitsusada and Ōsone Shōsuke, eds., *Ōjō-den/Hokke genki, Nihon shisō taikai* 7 (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1974), a reference to the physical attractiveness of *ōjō* achievers (of whom the vast majority are male) is extremely rare. Out of the 203 individuals who appear in these four anthologies combined (of whom 20 are female), only Monk Ryōhan and a woman from Nara (*Nara no miyako no onna*) are described as “good-looking” (*yōgi tanjō*, p. 241, and *gyōmō tanjō*, p. 347, respectively). Other than these two, a young boy who achieved *ōjō* is said to look beautiful (*yōgan birei*, p. 378) when he appeared in his mother's dream. In contrast, references to the physiognomy of brilliance for the individuals attaining *ōjō* are very common (for example, p. 236).

and four female entertainers, namely, Senju and the three *shirabyōshi* dancers in the “Giō” chapter (Giō, Ginyo, and Hotoke) possess these qualities. Moreover, the lives of Kenrenmon-in, Giō and Hotoke, and Senju were all adapted into noh plays, which indicates that these female characters were held in high esteem in terms of their elegance and aesthetics during the medieval period.¹¹¹

The noh play *Senju* (also *Senju Shigehira*) by the master playwright Komparu Zenchiku (1405-?) is based on the modest farewell banquet before Shigehira’s beheading in Nara, and the only characters appearing on stage are Munemochi (*waki*), Shigehira (*tsure*), and Senju (*shite*).¹¹² Unlike the original passages from *the Heike*, the narration delivered by the *waki* indicates that Shigehira and Senju have become acquainted on the previous night, which probably means that they have already become lovers.¹¹³ Yet, Shigehira at first refuses to see Senju again, perhaps because falling more deeply in love would

¹¹¹ Kenreimon-in is the *shite* of the noh play *Ohara gokō* (attributed to Komparu Zenchiku). For the original text, see SNKBZ 58, pp. 420-434. For an English translation, see Chifumi Shimazaki, trans., *The Noh Volume III: Woman Noh* (Tokyo: Hinoki Shoten, 1981), pp. 150-197. Hotoke is the *shite*, Giō is the *waki* of the play *Giō* (also *Futari Giō*, author unknown). For the original text, see *Yōkyoku taikan 2* (Tokyō, Meiji Shoin, 1930, 1982), pp. 857-868. Susan Matisoff’s English translation will be included in Elizabeth Oyler and Michael Watson, eds., *Translations and Transformations: The ‘Heike Monogatari’ in Noh* (Ithaca, East Asia Program, Cornell University, forthcoming).

¹¹² For the original text, see Itō Masayoshi, ed., *Yōkyoku-shū*, chū, *Shinchō Nihon koten shūsei* (Tokyo: Shinchōsha, 1986), pp. 241-249. For English translation, see Chifumi Shimazaki, trans., *The Noh Volume III: Woman Noh* (Tokyo: Hinoki Shoten, 1981), pp. 63-99.

¹¹³ “Yesterday [Yoritomo] even sent Senju-no-mae to [Shigehira]” (Shimazaki, p. 74).

make their parting even more difficult. Despite the man's reluctance to see her, Senju insists that it is Yoritomo's order and enters with her *biwa* and *koto*. Shigehira asks her if Yoritomo has approved of his wish to take holy vows, but she has no choice but to deliver the disappointing news. The devastated Shigehira expresses his penitence for the grave sin of burning the Nara temples, while attributing this action of his to karma from the previous life. Then Munemochi suggests they console each other by drinking saké. Senju pours saké for Shigehira, then sings and dances, during which the chorus sings of Shigehira's capture and his imminent end. As Senju dances, Shigehira picks up the *biwa* and starts playing. The two lovers enjoy their last moments together with music and dance until the dawn breaks, when Shigehira is escorted out by warriors. Senju is left on stage weeping sorrowfully.

In regards to this noh play, Paul Atkins discusses how Senju's internal beauty is constructed:

It is no accident that Senju should be endowed so deeply with the virtue of compassion, for her namesake is the Senju Kannon (Sahasrabhuja), a thousand-armed manifestation of Avalokiteśvara, the Buddhist bodhisattva of compassion, typically depicted in female form. Her task is a mission of mercy, in which she is successful, as she manages to help Shigehira find some peace before his death.... Zenchiku emphasizes Senju's namesake in the phrase "Senju's blossoming sleeves" (*hana sakul Senju no sode*); with her especial insistence on the common belief that even a chance encounter between two people—such as scooping water from the same stream, or resting under the shade of the same tree—are karmic links to future

lives, perhaps she is hinting that her brief and sad affair with Shigehira will bring him spiritual benefits in the life to come.¹¹⁴

In addition to Senju, another courtesan from *the Heike* inspired the creation of a noh play. Although her *ōjō* is not mentioned neither in *the Heike* nor in the play, Yuya—the *shite* of the self-titled noh play—is also an idealized female figure associated with Buddhist piety, physical beauty, and cultural sophistication represented by her talent in dance and *waka* poetry.¹¹⁵ The play deals with the reluctance of the great warrior Taira no Munemori (1147-1185) to allow his concubine Yuya, the madam of a brothel in Ikeda (in current Shizuoka Prefecture) to return to her home to see her dying mother. Yuya begs Munemori, reading aloud the letter that her mother just sent to her, but he forces her to go out to Kiyomizu Temple for cherry blossom viewing. Cherry blossoms at their peak symbolize impending decline, which is suggestive of Munemori's life in this time of great political instability, the life of Yuya's mother, and possibly Munemori and Yuya's fading love affair. On her way to the flower-viewing party, Yuya earnestly prays for Kannon to protect her mother, and at the Dharma Hall of Kiyomizu Temple, she continues to pray to the Buddha. However, once the party

¹¹⁴ Paul S. Atkins, *Revealed Identity: The Noh Plays of Komparu Zenchiku* (Ann Arbor: Center for Japanese Studies, University of Michigan, 2006), p. 183.

¹¹⁵ For the original text, see SNKBZ 58, pp. 405-419. For an English translation, see Shimazaki, trans., *Woman Noh*, pp. 101-147. In the Kakuichi variant of the *Heike*, the courtesan's name is actually Jijū, and Yuya is her mother's name. Also, rather than being a full-fledged character like Senju, Jijū is someone whose name is simply mentioned in passing in the "Journey Down the Eastern Sea Road" (*Kaidō kudari*) chapter (See McCullough, *Heike*, p. 336).

has begun, Munemori brings her out and makes her dance for everyone. She wipes her tears and dances, as her heart is being crushed thinking about her dying mother, which makes her dance all the more graceful. During her dance, it starts to rain, so she stops dancing and writes down a poem she has just composed on a strip of paper:

<i>Ika ni sen</i>	What am I to do?
<i>miyako no haru mo</i>	The Capital now in spring
<i>oshikeredo</i>	I'm loath to leave, yet,
<i>nareshi azuma no</i>	the long-familiar East's
<i>hana ya chiruran</i>	flower may pass away ¹¹⁶

Deeply moved by this poem, Munemori permits his lover to leave the capital.

Senju and Yuya make a great contrast in several ways. Most obviously, Yuya's compassion is solely directed towards her mother in the faraway eastern country. There is no apprehension for Yuya to have to leave Munemori for an extended time. This hints that her love for Munemori may have faded into an obligation in exchange for the financial security he provides, to the extent that some scholars argue that the letter from the mother was actually sent by Yuya's true love in Ikeda.¹¹⁷ Furthermore, compared to Senju, the delicate heroine of a tragic love story, Yuya projects a shrewder image, being a businesswoman who has a responsibility to take care of her mother, and having a wit to quickly compose a *waka* poem to persuade Munemori into giving her what she wants.

¹¹⁶ Shimazaki, *Woman Noh*, p. 144.

¹¹⁷ Himeno Atsuko, "Yuya," in *Nō tte nani?*, ed., Matsuoka Shimpei (Tokyo: Shinshokan, 2000), p. 152.

Hanjo, on the other hand, is a happy-ending love story between a *yūjo* and an aristocrat, written by Zeami Motokiyo (1363?-1443?).¹¹⁸ The heroine is a young woman named Hanago from a house of pleasure in Nogami. The name Hanjo is the Japanese pronunciation of Consort Ban (or Ban Jieyu), a former concubine of Emperor Cheng of the Western Han dynasty and renowned poet, as recorded in *the History of the Early Han Dynasty* (206 B. C.-24 A. D.). She was known for a poem in which she compared herself to a fan in the autumn, something to be discarded when no longer desired. Hanago was given a nickname after Consort Ban, because after meeting a traveling courtier known as Lesser Captain Yoshida, who happened to have dropped by the house of pleasure on his way back to the capital on a spring day, she refused to entertain her other patrons and spent months just staring at his fan. Having been dismissed by the madam of the brothel, she mourned over her misfortune:

O the world does play us false,
 and always will; yet many sorrows
 break her days' swift flow—she whom fate
 bends to be a woman of the stream
 Now I go wandering,
 knowing nothing of what lies ahead;
 robe wet with weeping¹¹⁹

¹¹⁸ For the original text, see SNKBZ 59, pp. 78-90. For an English translation, see Royall Tyler, trans., *Japanese Nō Dramas* (London, Penguin Books, 1992, 2004), pp. 108-119.

¹¹⁹ Tyler, *Nō Dramas*, p. 111.

Lesser Captain Yoshida returned to Nogami, but no one knew where Hanago had gone. Without knowing this, she traveled to the capital as she entertained people as a *monogurui* (“deranged dancer”). The season is autumn (*aki*, which is homophonous with “satiety”) and Yoshida’s promise of returning before the end of summer maddened her:

He was untrue, who took my love with him.

Now day follows day, the months wheel around,

while wearily I listen to the wind,

for no one else will speak to me of him....

O Gods, O blessed Buddhas, pity me!

O bring to pass what I so desire!¹²⁰

While continuously expressing her grudge against her lover and praying for a reunion, she ran into the entourage of Yoshida at the precinct of the Shimogamo Shrine. Hanago’s long-lost lover recognized the fan that the deranged entertainer was holding in her hand from inside the palanquin. In the end, they showed their fans to each other and became overjoyed at their reunion.

The heroine of *Hanjo* is different from Senju and Yuya in that she is not necessarily depicted as a woman of elegance or a devout follower of the Buddha. Rather, her virtue is the innocence to trust a man’s words and great loyalty for him, for which she loses a place to stay and almost endangers her well-being. Had Yoshida not been faithful to Hanago as well, this noh drama could have been gone in a very different direction, possibly the theme comparable to the origin story of *Dōjōji* or *Kanawa*, stories in which a woman-turned-demon kills or

¹²⁰ Ibid., p. 113.

attempts to kill the man she desperately loves. Fortunately for the couple, their love was mutual and truthful, and thus Hanago's prestige is expected to shift from the "covert" to the "overt" one as a wife of a courtier.

Out of all the noh plays whose *shite* is a courtesan, however, *Eguchi* is the most famous and has been best studied by scholars.¹²¹ Attributed to the founding father of noh theater, Kan'ami (1333-1384), and his son Zeami, *Eguchi* has attracted interest among scholars due to its ending, in which the ghost of a legendary courtesan named Lady Eguchi reveals her true self as the bodhisattva Fugen (Sk. Samantabhadra) and flies into the Western Paradise. In the past, quite a few scholars regarded this juxtaposition of a courtesan and a bodhisattva as a great paradox, presumably based on their modern, patriarchal interpretation of prostitution, and consequently offered elaborate hypotheses to explicate the "enigma." Nevertheless, by shifting our perspective towards the covert prestige that courtesans possess, Lady Eguchi can be best understood as a culturally, religiously, and aesthetically idealized figure, rather than a union of the sacred and defiled.

Such idealization of the heroine can already be observed in the two source stories of *Eguchi*. The first story is based upon a poetic exchange between Lady Eguchi and the prominent monk-poet Saigyō (1118-1190), included in *Senjūshō* (Anecdote anthology; mid-thirteenth century), *Shin kokin wakashū* (ca. 1205), and *Sankashū* (Collection of a mountain hermitage; n.d.).

¹²¹ For the original text, see SNKBZ 58, pp. 273-285. For an English translation, see Tyler, trans., *Nō Dramas*, pp. 68-81.

Caught in a shower at a strange town called Eguchi, Saigyō asked the mistress of a nearby brothel (Lady Eguchi) for a temporary shelter. When she declined the request, he admonished the woman's stinginess in the form of a poem:

<i>Yo no naka o</i>	To scorn the world
<i>itou made koso</i>	and all its ways:
<i>katakaramae</i>	<i>that</i> is hard— but you,
<i>kari no yadori o</i>	the least moment's refuge
<i>oshimu kimi kana</i>	you cling to as your own! ¹²²

However, the madam surprised the great master of poetry by composing a witty reply that precisely pointed out Saigyō's shortcoming—his attachment to temporary shelter at a house of pleasure:

<i>Yo o itou</i>	You are one, I hear,
<i>hito to shi kikeba</i>	who scorns the world,
<i>kari no yado ni</i>	and my sole care
<i>kokoro tomu na to</i>	is to say: Set not your heart
<i>omou bakari zo</i>	upon a moment's refuge. ¹²³

In the noh play *Eguchi*, a traveling monk visits the grave of Lady Eguchi on the way to Tennōji. As he recites the above poem by Saigyō, a village woman appears from nowhere and asks him why he has failed to recite Lady Eguchi's poem in response to Saigyō. Puzzled, the monk recites the courtesan's poem as well. Then, the village woman laments that she had been mistaken for a penny pincher, although her true intention was to protect the reputation of the holy man.

¹²² Tyler, *Nō Dramas*, p. 72; SNKBZ 58, p. 275.

¹²³ Ibid., p. 277.

When the monk asks for her identity, she answers, “I am the ghost of Lady Eguchi,” and vanishes. In the second act, the ghost reappears accompanied by two other *yūjo* on a pleasure boat, bemoans her sorrowful life as a courtesan, and dances. Meanwhile, her forlorn words transform into a Buddhist sermon, reminding the monk of the ephemeral nature of this world. In the end, she manifests her true form as Fugen on a white elephant and departs for her home in the Western Paradise.

In the second source story of *Eguchi*, included in a few Buddhist tale anthologies including *Kojidan* (Tales about old matters; 1212-1215) and *Jikkinshō* (A collection of ten maxims; 1252), the renowned holy man Shōkū (910-1007) prays for a chance to behold the living body of the bodhisattva Fugen. One day, he received an oracle in his sleep, which instructed him to visit the *chōja* (the “chief courtesan”) of Kanzaki.¹²⁴ At the dwelling of the women, a party was being held. Shōkū became enchanted by the utter exquisiteness of the *chōja*’s *imayō* songs and dances.¹²⁵ Miraculously, whenever he closed his eyes and clasped his hands in prayer, he had a vision of Fugen reciting holy scriptures. After having venerated the bodhisattva many times, the monk decided to head back home. To his surprise, the *chōja* followed him to the road

¹²⁴ The term *chōja* as in *shuku no chōja* means “a madam of a brothel,” as Yuya is, but in this case, the title refers to a leader of courtesans living in the same area. See Imanishi Hajime, *Yūjo no shakaishi: Shimabara, Yoshiwara no rekishi kara shokuminchi ‘kōshō-sei’ made* (Tokyo: Yūshisha, 2007), pp. 31-32.

¹²⁵ *Imayō* or *imayō uta* (“modern-style songs”) is a genre of songs composed of seven and five syllables, commonly sung by female entertainers.

and said to him, “Don’t tell anyone about this,” and suddenly died while a magnificent aroma filled the air.

Having interwoven these two intriguing legends, *Eguchi* was created and still enjoys great popularity today. While no one questions its artistic achievement, in the past few decades, this drama has been attracting much attention from non-noh specialists who are interested in the notion of so-called “sacred sexuality” or *sei naru sei*.

This association of sex and religion within Japanese academia goes back at least to 1913-14, when the founding father of folklore in Japan, Yanagita Kunio (1875-1962), wrote an essay titled “Fujokō” (Thoughts on shamanesses). In this essay, Yanagita hypothesized the origin of Japanese prostitutes to be shamanesses. Today, the juxtaposition of a shamaness and a prostitute is so common in Japanese academia to the extent that it is a cliché. For instance, Suzuka Chiyono contrasts two legendary beauties, Tegona and Tamana, about whom Takahashi no Mushimaro (early eighth century) composed *waka* poems, as “a shamaness-like woman” (*miko-teki josei*) and a woman who was “acting lewdly” (*midara-ni furumatte*).

Women as human beings (*ningen to shite no onna*) possess both *miko-sei* (“shamaness-ness”) and *yūjo-sei* (“courtesan-ness”) in their essence, and they live their lives by going back and forth between the two qualities. However, ordinary women can never live such extreme lives as Tegona and Tamana [the two legendary women] did. Tegona killed herself to devote her life to a god, while Tamana devoted her body to all men. They are like the two Marys in the Holy Bible—the Mary who became pregnant with the Holy Spirit and the Mary who was a prostitute—they are

both depicted as sacred women. They must have been believed to be sacred, because ordinary women could not live like either of them.¹²⁶

Other scholars who assume the sacred nature of prostitution in premodern Japan include Saeki (1987), Ōwa (1993), Amino (1994), Abe (1998), and Faure (2003).¹²⁷ Among them, Saeki, Abe, and Faure mention *Eguchi* in their writings as evidence to support their arguments.

In her influential book *Yūjo no bunka-shi: hare no onna-tachi* (The cultural history of courtesans: Women of the sacred realm), Saeki assumes the sacred nature of women across time and place, from ancient Babylonian mythology and *Nihon shoki* to *Eguchi* and the seventeenth century puppet play *The Love Suicides at Sonezaki*. She refers to *yūjo* as “women who have constantly shouldered the marginalized, extraordinary parts within cultural history,” and “women who were both lowly and sacred.”¹²⁸ Her empathy for historical *yūjo* and motivation to elevate the status of *yūjo* through their role in enriching performance arts can be observed throughout this book, although she states in the epilogue that justifying prostitution solely based on the women’s artistic

¹²⁶ Suzuka Chiyono, “Yūjo gensō,” in *Onna to otoko no jikū: Nihon josei-shi saikō 3* (*Onna to otoko no tanjō: Kodai kara chūsei e*), eds. Itō Seiko and Kōno Nobuko (Tokyo: Fujiwara Shoten, 2000), pp. 66-68.

¹²⁷ Saeki, *Yūjo no bunka-shi* (aforementioned); Ōwa Iwao, *Asobime to tennō* (Tokyo: Hakusuisha, 1993); Amino, *Hinin to yūjo* (aforementioned); Abe Yasurō, *Yuya no kōgō: Chūsei no sei to seinaru mono* (Nagoya: Nagoya Daigaku Shuppankai, 1998); and Bernard Faure, *The Red Thread: Buddhist Approaches to Sexuality* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998).

¹²⁸ Saeki, *Yūjo*, p. 241.

contributions is “a notion born out of modern prejudice and hypocrisy.”¹²⁹ She also labels *yūjo* as victims of a “cruel life” (*zankoku na seikatsu*) and condemns the fact that their “misfortune has been aestheticized and appreciated” within Japanese literature.¹³⁰ In addition, in the epilogue of her book, Saeki states that she has no intention to glorify contemporary prostitution:

To avoid the possibility of any misunderstandings, [I should state that] I neither wrote this book to advocate that we should revive the sacredness of sexuality of the old times today, nor am I a believer of sex religion [*seishūkyō*]. Such a sensibility belongs to our past and we live in a very different time in the continuum of cultural history. Knowing that [such a sensibility] is alien [to contemporary Japanese people], I was compelled to accurately reconstruct the mindset [*kokoro no arikata*] of the real people who once lived.”¹³¹

In response to Saeki and to Abe Yasurō’s *Yuya no kogō* (The empress of the bathhouse), the literary critic Koyano Atsushi pointedly problematizes the notion of “sacred prostitution” for its lack of sound historical evidence as well as the accumulation of scholarly literature built upon such a fragile foundation.¹³² According to Koyano, this genre of scholarly work has been heavily influenced by Western scholarship of the so-called “sacred prostitution” of the ancient world

¹²⁹ Ibid., pp. 242-243.

¹³⁰ Ibid., pp. 242-243.

¹³¹ Ibid., p. 244.

¹³² Koyano Atsushi, *Nihon baishun-shi: yūgyō nyofu kara sōpurando made* (Tokyo: Shinchōsha, 2007).

(Middle East and Europe).¹³³ He questions the legitimacy of such a universalization of the phenomenon and suggests that the amalgamation of sexuality and sacredness is an illusion that modern Japanese intellectuals endorsed without rigorous analyses. He attributes the rationale for this blind endorsement to historical incidents in which Western intellectuals (e.g., the German archeologist Heinrich Schliemann) who visited Meiji Japan expressed astonishment at the fact that prostitution was not regarded as a grave sin in Japan, and Japanese intellectuals felt the need for justifying their custom. To further affirm this point, in regard to Saeki and others who equate shamanesses and prostitutes, Goodwin states:

All of these theories are intriguing, and none can be disproved; but I think they are based on inconclusive evidence and colored by modern evaluations of the sexual nature of female shamans... I have found no direct evidence that female shamans as a group may be categorized as sexual professionals, and the circumstantial evidence that does exist is open to interpretation.... I know of no delighted patrons' recollections of sexual adventures with shaman-prostitutes, no complaints about shamans peddling sex, no stories of repentant shamans abandoning a life of prostitution and seeking the Buddha's mercy—all common features found in accounts of *asobi*.¹³⁴

¹³³ The historian Stephanie L. Budin has recently published *The Myth of Sacred Prostitution in Antiquity* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008). The main point of this book is clearly spelled out in the very beginning of the introduction: "Sacred prostitution never existed in the ancient Near East or Mediterranean" (p. 1).

¹³⁴ Goodwin, *Songs and Smiles*, pp. 90-91.

Koyano also criticizes Abe's methodology for its lack of rigorous scholarly analysis. That is to say, Abe's main conclusion of Chapter 1 is that female sexuality is paradoxical for its capacity to be defiled and sacred simultaneously, which he repeats in Chapter 3 by saying the sexuality of the female entertainers in noh plays, including Lady Eguchi, is paradoxical. This exhibits redundancy in Abe's argument, Koyano points out, because female entertainers should be included in the category of female. Tanaka Takako also criticizes Abe in her review of *Yuya no kōgō* because he never defines the term "sacredness" and says that his numerous examples are only there to support the same conclusion, namely, the simultaneity of sacredness and defilement in a range of people who lived in medieval Japan.¹³⁵

As convincing and persuasive as Koyano's criticism may be, his motivation to condemn Saeki and Abe's efforts to elevate the status of marginalized women seems to be instead degrading women engaged in the sex trade throughout history. In the very end of his book, he states that "it is insincere to glorify the past while ignoring prostitution as an occupation that still exists in our country,"¹³⁶ and what he means by being "sincere" is represented by his following statement:

¹³⁵ Tanaka Takako, "Shohyō: Abe Yasurō cho, *Yuya no kōgō*," *Setsuwa bungaku kenkyū* 34 (1999), p. 179.

¹³⁶ Koyano, *Baishun-shi*, p. 208.

When it comes to hard-core (*honkakuteki-na*) prostitution such as the “soap land,”¹³⁷ many of the women have mild mental disability (*karui chiteki shōgai*).... [I]t is not too much to assume that sex workers have slightly lower IQ’s [than the general population]. At any rate, the majority of the sex workers are females who are high school dropouts and the like [*kōkō chūtai reberu no onna*]. But, those with physical attractiveness and a good personality may marry their clients.¹³⁸

A statement of this sort is reminiscent of the early nineteenth-century “science” on prostitutes developed in Europe. The historian Sander L. Gilman introduces several examples of such studies conducted to “prove” that French, German, Italian, and Russian prostitutes exhibited peculiar physical characteristics and hence were different from “normal” women.¹³⁹ For instance, Pauline Tarnowsky, a St. Petersburg physician in the late nineteenth century, investigated the physiognomy of prostitutes, and characterized them as tending to be obese and having certain color hair and eyes, a certain skull size, asymmetrical faces, and misshapen noses and ears, among other things.¹⁴⁰ The difference between Tarnowsky and Koyano is that the latter does not even attempt to show any statistical evidence to support his claims. At any rate, Saeki’s generalization of all *yūjo* as victims, Abe’s labeling courtesans as mysterious beings that are simultaneously lowly and holy, and Koyama’s claim

¹³⁷ A semi-legal facility where women provide various services including washing the clients’ bodies in the bathroom and having sexual intercourse with them.

¹³⁸ Koyano, *Baishun-shi*, p. 202.

¹³⁹ Sander L. Gilman, *Difference and Pathology: Stereotypes of Sexuality, Race, and Madness* (Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1985), pp. 94-101.

¹⁴⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 95.

that contemporary sex workers tend to be mentally handicapped are all examples of stereotypes, which, as Gilman aptly states, all people create for things they fear (or glorify).¹⁴¹

On the other hand, the analyses of *Eguchi* by Michael F. Marra, Terry Kawashima, and Etsuko Terasaki do not seem to be arguing for the “sacred prostitution” hypothesis.¹⁴² However, their works still appear to be approaching the noh play as a great paradox. As a result, their explications are quite intricate and seem improbable at times.

In “The Aesthetics of Impurity: A Theatre of Defilement,” the second chapter of Marra’s book, he compares courtesans to social outcasts based on their ability to cleanse defilement due to their own impurity, most notably as non-persons (*hinin*) whose occupation was closely associated with death (e.g., disposal of corpses) and who were despised for their defilement, yet valued for their power to purify the environment. According to Marra’s hypothesis, inspired by the Japanese anthropologist Yamaguchi Masao’s theory, noh actors (who were considered outcasts themselves) on stage played the roles of outcasts, such as slaves, hunters, fishers, and courtesans, and by doing so they absorbed

¹⁴¹ Ibid., p. 15.

¹⁴² Michael F. Marra, *Representations of Power: The Literary Politics of Medieval Japan* (Honolulu: University of Hawai’i Press, 1993), pp. 92-95; Terry -, *Writing Margins: The Textual Construction of Gender in Heian and Kamakura Japan* (Cambridge: Harvard University Asia Center, 2001), pp. 51-66; and Etsuko Terasaki, *Figures of Desire: Wordplay, Spirit Possession, Fantasy, Madness, and Mourning in Japanese Noh Plays* (Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Center for Japanese Studies, 2002), pp. 263-293.

all the pollution brought to the noh stage by the outcasts (e.g., non-persons, lepers, and beggars) in the audience. He writes:

The Japanese anthropologist Yamaguchi Masao has devised a scheme for the interpretation of *nō* that... provides a thorough explanation of the plays that are most closely related to the problem of outcasts' defilement. The actor/character shelters the positive elements of society—such as centers of power, normality, organized settlements, the law, and the capital—from the negative factors—margins of power, abnormality, vagrancy, liminality, and the countryside—that challenge social stability.... Because of the alleged ability of actors to free the community from “evil,” troupes of outcasts were invited, put on stage, and then discarded after the “other” had been completely absorbed by the performers who, like “dolls of pollution” were then floated down the river to their new location, a temple or a neighboring village.¹⁴³

Marra explains that the noh actors took up the role of surrogate dolls on stage in order to secure endorsements from Buddhist institutions as well as from military elites. He goes on to say that the process of subduing the defiled courtesans “required Buddhist thinkers to do more than simply exorcise a member of the [outcasts] or stage/represent a courtesan as a scapegoat to be sacrificed for the safety of the community.” That is to say, “they challenged and assimilated non-Buddhist popular beliefs involving the cults of female shamans” in addition to “restoring the courtesan to the dignity of respected society by transforming her into a symbol of enlightenment.”¹⁴⁴ His interpretations of the two original stories of *Eguchi* illustrate his point. Regarding the encounter between Saigyō and Lady Eguchi, Marra states:

¹⁴³ Marra, *Aesthetics of Impurity*, p. 77.

¹⁴⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 88.

In the fictional version of the *Senjūshō*, the exchange [of poems] is followed by the woman's confession of repentance that makes possible her awakening to the Buddhist truth of impermanence as well as to the final rejection of her profession. The woman is transformed from a courtesan to a religious guide who helps monk Saigyō to experience "the seed of enlightenment." Once the pleasant entertainment of paying customers, her songs are now hymns asking the Buddha to shield the community from the impurities of which the courtesan was an example.¹⁴⁵

Furthermore, Marra interprets the ending of the anecdote of Shōkū as follows:

As the shaman, [*Kojidan* and *Senjūshō*] introduced the chief courtesan of Kanzaki whose appearance changes according to Shōkū's state of mind.... The sinful ripples of the sea of Murozumi taking clients to the courtesan's boat are transformed into the waves of the Absolute (*tathatā*) that purify "the wind of the five senses and six cravings" blowing onto the impure world.... The death of the defiled scapegoat [the *chōja*] assures the holy man with a perfect Buddhist realization as well as protecting Shōkū and the common people from the threat of defilement.¹⁴⁶

One noticeable shortcoming of Marra's argument is that, in order to deduce the idea that courtesans were considered defiled by the commoners, he only points to textual evidence that refers to pollution of the female body, which of course is not limited to courtesans but applied to half of the human population.

Namely, he cites a passage from *Mahāratnakūṭa* (The Collections of Jewels):

Like the overflow from a toilet
Or the corpse of a dog
Or that of a fox

¹⁴⁵ Ibid., p. 94.

¹⁴⁶ Ibid., p. 93.

In the Śītavana cemetery
 Pollution is everywhere.
 The evils of desire
 Are contemptible like these.
 Fools
 Lust women [sic]
 Like dogs in heat.¹⁴⁷

Although Marra claims that “[w]ith an increase in the count of pollution following the commercialization of the female body, the nature of the feminine came to be considered no less defiling than the disposal of animals and the consumption of meat,” he does not support this statement with any evidence, textual or otherwise. It appears that Marra’s argument on courtesans’ defilement due to the nature of their occupation (rather than their female sex) is not as strongly substantiated than the case of non-persons, for which he provides an example from *Tengu no sōshi* (A tale of goblins, thirteenth century)—an anecdote about a non-person who actually kills and eats the flesh of a goblin. To this, Marra pointedly states, “[t]he consumption of the *tengu*’s meat by the outcast underlines the contempt with which commoners regarded the people of the riverbanks a mixture of fear and disbelief toward ‘inferior’ species,” although he does not provide equally convincing evidence about the courtesans.¹⁴⁸

¹⁴⁷ Cited by Marra, *ibid.*, p. 88. According to Marra, *Mahāratnakūṭa* is an anthology of Buddhist tales translated into Chinese by Bodhiruci between 706 and 713 (p. 88).

¹⁴⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 64.

It is a well-known fact that Buddhism does teach the eradication of cravings, desire, and worldly attachments, and that sexual desire for women is deemed the greatest obstruction to the majority of the clergy. Therefore, a number of Buddhist scriptures and anecdotes employ misogynistic teachings that are reminiscent of the above quote from *Mahāratnakūṭa* as expedient means for monks and those who contemplate renouncing the world.¹⁴⁹ For the majority of the general population, however, the female body could not have been a serious threat (otherwise the population of Japan would have sharply diminished!). Moreover, with the goal of the Way of Buddha being attainment of enlightenment, women's sexuality can be skillfully utilized in Buddhist soteriology, as long as the action leads the follower to take a step forward to that goal, as one of such examples is included in *Konjaku monogatari* (Tales of times now past; twelfth century). In this tale, the bodhisattva Kokūzō (Sk. Ākāśagarbha) manifests himself as a beautiful young widow and promises to a novice monk that she will become his lover if he eagerly studies the Buddhist teachings for three years on Mt. Hiei.¹⁵⁰

Above all, I want to emphasize the fundamental difference between lustful sex and the sex trade. In fact, the Buddhist literature that cautions the reader against strong attachment to physical pleasure—such as the story of an amorous

¹⁴⁹ See, for example, Chapter 1 of Ōkoshi Aiko and Minamoto Junko, *Kaitai suru Bukkyō: sono sekushuariti-kan to shizen-kan* (Tokyo: Daitō Shuppansha, 1994).

¹⁵⁰ *Konjaku monogatari*, Vol. 17, No. 33, "How a monk of Mt. Hiei has acquired wisdom with help from Kokūzō." See SNKBZ 36, p. 370-382. For an English translation, see Royall Tyler, trans., "The awakening," in *Japanese Tales* (New York, Pantheon Books, 1987), pp. 252-257.

woman who turned into an oily yellow liquid after death¹⁵¹—hardly, if not never, use courtesans as examples of promiscuous women. As I defined earlier, the sex trade is a series of performances between two parties with a mutual understanding about the meanings of the performances. In other words, a sexual act between a courtesan and her patron is mediated by a reward, just as any working people normally trade their labor with compensation, whereas that of a promiscuous individual and her partner is mediated by an attachment to corporeal desire.

In her chapter on courtesans and puppeteers (“Fragmented Margins: The Asobi and Kugutsu”), Terry Kawashima also surveys a number of Buddhist tales that feature female sexual entertainers who, according to her reading, achieve *ōjō* due to their ability to sing *imayō* songs.¹⁵² Among them is the legend of Shōkū, and she concludes that it “attempts to replace the crucial role of *imayō* singing in attaining *ōjō*.”¹⁵³ On the other hand, in regard to the text of *Eguchi*, Kawashima states that it exhibits “uncertainty over the exact reasons why an asobi could achieve *ōjō*,” because “the spirit of an asobi from *Eguchi* expresses remorse over her own sinfulness not only as a woman but particularly as an asobi.”¹⁵⁴

¹⁵¹ *Kokon chomonjū*, No. 330, “How the eldest sister of the secretary monk from Mt. Hiei named Keichō turned into yellow liquid after her death and a fraction of her skull remained due to her lust.” See NKBT 84, pp. 259-260.

¹⁵² See Note 124.

¹⁵³ Kawashima, *Writing Margins*, p. 57.

¹⁵⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 65.

The fact is that neither the *chōja* of Kanzaki nor Lady Eguchi attained rebirth in Pure Land, because they were bodhisattvas in human form, not mortals who achieved *ōjō* by means of Buddhist practice.¹⁵⁵ Therefore, it is more natural to regard these two women along the same lines as other medieval Buddhist tales, such as the abovementioned story about Kokūzō from *Konjaku monogatari*, a similar story from the same anthology with Bishamonten (Sk. Vaiśravaṇa; 17:44), *Chigo Kannon engi* (The origin of Chigo Kannon, early fourteenth century), *Aki no yo no nagamonogatari* (A long tale for an autumn night, fourteenth century), *Onzōshi shimawatari* (Yoshitsune's voyage among the islands, ca. fourteenth century), and others, wherein a bodhisattva descends to this world in human form in order to grant a religious awakening to mortals. In the legend of Shōkū, he has a vision of Fugen because he, a renowned holy man, prayed for it and was given a special privilege in the oracle, not because the *chōja* sang the *imayō*. Also, as many of the bodhisattvas in the above stories do, the *chōja* of Kanzaki returns home to the Pure Land, rather than “achieving” *ōjō*.” When it comes to the noh play *Eguchi*, the courtesan’s action of returning

¹⁵⁵ For the same reason, Marra’s reading of the Shōkū’s legend (“The death of the defile scapegoat [the *chōja*] assures the holy man with a perfect Buddhist realization as well as protecting Shōkū and the common people from the threat of defilement”) cannot be supported by the text.

home is even clearer, because the *shite* literally says, “It is time for me to go back.”¹⁵⁶

Finally, Etsuko Terasaki dedicates an entire chapter of her book to analyzing *Eguchi* (“*Eguchi*: Is Courtesan Eguchi a Buddhist Metaphorical Woman?”) from a feminist perspective. Her position is that Lady Eguchi is a patriarchal construct that reflects the image of the Buddhist ideal woman, despite the appearance that the “metamorphosis of a courtesan into one of the most powerful deities flanking the Buddha seems to celebrate womanhood.”¹⁵⁷ She criticizes scholars who claim that this play has a pro-woman message, as her analysis reveals its manipulation of the legends to create a microcosm in which women are subjugated by the phallocentric structure. At last, a “profound misogyny” underlying this play is demonstrated, when Lady Eguchi “turns into” a male deity, Fugen, in order to attain salvation, much like the well-known episode of the dragon girl in the “Devadatta” chapter of the *Lotus Sutra*.¹⁵⁸

Nonetheless, our textual evidence shows that Lady Eguchi did not “turn into” Fugen, so rather than questioning the playwright’s motivation, we could ask the question of why a male deity chose to appear as a female mortal. Having said that, it is also possible to think that gods and bodhisattvas would transcend such a this-worldly binary as gender, and it may be more worthwhile exploring as to

¹⁵⁶ “*Kore made nariya kaeru tote, sunawachi Fugen bosatsu to araware*” (SNKBZ 58, p. 285).

Royall Tyler’s translation obscures this important point; it reads: “I will leave you now, she cries, revealed as the bodhisattva Fugen” (*Nō Dramas*, p. 81).

¹⁵⁷ Terasaki, *Figures of Desire*, p. 265.

¹⁵⁸ *Ibid.*, pp. 291-292.

why Fugen chose to appear in the form of a courtesan, the type of woman whom many scholars I have encountered consider to be the most sinful.

The textual evidence most frequently used to allege the sinfulness, alterity, and victimhood of *yūjo* is their self-remorse as being born as “bamboo-pliant women” (*kawatake no nagare no onna*) and being born in “immersed in sin” (*zaigō fukaki mi*).¹⁵⁹ Terasaki, too, states while citing a passage from *Eguchi*:

The fate of women is seen as the inevitable result of karma, but the karmic law greatly privileges men: to be born as a man is fortunate, while to be born as a “sinful” woman is particularly unlucky, and to become a courtesan even worse.

Eguchi	Even though we receive human form, a gift one rarely gets,
Chorus	we are reborn as sinful women, and become the misfits of society: we, the courtesans, are like the river bamboo whose fate lies with the stream ¹⁶⁰

Much like other scholars’ claims about the courtesans’ sinfulness, the sinfulness mentioned here seems to be attributed to the female gender. Furthermore, Terasaki’s claim that becoming a courtesan is particularly unfortunate may not be especially compelling considering the fact that the *noh* dramas tend to shed light on the dark and pathetic side of humanity (while *kyōgen* plays focus on the

¹⁵⁹ The first phrase appears in *Hanjo* (SNKBZ 59, p. 81), while both phrases appear in *Eguchi* (SNKBZ 58, p. 283). Also, as previously mentioned, the *yūjo* who appears in *Hōnen shōnin eden* calls herself “sinful,” (cited in Nakai Shinkō, *Hōnen eden*, p. 112).

¹⁶⁰ *Ibid.*, p. 284.

comical side of humanity), and the main character's grieving over his or her status quo is highly conventionalized and observable in the majority of plays. In fact, all of the four female *shite* discussed in this chapter—Senju, Hanago, Yuya, and Lady Eguchi—lament their status quo at some point in the plays.

Nevertheless, the magnitude of their forlornness is not any greater than other *shite* of noh plays, such as the woman who turns herself into a demon to kill her ex-husband and his new wife (*Kanawa*), a deranged mother who traveled from the capital to the eastern province in order to find her kidnapped son only to find out he is dead (*The Sumida River*), the ghost of an old man who killed himself after being cruelly rejected by a court lady (*The Damask Drum*), the ghost of Lady Rokujō, who cannot attain salvation (*Lady Aoi*), and many more.

Interestingly, none of the courtesans in the noh dramas seem to be afraid to be cast down to hell, while this happened to so many *shite* of noh plays: fishermen (*The Cormorant-Fisher*, *Akogi*), a hunter (*Birds of Sorrow*), the author of *The Tale of Genji* (*A memorial service for Genji*), a *shirabyōshi* dancer (*Higaki*), an ordinary wife who died while longing for her husband in the capital (*The Fulling Block*), a woman who drowned herself in the Ikuta River for not being able to choose who to marry (*The Sought-for Grave*), among others.

Another point that needs to be addressed about the tragic image engendered by courtesans is that appealing to the clients' compassion is a part of entertainers' art. Giving their patrons the impression that they are in need of their mercy, whether it is true or not, makes the business work, because the men feel that their action is validated sentimentally and morally, whereas giving a

client an impression that the business is thriving and an optimistic appearance could damage their business.

We have seen above the challenge of analyzing the *shite* of *Eguchi* within the previous academic research. If in fact the sex trade were labeled as a exploitation of female sexuality, a necessary evil in a life-or-death situation, or the immoral deed of loose women in the majority of the texts surveyed (which would strongly indicate negative perception towards prostitution within mainstream society), the juxtaposition of Bodhisattva Fugen and a courtesan would have to be a product of subversion or contradiction. On the other hand, when positive literary depictions of courtesans are analyzed in the light of covert prestige, Lady Eguchi is best understood as an ultimate idealization of a woman: the union of the ultimate goodness (a deity) and the covert side of hyperfemininity. While Goodwin suggests that the choice of a transgressive figure like a courtesan as the avatar of a bodhisattva emphasizes the “conquest of female sexuality” by the supremacy of Buddhism, and the same effect could not have been with “an ordinary wife or daughter,”¹⁶¹ I would like to add aesthetic appeal to the recipients of the legend and the *noh* play to the motivation. If an emphasis on the omnipotence of Buddha had been the priority, a combination of a deity and a member of more socially stigmatized class, such as a non-person, would have been even more effective. The legend of Shōkū was cherished by generations of people and adapted into the play because of its superb storyline, message, and

¹⁶¹ Goodwin, *Songs and Smiles*, p. 115.

the exquisite image of an alluring lady revealing her true identity as Fugen, the bodhisattva of wisdom.

Finally, in order to further understand the aesthetics of *yūjo*, especially Lady Eguchi, the Japanese philosopher Kuki Shūzō's (1888-1941) theory of *iki* is a useful framework. First published in 1930, *Iki no kōzō* (*The structure of Iki*) attempted to scrutinize the intrinsic structure of *iki*, an aesthetic sensibility possessed especially by courtesans, which Kuki assumes to be a uniquely Japanese cultural construct.¹⁶² Although it is impossible to claim today that *iki* is a concept that can be only shared and understood by the Japanese, we need to recognize his efforts to concretely analyze the aesthetic appeal of *yūjo* without simply attributing it to their beauty and artistic talent.

The first element of *iki* is coquetry (*bitai*), which Kuki explains to be “a dualistic attitude which constitutes the possible relations between the self and the different sex, where a non-relational self posits a sex different to that of the self.”¹⁶³ This relates to the performative exchange of sexual service and a reward that projects an illusion of a love affair to the third party who is unaware of

¹⁶² Kuki Shūzō, “Iki no kōzō,” in *Kuki Shūzō zenshū*, bekkan, eds., Amano Teiyū, et al. (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1982), p. 55. The English translation by John Clark reads: “That is to say, whilst European languages possess words which are merely bare analogies of *iki*, words which have completely identical significance cannot be discovered. There can be no objection, therefore, if we were to consider *iki* as a remarkable self-manifestation of the specific mode of being of Oriental culture, or rather, of the Yamato people” (*Reflection on Japanese Taste: The Structure of Iki* by Kuki Shūzō [Sydney: Power Publications, 1997], pp. 32-33).

¹⁶³ Ibid., p. 38.

the mutual understanding between the *yūjo* and her customer. Although coquetry can be perceived as a desirable aspect of human—especially erotic—relationships, it is accompanied by potential danger on the female side, because men may misinterpret the message and approach the women aggressively. However, courtesans, or the “professionals of love,” are free to express coquetry without fearing negative consequences precisely due to the mutual understanding on the nature of the performative exchange, and thus able to enjoy their power to enchant men, especially within institutions specially built for sexual entertainment.

The second element of *iki* is “brave composure” (*ikuji*). A little bit of toughness makes a woman all the more appealing, according to Kuki. This, again, relates to the intrinsic structure of a courtesan, an artist who solely relies on her skills to charm men. Although each of the heroines of the *yūjo* noh plays examined in this chapter are idealized in her own way, when it comes to *ikuji*, Lady Eguchi, the mistress of the house of pleasure who rejected Saigyō’s request for a night of shelter, exhibits more of the quality than the other three: Senju, the compassionate woman who renounced the world after the death of her lover, Hanago, the woman who became deranged over her missing lover, and Yuya, who reluctantly follows her lover to the flower-viewing banquet.

The last element of *iki* is resignation (*akirame*), or “an indifference which has renounced attachment and is based on knowledge of fate.”¹⁶⁴ Senju, Hanago and Yuya have all created their own sorrowfulness by strongly attaching

¹⁶⁴ Ibid., p. 41.

themselves to another human being (i.e., Shigehira, Lesser Captain Yoshida, and the sick mother). On the contrary, being the bodhisattva of wisdom, Lady Eguchi is not attached to this-worldly matters.

By adapting Kuki's interpretation of *iki*, a multifaceted notion of Japanese aesthetics, into our analysis, the ghost of Lady Eguchi can be understood as a culturally ideal woman. Being the woman that she is, she is the avatar of the bodhisattva of wisdom and creates the image of ultimate desirability, and there is no contradiction in her being a bodhisattva in the form of a courtesan, as both identities were positively viewed by contemporary audiences.

VIII. Conclusion

The current chapter examined the representations of *saiō* and *yūjo*, two groups of idealized female characters in premodern Japanese literature. My survey of fictional royal priestesses indicated that they were constructed with a dual image of a mysterious, sacred virgin and a sexually naïve old-maid-to-be, revealing the bifacial structure of overt prestige. On the other hand, literary depictions of courtesans tended to be associated with such negative traits as sinfulness (albeit due to their female sex), instability, and forlornness, as well as enchanting charm, religious piety, and *iki*. What seems to be the surprisingly favorable treatment of fictional *yūjo* in Buddhist anecdotal tales and noh dramas based on our modern perception of prostitutes should not be surprising after all, considering that they represent the covert side of hyperfemininities.

Although historical research has found the trend of increasingly strict regulations towards prostitution during the Kamakura period onward, this does not necessarily lead to the conclusion of the overall fall of courtesans' status, as many of the research studies do not tease apart the status of courtesans and that of women in general, whether it may be their socio-economic power, legal rights and religious teachings. My study has shown that among a number of social outcasts, courtesans were held in high regard within the mainstream society due to their cultural, aesthetic cachet. This finding may be able to encourage a new way of analysis in the literary studies on fictional courtesans, and at the same time shed new light on historical research on those women as one clue as to why women may have chosen to make a living or chose to remain in this business beyond mere financial necessity.

CHAPTER 2: HYPERMASCULINITIES OF WARRIORS AND OUTLAWS

I. Introduction

In this chapter, I am going to examine the representation of hypermasculinities associated with overt and covert prestige within premodern Japanese literature. For the first category, the masculinity of elite warriors will be discussed, followed by the depictions of the second category, outlaws, much like Chapter 1 dealt with how imperial priestesses (overt prestige group) and courtesans (covert prestige group) were portrayed in Heian and medieval texts. Despite the two chapters' shared goal of examining idealized gender construction in literature, we will not see a simple parallel due to the complexity of issues surrounding the hypermasculinity of warriors.

In the previous chapter, ample examples of fictional and semi-fictional royal priestesses were enumerated to demonstrate the connection between their hyperfemininity and overt prestige. Given that the post was granted only to young unwed (hence "pure") women closely related to the sovereign, it comes as no surprise that the *saiō* were deemed highly desirable female figures. In contrast, the status of elite warriors is palpably different from that of *saiō* because of the presence of a competing class for the first, namely, aristocrats. Because overt prestige is generally more closely associated with the aristocrats, its connection with the military class is sometimes compromised.

In addition, the hypermasculinities of warriors and outlaws overlap significantly more than the contrasting hyperfemininities of *saiō* and courtesans.

While it is easy to imagine how dissimilar the experiences of those women must have been, the lives of warriors in wartime and outlaws are directly connected through violence. Evidently, violence used by military personnel in combat is accepted and sometimes even glorified, whereas civilians are typically subject to sanctions when they commit violent acts. Despite the degree of legitimacy allowed for different people who engage in violence, hypermasculinities cannot be dissociated from physical might, and its most concrete embodiment is violence. This strong tie between the two groups of men makes it difficult to draw a clear line between overt and covert prestige, as we will see below.

In the next section, I will briefly discuss the ambivalent power relations that the military class and aristocrats shared from the earliest times until the establishment of the Kamakura Shogunate in 1185. This background information is imperative for understanding the fragmentary construction of the prestige of elite warriors in Japan's literary tradition.

II. Historical Context of the Emergence of the Military Class

Long before the emergence of the elite warrior class in the late twelfth century, military arts were a critical function of the court. This notion is symbolized in the appearance of gods—the ancestors of the imperial family and several noble clans—in mythologies. For instance, in a section called “Descent of the Heavenly Grandson” of the *Kojiki*, Ame-no-Oshihi and Ama-tsu-Kume, the two gods that are assumed ancestors of the Ōtomo and Kume clans respectively, are equipped with swords and bow and arrows, prepared to guard the Heavenly

Grandson, Ninigi.¹⁶⁵ Susano-o, the wicked brother of the Sun Goddess Amaterasu, is a fierce swordsman who hacks the eight-tailed serpent into pieces.¹⁶⁶ Additionally, Japan's first official emperor is posthumously named Jimmu 神武, a name composed of the two Chinese characters "divine" and "warrior" or "ferocious."

The armament of the court continues well beyond the times of mythology and legends, as Emperor Temmu in 683 declared the focus of the government to be military affairs.¹⁶⁷ Nevertheless, Takahashi Tomio points out that Temmu's edict simply means that martial affairs of the government must be supported by the combined efforts of both military and civil offices. Takahashi goes on to remark that this does not mean that the two offices were equally prestigious. Rather, the Ritsuryō system positioned the five martial offices far below the ministries, as the highest rank that a military officer could achieve was the upper fifth, or an equivalent to the chief of the Bureau of the Imperial Stable.¹⁶⁸

In any case, the military personnel stationed at the court were not necessarily deemed to be gallant combatants. The narrator of an anecdote compiled in *Zoku Kojidan* (Talks about Ancient Matters, Sequel; 1219), for instance, retrospectively states that, "imperial guards (of the Heian period) were equipped with bows and arrows, but they were far from courageous fighters."¹⁶⁹

¹⁶⁵ SNKBZ 1, p. 117.

¹⁶⁶ Ibid., pp. 69-72.

¹⁶⁷ SNKBZ 4, p. 435.

¹⁶⁸ Takahashi Tomio, *Bushidō no rekishi* (Tokyo: Shin Jinbutsu Ōraisha, 1986), pp. 68-69.

¹⁶⁹ SNKBT 41, p. 804.

It may not strike one as surprising to find that the type of hypermasculine fighters we read about in martial epics mostly emerged from the periphery, or the lands of subjugation to Yamato, where skill with bow and arrows was much more valued than courtly arts such as composing *waka* poems and playing music. As Jeffrey P. Mass succinctly remarks, the instability in the relationship between warriors and aristocrats was predestined: “[A]s the courtiers in the capital became more confident of their superiority, they began to loosen their grip over the provinces, exchanging governance over a public realm for proprietorship over its component pieces.”¹⁷⁰ While the court nobles accumulated wealth by becoming absentee landlords of their massive private estates outside the capital and led extravagant lifestyles for centuries, local military leaders of the provinces amassed power. However, the genealogy of those powerful warriors, in particular Minamoto (Genji) and Taira (Heishi or Heike) in the provinces, actually goes back to royalty. That is to say, the common practice of polygamy in imperial households resulted in a large number of offspring, who would eventually have strained the finances of the public treasury, had they stayed princes and princesses. To avoid this economic burden, many were given surnames, most commonly Minamoto or Taira, and relegated to the commoner rank. There were seventeen major lines of Minamoto and four of Taira, all of which descended from different emperors. The Seiwa Genji from Emperor Seiwa

¹⁷⁰ Jeffrey P. Mass, “The Kamakura Bakufu,” in *Warrior Rule in Japan*, ed., Marius B. Jansen (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995), p. 2.

(r. 858-876) and Kammu Heishi from Emperor Kammu (r. 781-806) are the two lineages that became the most renowned military families.¹⁷¹

The mid-tenth century marks the advent of “professional warriors,” the very men we identify as *bushi* or samurai today. These warriors were employed by the government to fight in wars. In 939, a rebellion led by Japan’s so-called “first samurai,” Taira no Masakado (?-940), broke out.¹⁷² He first became involved in a marriage dispute with his own kin. He and his family members skirmished for four years, resulting in great destruction in their region. This occurred without the court’s knowledge. When Masakado caused squabbles over taxation in Musashi and Hitachi, the court finally took notice and sent armies to suppress the chaos. Masakado at last seized the eastern provinces, killed his uncle, and declared himself the “New Emperor” (*shin-nō*). Due to this grave insult to the court, he gained the reputation of a state criminal and a folk hero at the same time. In 940, Masakado was killed by government forces. *The Chronicle of Masakado* (*Shōmonki*; early eleventh century) regards this as divine punishment and narrates his agonizing journey in hell.¹⁷³

¹⁷¹ See, for example, Oboroya Hisashi, *Seiwa Genji* (Tokyo: Kyōikusha, 1984).

¹⁷² See Karl F. Friday, *The First Samurai: The Life and Legend of the Warrior Rebel Taira Masakado* (Hoboken, New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons, 2008). According to Friday, the Rebellion of Masakado was not a full-fledged revolt, contrary to the common belief that this insurrection shook the court to its core. He writes, “Masakado, his allies, and his enemies were men with one foot in the countryside and the other firmly planted in Kyoto—‘bridging figures,’ in the words of the late Jeffery Mass” (p. 161).

¹⁷³ SNKBZ 41, pp. 83-91.

After the death of Masakado, conflicts and battles in the provinces persisted, and a few elite military families bolstered their control over the regions. In the capital, on the other hand, retired emperors retrieved power back from the Fujiwara, the family that dominated the court as the grandparents of infant emperors for over a century. From 1086 to 1129, Shirakawa-in ruled as the first cloistered emperor and realized the benefit of interdependency between the court and the elite professional warriors to secure the imperial authority both in the center and periphery. As part of this coalition, Shirakawa-in recruited a branch of the Taira (later known as the Ise Heishi). In 1097, Taira no Masamori, Kiyomori's grandfather, offered a large mass of land to the retired emperor, upon which the ex-emperor-Taira tie was formed and remained firm for three generations.¹⁷⁴

In 1156, the so-called Hōgen Disturbance, a dispute over the imperial succession, took place, for which various Taira and Minamoto were called into the capital. This was followed by another conflict three years later called the Disturbance of Heiji, fought out among survivors of the earlier encounter. During this, Minamoto no Yoshitomo, the father of the future Kamakura shogun, Yoritomo, was killed by a Taira vassal.

Much like his grandfather and father, Taira no Kiyomori formed a coalition with the retired emperor of the time, Go-Shirakawa, and solidified the family's power by occupying a number of government posts at court and in provinces, most strikingly represented by Kiyomori's appointment to the post of prime

¹⁷⁴ Jeffrey P. Mass, *Yoritomo and the Founding of the First Bakufu: The Origins of Dual Government in Japan* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1999), pp. 14-17.

minister in 1167. Additionally, Kiyomori successfully married his daughter Tokuko (later Kenreimon-in) into the imperial family and, in 1178, became the grandfather of the crown prince who would be enthroned two years later. Nevertheless, by 1180, the Taira was “embracing both the peak of their influence and the beginning of their decline.”¹⁷⁵ For the next six years, Japan endured a series of battles that we know of as the Gempei War, which William Wayne Farris calls “the Japanese version of the Peloponnesian Wars of ancient Greece” for being “an asymmetrical battle between two different military traditions.”¹⁷⁶ That is to say, western Japan, including Shikoku and Kyushu, began to develop sea routes to transport goods as early as the eighth century, whereas the predominate means of transportation in the east was horse.¹⁷⁷ Therefore, warriors of the East are reputable for “the way of the bow and horse” (*kyūba no michi*), while the Taira of the West excelled in sea battles. In the end, the Genji toppled the Heike, and their commander-in-chief, Minamoto no Yoritomo, established Japan’s first military government in Kamakura.

¹⁷⁵ Ibid., p. 31.

¹⁷⁶ William Wayne Farris, *Heavenly Warriors: The Evolution of Japan’s Military, 500-1300* (Cambridge, Mass: Council on East Asian Studies, Harvard University, 1992), p. 289. Although Gempei War (*Gempei gassen*) is a widely accepted name for this conflict, Farris instead uses “the Great Civil War of 1180-1185,” probably because the war involved far more than the Minamoto and Taira (i.e. Gempei), including the imperial household, large religious institutions, and non-Gempei military families. Furthermore, both Minamoto and Taira had internal conflicts, with members of each family fighting against their own kin, most famously between Yoritomo and Yoshinaka, and Yoritomo and Yoshitsune.

¹⁷⁷ Friday, *First Samurai*, p. 110.

It is important to note that advancement in the field of medieval Japanese history over the past few decades suggests that the establishment of the Kamakura Shogunate did not suddenly elevate the status of the military class nor did it greatly curb the political power of the court.¹⁷⁸ That being said, there is no doubt that this event marked the first pivotal milestone in the process of a political power shift. Moreover, when the cloistered emperor Go-Toba (r. 1183-98) plotted a large-scale rebellion against the Shogunate in 1221 (the Jōkyū Disturbance), it was immediately thwarted. Finally, towards the end of the Northern and Southern Courts period (1336-1392), the ever-supreme power of the military government became clear. The dominant political authority over the court was solidified by the establishment of the Muromachi shogunate in 1378, continuing through the Edo period (1603-1867) under the rule of the Tokugawa shogunate.

III. Hypermasculinity within Heian Vernacular Tales

As mentioned in the previous chapter, *The Tale of Genji* (ca. 1000) is the pinnacle of all Heian court literature, written by Murasaki Shikibu, who waited on the imperial consort Shōshi, during the hegemony of Fujiwara no Michinaga (966-1028; the father of Shōshi). In this masterpiece, ideal manhood is unequivocally embodied by its hero, Hikaru Genji, who possesses every element

¹⁷⁸ For instance, see G. Cameron Hurst III, "The *Kōbu* Polity: Court-Bakufu Relations in Kamakura Japan," in *Court and Bakufu in Japan: Essays in Kamakura History*, ed. Jeffrey P. Mass (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1982), pp. 3-28.

of overt prestige, from royal pedigree, wealth, beauty, power and intelligence to talents in music, dance, and painting. It is no exaggeration to say that all male characters exist as a foil to Genji, although some are depicted more favorably than others. In particular, out of all the male characters of marriageable age, two are portrayed as exceptionally undesirable lovers: Taifu no Gen and Hige-kuro, both of whom long for Genji's adoptive daughter, Tamakazura.

Tamakazura is the daughter born to Genji's deceased former lover, Yūgao, and his best friend, the Secretary Captain (Tō no Chūjō). After the death of Yūgao, the young Tamakazura was taken to Tsukushi (present-day Kyushu) and raised by her wet nurse. As she grew older, the reputation of her beauty spread, causing unwelcome suitors to constantly show up on her doorstep, with the worst of all being the Audit Commissioner (Taifu no Gen). He was a fairly powerful warrior of the area and allegedly preoccupied with "collecting pretty women." According to the narrator, he was a "tall and impossibly massive man of about thirty," "not unsightly, but his attitudes were repellent and his brusque manners painful to watch," and "his voice was remarkably gruff and his jargon was hard to follow."¹⁷⁹ In an attempt to rebuff Gen's courting, Tamakazura's guardians took such extreme measures as untruthfully telling him that their young mistress was crippled, blind, and about to renounce the world. However, Gen became even more excited each time, boasting that he had all the gods and buddhas of Higo on his side and that the deities would be sure to cure the ill-fated lady. Furthermore, as was the case with the female comic relief character, the

¹⁷⁹ Tyler, *Genji*, p. 410.

Safflower Lady (Suetsumuhana), the author revealed Gen's lack of talent in poetry composition to emphasize his ruggedness:

On leaving the house [Gen] paused a while in thought, for he wished to deliver himself of a poem:

"If to my darling I should ever prove untrue, I solemnly swear

*By the god of the mirror of the shrine of Matura."*¹⁸⁰

Now, that is a poem, if I say so myself," he declared, grinning, with what colossally naïve innocence!

The nurse, whose head was spinning, was not up to a reply, but her daughters said when she asked them for one that they were even dizzier than she; and so, after blank ages, this, in trembling voice, was the best she could do:

"If my heartfelt prayer offered up year after year should now come to naught,

I might easily condemn the god and the mirror, too."

"Just a moment! What was that you said?" All at once he loomed before her, and she paled with fear.

Her daughters nonetheless beamed at him gamely through their daze. "The young lady is simply not like other people, you see," they earnestly explained.

"Of course it would be a great disappointment if things were not to turn out as you wish, but I am afraid my poor mother is very muddled in her old age and got it all wrong."

¹⁸⁰ Tyler notes, "The poem does not follow; something like 'I accept the punishment of the gods' is missing between its two halves. Its great virtue, for the speaker, seems to be that it gets in a wordplay (on *kakete*), according to accepted poetry practice. This divine mirror is enshrined in the Kagami Jinja ("Mirror Shrine") in Matura, now Karatsu, on the north coast of Kyushu" (p. 411, n. 13).

“Oh. I see, I see!” He nodded. “No, no, the turn of phrase was delightful! Here in the provinces we are all supposed to be bumpkins, but we have a lot more to us than that! What is so wonderful about people from the City? I know all about this. Don’t you go looking down on me!” He had a good mind to give them another, but perhaps that was too much for him, because he went away.¹⁸¹

It is unequivocally clear that Gen is not a bad person. Rather, he is a man with a kind heart who is eager to help an unseen lady financially and by curing her physical handicaps. Also, he was aware of his own provinciality and this sense of inferiority made him say to the women from the capital, “Don’t you go looking down on me.” Nevertheless, he was hopelessly unaware of and would never know *how* provincial he actually was and how unworthy he was of a daughter of the Secretary Captain. While the hideous, unrefined Suetsumuhana was eventually taken into Genji’s Rokujō Mansion as one of many wives, albeit out of pity, there was no way for Tamakazura to accept Gen’s marriage proposal and become his wife. At last, Tamakazura and her former wet nurse narrowly escaped Tsukushi and returned to the capital, where the wet nurse miraculously came across her former coworker (Yūgao’s attendant) now working for Genji.

When Genji first met Tamakazura, who clearly surpassed her mother’s beauty and wit, he felt intense attraction. Instead of inviting her to become a new wife, however, Genji officially announced that Tamakazura was his long-lost daughter. As a result, a number of courtiers swarmed around Genji and begged him for permission to marry his daughter. Among them, the most atypical nobleman was the Commander of the Right, known to readers as Higekuro

¹⁸¹ Tyler, *Genji*, pp. 411-412.

Taishō (Black-bearded General). After a period of courting via letters, Tamakazura caught a glimpse of Hige-kuro's face during the imperial progress, and immediately felt repulsed by the heavy black beard and the darker complexion of his skin.¹⁸² Nevertheless, the following chapter, "The Handsome Pillar" (*Makibashira*), begins with a narration to inform readers of Hige-kuro's "marriage" to Tamakazura, which was made possible by his sneaking into her chamber one night and raping her. Heartbroken, Tamakazura "remained as disheartened as ever by such evidence of her disastrous karma."¹⁸³ Her ill luck was pitiful as is, yet it strikes one as even more sorrowful when it becomes obvious that her entrance to the court as a highly honorable Mistress of Staff¹⁸⁴ had been arranged and was now cancelled. Upon receiving the news of Tamakazura's marrying Hige-kuro, Emperor Reizei (Genji's illicit son) cannot contain his disappointment.

His Majesty's face was ineffably beautiful in the bright moonlight, and everything about him recalled His Grace the Chancellor [Genji]. Can there really be two such men? She wondered as she watched him. Genji's peculiarly keen interest in her had added cruelly to her cares; and His Majesty—why did *he* feel so strongly about her? She just wanted to disappear when he spoke, ever so kindly, of his unhappiness that what he had hoped had not come to pass. He said when she

¹⁸² Ibid., p. 500.

¹⁸³ Ibid., p. 525.

¹⁸⁴ *Naishi no kami*. "The senior woman official (third rank) in the Office of Staff. In principle, the incumbent supervised female palace staff, palace ceremonies, and the transmission of petitions and decrees. In practice, she was a junior wife to the Emperor" (Tyler, *Genji*, p. 1166, "Offices and Titles").

remained mute, her face hidden behind her fan, “How strangely silent you are! I assumed that you would know from your recent good fortune [her appointment as a Mistress of Staff] what my feelings for you are, but I suppose it is your way to continue pretending not to notice.”¹⁸⁵

In the world of *The Tale of Genji* that revolves around its hero, a man’s desirability is measured against Genji, and Reizei, Genji’s son with an empress (his stepmother Fujitsubo), is probably as close as one could ever come to the unreachable standard. On the contrary, the comic relief character Gen no Taifu had to be the worst possible suitor for Tamakazura Lady Murasaki could imagine—so hideous that the young lady would flee the familiar Tsukushi and move to the capital—and he was almost necessarily a samurai from the countryside. As a matter of fact, the narrator’s description of Gen illustrates a stereotype of warriors composed of provincality as well as hypermasculinity that cannot be teased apart (i.e., massive physique, repellent attitude, brusque manners, gruff voice and lack of talent in poetry). During the early eleventh century, the notion of warrior-aristocrat was not yet firmly established, and the image of a warrior seems to have been strongly associated with both machismo and ruggedness.

On the other hand, Hige-kuro’s “military” title at court, the general of the Right, does not signify an inferior status compared to his fellow suitors, as Genji and many of his entourage also hold or once held such titles. Moreover, Hige-kuro would eventually be promoted first to the minister of the Right then to the highest non-imperial rank, prime minister. Nevertheless, the hypermasculine

¹⁸⁵ Ibid., p. 538.

image represented by his thick black beard and the dark complexion of his skin indicates a one-sidedly negative evaluation of hypermasculinity in the world of Heian court tales, wherein a stock phrase to praise men's desirability is "I wish he were a woman" (*onna ni mi tatematsura mahoshi*).¹⁸⁶

That said, it is important to point out the fact that warriors were not always negatively portrayed even during the Heian period, once we turn our attention outside of courtly tales. Volume 25 of *Konjaku monogatari-shū* includes fourteen chronologically arranged anecdotes on great warriors, twelve of which are translated by William Ritchie Wilson.¹⁸⁷ The volume begins with an account of the aforementioned Rebellion of Masakado (939-940) and ends with a story about the Later Three-Year War (1083-87), which indicates that *Konjaku* was compiled before the Hōgen and Heiji Disturbances in 1156 and 1160, respectively. According to Wilson, the compiler of *Konjaku* "often seems to view the warriors as abnormal or, at any rate, peculiar, although usually admirable,

¹⁸⁶ Literally, "I wish I could see him as a woman." Genji is one of the recipients of this phrase. In the famous "discussion on a rainy night" scene of the "Broom Tree" chapter, Genji and his friends gather and talk about the ideal type of women. After a while, however, the men stare at Genji, realizing no woman could be as appealing as he: "Over soft, layered white gowns he had on only a dress cloak, unlaced at the neck, and, lying there in the lamplight, against a pillar, he looked so beautiful that one could have wished him a woman." (Tyler, *Genji*, p. 24).

¹⁸⁷ William Ritchie Wilson, "The Way of the Bow and Arrow: The Japanese Warrior in *Konjaku Monogatari*," *Monumenta Nipponica*, Vol. 28, No. 2 (1973), p. 177-233. Wilson also translated another *Konjaku* episode with a similar theme, "How the Lieutenant of Left Gate Guards Taira no Munetsune Escorted the Bishop Myōson" (23:14).

human beings.” One such example is a story of Minamoto no Yorinobu (968-1048), the first-generation Kawachi Genji, as summarized below:

Now a long time ago, when Minamoto no Yorinobu was still the governor of Kōzuke (present-day Gumma), a son of his former wet nurse, Fujiwara no Chikataka, captured a robber. This robber managed to get out of his chains, kidnapped Chikataka's young son, and held him hostage. In panic, Chikataka went to the governor's office to seek help from his lord, Yorinobu. Hearing the news, Yorinobu admonished Chikataka for losing composure. He said, “Though there is some justification, do you really have to cry about this? Crying away like a child is such a stupid thing! For just a small boy—let the robber stab him to death! Only by having this attitude does the honor proper to a warrior hold good. If you think of wife and children, you'll end up failing in everything. To fear nothing means having no concern for one's prospect or for one's family.”

Yorinobu walked into the storeroom where the robber was holding a sword against the boy's belly, and calmly asked him about his intention. The robber replied in a thin, despairing voice, that he had no desire to kill; he merely wanted to survive. After hearing this, Yorinobu yelled, “You must have heard what people say about my temper. Throw your sword out!” As soon as the robber obeyed the command, Yorinobu's vassals grabbed the man. Instead of beheading this robber, however, the governor gave him food, a horse, and even a bow and arrows and told him to get lost. The story ends with the narration, “Even a robber, awe-struck and impressed by one word from Yorinobu, released his hostage. When one considers this, Yorinobu's prestige and charisma as a warrior must have been tremendous.”¹⁸⁸

¹⁸⁸ “How a Child of Fujiwara no Chikataka, Having Been Seized as a Hostage by a Robber, Escaped though a Word from Yorinobu,” (Wilson, *Bow and Arrow*, pp. 218-219).

Another example deals with a young samurai's vengeance upon his father's killer. The young man is a retainer of Taira no Kanetada (dates unknown). One day, Kanetada's son Koremochi visits the father's mansion with a group of followers. One of the followers is named Tarō no Suke, whose description is reminiscent of Gen no Taifu and Higekuro: "A man of some fifty years of age, he was very fleshy and had long face-hair. He had an extremely grim air and he certainly seemed a fine warrior."¹⁸⁹ Then, Kanetada told the young retainer that the bearded man was the one who had killed his father (Tarō no Suke was enraged when this stranger "insulted" him by not getting off the horse at their encounter, and slashed him). That night, the young man sneaked up to the drunken Suke and sliced his windpipe in one blow. The following morning the mansion was in the state of chaos. Koremochi stormed into his father's room and ranted that it must have been the young samurai who had killed Suke and that he needed be turned in. However, Kanetada harshly reproached his son in a loud voice:

"Now suppose that, in a case just like this, someone censured and was angry at one of your men for killing, just like this, a man who had killed me. Would you think that right? Is not revenge on one's parent's enemy something which the gods of heaven and earth approve of? Now because you are an implacable warrior, anybody killing me would realize that he could never rest easy. If you press me like this about a man who has revenged his father, I will not, it seems, be mourned, let alone revenged."¹⁹⁰

¹⁸⁹ "How a Follower of Taira no Koremochi was Killed," (Ibid., p. 199).

¹⁹⁰ Ibid., pp. 201-202.

The story ends with the narrator's remark:

Revenge, therefore, on the enemy of one's father, even though a man is a splendid warrior, is something precious and much to be revered in this world. Moreover, it has been related and handed down that people indeed applauded the fact that this man, all alone, was able audaciously to obtain his intended revenge on a person constantly guarded by so many followers—something which truly the gods of heaven and earth approve of.¹⁹¹

As Wilson states in the introduction of his article, these two stories as well as many others in this volume emphasize the idea of honor among warriors.¹⁹² In addition, I would note, Yorinobu's fearlessness when confronting the armed robber, his robust manners, aversion towards Chikataka's display of sadness and attachment to his child, as well as his charisma to completely awe the robber are all positive elements of hypermasculinity. Similarly, in the second story above, praising avengers (i.e. endorsement of vindicated killing) can be explained by the affirmation of hypermasculinity.

The contrast between how the *Genji* and *Konjaku* treat hypermasculinity of warriors is significant. This illustrates a shifting focus from the negative to the positive—the opposite trend from the literary depictions of imperial priestesses. This can be understood as a reflection of the general increasing status of warriors that occurred during the late eleventh to early twelfth century as well as the difference in genre. Yet, as more and more warriors came to be depicted in vernacular tales, particularly so-called martial epics (*gunki mono*) chanted by

¹⁹¹ Ibid., p. 202.

¹⁹² Ibid., p. 188.

blind lute-paying minstrels, a variety of stereotypes of warriors emerged.

Curiously, one of the main determinants of what “type” a given warrior belongs to is his geographical origin, which I will discuss in detail in the following section.

IV. Fragmentary Images of Warriors: East vs. West

At least from the time of the establishment of the Yamato court around the fourth century, western Japan was the center of culture, civilization, and politics. For the ruling class of Yamato, the rest of the archipelago was virtually wild lands that needed to be cultivated and subjugated, while those who lived in the wild lands were viewed as barbarians:

*Though folk say
That one Yemishi
Is a match for one hundred men,
They do not so much as resist¹⁹³.*

Because those alleged barbarians in eastern and northeastern Japan (Emishi) were considered fierce fighters, they were sent all the way to Kyushu as border guards (*sakimori*), lest armed forces from the continent attempt an invasion. Portrayals of such mighty, unruly images of Emishi are prevalent in *The Chronicles of Japan* (720), two of which are below:

[Yamato Takeru], striking a martial attitude, said, “Not many years have passed since I subdued the Kumaso. Now the Yemishi of the East have made a fresh rebellion. When shall we arrive at a universal peace? Thy servant, notwithstanding that it is a

¹⁹³ W. G. Aston, trans., *Nihongi: Chronicles of Japan from the Earliest Times to A.D. 697*, Vol 1 (1896; reprinted: Rutland, VT: Tuttle, 1982), p. 124.

labour to him, will speedily quell this disturbance.” So the Emperor [Keikō] took a battle-axe, and giving it to [Yamato Takeru] and said, “We hear that the Eastern savages are of a violent disposition, and are much given to oppression: their hamlets have no chiefs, their villages no leaders, each is greedy of territory, and they plunder one another....Amongst these Eastern savages the Yemishi are the most powerful their men and women live together promiscuously, there is no distinction of father and child. In winter they dwell in holes, in summer they live in nests. Their clothing consists of furs, and they drink blood....In ascending mountains they are like flying birds; in going through the grass they are like fleet quadrupeds....Therefore ever since antiquity they have not been steeped in the kingly civilizing influences.”¹⁹⁴

In the 55th year of Emperor Nintoku’s reign:

The Yemishi rebelled. Tamichi was sent to attack them. He was worsted by the Yemishi, and slain at the Harbour of Ishimi. Now one of his followers obtained Tamichi’s armlet and gave it to his wife, who embraced the armlet and strangled herself....After this Yemishi again made an incursion and carried off some of the people. Accordingly they dug up Tamichi’s tomb, upon which a great serpent started up with glaring eyes, and came out of the tomb [and bit them]. Therefore the men of that time said, “Although dead, Tamichi at least had his revenge. How can it be said that the dead have no knowledge?”¹⁹⁵

According to Kudō Masaki, the word *emishi* 蝦夷 originally meant something similar to “fearsome yet respectable one” in ancient Japanese.¹⁹⁶ For this reason, some powerful court officials and military personnel during the Asuka and Nara periods (from late sixth century to late eighth century) took this as their

¹⁹⁴ Ibid., p. 203.

¹⁹⁵ Ibid., p. 296.

¹⁹⁶ Kudō Masaki, *Kodai Emishi no eiyū jidai* (Tokyo: Heibonsha, 2005), p. 74.

given name, including Soga no Emishi (?-645; father of the famous statesman, Iruka), Ono no Emishi (n. d.; father of Imoko, Japan's first envoy to Sui China), and Kamo no Emishi (?-695; a military officer during the Jinshin War of 672).¹⁹⁷ Despite this, the Yamato called the easterners "Emishi" while superimposing the negative images onto them, which appears to be motivated by xenophobia and a desire to expand their control in the eastern and northeastern Japan.

Curious is that this fierce and uncivilized image of the eastern people persisted well beyond the ancient period. Although both Kammu Heishi (Taira) and Seiwa Genji (Minamoto) originated from eastern Japan, since the father of Taira no Kiyomori, Tadamori, became the first courtier among the Ise Heishi, the two rival clans came to be associated with the geography of their home bases. By the time of the Gempei War, the dichotomy of "the elegant Heishi of the West versus the valiant Genji of the East" was well established, and further reinforced by other martial tales. This stereotyping can be most unequivocally observed in a scene from Volume 5 of *The Tales of the Heike* (Kakuichi version; "Fuji River"):

[Taira no] Koremori summoned Nagai no Saitō Bettō Sanemori, a man known to be acquainted with conditions in the east. "Tell me, Sanemori, how many men in the Eight Provinces can wield a strong bow as well as you do?" he asked.

Sanemori uttered a derisive laugh. "Do you think I use long arrows? They barely measure thirteen fists. Any number of warriors in the east can equal that: nobody is called a long-arrow man there unless he draws a fifteen-fist shaft. A strong bow is held to be one that requires six stout men for the stringing. One of

¹⁹⁷ Ibid, p. 76.

those powerful archers can easily penetrate two or three suits of armor when he shoots.

“Every big landholder commands horsemen. Once a rider mounts, he never loses his seat; however rugged the terrain he gallops over, his horse never falls. If he sees his father or son cut down in battle, he rides over the dead body and keeps on fighting. In west-country battles, a man who loses a father leaves the field and is seen no more until he has made offerings and completed a mourning period; someone who loses a son is too broken up to come back at all. When westerners run out of commissariat rice, they stop fighting until the fields are planted and harvested. In summer, they think it’s too hot to fight; in winter, they think it’s too cold. Easterners entirely different....¹⁹⁸

Sanemori went on to say that he had no plan to live and go back to the capital, which made every Taira warrior around him quiver in fear and awe. To further illustrate the assumed cowardliness of the Heike in the scene, the narrator talks about how a sound of water birds frightened the troops so much so that some of them jumped on hitched horses and ran in circles, dropped their weapons in haste, and accidentally stepped on or kicked the courtesans who were playing music nearby.¹⁹⁹

Recall that in one of the *Konjaku* stories mentioned above, Minamoto no Yoritobu, an eastern elite warrior, scolded his vassal, Chikataka, for not being able to contain himself but crying over the kidnapping of his young son. Even

¹⁹⁸ *The Tale of the Heike*, trans. Helen Craig McCullough (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1988), pp. 188-189.

¹⁹⁹ *Ibid.*, p. 190.

from that time, detachment from one's family, suppression of gentle emotions, and fearlessness were regarded as necessities for warriors.

In addition to emotional detachment and bravado, another recurrent characteristic for eastern warriors is their keen desire to defeat the enemy by any means necessary. In regard to *The Chronicle of Taira no Masakado* (late tenth century), Karl F. Friday writes that this narrative about the rebellion of Masakado, another eastern warrior, "make[s] clear that warriors, whether fighting on behalf of the state or for personal reasons, made little time for ceremony for the battles. Their concerns lay overwhelmingly with accomplishing their objectives in the most efficient way possible, with scant regard for the lives and property of women, children, and other noncombatants or for any notions of fair play."²⁰⁰ In other words, being a polite gentleman is not prerequisite to being a war hero like Masakado who is "the subject of national history, folklore, literary imagination, and local legends passed down in more than three hundred fifty places across Japan."²⁰¹

Out of all the legendary eastern warriors, one is renowned for his super-human ability to fight. His name is Minamoto no Tametomo (1139-1170), a warrior who fought for the Retired Emperor Sutoku (r. 1123-1141) during the Hōgen Rebellion in 1156. His extremely masculine appearance described in the *Tale of Hōgen* far surpasses that of Taifu no Gen and Hige-kuro of the *Genji*: a young man of "exceedingly gruff physique," standing over seven-feet tall with

²⁰⁰ Friday, *First Samurai*, p. 43.

²⁰¹ Ibid., p. 7.

arms “longer than the poles of a carrying chest.”²⁰² According to the *Tale of Hōgen*, Tametomo was a natural-born archer whose left arm was longer than the right one by four inches, which enabled him to manipulate a powerful 8’5” long bow and fifteen-fist arrows specially crafted for him. With this special bow, there was nothing he could not pierce, whether it be a flying bird or a sprinting beast, and the explosive power of his arrow instantly skewered multiple enemies at once. The narrator goes on to state that “there has never been a superior soldier to Tametomo and there will never be one in the future,” including Xiang Yu (232 BC–202 BC) of Qin China, let alone Taira no Masakado or the legendary courtier-turned-pirate-leader, Fujiwara no Sumitomo (?-941).²⁰³

The author of the *Heiji* makes a clear contrast between Tametomo and his enemy of the West, Taira no Kiyomori (future commander-in-chief for the Gempei War for the Heishi), by having Tametomo describe Kiyomori’s skills in archery as “wimpy arrows” (*Kiyomori-nado-ga herohero ya*).²⁰⁴ In fact, when Kiyomori, then-governor of Aki, and his troops marched to the palace of the Cloistered Emperor Sutoku to deliver an edict from Emperor Go-Shirakawa, he yelled, “Now who is guarding this gate, the Genji or the Heishi?” The moment Kiyomori heard the dreadful reply, “Chinzei Hachirō Tametomo is guarding,” it kept him from moving

²⁰² SNKBZ 41, pp. 250-251.

²⁰³ Ibid., pp. 252-253. The two contemporary revolts led by Masakado and Sumitomo are called the Revolts of Jōhei-Tengyō.

²⁰⁴ Ibid., p. 254.

forward. “Alas, I am about to attack a place protected by the outrageous one,” murmured the future head of the Heike.²⁰⁵

In the end, Kiyomori and Go-Shirakawa’s side turned out to be the victor, and Tametomo quickly went into hiding. When Tametomo was discovered by his pursuers at a bathhouse in the unknown place wherein he had been living as a fugitive, he fought back like a man possessed, grabbing his enemies with bare hands—crushing, dismembering, and breaking them as if they were miniscule insects. Nevertheless, not fully recuperated from a recent bout of illness that almost killed him, Tametomo was subdued and sent back to the capital. At court, a number of courtiers gathered to discuss the fate of this unearthly fighter. At last, Regent Fujiwara no Tadamichi suggested they spare his life for being such an unprecedented warrior of prowess. Therefore, after dislocating his elbows and arms, they exiled Tametomo to Ōshima Island.²⁰⁶

If we are to place Tametomo on one end of the continuum of hypermasculinity (i.e. otherworldly hypermasculinity) portrayed in classical Japanese literature, the group that follows is the “eastern-type” warriors.²⁰⁷ I will

²⁰⁵ Ibid., pp. 275-276.

²⁰⁶ Ibid., pp. 387-390.

²⁰⁷ Although technically not a warrior, nor from the East, the legendary fighting monk Musashibō Benkei (?-1189) is one of the few beloved characters in classical Japanese literature, if not the only one, who can match Tametomo’s super-human might. Benkei is the primary follower of Minamoto no Yoshitsune, whom I will discuss in detail later. According to *The Chronicle of Yoshitsune*, Benkei stayed in his mother’s womb for eighteen months and was born the size of a toddler with shoulder-length hair and a full set of teeth (SNKBZ 62, p. 112). At the end of his life,

say *type* because one who fits in this category need not be actually from the East (although many are). As mentioned above, this group is associated with, first, provinciality, and, second, uncompromising determination to defeat their enemies, for which they would be willing to sacrifice their reputation to be a fair-player, their loved ones, and, ultimately, their own lives. The quintessential example of this type is Kiso (Minamoto) Yoshinaka (1154-1184) of *The Tales of the Heike*.

Kiso Yoshinaka (nicknamed after the place where he was raised) is a cousin of the commander-in-chief of the Genji, Minamoto no Yoritomo. He is one of the central characters of the middle sections of the *Heike*, whose likability shifts quite dramatically throughout the story. Nevertheless, his image as a superior general, who excels in surprise attacks, remains unquestionable from his introduction to his final moments. The first mention of Yoshinaka's name appears in Volume 6, described as "a man of surpassing strength and matchless valor," and "an archer of rare power, the equal on horseback or afoot of" historical war heroes such as Sakanoue no Tamuramaro, Japan's first shogun (758-811).²⁰⁸ In mid-1183, the Heike launched a campaign against Yoshinaka, yet his army stroke back and defeated the enemies in one battle after another. In the seventh month of the same year, Yoshinaka's troops entered the capital as pseudo-crusaders. It is during this period that Yoshinaka's vulgar nature and superciliousness surface, as H. Paul Varley writes:

Benkei became a human shield for Yoshitsune, who was preparing to perform self-disembowelment. The monk's armor bristled with myriad arrows shot by the enemies, yet Benkei stood still like a massive wall long after he died (*Ibid.*, pp. 456-458).

²⁰⁸ McCullough, *Heike*, p. 207.

Yoshinaka in Kyoto is transformed from a brilliant military commander into an incredible buffoon and bully. He mocks a courtier calling him a cat because the word cat appears in the name of the place where the courtier lives [Nekoma]; he wolfs down his food, he falls unceremoniously from a carriage on his way to court. In a surge of arrogance, he even toys with the idea of making himself emperor or retired emperor. Perhaps this gross satirization of Yoshinaka is meant to mock all rustic warriors who go to the capital and ape courtly ways. Or perhaps the rude and vulgar Yoshinaka is intended as a foil to highlight the role of the Taira in the second half of the *Heike* as courtier-like fugitives, hounded and hunted by rough warriors from the provinces.²⁰⁹

After this, Yoshinaka was depicted as a merciful chieftain, who spared the life of an enemy, Senō Tarō, in “The Death of Senō.” Three chapters later (The Battle at the Hōjūji), however, his maliciousness was emphasized: he lays out more than six hundred chopped heads on the riverside and made earth-shaking battle cries as if he were possessed by a demon.

Meanwhile, growing suspicion and displeasure towards Yoshinaka prompt Yoritomo to campaign against his cousin, and in the chapter “The Death of Kiso,” he dies one of the most heart-wrenching deaths in the *Heike*. According to Paul S. Atkins, *seppuku* (literally, “cutting the belly”) carried various significance at different times of history. During the medieval period, warriors, especially the Minamoto, performed this act by casting off the intestines in order to “express

²⁰⁹ H. Paul Varley, *Warriors of Japan as Portrayed in the War Tales* (Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1994), p. 102.

and relieve” such strong emotions as “grief, anguish, and resentment.”²¹⁰ If a warrior failed to commit *seppuku*, it meant “death at the hands of a high-status opponent at best. At worst, it led to capture, humiliation, torture, and decapitation by a low-status opponent. The costs were social and psychic.”²¹¹

When an army of Yoritomo surrounded Yoshinaka and Imai Kanehira (his primary retainer and a son of Yoshinaka’s former wet nurse), Kanehira told his lord to go into the pinewoods and commit *seppuku*. As Yoshinaka galloped into the woods, his horse fell into rice paddles and sank deeply into the mud. Panicked, Yoshinaka turned his head in hope of finding Kanehira for aid, only to see his enemies fast approaching. At this moment, an arrow pierced Yoshinaka’s head, knocking him off his drowning horse. While he was lying on the ground, a warrior named Ishida no Jirō Tamehisa beheaded Yoshinaka.²¹²

What would happen if a samurai did not have sufficient time to commit *seppuku* yet still desired to preserve his honor and display his hypermasculinity? The answer lies in the way Kanehira performs *junshi* (following the lord in death), as H. Paul Varley describes him as “[t]he berserk warrior capable of inhuman feats of derring-do and prepared to meet a grisly death without a moment’s

²¹⁰ Paul S. Atkins, “The Stages of *Seppuku*: Performing Self-Execution in Premodern Japan,” in *Ritual Dynamics and the Science of Ritual: Grammars and Morphologies of Ritual Practices in Asia*, eds., Axel Michaels and Anand Mishra (Wiesbaden, Germany: Harrassowitz Verlag, 2010), p. 533.

²¹¹ *Ibid.*, 531.

²¹² SNKBZ 46, p. 180-182.

hesitation.”²¹³ That is to say, as soon as he heard Ishida’s victory cry, Kanehira turned to his enemies yelling, “Who is left now to go on fighting for? Lords of the eastern provinces, allow me to show you how the bravest man in all Japan ends his life!” Then he shoved the tip of his sword into his mouth, jumps off his horse headfirst, and killed himself.²¹⁴

As opposed to these violent deaths of many Minamoto, the Heike of the West tend to prefer a more elegant method: “entering the water” (*jusui*). Unlike the disembowelment that probably evokes discomfort in modern readers (and goriness of *seppuku* illustrations intensifies in *Taiheiki* of Muromachi period), the suicides of the Taira aristocrat-warriors, women, and the child emperor Antoku evince sorrow and empathy. Additionally, there are a number of chapters in the *Heike* that vividly capture the courtliness of the Taira men through their talents in *waka* poetry or music, namely, Tadanori (7:16; 9:14), Tsunemasa (7:17; 7:18), Atsumori (9:16), and Shigehira (10:5; 10:6; 10:7), all of whom become subjects of *noh* plays during the Muromachi period.

V. Yoshitsune: The Amalgamation of East and West

As we have seen thus far, the construction of the “eastern-type” (i.e. fearless yet crude) warriors in military tales has its foundation in the geopolitical history of premodern Japan. Furthermore, when it comes to the development of the Kakuichi text of the *Heike*, it is not difficult to imagine how dramatically effective it

²¹³ Varley, *Warriors of Japan*, p. 106.

²¹⁴ *Ibid.*, p. 182.

was for a minstrel to chant combat and death scenes based on the cultural stereotypes of the East and West.²¹⁵ Nevertheless, not all war heroes' masculinities can be categorized into the three distinct types discussed above: the "superhuman masculinity" of Tametomo and Benkei, the "hypermasculinity" of "eastern-type" warriors, and the "courtly masculinity" of the Taira. Minamoto no Yoshitsune, "the single most famous man in all premodern Japanese history,"²¹⁶ who appears in the fifteenth-century quasi-martial epic titled *Gikeiki* (The Chronicle of Yoshitsune), can be best understood as the perfect amalgamation of the East and the West.²¹⁷ In other words, Yoshitsune represents the ideal maleness that consists of both hypermasculinity and courtly elegance, and this fusion of the two worlds undoubtedly contributes to his

²¹⁵ For the role of tale singers in development of the *Heike* characters, see, for example, Kenneth Dean Butler, "The Heike Monogatari and the Japanese Warrior Ethic," *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies*, vol. 29 (1969), pp. 93-108.

²¹⁶ Helen Craig McCullough, trans., *Yoshitsune: A Fifteen-Century Japanese Chronicle* (Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1966), p. 5. Yoshitsune's popularity can be measured by over a hundred works of his life stories adapted into noh plays, kabuki dramas, *jōruri* puppet plays, *kōwaka* dances, *otogi zōshi* and so on. The childhood story of Yoshitsune, *Ushiwaka-maru*, is one of the most commonly read children's books in today's Japan.

²¹⁷ The reason why *Gikeiki* is categorized as quasi-martial epic (*jun-gunki mono*) is because the only reference to the five-year long Gempei War within the text is a few lines in Volume 4. Up to this point, the story is concerned with Yoshitsune's adventurous youth and Benkei's biography. After this point on, his life as a refugee with his loyal retainers until the deaths of Yoshitsune, his retainers, and the Fujiwara family are narrated.

immense popularity, about which Ivan Morris says, “If he had not actually existed, the Japanese might have been obliged to invent him.”²¹⁸

Recall that one of the traits of eastern-type warriors is their provinciality. Although historically accurate information on Yoshitsune’s childhood is largely unknown, tradition has it that he spent a part of his childhood at the Kurama Temple in the deep mountains of Kyoto training to become a monk. At age sixteen, he moved to Hiraizumi (in modern-day Iwate), spending his adolescence in the care of Fujiwara no Hidehira until his half-brother, Yoritomo, raised the banner of revolt against the Taira in 1180.

In the *Heike*, Yoshitsune’s fighting style was defined by fast-pace surprise attacks. During the Battle of Mikusa, for instance, his armies attacked the Taira in the middle of the night. For the Battle of Ichi-no-tani, he sent out three separate platoons to charge the Taira camp from three different directions. However, neither the assault at the western gate nor the attack at Ikuta no Mori to the east turned decisive. In the end, Yoshitsune himself brought unequivocal victory to the Genji by one of the most daring and celebrated military exploits in Japanese history: his descent down the precipitously steep Hiyodorigoe cliff to attack the Taira from the rear. As a result of this decisive victory, Taira no Tadanori was killed and Shigehira was captured. Also, in Yashima, Yoshitsune’s hot temper became apparent. Knowing that Genji troops were not versed in sea battles, a fellow commander, Kajiwarra no Kagetoki, suggested to Yoshitsune that

²¹⁸ Ivan Morris, *The Nobility of Failure: Tragic Heroes in the History of Japan* (New York: Holt, Rinehart, and Winston, 1975), p. 67.

they attach “reverse oars” to each ship in case they needed to retreat quickly. Infuriated, Yoshitsune ridiculed Kajiwaras’s cowardice, and the tension between these two would eventually take a toll on Yoshitsune’s fate. The same night, Yoshitsune prepared to travel farther south via seaway, as he knew that the enemies would least expect a battle on a stormy night. Being aware of the danger of the stormy sea, the mariners naturally expressed their hesitation, to which Yoshitsune answered by giving them an ultimatum—dying by his arrow or taking a chance of drowning. Miraculously, the five ships arrived at Awa in one piece after six hours, rather than the typical three-day journey. These consecutive victories for Yoshitsune, however, were “bound to irk more cautious colleagues and to arouse their jealousy, and this was no doubt one reason for the damaging reports which Yoritomo, ensconced in his distant eastern headquarters, now began to receive about his headstrong young brother.”²¹⁹

So far, Yoshitsune has demonstrated many traits in common with his cousin Kiso Yoshinaka, namely a provincial upbringing, keen ability to win battles, and overconfidence. Unfortunately, their conceited behaviors make them share the fate of becoming public enemy and dying a premature death. That said, there is a vast difference between the two Minamoto: their posthumous statuses within literary arts.

²¹⁹ Morris, *Failure*, p. 76.

Of the research on Yoshitsune reviewed for this study, virtually all sources attribute his immense popularity to his tragic destiny, which drives people to sympathize with him.²²⁰ For example, Morris analyzes:

Finally [Yoshitsune] grew desperate, and from the little post station of Koshigoe about a mile from Kamakura he addressed his famous “Koshigoe letter” to one of his brother’s chief ministers. Though Yoshitsune probably sent some sort of emotional appeal to Kamakura at this time, the particular document that has come down to us is full of additions and embellishments that are deliberately designed to build up sympathy for the mistreated hero. This final appeal, however, is a most important part of the Yoshitsune legend; with its mixture of bravado and an almost masochistic indulgence in misfortune, it gives valuable insights into the psychology of heroic defeat[.]²²¹

Morris also points out that Yoshitsune’s supercilious nature eventually antagonized Yoritomo and caused his own downfall, which after all is the foundation of Yoshitsune’s status as a great tragic hero:

If he had faithfully submitted himself to instructions like his lackluster brother Noriyori, he could never have been a hero but he would undoubtedly have enjoyed a longer and more successful career.²²²

Similarly, in the annotation of the *Gikeiki*, Kajihara Masaaki discusses Yoshitsune’s construction as an idealized tragic hero in the latter half of the story:

²²⁰ Yoshitsune’s popularity led to the modern expression *hōgan biiki* (sympathy for Hōgan Yoshitsune, i.e. the underdog).

²²¹ Morris, *Failure*, p. 85.

²²² *Ibid.*, p. 102.

A hero in the wake of great adversity evokes empathy in the readers with his humanly weakness, rather than with his super-human strength. The Yoshitsune depicted in the latter half concedes his military role to others, while he transforms into a powerless noble, hiding in the shadow of Benkei and his other retainers.²²³

Still another example is Okutomi Takayuki's ascription of Yoshitsune's popularity to the aesthetics of impermanence:

[T]he loser is always pitiful. Such aesthetics of impermanence idealized Yoshitsune, and the result is the notion of *hōgan biiki*, which is further reinforced after being combined with the aesthetics of defiance.²²⁴

As much as the reader's compassion towards the hero plays a key role in his positive reception, the magnitude of Yoshitsune's popularity cannot be solely explained by the tragic nature of his life, as there are many other literary figures that suffered far more than Yoshitsune and did not come even close to Yoshitsune in deserving misfortune. This leads me to conclude that Yoshitsune's troubling life was perhaps a secondary factor in his popularity, and, rather, Yoshitsune's "hybrid masculinity" depicted in the *Gikeiki* transformed him into the quintessential hero of premodern Japan.

According to the *Heike*, Yoshitsune had to change his robe and armor frequently on the battlefield because his short stature, pale skin, and buckteeth made him easily identifiable even from a distance.²²⁵ Approximately a century later, however, Yoshitsune was reborn as an androgynous youth whose beauty is

²²³ SNKBZ 62, pp. 493-494.

²²⁴ Okutomi Takayuki, *Yoshitsune no Higeiki* (Tokyo, Kadokawa Shoten, 2004), p. 207.

²²⁵ SNKBZ 46, p. 373.

compared to historical beauties including the Tang Chinese *femme fatale*, Yang Guifei, as the passage from the *Gikeiki* below illustrates:

In appearance [Yoshitsune] was still the matchless page whose fame had spread from Kurama to Nara and Mount Hiei. With his dazzlingly white skin, blackened teeth, thinly penciled brows, and covered head, he seemed no less fair than Matura Sayohime, the maiden who waved her scarf on the moor year after year. His painted, sleep-smudged eyebrows were as graceful as the wings of a nightingale in flight. In the reign of the Emperor Hsüan Tsung, he would certainly been called Yang Kuei-fei; in the day of Han Wu Ti, people would have confused him with Lady Li.²²⁶

This drastic beautification and feminization of Yoshitsune's appearance in *Gikeiki* made him known as a gallant warrior with the face of an exquisite lady. Furthermore, due to his feminine, youthful image, Yoshitsune has customarily been played by a child actor in noh plays, while an *onna-gata* or female role actor plays him in kabuki plays, unlike other military commanders.

It is fairly well known that in classical Japanese literature, feminine male beauty is a stock image for imperial pedigree, as observed in such texts as the *Kojiki* (Yamato Takeru), *The Tale of Genji* (Genji), and *The Tale of Heiji* (Emperor Nijō). Therefore, intense feminization of a man can be interpreted as the ultimate form of nobilization. Also, physical characterization of a literary figure is much more powerful than acquired abilities such as music and poetry composition. The reason is that one's appearance is deemed a fundamental, biological part of the individual that cannot be easily altered.

²²⁶ McCullough, *Yoshitsune*, p. 84.

By now, it is clear that ideal manhood in light of overt prestige is something protean and iridescent—the evaluation of a particular construct changes depending on what it is being measured against. Yet, the intertextual construction of Yoshitsune—fierce warrior of the *Heike* and the appearance of an extraordinarily beautiful lady in the *Gikeiki*—has accomplished the impossible status of ideal man during the post-Genji era, when the political power of the aristocrats has been surpassed by that of the military class yet still preserving the eminence courtly culture.

VI. Hypermasculinity of Outlaws: An Overview

As a group of men who represent hypermasculinity in light of covert prestige, this section will deal with literary depictions of those who can be generally described as “outlaws.” Whereas “outlaw” may be an ambiguous appellation, I will use the term to refer to an individual who utilizes violence as a means of “making a living.” These “occupational” criminals are quite different from their “non-occupational” counterparts in many ways. On the one hand, the primary concern of outlaws is to feed themselves and to sustain their lifestyles, and their use of violence is auxiliary. While an outlaw may actually injure or murder someone for the purpose of purloining the victims’ money or goods, my survey shows that they are far more likely to use the *threat* of violence as a means of obtaining money or goods than violence itself. They principally arm themselves only in case of confrontation by the victim or law enforcement, rather than with the intention of attacking their victim. On the other hand, when an individual uses violence

against others out of greed, hatred, or disregard for human life, he or she is not considered an “outlaw.” Rather, the individual is a criminal, unless the violence is justified in the contexts of fighting a war, capital punishment, saving one’s honor, and so on.

Based on my analysis, the label “outlaw” is much like a mode or a state composed of a certain appearance (e.g. brawny physique, rugged appearance, and armament) that openly marks his “occupation” and his assumed habitual actions of exchanging (the threat of) violence and what he desires (money, goods, sex, etc.).²²⁷ This construction of outlaws parallels that of courtesans. As discussed in Chapter 1, due to the particular appearance, a courtesan can make a smooth transaction of sex and rewards without undesirable consequences.²²⁸ Similarly, based on the mutual understanding of the both parties (the offender and the offended) about each other’s wants and needs, they either choose to

²²⁷ Judith Butler famously theorized the performativity of gender in her monumental work, *Gender Trouble: Feminism and the Subversion of Identity* (New York: Routledge, 1990; 1999). According to Butler, gender is an identity constructed through a “stylized repetition of acts,” contrary to the common notion that it is one’s gender that causes one to perform acts in certain ways (p.179). This function of performativity, namely attaching a new meaning to repeated actions, is helpful in understanding how outlaws and courtesans are deemed different from non-occupational villains and promiscuous women.

²²⁸ It is possible for an “outlaw” to opt for obscuring his identity for a variety of incentives. However, as in the case of courtesans, presenting oneself as an “outlaw” is useful in that the threat of violence becomes more effective and therefore makes the “transaction” easier. Such marker of the two “modes” (i.e. being a courtesan or an outlaw) signifies the hyper-gender of the outcast groups.

make an expected transaction or resort to another, such as resistance by the victim and casualty of either party or both and escape of either party or both.

Additionally, it is important to point out another group *not* considered for my study. It is fairly well known that during the Kamakura and Muromachi periods, certain groups of rebels were branded as *akutō* (literally “evil bands” in modern Japanese), which has attracted the keen attention of renowned scholars in Japan, including Kuroda Toshio and Amino Yoshihiko.²²⁹ The best documented *akutō* is the so-called Kuroda Akutō, residents of the Kuroda estate in Iga province (present-day Mie) owned by Tōdaiji, and the majority of the previous research on historical *akutō* has been on this particular group. Nevertheless, according to Morten Oxenbell, when it comes to what exactly constitutes *akutō*, there is no consensus among historians due in part to the modern connotation of the word that skewed the perception of the group until recently.²³⁰ Another challenge for researching *akutō* is that the historical documents on those groups that are available today are mostly indictments filed by proprietors of lands in which they resided (in the case of the Kuroda Akutō, Tōdaiji), and, hence, researchers have direct access to “only one version of the conflict.”²³¹ For these reasons among others, *akutō* are not a part of this study.

²²⁹ See, for example, Kuroda Toshio, *Nihon chūsei hōkensei-ron* (Tokyo: Tokyo Daigaku Shuppankai, 1993) and Amino Yoshihiko, *Akutō to kaizoku: Nihon chūsei no shakai to seiji* (Tokyo: Hōsei Daigaku Shuppankyoku, 1995).

²³⁰ Morten Oxenboell, “Images of *Akutō*,” *Monumenta Nipponica*, Vol. 60, No. 2 (Summer, 2005), p. 235.

²³¹ *Ibid.*, p. 244.

That being said, I would like to remark on the curious connotation of the prefix “aku-” as in *akutō*. According to the *Nihon kokugo daijiten*, its primary definition is “evil” and “deviant.” Citations include the thirteenth-century collection of Buddhist tales *Shasekishū* (*aku-tengu*; “evil goblins”) and *Taionki*, a 16th century *waka* treatise by Matsunaga Teitoku (*aku-gosho*; “a deviant nobleman”). For the second definition, “unpleasant” and “imperfect,” the *Nihon Kokugo daijiten* shows two modern examples of *aku-fūshū* (unpleasant customs) and *aku-dōro* (poorly paved roads). The final and now obsolete definition listed for this prefix, however, has a positive connotation: “(Attached to a personal name or a similar word) it expresses that a person possesses exceeding ability, will power, and physical power, and that the individual is fearsome.”²³² Famous historical figures nicknamed with this prefix include Minamoto no Yoshihira (Aku-Genta Yoshihira; 1141-1160; a Minamoto warrior and an older brother of Yoritomo), Fujiwara no Yoronaga (Aku-Safu; 1120-1156; Minister of the Left during the reign of Emperor Konoe), and Taira no Kagekiyo (Aku-Shichibyōe; n.d.; a Taira warrior). This reminds us of the word *Emishi*, the appellation for the “unruly eastern barbarians” as well as the given name for Asuka and Nara period noblemen and military officers. These are, so to speak, tokens of cultural evidence that indicate the interrelationship between machismo and transgressiveness, which crosses the boundary of social classes.

²³² *Nihon kokugo daijiten*, 2nd ed., included in the online encyclopedia *Japan Knowledge*, s. v. “aku,” <http://www.japanknowledge.com/> (accessed May 28, 2011). Similarly, the term *akusō* (corrupt monks) has a secondary meaning of “monks who excel in fighting.”

This paradoxical construction of violence composed of manliness (positive) and transgressiveness (negative) is prevalent in my survey. As we have seen in the first part of this chapter, after the rise of the military class, warriors came to be associated with the positive aspect of violence such as physical might and bravado. Nevertheless, if a warrior's use of violence appears to be unjustifiable in some way, he can still be portrayed negatively. For instance, in the scene where Kiso Yoshinaka displays over six hundred heads of his enemies on the riverside and makes earth-shaking battle cries in the *Heike*, the narrator does not hesitate to describe it as, "a sight that drew tears from the eyes of all who witnessed it," emphasizing his cruel nature.²³³ Likewise, an outlaw is not always equated with the negative aspect of violence. In the following sections, I would like to investigate how outlaws are depicted in premodern texts and consider how their depictions differ from the non-occupational criminals and those who engage in legitimized violence.

VII. Criminals and Criminal Acts Portrayed in Buddhist Didactic Stories

It is quite surprising to see how rarely so-called "blue-collar crimes" are depicted in premodern Japanese texts, compared to the abundance of "socially legitimized" violence (i.e. organized battles, vendettas, and capital punishments), killings motivated by political gains, and violence committed by non-persons (i.e. devils and evil spirits of humans and animals), which are all well illustrated in a variety of texts including Heian court tales, martial epics,

²³³ McCullough, trans., *Heike*, p. 280.

noblemen's chronicles, noh plays, and anecdotal tales. This, of course, does not mean that outlaws were rare, but the contrast must reflect the attitudes of the mainstream society—those who possessed the resources to create such texts—regarding what events were noteworthy and otherwise.

Anecdotal tales are almost the sole genre that gives quite a few accounts of “illegitimatized violence,” of which the majority is composed for didactic purposes.²³⁴ In such a context, an episode of a criminal act becomes a powerful tool to educate the masses of karmic retribution. Curious is that the vast majority of villains who appear in such stories are not outlaws but ordinary members of society. One example is an account included in *Nihon ryōiki* (*Record of miraculous events in Japan*; compiled by Keikai in 822).²³⁵ In this anecdote, a Musashi resident named Kishi no Ōmaro was appointed to become a frontier soldier for three years. In order to stay with his beloved wife, however, he

²³⁴ Within the Buddhist doctrine of nondualism, the difference between “good” and “evil” is believed to be transcended in the realm of Ultimate Truth. Nevertheless, Buddhist literature composed for the laity adhered to its important mission of educating the masses on the “good” and “evil” within the realm of Provisional Truth. For details on the Buddhist notions of “evil,” see, for instance, Brook Ziporyn, *Evil and/or/as the Good: Omnicentrism, Intersubjectivity, and Value Paradox in Tiantai Buddhist Thought* (Cambridge: the Harvard Asian Center for the Harvard-Yenching Institute, 2000) and James C. Dobbins, *Jōdo shinshū: Shin Buddhism in Medieval Japan* (Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1989), pp. 47-62.

²³⁵ *Nihon ryōiki* (2:3). For the original, see SNKBZ 10, pp. 125-128. An adapted English translation by Kyoko Nakamura is included in Shirane and Arntzen, *Traditional Japanese Literature*, pp. 122-123. The same story is also found in *Konjaku monogatari-shū* (20:33) and *Hōbutsu-shū*, Vol. 7.

conspired to murder his own mother so that he would be exempted from his duty on the pretext of mourning. Ōmaro tricked his mother, who was a devout Buddhist, into believing that there would be one-week-long lectures on the Lotus Sutra in a neighboring village, brought her into deep mountains, and drew a sword at her. Stunned, the mother attempted to persuade Ōmaro to change his mind, but that seemed to be impossible. In the end, as if accepting this unexpected turn of fate, the old woman knelt down, took off her clothes, and asked Ōmaro to divide them among her three sons. What happens next, however, is an unequivocal triumph of goodness over evil:

When the wicked son stepped forward to cut off his mother's head, the earth opened up to swallow him. At that moment his mother grabbed her falling son by the hair and appealed to heaven, wailing, "My child has been possessed by a spirit and has been driven to commit such an evil deed. He is out of his mind. I beg you to forgive his sin." Despite all her efforts to pull him up by the hair, he fell. The merciful mother brought his hair back home to hold funeral rites and put it in a box in front of an image of Buddha and asked monks to chant scriptures.

The narrator concludes the story by saying:

How great was the mother's compassion! So great that she loved an evil son and did good on his behalf. Indeed, we know that an unfilial sin is punished immediately and that an evil deed never avoids a penalty.²³⁶

A similar story from *Nihon ryōiki* (1:29) features another "non-outlaw" malicious man, Nimaro. The narrator describes him as "ruthless and not believing in the Three Jewels (i.e., Buddha, Dharma, and monks)." One day a

²³⁶ Nakamura, *ibid.*, p. 123.

mendicant monk knocked on his gate, asking for food. Not only did he refuse to feed the monk, but Nimaro also physically tormented him, broke his alms bowl, and kicked him out of the premises. Soon afterwards, on his way to a neighboring village, Nimaro was caught in a shower. While he was taking shelter under someone's storehouse, the building suddenly caved in, crushing him to death.²³⁷ An almost identical plot can be found in the same anthology. This episode describes how a man who tortured a mendicant monk vomited black blood and died the following day (3:15).

In *Shasekishū* (A collection of sand and pebbles; compiled by Mujū Ichien in 1279), another case of divine punishment for a coldblooded murderer is described (9:7). A vassal of a warrior caught his menial stealing a short halberd. The vassal tied up the menial on a poll and stabbed his body with the very halberd for three days, saying, "This is what you wished for," despite the fact that his lord, who was mourning his parent's death, already granted the menial a pardon. The menial died in agony, as he screamed that the vassal would regret his action. Soon afterwards, the lord found out about this horrendous affair, and immediately banished the vassal. In his home province of Owari, the former vassal suffered from ceaseless, intolerable pain throughout his body, as if someone were piercing him with a sharp object, until he finally died in anguish. After giving the account of this event, the narrator goes on to preach the grave sin of all killings, with an emphasis on those of animals:

²³⁷ The same story is also included in *Konjaku* (20:26).

Karma is a terrifying matter. If one kills a living thing, he will definitely call forth retribution. If the victim is another human, the murderer will be punished based on the claim. However, men have no reservation for killing hoofed animals living in the mountains and fields or scaled creatures inhabiting in the river, for they are unable to make such a claim. Those who take lives of other creatures will be judged and sentenced in the Kingly Realm of Enma.... It is absolutely foolish of one not to fear the act of killing just because no one is filing a complaint, because he will be cast down to hell and undergo everlasting tortures by the devils....²³⁸

Another typical plot of Buddhist didactic stories, on the other hand, does frequently feature outlaws. In this second type of plot, an evildoer experiences a religious awakening after a spiritual encounter of some sort. *Shasekishū* collects a few such anecdotes. In one of them (6:7), a group of brigands robbed a highly renowned priest of money that he had just received as offerings for holding a Buddhist rite. Instead of fearing for his life or feeling distressed about the loss of money, the monk mourned the magnitude of the sufferings that await the bandits in hell. As the priest tearfully and wholeheartedly spoke of their grave sin, the head of the bandits also shed tears of regret and walked away. The next day, a lay monk with a freshly shaven head appeared at the priest's chamber with thirty chopped top-knots in hand. He said, "Here I am, the robber lay monk (*gōtō nyūdō*) from last night," adding that he had been awoken by the holy words of the reverend. At last, all of his thirty underlings were also inspired to become lay monks.²³⁹

²³⁸ SNKBZ 52, pp. 458-461.

²³⁹ Ibid., pp. 323-325.

Similarly, within the same anthology, a group of burglars broke into a Shingon monk's chamber only to leave the money behind due to his solemn, awe-inspiring disposition and attitude (6:13).²⁴⁰ Also, in Episode 10:7, a man who murdered a woman and her girl attendant for their clothes after having been persuaded by his wife renounced the world.²⁴¹ *Uji shūi monogatari* (A collection of tales from Uji; early thirteenth century), as well, includes an account of a former pirate who entered the Way of Buddhism after witnessing a miracle (10:10).²⁴²

The way the authors of the above-mentioned stories strategically selected the “villain” provides us with a clue as to their view of outlaws. For the first type of plot on karmic retribution, those who become subject to the heavenly punishments are civilians. One factor to explain this is the presumed audience. That is, based on the premise of such stories being didactic, the anecdotes naturally feature people like the target audience themselves, rather than professional criminals—unlikely readers of Buddhist didactic stories. More significantly, nonetheless, I would argue for another explanation: outlaws were not necessarily considered the most despicable people in society. Unlike the coldblooded, sadistic, selfish sinners in the stories, whom the readers are expected to loath and wish not to behave like, outlaws may represent positive elements such as machismo, fearlessness, and defiance to authority. Again, this

²⁴⁰ Ibid., p. 350.

²⁴¹ Ibid., pp. 548-551.

²⁴² SNKBZ 50, pp. 325-330.

is analogous to my finding of how sexual entertainers hardly, if at all, represented licentiousness, promiscuity, or immorality in Buddhist anecdotal tales surveyed for this study.

Conversely, featuring professional criminals for the tales on evildoers' spiritual awakening is very effective in order to exalt the supremacy of Buddhism. In this case, it is crucial for the readers to be able to sympathize with the evildoers, and thus the villains are required to possess the complex characterization of being somewhat agreeable *and* having accreted multitudes of sins. An abusive tyrant who kills innocent people for his personal gain, for instance, may not be an effective character for this type of narrative, since it is quite implausible for such an individual to suddenly realize the gravity of his sin. Moreover, the reader may not wish for the presumed mercy bestowed on such a villain by the Buddha. Essentially, this type of narratives is paralleled with the account of the courtesan who entered the Way of Buddha after meeting Hōnen and was finally reborn in the Pure Land (See Chapter 1, pp. 32-33).

Finally, a slightly different scenario that still effectively illustrates the excellence of Buddhism can be found: Deterrence of an evil act by the holy powers of Buddha. A very brief story included in the *Uji* gives an account of such an event. My translation of the entire story is as follows:

Long ago, around the Tenryaku era, a group of robbers intruded into the priests' quarters at Yasaka Temple, in which Jōzō resided. Nevertheless, those men merely stood there frozen, with their torches lit, swords drawn, and eyes wide open. Thus many hours passed. The break of dawn was approaching, and Jōzō respectfully

said to the statue of Buddha, “Please forgive them now.” It has been told that the robbers fled the temple without taking a thing.²⁴³

This particular story effectively makes use of the hypermasculine image of outlaws to demonstrate Buddha’s overwhelming superiority in power. My claim may become clearer by contrasting the above anecdote with two secular stories, also from the *Uji*, with a very similar motif. Both are summarized below (3:1 and 2:10 respectively):

A long time ago, there once was a greatly notorious commander-in-chief of robbers named Daitarō.²⁴⁴ He ascended to the capital and browsed around a neighborhood, looking for a potential house to break into. Then, he came across a rundown mansion with a wrecked gate in a rather deserted area, where a number of female attendants were laundering cloth and buying rolls of silk from the peddlers busily going in and coming out of the mansion. Daitarō thought this was a gift from heaven, and came back to this house disguised as a silk dealer in order to take a peek at the inside. Strangely, there was not a single man on site, and all he saw were female attendants. This seemed very convenient to Daitarō, and, the mansion appeared full of valuable goods.

That night, Daitarō returned to the house with a bunch of underlings. The moment they tried to step onto the premises, however, they all felt stunned and could not move forward because they felt as if someone were pouring boiling water on their faces. Terrified, they all fled the site.

The next day, Daitarō and his followers disguised themselves as silk peddlers and came back. Everything looked normal, with the same female

²⁴³ Ibid., p. 309.

²⁴⁴ *imijiki nusubito no dai-shōgun*; another example of connecting warriors and outlaws via hyper-masculine image. Hakamadare, the outlaw in the following story is introduced in the same way.

attendants busily running around the house. The same night, the men resumed their attempt to break into the house, but, again, they felt the same indescribable awe and could not follow through on their plan.

The same back-and-forth was repeated for another day. The next night, Daitarō finally walked into the mansion while thinking that this might be the last day of his life, and the other men nervously walked behind the leader. Suddenly, from inside the main building of the premises, bone-chilling squeaks were heard. It was the sound of someone readjusting his arrows. Because the robbers were certain that they were about to be pierced by those arrows, they scrambled to escape.

In the end, Daitarō learned from a friend that the mysterious house belonged to a valiant warrior nicknamed Ōya (“Great Arrow”). As soon as the friend mentioned the name, Daitarō threw his sake cup up in the air, knocked over all the dishes on the table, and ran away in fear.²⁴⁵

In the other story, the time was set in the tenth month, when a legendary outlaw named Hakamadare felt the need for winter clothes. As he wandered about in search of a victim, he spotted a flute-playing gentleman with layers of clothes. Hakamadare was delighted and ran after the man from behind. However, as he approached the man, he suddenly became immobile. After a few attempts, Hakamadare decided to draw his sword and started dashing toward the mysterious man. That is when the man stopped playing the flute, turned around, and said, “Who are you?” Hakamadare felt spineless in front of the man, and answered his question. When the man told the robber to follow, he felt as if “the devil sucked his soul out,” and just obeyed the command. At the

²⁴⁵ SNKBZ 50, pp. 104-108.

mansion, the gentleman— who turned out to be a famous military commander, Fujiwara no Yasumasa—gave Hakamadare a warm winter robe and told him to come back whenever he needed clothes. The story ends with a narration:

It has been reported that Hakamadare had said the following upon being captured, “I was just incredibly terrified and frightened. [Yasumasa] was a man of such majestic bearing.”²⁴⁶

In the above three anecdotes, none of the outlaws had a chance to exercise his hypermasculinity due to the miraculous power of the Buddha and the astounding awe of the warriors. Simply put, the outlaws were emasculated. To vividly exemplify the overwhelming power of Buddha and the two warriors, the emasculated beings almost had to be professional criminals, rather than ordinary citizens who attempted to ambush the monk or the warriors out of a personal grudge.

VIII. Criminals and Criminal Acts Portrayed in Secular Anecdotal Tales

In this section, I will switch my focus to secular anecdotes, contrasting how outlaws and non-professional villains are portrayed in them. With this last piece, a provisional picture of hypermasculinities, in relation to both overt and covert prestige, is presented.

Out of the thirty-one volumes of *Konjaku monogatari-shū*, one is dedicated to introducing twenty-nine accounts of transgressions, of which the gravity

²⁴⁶ Ibid., pp. 89-91.

ranges from rice theft to brutal murders: Volume 29, “Evil deeds of Japan.”²⁴⁷. It is interesting to find out what types of “evil deeds” were considered noteworthy enough by the compilers of *Konjaku* to make it into the book. While these tales are secular in nature, it is important to bear in mind that many of them are still meant to be didactic, typically summarizing the most significant lesson of the event in the final few sentences.

Within the twenty-nine narratives, seventeen feature occupational criminals. The vast majority are labeled as “bandits” (*tōzoku*) while in two stories the villains are called “beggars” (*kotsujiki* or *kotsugai*). Some of them are fully developed characters with personalities and emotions, and at times they are portrayed favorably. The non-occupational villains include famous warriors, politicians, a traveling monk, a policeman, wives, and a lowly servant. When these people are the perpetrators, much like the cases of Buddhist didactic stories, they typically represent extreme brutality motivated by pure greed.

The most dominant pattern is the secular version of the karmic retribution stories, or *kanzen chōaku* (“encourage good and vanquish evil”), wherein the criminal is punished by death penalty or incarceration. For this type of plot, professional criminals are featured in only three episodes (Episodes 5, 6, and 8), ending with the bandits being killed by famous warriors in the first two and incarceration of the robber in the last. In Episode 5, the robbers do not have much personality and merely function as a foil for the great warrior, Taira no

²⁴⁷ SNKBZ 38, pp. 283-386. Because Episode 16 lacks its main text and only the title survived, it is not counted towards the number.

Tadamori, who shoots the thieves to death.²⁴⁸ In Episode 6, the robbers are characterized as arrogant men who are in the end outsmarted by a servant of the house they tried to break into. Episode 8 is an extremely tragic case: A robber kidnaps a princess of Retired Emperor Kazan and escapes on a horse. At one point he becomes afraid that he would soon be caught and, in a panic, strips the robe from the princess and kicks her off the horse. The petrified princess freezes to death, and, to make the matters far worse, her body is viciously devoured by dogs.²⁴⁹ Although the robber is caught later, his presumed death penalty is not mentioned in the text, which makes this episode less of an example of *kanzen chōaku*. Moreover, the narrator's concluding remark suggests a critical tone towards the princess (and perhaps her attendants) for not being more vigilant, which may strike modern readers as rather ruthless.

The three *kanzen chōaku* stories with non-occupational criminals, on the other hand, vary significantly in the seriousness of the crimes. The least grave case concerns a policeman who stole a large amount of thread from a thief he had arrested and hid the thread under his *hakama* trousers. The tone of this anecdote is lighthearted and humorous, and the narrator tersely describes the event as, "ridiculous (*asamashi*)."²⁵⁰ The second anecdote deals with a wife who murdered her own husband with the help of her lover, although the focal point of this incident is the sagaciousness of Emperor Daigo, who mysteriously heard the

²⁴⁸ Ibid., pp. 303-307. For an English translation, see Royall Tyler, trans., *Japanese Tales* (New York: Pantheon Books, 1987), pp. 233-235.

²⁴⁹ SNKBZ 38, pp. 315-317. According to the annotation, this is a historical event.

²⁵⁰ SNKBZ 38, pp. 337-340.

fake crying of the woman in Kujō Horikawa from the imperial palace. The wife and her lover were both arrested and incarcerated, to which people said to each other, “One should never trust one’s wife, if she seems to have a wicked personality.” They also greatly praised their extraordinary sovereign.²⁵¹ Lastly, the ninth episode of the book far exceeds all the *kanzen chōaku* plots mentioned thus far in its offender’s maliciousness and the extent to which the people felt disgusted towards him. It begins as follows:

A long time ago, there once was a temple named _____ in the _____ County of _____ Province. Belonging to the temple was a monk who traveled around the country with a two-legged cane decorated with deer antlers in one hand and a small gong in the other, who taught the masses *nenbutsu*. One day, he bumped into a man carrying luggage on his back in the mountains. The two became companions, walking side by side. Around midday, the man sat on the side of the mountain road, took out his lunch and started eating. The monk was going to part with him, but the man kindly offered half of his lunch to the monk. Having eaten all of his food, the man stood and bent over to lift his luggage. At this moment, a thought came to the monk’s mind: “This is not a place many people come. If I beat this man to death and took his belongings and robe, no one would find out.” The monk grabbed his cane, and held down the neck of the man with the two-legged end made with metal. Panicked, the man screamed, “What are you doing?” and tried to escape. However, the monk was very stalwart and beat the man to death without showing any mercy. As soon as he grabbed the man’s belongings and robe, the monk fled the mountain in haste.

²⁵¹ Ibid., pp. 334-337.

The monk traveled a great distance and finally arrived at a village. Then he knocked on the door of a shack and asked the woman for a night's shelter, never dreaming that she was the wife of the man he had just murdered. The wife, who had been anxiously awaiting the return of her husband, recognized the robe the traveling monk was wearing. Extremely distressed, she quietly sneaked out of the house, and told her neighbor about this. Later that night, several young brawny men from the village tied the monk up and tortured him until he finally confessed. At the crack of dawn, a group of villagers made the monk lead them to the site, where the body of the man was still lying, yet to be damaged by birds or beasts. Upon seeing this, the man's wife and child cried hysterically. Then the villagers tied the monk up on a tree and shot him with an arrow. The narrator concludes:

Anyone who heard of this matter abhorred this monk. It has been said that the people who heard of this story said to each other, "The man offered to share his food with the monk out of pure kindness, but he had no sense of gratitude. Instead, he had a heinous heart. It is indeed remarkable that heaven also loathed him so much so that the monk wound up at none other than the poor man's own home, so he paid with his own death."²⁵²

For the rest of the stories collected in Book 29, justice is not necessarily served.²⁵³ The first non-*kanzen chōaku* pattern is the most common and five out

²⁵² Ibid., pp. 318-321.

²⁵³ Out of the total twenty-nine episodes, Episodes 1, 2, 3, 4, 7, 10, 22 are excluded from my analyses due to one of the following reasons: it is impossible to know whether the villain is a

of seven are categorized as this type: stories that focus on the shortcomings of the victims and/or merely praise the cleverness of the outlaws (Episodes 17, 19, 20, 21, and 23). To illustrate, I will provide Royall Tyler's translation of Episode 19 on the aforementioned legendary outlaw, Hakamadare:

Being a professional, the robber Hakamadare naturally ended up in jail. He was released under a general amnesty. Having nowhere to go then, and nothing else to turn his hand to, he went up to Osaka Pass and played dead, stark naked, beside the trail. The passing travelers clustered round and, noticing that he was not wounded, chattered to each other about how he might have died.

Long from Kyoto came an armed warrior on a good horse, followed by a troupe of servants and retainers. The warrior saw the crowd, stopped, and sent one of his men to find out what they were gawking at. The man reported that they were puzzling over a dead man without a wound on him. The warrior ordered his followers back into proper formation and rode on. He stared at the corpse as he passed. The crowd clapped their hands and laughed. "A fine warrior *you* are," they taunted him, "with all that train of yours, to be squeamish about a body!" The warrior ignored them.

After a while, the crowd dispersed, and another warrior came along albeit without a follower. He carelessly approached the body wondering what had caused his death. Then, Hakamadare leaped up, grabbed the samurai's dagger, and killed him instantly. With a full set of clothes, weapons, and a horse newly in possession, he became reunited with his former underlings. The band of brigands swept through multiple villages, terrorizing the commoners relentlessly. The narrator continues:

professional criminal or not; an occupational criminal appears as a character but does not commit a crime in the story; or the occupational criminal is a woman.

That's what a man like that will do if you give him half a chance. Just get close enough for him to touch you, and watch out! The first warrior, the one who rode resolutely by, turned out to have been a fellow named Taira no Sadamichi. Everyone who heard the story nodded approval of his action. It had been wise of him to pass on, despite his large train. And what a fool he had been, the one who, without a single follower by him, to go right up to the body!²⁵⁴

Another striking story with a remarkable conclusion is Episode 23, a well-known story adapted by Akutagawa Ryūnosuke (1892-1927) as "In a Grove" (*Yabu no naka*).²⁵⁵ A translation by Marian Ury is as follows:

At a time now past, a man who lived in the capital had a wife who came from Tanba Province. He accompanied her on a journey to Tanba. The husband had his wife ride their horse while he himself walked along behind, keeping guard, with a quiver with ten arrows on his back and a bow in his hand. Not far from Ōeyama there fell in with them a brawny-looking young man with a sword at his waist.

They walked along together, each inquiring politely where the other was going and chatting about this and that. The new man, the one with the sword, said, "This is a famous sword that I'm wearing, and heirloom from Mutsu Province. Look at it," and he unsheathed it. In truth it was a magnificent blade, and when the husband saw it he wanted it above all things....²⁵⁶

²⁵⁴ Tyler, *Japanese Tales*, pp. 205-206.

²⁵⁵ This story was adapted into Kurosawa Akira's 1950 film *Rashōmon*. The role of the outlaw, Tajōmaru, was played by the handsome, wildly popular movie star of the time, Mifune Toshiro (1920-1997).

²⁵⁶ Marian Ury, trans., *Tales of Times Now Past: Sixty-Two Stories from a Medieval Japanese Collection* (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1979), p. 184.

The man then suggested to the husband they should exchange their weapons, to which the husband agreed in a heartbeat. When the three went deep in the grove to have a meal, the young man took out the bow and arrow and pointed at the former owner, saying, “I’ll shoot if you move.” As soon as the husband surrendered, the young man tied him onto a tree.

Then this man went up to the woman and looked at her closely. She was twenty or a little older and of humble station but adorably pretty. Her beauty aroused his desire, and forgetting any other purpose, he made her take off her clothes. The woman had no way of resisting, and so she stripped as he told her to. Then he too undressed and embraced her and laid with her. The woman was helpless and had to obey. All the while her husband watched in his trusses. What must he have thought!²⁵⁷

After the man rode off on the couple’s horse, the wife freed the husband from his bonds.

He looked stupefied. “You wretch!” she exclaimed. “You good-for-nothing coward! From this day forward I’ll never trust you again.” Her husband said not a word, and together they went to Tanba.

The rapist²⁵⁸ had a sense of shame, for after all he did not rob the woman of her clothes. But the husband was a worthless fool: in the mountains to hand his bow and arrows to someone he’d never before laid eyes on was surely the height of stupidity.

No one knows what became of the other man. So the tale goes, and so it’s been handed down.²⁵⁹

²⁵⁷ Ibid., p. 185

²⁵⁸ This is Ury’s word (p. 185). The original reads, “the new man” (*ima no otoko*).

²⁵⁹ Ibid., p. 185.

What is common between Episodes 19 and 23 is the heightened machismo of the two outlaws. Although in the story of Hakamadare, the people were impressed with the astute judgment of Taira no Sadamichi, we need to bear in mind that Sadamichi, who was accompanied by a group of retainers, deliberately left the unarmed Hakamadare alone (How refined his naked body must have been!). This means that Sadamichi chose protection of his life over that of his masculinity. As for the warrior who approached Hakamadare and became his prey, not only was he criticized for his carelessness by the narrator, his image was also completely emasculated.

In the story of Ōeyama, the narrator painted a vivid picture of the young, brawny, attractive man, who boldly violated the beautiful woman in front of her husband. (Perhaps the outlaw is depicted so favorably that Ury might have felt the need to use the judgmental appellation, “rapist,” in her translation). As for the husband, not only was he emasculated by the outlaw but also by his own wife. The remaining seven episodes in the volume can be understood as sensational retelling of criminal events. They are implicitly didactic by teaching the readers to be vigilant about whom they associate with and by simply informing them of the unfair nature of life. Just two of the seven feature occupational criminals, who are referred to as “beggars” (Episodes 28 and 29). In these, a heavier focus is placed on the victims rather than the villains. The first story unfolds around a love affair between a young, handsome middle captain of the imperial guard and a beautiful woman living in a mansion in Kiyomizu. After they fell deeply in love, the woman tearfully confessed to the middle captain that she had been

kidnapped by the master of the mansion, a former beggar, and been used to lure affluent gentlemen into the house. She told him that she had helped the beggar kill and steal from two other gentlemen and all of their retainers thus far.

However, she would refuse to be a part of this horrendous crime any longer.

After letting the middle captain escape, she died by being pierced with the very pike that would have killed him. Towards the end of the story, the narrator praises the righteousness of the woman as “truly rare,” as well as the wit of the child servant who had come along with the middle captain. Nevertheless, the true moral of the story is expressed in the last remark: “Therefore, it has been handed down that the people who heard of this event said to each other that one should not wander into a strange place after seeing a beautiful woman.”²⁶⁰

The other tragedy befalls a young mother and her child while traveling. Two beggars grabbed the woman, dragged her into the deep mountains, and tried to rape her. She pretended as though she had given in, but lied to them saying, “I am suffering from a bad case of diarrhea today. So, before you can do what is in your mind to me, I have to go into the bush and come right back.” As a token of the “truthfulness” of her words, she left her beloved child with the beggars and ran for her life. Luckily, she ran into a horde of mounted warriors, who rescued her. When the warriors and the young mother went back to the site, the dismembered body of the child was left on the ground. The warriors praised

²⁶⁰ For the full story in the original, see SNKBZ 38, pp. 374-381. For an English translation, see Tyler, *Japanese Tales*, pp. 110-113.

the woman's chastity, after which the narrator concludes: "Therefore, it's been handed down that even among lowly people, some know shame."²⁶¹

To put things in perspective, I shall point out that in all five accounts on evil deeds committed by non-professional criminals for which justice was not served within the narrative, the villains—all but one are men in high positions—are portrayed devilishly (Episodes 10, 24, 25, 26, and 27). While the central point of each anecdote is the sheer wickedness of those men, the readers are left frustrated with the reality that some powerful men can abuse others without fearing a consequence. To illustrate this, I will provide summaries of Episodes 25 and 26 below:

A long time ago, there once was a warrior named Taira no Sadamori. While he was the governor of Tanba, he suffered from a malignant sore (*kasa*). Therefore, he invited a renowned doctor named _____ of _____ from the capital and had him take a look. The doctor said, "This is a terrible sore. I will have to prescribe the medicine Dried Infant (*jikan* 児干)²⁶². This is a medicine you cannot openly discuss. However, if you wait too long, it may not be effective. Please find the ingredient as soon as possible."

Tadamori called in his son, whose wife was pregnant, and instructed him to obtain the fetus. Horrified, the son returned to the doctor and begged to spare the lives of his wife and unborn child. So, the doctor told Tadamori that the fetus

²⁶¹ Ibid., pp. 381-384.

²⁶² Although the annotation of SNKBZ glosses this term as "dried liver of an infant," according to an article by Andrew Edmund Goble titled "War and Injury: The Emergence of Wound Medicine in Medieval Japan," this is dried fetus. See *Monumenta Nipponica*, Vol. 60, No. 3 (Autumn 2005), p. 322.

would not be effective if related to the patient. Disappointed, Tadamori searched for another source. Upon hearing that one of the female servants was six-months pregnant, Tadamori sent someone to slit her stomach open. But he was disappointed again, because the child was female and the medicine must be made of a male fetus. Eventually, Tadamori obtained a male fetus from somewhere, and his sore was cured. Now he conspired to have the doctor killed, as he knew that Tadamori's sore had originated from an arrow wound, and he was afraid of damaging his reputation as a military commander. After all, due to the aid of Tadamori's son, the doctor successfully tricked Tadamori's men into believing he was someone else, a courtier, so the courtier was killed in place of the doctor. The narrator comments, "It is astoundingly cruel and shameless of Tadamori to attempt to cut the stomach of his own daughter-in-law and take her fetus."²⁶³

The next story is also about a cold-blooded selfish man in power: a governor of Hyūga who confined one of his secretaries in a room and made him falsify old paperwork. After twenty long days, the governor praised the man's hard work, gave him four rolls of silk, and disappeared. Then two armed men escorted him to a quiet place. The secretary despaired to find out that the governor was going to kill him. So, he begged the armed men to take him home and see his eighty-year old mother, wife and ten-year old child so that he could exchange farewell.

²⁶³ SNKBZ 38, pp. 363-366.

The men arrived at the secretary's house, and someone went inside to inform about the matter. The old mother with snow-white hair, and the child, held in the wife's arms came out. The secretary asked his mother to step forward and said:

"I have not done anything wrong, but due to karma from my previous life, I must leave this life. Please do not lament so much. I know my child will be fine, even if he will eventually have a new father. However, Mother, it is excruciating to think what you will do after I am gone. This is more heart-wrenching than the pain I am about to endure. Now, please go inside. I just wanted to take one more look at your face."

After hearing this, the armed men wept. The men who were reining in the horses also shed tears. The mother also kept crying frantically until she finally fainted.

The armed men were no longer able to prolong the farewell, so they told the secretary to stop talking and escorted him. Deep into the chestnut woods, they shot the secretary with an arrow, and went back to the governor's mansion with the chopped head.

Come to think it, what kind of sin did the governor of Hyūga end up committing? Falsifying his paperwork was sinful enough, but it is incomprehensible to think how grave his sin must have been for murdering an innocent man. It has been handed down that those who heard about this loathed the governor, saying that his sin is as deep as a lowly robber's.²⁶⁴

²⁶⁴ Ibid., pp. 367-370.

	Religious Tales	Secular Tales
Non-occupational Criminals	-Karmic retribution	- <i>Kanzen chōaku</i> -Ruthless reality
Occupational Criminals	-Religious awakening -Deterrence of a crime	- <i>Kanzen chōaku</i> -Ruthless reality -Praising the criminal

The chart above illustrates the themes of stories surveyed for this study. As mentioned above, the most heinous crimes are usually committed by non-occupational criminals, warning the readers against engaging in such acts themselves as well as being subject to abuse by others. In no cases, the non-occupational criminals are praised for their wisdom. In contrast, within my corpus, outlaws rarely harm others within the story. Instead, they often function as a foil to more powerful being, namely, the supremacy of Buddhism or eminent warriors. In three cases, the narrator even praised the cleverness of the villain. Deducing from these findings, it is clear that outlaws were foremost associated with hypermasculinity, and their connection with iniquity, immorality, and wickedness comes second. Furthermore, unlike the hypermasculinity of the elite military class examined in the first half of this chapter, outlaws are associated with defiance toward authority, a hallmark of covert prestige.

To reiterate, the deeply intertwining relationship between outlaws and the notion of hypermasculinity is parallel to that of courtesans and hyperfemininity, depicted in a range of premodern Japanese texts. On one hand, promiscuity and strong attachment to corporal pleasure are harshly condemned in a number of Buddhist scriptures and many religious didactic stories warn the readers against such human traits, giving accounts of wives and monks who received divine

punishments. On the other hand, sexual entertainers are hardly depicted as promiscuous, morally corrupt, or deserving to be cast down to hell. That is to say, the *performativity* of selling sex and committing crimes seems to allow those acts to surpass the moral judgment and in some cases even glorifies them due to their heightened femininity and masculinity. Once a figure is established as a courtesan or an outlaw, which can happen instantaneously just by the narrator's referring to him as a robber or her as a courtesan, the readers no longer need to read about what they habitually do. What is also achieved instantly is the superimposition of their gender stereotypes, some of which are positive. Due to these layers of meanings the readers (are expected to) assign to the literary figures, each anecdote functions as intended by the author or a compiler without spelling out everything about the characters.

IX. Conclusion

In this chapter, I have closely examined gender constructions of warriors and outlaws, two groups of men who earn a living by means of violence in a broad sense. Combined with imperial priestesses and courtesans, four groups in total can be related vertically by the type of prestige and laterally by the gender.

	Overt Prestige	Covert Prestige
Hyperfemininity	Imperial Priestesses	Courtesans
Hypermasculinity	Elite Warriors	Outlaws

My study has revealed that the two elite groups, imperial priestesses and elite warriors, cannot draw a neat parallel. This is so because ideal masculinity in premodern Japanese society became fragmentary due to the two competing elite classes, aristocrats and high-ranking military officials, while *saiō* did not have a rival cohort of women with whom they equally shared the hyperfemininity associated with overt prestige. Consequently, there was not a samurai equivalent of Hikaru Genji, whether in fiction or legend, who was regarded as the archetypal male ideal even after the rise of the military class in the late Heian period. This finally changed with the *Gikeiki* of the Muromachi period. It marked the birth of a new tragic military hero, Minamoto no Yoshitsune, who was newly equipped with courtly elegance and a *femme fatale* beauty.

In contrast, the two outcast groups, courtesans and outlaws, exhibit more of a parallel structure in that each group often surpasses its transgressiveness and depicted in a positive light, although this applies to the female group more frequently than the male. One way to explicate this phenomenon is that within the literary tradition of premodern Japan, transgressiveness is hardly viewed as a negative characterization but quite the reverse. Numerous beloved literary figures are transgressive, most notably Hikaru Genji, who commits adultery with his own step-mother/empress, and it may not be exaggeration to say those imperfect heroes are cherished by generations of readers rather because of their humanly weakness.

Lastly, as mentioned, the tendency of glorifying transgressive futures/acts is clearer for courtesans. This is probably because sex trade is no greater threat

to society as violent crimes are. In addition, considering the fact that men generally occupied a higher percentage of authorship and readership of the literary works, the desirability of courtesans was probably understood more readily than that of outlaws.

In the next chapter, I am going to examine violations of Buddhist celibacy precept. While making a living as a courtesan or an outlaw is at times described as sinful in various texts, they are also subject to regulations by civil laws. Monks' and nuns' breaching of celibacy precepts is, on the other hand, is almost strictly a religious transgression. Contrasting these different types of transgressive literary figures may elucidate how transgression was viewed by mainstream society juxtaposed with gender and sexuality of the so-called "offenders."

CHAPTER 3: HYPERSEXUALITIES OF BUDDHIST PRIESTS

I. Introduction

The previous two chapters have examined the representations of hyperfemininities and hypermasculinities within ancient and medieval texts, discussing how imperial priestesses, courtesans, elite warriors, and outlaws were portrayed in the literary world. During this process, I have also touched on the Heian model of ideal manhood among the aristocracy (i.e. feminine masculinity), which exhibits a stark contrast to the hypermasculinity of the military class. Thus, I have so far considered the female and male gender ideals of elite and outcast classes. In the current chapter, I will direct my attention to the Buddhist communities in premodern Japan, investigating the literary depictions of the last of the three ruling classes, elite monks, as well as their marginalized counterpart, the so-called *hakai-sō* (“precept-breaking monks”) especially from the perspective of their sexualities.²⁶⁵

From the beginning of the propagation of Buddhism during the sixth century until the Meiji government decreed that monks (but not nuns) should be free to marry in 1872, monks and nuns were in principle expected to practice

²⁶⁵ At times, academic studies on the militarization of Buddhist institutions characterize “monk-warriors” (*sōhei*) as a type of *hakai-sō*. Nevertheless, Mikael S. Adolphson (2007) points out that the term *sōhei* and its accompanying stereotypes are products of the Tokugawa period and that those who actually participated in combat were composed of heterogeneous people, of whom the majority were laymen. See *The Teeth and Claws of the Buddha: Monastic Warriors and Sōhei in Japanese History* (Honolulu: University of Hawai’i Press, 2007), pp. 1-20.

sexual abstinence.²⁶⁶ In other words, transcending one's biological sex was a significant part of taking the tonsure, as nuns eliminated their feminine markers (e.g. long hair, makeup, colorful robes), both monks and nuns dressed alike in simple robes, and they ceased to engage in sexual relationships, whether reproductive or amorous. Because sexual acts of those who took the celibacy vow can be thus regarded as a kind of hypersexuality, I have entitled this chapter "Hypersexualities of Buddhist Priests," drawing a parallel structure with the hyperfemininities and hypermasculinities of the elites and outcasts we have considered up to this point.²⁶⁷

Much as in the previous two chapters, I am going to first explore literary representations of an elite group associated with overt prestige, followed by an outcast group in relation to their covert prestige. In Section II of this chapter, I will provide an overview of how the Buddhist Vinaya approaches the sexuality of monks and nuns. This will help illustrate the historical, cultural, and political dynamics of premodern Japanese society that fostered a general leniency towards sexualities of clerics. In the following section, I will discuss the practice of *nanshoku* (male-male love), with a particular focus on how romantic and/or sexual relationships between priests and adolescent acolytes (*chigo*) came to be

²⁶⁶ Well-known exceptions include monks of the True Pure Land School (Jōdo Shinshū).

²⁶⁷ In this study, hypersexualities of nuns are not considered because there are not enough literary texts that depict nuns' engagement of sexual acts (one of the few examples is *Kokon chomonjū*, No. 551). Furthermore, when a nun's sexual encounter is described in a text, it is treated as an individual, independent occurrence, rather than a part of a larger, systematically established custom.

established and widely practiced in Buddhist communities. In Section IV, literary depictions of the monks involved in pederastic relationships with *chigo* within poetry and prose are examined. Section V will deal with the sexualities of *hakai-sō*, with a special focus on one of the most prominent religious figures of Japan, Ikkyū Sōjun (1394-1481), based on his self-representation in seven-character *jueju* (J. *shichigon zekku*) and his posthumous legends.

II. The Development of Buddhist Vinaya and Celibacy Precept in Premodern Japanese Context

The Buddhist Vinaya is the regulatory framework for the monastic community originally spoken by the historical Buddha. It meticulously stipulates well over two hundred rules for priests and over three hundred for nuns.²⁶⁸ All the instructions one needs to follow in order to attain enlightenment are presented in the form of precepts, and during the ordination ceremony, he or she vows to adhere to those precepts. When and if the ceremony is conducted correctly by a qualified preceptor on an authorized ordination platform (*kaidan*), the monk or nun is believed to acquire an internal force known as *kaitai* (“essence of the Vinaya”), which prevents the individual from committing a sin.²⁶⁹ Therefore, the

²⁶⁸ Due to the fact that the Vinaya was orally transmitted during the lifetime of Śakyāmuni Buddha, after his death, it was compiled into many variants. In ancient Japan, the *Four Part Vinaya* (J. *Shibun ritsu*) and the *Brahmā Net Bodhisattva Vinaya* (J. *Bonmō bosatsu-kai*) became of special import. See Matsuo Kenji, *Hakai to nanshoku no Bukkyō-shi*, (Tokyo: Heibonsha, 2008), pp. 20-21.

²⁶⁹ William M. Bodiford, “Introduction,” in William M. Bodiford, ed., *Going Forth: Visions of Buddhist Vinaya* (Honolulu: University of Hawai‘i Press, 2005), pp. 2-3.

Vinaya is to be interpreted “not as rules imposed from the outside, but as the manifestation of an inner spiritual quest.”²⁷⁰

Two centuries after the official transmission of Buddhism to Japan through the Korean Peninsula around the mid-500s, the renowned Vinaya master of Tang China named Ganjin (Ch. Jianzhen; 688-763) arrived in the capital of the time, Nara, in 754. His primary mission was to pass the Vinaya onto the Japanese Buddhist community. With the guidance of Ganjin, Japan’s first ordination platform was constructed in the precincts of Tōdaiji in the following year, which was a mandatory step to producing the first generation of continentally authorized Buddhist monks in Japan. On the significance of this historical event, Matsuo Kenji states:

This inception of Buddhist ordination in Japan signified crucial milestones. First, this was a pivotal advancement of Japan’s regional status in East Asia, for it acquired the means to formally ordain [priests and nuns] based on the procedures established in China.... Back then, China was the leading power of East Asia, and many of the monks had traveled [there to study Buddhism]. [Before 755,] the Japanese monks, not having received the Vinaya on the ordination platform, were probably treated as priests-in-training....²⁷¹

In other words, the court’s effort for establishing an authentic ordination system was as politically motivated as it was a religious achievement. Furthermore, Matsuo goes on to remark that one of the byproducts of this newly installed

²⁷⁰ Ibid., p. 3.

²⁷¹ Matsuo Kenji, “<Kai> to Nihon Bukkyō: Hakai to jikai no hazama de,” in Matsuo Kenji, ed., *Shisō no shintai: Kai no maki* (Tokyo: Shunjūsha, 2006), p. 11.

practice was the seniority system called *kairō*. *Kairō* is a hierarchy within the monasteries purely based on the sum of years since one's ordination, which has little to do with a monk's profound understanding of Buddhist teachings.²⁷² Such politicizing of the priesthood foreshadowed its growing tendency of turning away from the Vinaya.

Another factor that may have contributed to the lax attitude towards the Vinaya was rather inadvertently brought about by the founder of Japanese Tendai (Ch. Tiantai) School, Saichō (767-822). In 785, at the age of eighteen, he received the precepts at Tōdaiji, where “he had witnessed the zenith of Nara Buddhism, with its emphasis on the academic study of Buddhism on the one hand and its heavy involvement in secular affairs and the world of politics on the other.”²⁷³ Only three months after his official ordination, Saichō left the capital and retreated to Mt. Hiei. The next thirteen years of his life were spent in seclusion, searching for a supreme Buddhist teaching, which Saichō finally identified as the doctrine of the One Vehicle (Sk. *Ekayana*) preached in the *Lotus Sutra*. This was followed by his travel to Tang China in 804 to further his understandings of the Tiantai principles among other Buddhist teachings. After his return, Saichō devoted the rest of his life to establishing the Japanese Tendai School as well as to a radical departure from the hitherto Buddhist tradition in Japan: the construction of a new ordination platform at Enryakuji and

²⁷² Ibid., p. 12.

²⁷³ Tamura Yoshirō, *Japanese Buddhism: A Cultural History*, trans. Jeffrey Hunter (Tokyo: Kosei Publishing Co., 2000), p. 62.

abandonment of the *Four Part Vinaya* brought by Ganjin. Saichō regarded this Theravāda sutra as “*hīnayāna*” (inferior) and advocated adopting the apocryphal *Brahmā Net Bodhisattva Vinaya*, a Mahāyāna (superior) Vinaya. Seven days after the death of Saichō, the court finally authorized Enryakuji to build its own ordination platform, where the rites were henceforth conducted based on the Mahāyāna Vinaya.²⁷⁴

Contrary to the intention of Saichō, however, as the Tendai ordination at Mt. Hiei became more prevalent, rigid adherence to the Vinaya became of secondary import, due to the laity-centered nature of the Mahāyāna principles.²⁷⁵ One of the outcomes of this trend is described by William M. Bodiford: “[T]he vast majority of Japanese Buddhist monks took monastic vows no more demanding than those asked of laymen and laywomen. Many distinctions between a lay lifestyle and a monastic one were abandoned.”²⁷⁶

Matsuo identifies still another factor that may have accelerated the deterioration of the Vinaya: skirmishes between temples. Despite the fact that

²⁷⁴ For details, see Paul Groner, *Saichō: The Establishment of the Japanese Tendai School*, Berkeley Buddhist Studies Series 7 (Berkeley: Center for South and South East Asian Studies, University of California at Berkeley, 1984), especially Chapters 5, 7, and 8.

²⁷⁵ William M. Bodiford, “Bodhidharma’s Precepts in Japan,” in William M. Bodiford, ed., *Going Forth* (Honolulu: University of Hawai’i Press, 2005), p. 185. Of many Mahāyāna sutras, the *Vimalakīrtinirdeśa*, the teaching of the wealthy, married, lay bodhisattva, was especially influential in East Asia in modifying attitudes regarding desire and sexuality. See, for instance, *The Holy Teaching of Vimalakīrti: A Mahāyāna Scripture*, trans., Robert A. F. Thurman (University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1976).

²⁷⁶ *Ibid.*, p. 185.

both belonged to the Japanese Tendai School, Enryakuji and Onjōji (Miidera)—two of the largest temples in Heian Japan—had a history of violent conflicts from the late ninth century onward. By the early twelfth century, the monks of Miidera were customarily ordained at Tōdaiji instead of on the Enryakuji platform that Saichō had built.²⁷⁷ Similarly, monks of two Shingon temples, Tōji and Kongōbuji, who had traditionally received the precepts at Tōdaiji, started to rely on Enryakuji for providing their monks with the ordination rites in the early thirteenth century. Due to this muddling, differences between the ordination procedures at Enryakuji and Tōdaiji gradually diminished, and the primary goal of these religious powerhouses shifted towards mass-production of “official priests” (*kansō*) who would serve the state at large for the purpose of praying for its stability and welfare.²⁷⁸

These historical, political, and cultural dynamics of premodern Japanese society all contributed to the less-than-rigid adherence to the Vinaya in the monasteries, despite the prohibitions stipulated not only by the precept but also by some civil laws.²⁷⁹ Of course, there ought to be numerous other factors intertwining to sustain the phenomenon collectively, although it is impossible to enumerate all. For now, I would mention one more possible factor, a Mahāyāna

²⁷⁷ For the rivalry between Enryakuji and Onjōji, see Adolphson, *Teeth and Claws*, pp. 21-56.

²⁷⁸ Because the Mahāyāna-based ordination of Enryakuji was not recognized in China, the court customarily permitted Enryakuji-ordained priests to travel to China with substitute certificates issued by Tōdaiji. See Matsuo, <*Kai*> to *Nihon Bukkyō*, pp. 20-21.

²⁷⁹ For the examples of secular laws, see, for instance, Hiramatsu Ryūen, “Nihon Bukkyō ni okeru sō to chigo no nanshoku,” *Nihon kenkyū* 34 (March 2007), pp. 91-92.

dogma known as “original enlightenment” (*hongaku*). Originally a Huayan and Tiantai doctrine, it grew to be especially influential in medieval Japan.²⁸⁰

Whereas it is beyond the scope of this dissertation to discuss the significance of *hongaku*, to borrow Tamura Yoshirō’s words, it “reveals the ultimate nature of existence, the ultimate realm, and elucidates its logical structure.”²⁸¹ This doctrine assumes that “[h]uman existence is twofold, comprising an ultimate, monistic aspect and an actual, dualistic aspect,” and being human “entails the task of realizing the ultimate, monistic aspect within the actual, dualistic aspect.”²⁸² Because *hongaku* transcends all dualism conceptualized in the human realm, it eradicates distinctions between life and death, good and evil, and even Buddha and human beings. This idea evolved into the notion that humans were born enlightened, which, for some priests, became a pretext for slighting the Vinaya:

Since the Buddha and ordinary human beings are one in essence, it is tempting to affirm the present state of ordinary human beings as identical to the state of the Buddha. This ignores, however, the dual nature of provisional reality. It is impossible to establish the activity of the nondual within the realm of duality. Only with the premise of the provisional reality of a dual nature does the nondual essence come alive....But the Tendai priests tended to become too attached to the realm of the nondual essence and neglected to apply that principle to the dualistic human

²⁸⁰ For a comprehensive study on *hongaku*, see Jacqueline Ilyse Stone, *Original Enlightenment and the Transformation of Medieval Japanese Buddhism* (Honolulu: University of Hawai’i Press, 1999).

²⁸¹ Tamura, *Japanese Buddhism*, p. 76.

²⁸² *Ibid.*, p. 76. Also see Faure, *Red Thread*, pp. 39-40.

realm. When they did direct their attention to the dualistic realm of actuality, they were apt to affirm it *as it was* as the nondual essence and to teach that evil is good and ordinary people are buddhas. This encouraged people to indulge their desires and contributed to moral degeneration.²⁸³

Out of all the sins that monks and nuns may commit, engagement in sexual acts is one that the Vinaya goes to great lengths to define and describe, as if attempting to list every humanly possible way to achieve sexual pleasure and every possible type of accomplice one may encounter. To illustrate this, Bernard Faure quotes from the *Samantapāsādikā* (a fifth-century commentary to the *Vinaya Piṭaka*):

[The commentary considers it the sexual act] “when the external part of the male organ is inserted, even as much as a sesame seed, into the female organ—the humid region where the wind itself does not reach.” The act comprises four phases: “the initial entrance, the time of staying in, the time of taking out, and the subsequent period. If the monk feels pleasure during any of the four phases, he is guilty; otherwise he is innocent.”

But clarifications do not stop here....The commentary, concerned about the identity of potential partners, lists “three kinds of females,” two types of “neuters”...and three kinds of males....At any rate, through a complicated calculation based on the principle that some of these categories of beings (human females and hermaphrodites, non-person, and animals) have “three ways,” whereas others (“neuters” and human, nonhuman, and animal males) have only two, the commentator reaches a total of thirty “ways” into which the insertion of a monk’s

²⁸³ Ibid., p. 77.

penis—“even to the extent equal to the length of a sesame seed”—constitutes an act involving “defeat” and requires exclusion from the community.²⁸⁴

It seems reasonable that the Buddha and his followers (i.e. compilers of the Vinaya commentaries) were especially preoccupied with the issue of sex due to the magnitude of attachment and sufferings it can cause. Not only does carnal desire impede one’s quest for enlightenment, but sex also procreates offspring for whom humans are bound to feel love and attachment. Thus, the cycle of human sufferings would never cease. The historical Buddha also famously renounced his wife, Yaśodharā, just before entering the new life of ascetic practice. The night before the so-called Great Departure, the Buddha purposefully slept with his wife and impregnated her. Remarkably, her gestation period lasted for the next six years. In the end, Yaśodharā gave birth to a son, which concurred with the enlightenment of the Buddha—an event that “would presumably count as the fulfillment of the Buddha’s familial role.”²⁸⁵

At any event, severance of all amorous feelings towards women is difficult even for some of the closest disciples to Śākyamuni Buddha.²⁸⁶ To spiritually awake his followers, the Buddha frequently talks about the defilement of the human body as a passage from the *Sutta Nipata* (1:11) exemplifies:

²⁸⁴ Faure, *Red Thread*, p. 76.

²⁸⁵ Alan Cole, “Buddhism,” in Don S. Browning, M. Christian Green, and John Witte Jr., eds., *Sex, Marriage, and Family in World Religions* (New York: Columbia University Press, 2006), p. 329.

²⁸⁶ See, for example, Faure, *Red Thread*, p. 16 and p. 41.

[T]he body is not seen for what it is. The body is filled with intestines, stomach, the lump of the liver, bladder, lungs, heart, kidneys, and spleen. It contains mucus, sweat, saliva, fat, blood, synovial fluid, bile, and oil. Also, filth constantly oozes out of the nine human cavities.... However, the fool ignorantly believes that it is pure....

Having heard the words of the [Buddha], the wise monk reached complete realization of this, as he can now see the body for what it is....²⁸⁷

As mentioned in Chapter 1, the defilement of body was such a powerful expedient means to deflect the attention of male Buddhist followers from women, it gradually evolved into a number of misogynistic discourses that later became prevalent in (but not limited to) Japan.²⁸⁸ Of all, the most influential is the notion of the “Five Obstacles, Three Obediences” (*goshō sanjū*). The first part refers to the five different spiritual statuses that women are inherently unable to attain: the god Brahma, the god Śakra, Māra, a universal monarch, and a buddha. The Three Obediences indicates the three types of male figures (fathers, husbands, and sons), whom women must obey. Additionally, pollution by blood, in particular that of menstruation and child birth, as represented in the influential Chinese apocrypha *Blood Bowl Sutra*, reinforced the idea of the defilement of female body to the extreme. These misogynistic ideologies collectively “justified the institutional submission of women, and their exclusion of women from sacred

²⁸⁷ Nakamura Hajime, trans. *Budda no kotoba: Sutta Nipata* (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1958: 1976), pp. 40-41.

²⁸⁸ See, for example, Ōgoshi Aiko, “Bukkyō to sekushuariti,” in Ōgoshi Aiko & Minamoto Junko, *Kaitai suru Bukkyō: Sono sekushuariti-kan to shizen-kan* (Tokyo: Heibunsha, 1994), pp. 3-131.

places (*nyonin kekkai*), or even, in the worst-case scenario, from paradise and buddhahood.”²⁸⁹

Nevertheless, the inferior political, biological, and religious status of women did not keep some priests, let alone laymen, from having sex with them. Furthermore, there is a large corpus of evidence indicating that it was never uncommon for priests to engage in sexual relationships with women, as the Buddhologist Ishida Mizumaro dedicates an entire book to introducing various extant texts that record events ranging from monks’ illicit affairs to raising families.²⁹⁰ In premodern Japan, the most famous married monk is Shinran (1173-1262), the founder of the True Pure Land Sect (*Jōdo shinshū*). Not surprisingly, the monks of the True Pure Land Sect are known for openly having wives.²⁹¹

With that being said, engaging in sexual relationships with women were still forbidden by the Vinaya and considered a taboo within the Buddhist community at large. One way to put this in perspective is to think of how prevalent and yet equally scandalous illicit extramarital affairs are in today’s Japan, the United States, and other industrialized nations. In addition to numerous religious tales in which monks and nuns are subject to heavenly punishments for breaching the celibacy precept, the following anecdote,

²⁸⁹ Bernard Faure, *The Power of Denial: Buddhism, Purity, and Gender* (Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003) pp. 62-63.

²⁹⁰ Ishida Mizumaro, *Nyobon: Hijiri no sei* (Tokyo: Chikuma Shobō, 1995).

²⁹¹ *Ibid.*, p. 121.

presented as a historical event, features a mother who attempts to kill her own baby fathered by a high-ranking priest in fear of scandal.

It has been said that Bishop Jōson is the child-disciple (*shin deshi*) of Archbishop Ningai [951-1046]. A certain female attendant had an illicit affair with Archbishop Ningai and soon afterwards gave birth to a son. She allegedly made the baby swallow mercury, for being afraid of the revelation of the matter when her son grew up. Because mercury would still make the survivor of the poison impotent, Jōson never violated men or women for his lifetime.²⁹²

This anecdote from the *Kojidan* (Talks about Ancient Matters; 1212-15) exemplifies that sex with a woman was considered as a serious taboo. Moreover, as Matsuo states, the story is intriguing in that the narrator also mentions that Jōson “violated” (*okasu*) no men, indicating how common *nanshoku* (male-male love) was among Buddhist priests.²⁹³

As closely examined next, a certain type of *nanshoku*—pederastic relationships between monks and their acolytes (*chigo*)—was indeed so ubiquitous to the extent that it was “the norm,” or a significant part of the medieval monastic culture with little signs of guilt or fear of negative consequences. In the following section, the historical and cultural backgrounds of monk-*chigo* relationships are first considered, representing the overt prestige of monk’s sexuality.

²⁹² SNKBT 41, pp. 329-330. I will discuss the significance of the verb “*okasu*” in Note 303 below.

²⁹³ Matsuo, *Hakai to nanshoku*, p. 65.

III. Historical and Cultural Backgrounds of the *Chigo* System

From the late Heian and through the Tokugawa period, Buddhist temples customarily employed beautiful teenage pageboys known as *chigo*, which literally means “children.”²⁹⁴ In exchange with service to their masters, *chigo* received food and shelter, education in the Way of Buddha, training in performance arts and poem composition, among other things.²⁹⁵ Dressed and made up gorgeously with colorful robes, face powder, lipstick, blackened teeth, and a long ponytail, they had a distinctive appearance different from that of any other temple attendants. In fact, they had an official duty no one else on the temple precinct was given: to bring visual, psychological, and sexual pleasures to their masters as catamites.

Why was having sex with *chigo* not regarded as a breach of the Vinaya? It is at least partly because *chigo* were considered much more than mere temple attendants. That is to say, in order to become an official sexual companion to his

²⁹⁴ Although the term can simply denote “child,” in the Buddhist context, *chigo* refers to acolytes, often written in the Chinese compound 稚児 (young boy) or simply as 児 (boy), indicating the male gender (the female gender of a child can be indicated with the character 嬰). Temple acolytes may be also referred to as *warawa* or *dōji*, both of which also mean “child,” or *tera koshō*, meaning “temple child.” At Zen monasteries, they are given a special title, *kasshiki* (“meal announcer”). As I will discuss later, Tsuchiya Megumi has a study on the hierarchical structure of temple acolytes. See Tsuchiya Megumi, *Chusei jiin no shakai to geinō* (Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kōbunkan, 2001), pp. 129-177.

²⁹⁵ Paul S. Atkins, “Chigo in the Medieval Japanese Imagination,” *The Journal of Asian Studies*, Vol. 63, No. 3 (2008), p. 947.

master, a youth was supposed to undergo a weeks-long, elaborate initiation ritual called the *chigo kanjō*, through which he was reborn as a bodhisattva. Due to the sacralization of *chigo*, monks were thought to be able to earn Buddhist virtues by having sexual intercourse with the living bodhisattva.²⁹⁶ Today we can have a glimpse of how the *chigo kanjō* ceremony was conducted centuries ago from the minutely depicted illustration of the rite in the short story “*Chigo*.”²⁹⁷ Written by the novelist and Tendai abbot Kon Tōkō (1898-1977), the description of the *chigo kanjō* is based on a copy of the fifteenth century Tendai text called *Kō chigo shōgyō hiden* (Great esoteric Buddhist teachings on *chigo*).²⁹⁸ Kon’s

²⁹⁶ Matsuoka Shinpei suggests that the sacralization of boys may have its roots in the emergence of child emperors during the period in which the retired emperor ruled Japan (*insei*) from the late eleventh century through the early fifteenth century. Being the nominal sovereign, the child emperors were stripped of their secular powers of rulership and left with the amplified purity and sanctity. Interestingly, during this time, a number of historical and religious figures were infantilized in their artistic embodiment. For instance, in 1069, the principal object of worship at Hōryūji, the statue of Prince Shōtoku, was replaced with another that represented Shōtoku as a seven-year-old boy. See *Utage noshintai* (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1991; 1992), pp. 117-122.

²⁹⁷ Matsuoka notes that Mishima Yukio’s novel *Forbidden Colors* (*Kinjiki*, 1953) includes a scene in which a character talks about the *chigo kanjō* ritual and that Kon Tōkō complained of this as plagiarism of his short story. See *Utage*, pp. 115-116.

²⁹⁸ Kon Tōkō, “*Chigo*,” in Vol. 5 of *Kon Tōkō daihyōsaku senshū* (Tokyo: Yomiuri Shimbunsha, 1973), pp. 107-142. Kon, a former New Sensationalist School writer in the 1920s, took holy vows in 1930, and became the abbot of the Tendai temple Chūsonji in Hiraizumi. In the preface of “*Chigo*,” he states that the description of the ritual in this work is based on a copy of *Kō chigo shōgyō hiden*, a part of the Tendai School’s private library that is unavailable to the public. This esoteric manual is listed in the second volume of *Shōwa genzon Tendai shoseki sōgō mokuroku*

one-and-a-half page long narration on the initiation opens with the preliminary austerities that the youth named Hanawaka undergoes in seclusion seventeen days prior to the ritual. On the day of the initiation, Master Renshū chants the name of Kannon five hundred times, recites the Five Great Vows, and bestows various esoteric gestures and mantras to the *chigo*-to-be. Subsequently, Hanawaka's appearance is transformed into that of a *chigo*, feminized with blackened teeth, powdered face and exquisite attire; thenceforth he is acknowledged to be the great merciful bodhisattva, Kannon.²⁹⁹ Later that night, Master Renshū finalizes the holy rite by penetrating the new *chigo* in his bedchamber, and they pledge unconditional love that will last for two lifetimes.³⁰⁰

As fascinating as this historical custom of Japanese monasteries is, the now-obsolete practice of housing sexual companions in the temple precincts involves highly complex and rather controversial issues, including those of male-male sexuality, pederasty, and sexuality of Buddhist priests. Despite the sensitivity of the topic, in recent years, due serious scholarly attention has been paid to what Paul S. Atkins calls the "*chigo* system (*chigo-sei*),"³⁰¹ illuminating its historical, religious, and literary significances. Such collective scholarly efforts

(Complete catalogue of texts of the Tendai School existing in the present Shōwa era) as "one volume; by Eshin [Genshin; 945-1017]; one-*shaku* six-*sun* in length; copied by Enkei of Mount Haguro, Aizu, of Mutsu Province in Daiei 4 [1524]; owned by Tenkai of Mount Hiei" (p. 109). Kon denies that this manual was written by Eshin (p. 108).

²⁹⁹ Kon, "Chigo," pp. 124-126.

³⁰⁰ Ibid., p. 130.

³⁰¹ Atkins, "Medieval Japanese Imagination," p. 951.

have made a significant contribution to the repository of knowledge, but they still have a long way to go until a firm understanding of the entire *chigo* system can be achieved.

Tsuchiya Megumi's study on the seating arrangement at Daigoji during two New Year's ceremonies was groundbreaking in that it revealed the surprisingly high status of *chigo*, only second to noblemen, indicated through the physical proximity to the abbot. Another significant discovery of her study is that there is a hierarchical structure determined by lineage among the temple attendants with *chigo* at its acme, followed by *chūdōji* ("medium children"), and lastly *daidōji* ("large children"), the group of adult men who maintained long hair, the most iconic sign as non-adult.³⁰² However, greater details on the rankings of various groups of temple "children" are still in debate.³⁰³ The issue of categories for the temple "children" is farther complicated by the fact that these terms (*chūdōji*, *daidōji*, etc.) probably varied depending on the temples and time periods. For my study, one of the most serious challenges is that these ranks of various "children" are often obscured by such umbrella terms as *chigo*, *dōji*, and *warawa* (all meaning "children") in *waka* poems, anecdotal tales, fictional short stories, and so on, making it impossible for the readers to know if a given sexual relationship between a monk and a "child" is illicit or legitimate (i.e. sanctioned by means of the *chigo kanjō* ceremony).

³⁰² Tsuchiya Megumi, *Chūsei jīn*, pp. 137-177.

³⁰³ Niunoya Tetsuichi, *Mibun, sabetsu to chūsei shakai* (Tokyo: Hanawa Shobō, 2005), pp. 201-228.

To illustrate this complex issue, let us examine another Tendai text known as *Chigo kanjō shiki* (Private record on the *chigo* initiation), an abridged variant of the aforementioned *Kō chigo shōgyō hiden*. Note that the following passage clearly forbids priests to have sex with youths who are yet to be initiated through the *chigo kanjō*:

We, all sentient beings, trust the great mercy of Kannon. Therefore, as long as we sever our ignorance [of Buddha's teachings] and worldly attachments, we are free of sins. This is why we call this "innate Vinaya." Nevertheless, we are not to violate (*okasu*) others as we please. If we are lured by delusion and illusion and ignite the flame of worldly attachment, then we should violate others. But even if we must violate others, we should violate the *chigo* who have undertaken the *kanjō* rite in this way. If we violate uninitiated *chigo*, this will cause a seed of (falling into) the Three Evil Realms.³⁰⁴

This is a passage full of curious information. First of all, the author of this text, an unidentified Tendai priest in a high position, chooses to use a verb with negative connotation, *okasu*, instead of the common euphuism like *chigiru* (to exchange vows) or even a neutral verb such as *majiwaru* (to have intercourse) to describe having sex with initiated *chigo*, tacitly acknowledging the sinful nature of the act.³⁰⁵ Second, the author uses the phrase "*mukanjō no chigo*" (uninitiated *chigo*), clear evidence for the fact that *chigo kanjō* ritual was not a prerequisite for

³⁰⁴ Cited by Matsuoka Shinpei, *Utage*, p. 138. The oldest colophon dates 1450.

³⁰⁵ Although "*okasu*" (犯す) can refer to the act of rape, this probably refers to violation of their celibacy precept. The prevalent phrase of *nyobon* (女犯) literally means "violating a woman" but it actually refers to violation of the precepts with a woman (*Nihon kokugo daijiten*).

the title. Third, sex with uninitiated *chigo* must have been common enough that the author needed to spell this out. An important question we should ask regarding the last point is whether this “*mukanjō no chigo*” only refers to the highborn adolescents who are expected to be initiated in the near future or if it is the generic term for all temple “children,” which includes lower ranking *chūdōji* and *daijōji*. If the latter is the case, the text could be interpreted as intercourse with *chūdōji* and *daijōji* was prevalent enough to call for an official prohibition, as I will argue for the case of historical *daijōji* next.

Another representative study of *chigo-sei* is that of Hosokawa Ryōichi, who has a rather pessimistic view of this system, as he describes it as a practice that “coerces the youth into accepting the total control of his body and internal self by his master and absolute subordination to his master.”³⁰⁶ One of the main reasons why Hosokawa reaches this conclusion is the tragic fates of two pairs of historical *chigo*. The first pair is Aichiyo-maru and Aimitsu-maru, known from the diary of Jinson (1430–1508), the aristocratic abbot of the Daijōin temple at the Kōfukuji complex in Nara. Aichiyo-maru was the son of a temple administrator at Daijōji, who later underwent the coming-of-age ceremony at age nineteen, becoming independent of Jinson as a secular adult male of the samurai rank. At age twenty-eight, however, the former *chigo* took his own life for an unknown reason.³⁰⁷ The other favorite of Jinson was named Aimitsu-maru; his father

³⁰⁶ Hosokawa Ryōichi, *Itsudatsu no Nihon chūsei: Kyōki, tōsaku, ma no sekai* (Tokyo: Yōsensha, 1996), pp. 73-74.

³⁰⁷ *Ibid.*, pp. 70-71.

belonged to the outcast class (*senmin*) and was attached to one of the other temples at Kōfukuji as a drum performer. There is a document of transaction (*mibiki-jō*) that shows Jinson's total custody over Aimitsu-maru as his menial (*komono*) to which Hosokawa remarks, "Due to his social class as the son of a noh musician...he was purchased by Jinson for the purpose of pederasty (*chigo nanshoku*) in a manner that is almost equal to human trafficking."³⁰⁸ Aimitsu-maru maintained his position of *ō-chigo* (an equivalent of *daidōji* or "large child") until the age of twenty-six, when he took the tonsure and became a recluse. Much as Aichiyo-maru, however, he committed suicide two years later, after a long battle with an illness.³⁰⁹ While the destinies of the two beloved attendants of Jinson offer numerous implications on lives of historical *chigo* at large, for the purpose of this study, I shall point out that this particular historical account shows us that it is an overgeneralization to assume that only highborn and officially deified youths became sexual companions of the priests. In the case of Aimitsu-maru, he was more likely to have become a catamite of Jinson as he maintained the position of a menial/*ō-chigo* than to have been promoted to the level of "the *chigo*," or the highborn living bodhisattvas(-to-be) with special privileges.

Another account of historical *chigo* whom Hosokawa mentions in his book is that of Senju and Mikawa, two favorites of the abbot of Ninnaji, Cloistered Prince Kakushō (1129-1169). This well-known anecdote is curiously included in

³⁰⁸ Ibid., p. 72.

³⁰⁹ Ibid., pp. 72-73. Hosokawa goes on to remark that the memorial ceremony for Aimitsu-maru was given at Byakugōji with extravagance—considering his low birth—implying Jinson's affection for the fallen ex-*chigo* (p. 74).

the section called “*kōshoku*” (sensuousness) of *Kokon chomonjū* (A collection of things written and heard in the past and present; 1215). The story is one with forlorn overtones, hinting at the volatile status of *chigo*, ending with Mikawa’s taking the tonsure in Mount Kōya after the favor of Kakushō had returned to his predecessor, Senju.³¹⁰

The historical accounts of Jinson and Kakushō may give us the impression that a high-ranking priest has two or three *chigo* and each *chigo* only has sex with his master. Nevertheless, there is much counterevidence to this picture. First is a written oath of a scholar monk at Tōdaiji named Sōshō (1202-1278), included in *Tōdaiji Sōshō shōnin no kenkyū narabi ni shiryō* (A study and historical records on Reverend Sōshō at Tōdaiji).³¹¹ It states:

The matter of my oath of five articles:

1. I shall retreat to Kasagi temple and remain there after age forty-one;
2. I have hitherto had ninety-five [sexual partners]; I shall not violate more than one hundred males;³¹²
3. I shall not have a favorite *warawa* besides Kameō-maru;
4. I shall not place a *jōdō* (high-ranking *chigo*) in my bedchamber;
5. I shall not have sexual partners (*nenja*) among *jōdō* or *chūdō*;³¹³

³¹⁰ Ibid., pp. 62-63. For an original version, see, for example, NKBT 84, pp. 255-257. In this story, the two *chigo*’s lineage and ranks at the temple are unknown, as both are referred to as *warawa* (Senju is also described as *chōdō* (a favorite child)).

³¹¹ Hiraoka Jōkai, ed., *Tōdaiji Sōshō shōnin no kenkyū narabi ni shiryō*, chū (Tokyo: Nihon Gakujutsu Shinkō-kai, 1959), p. 536. Sōshō wrote this oath in 1237 at age 36.

³¹² Sōshō also uses the verb *okasu* to describe having sex with *chigo*, indicating that the earlier example in the *Chigo kanjō shiki* was not idiosyncratic.

Matsuo points out two significances of this oath. The first is that this passage disproves the common belief that only elite priests, *sōgō*, were able to keep multiple *chigo*.³¹⁴ At age thirty-six, Sōshō was a monk of a mid-rank, far below the *sōgō* class, partly due to his mid-ranking aristocratic origin. The second point is that at this young age, he had already had ninety-five sexual partners, which means he must have had intercourse with youths who were not his personal attendants.³¹⁵ Not only is this astonishing in itself, but it goes against one of the rules stipulated in *Uki*, an official etiquette book for *chigo*, authored by the abbot of Omuro in Ninnaji, Cloistered Prince Shukaku (1150-1202; a nephew of the aforementioned Kakushō): “You shall not visit a monk [who is not your master].... You shall refrain from visiting others’ rooms.”³¹⁶ This fact is farther substantiated by another study on the Tendai text *Kō chigo shōgyō hiden*. According to Tsuji, the section called “preparation of the anus” instructs how the *chigo* should prepare his own body by “clutching the belly at the left and right and twisting the torso” when he “intends to meet many people.”³¹⁷ It also encourages the *chigo* to serve as many monks as possible, “because it is unsightly if even one monk is excluded.”³¹⁸

³¹³ The term normally refers to the older partner in *nanshoku*, but from the context, Sōshō is presumably referring to younger partners.

³¹⁴ *Sōgō* is the ruling priest class composed of three official ranks: *sōjō*, *sōzu*, and *risshi*.

³¹⁵ Matsuo, *Hakai to nanshoku*, pp. 71-80.

³¹⁶ Cited by Hiramatsu, “Sō to chigo no nanshoku,” p. 105.

³¹⁷ Tsuji Shōko, “Kon Tōkō *Chigo* and *Kō chigo shōgyō hiden shi*,” *Josetsu*, No. 38, p. 223.

³¹⁸ *Ibid.*, p. 223.

As we have seen so far, it is a challenging task to holistically explicate the *chigo* system, not necessarily because of lack of information but rather due to the conflicting information. In addition, some earlier research appears to reflect upon the scholar's negative attitude towards the *chigo* system as it involves sex between an adult and a "child," sex between two males, and/or sex of a Buddhist monk. One of the critiques of the *chigo-sei* due to the age difference of the priest and *chigo*, rather than its homosexuality or violation of celibacy, is Bernard Faure, who regards the custom as "massive child abuse."³¹⁹ Although this claim would have been accurate if the *chigo* system were to be brought back today, this was probably not the understanding of premodern Japan, both inside and even outside of the Buddhist community. In fact, as I will discuss later, a significant amount of textual evidence indicates quite the contrary. As for the issue of having sex with "children," this idea may be amplified due to the primary meaning of the term "*chigo*," which, again, means "children." Nevertheless, as Faure himself notes (p. 268), some "temple children" were adult menials (i.e. *ō-chigo*, *ō-warawa*, *daidōji*) and it is quite possible they became the subject of *nanshoku* in the temple precincts.³²⁰ In addition, the famous fourteenth-century erotic work *Chigo no sōshi* (another source that Faure mentions in passing on p. 213) even provides visual clues as to how an ideal *chigo* in a monk's imagination may look in the nude. To say the least, none of the *chigo* painted in this erotica are what

³¹⁹ Faure, *Red Thread*, p. 278.

³²⁰ Kuroda Hideo studied the pictorial depictions of adult *dōji* or low-ranking temple attendants. Some have receding hairline and whiskers, clear signs of adult males. <Emaki> *Kodomo no tōjō: Chūsei shakai no kodomo-zō*, (Tokyo: Kawade Shobō Shinsha, 1989), pp. 97-100.

we generally think of as “children.” Their skin complexion is fairer than their partner’s, while their figures are similar to those of idealized adult women, that is, fleshy and curvy, compared to their partners’ muscular bodies. At a glance, most people would assume the lovemaking scenes are of heterosexual ones, until they notice the *chigo*’s genitals, which are no less developed than their lovers’.

Aside from the issue of age, there are many instances of counterevidence for “abusive relationships.” For example, *Uji shūi monogatari* (Gleanings from the *Tales of Uji Dainagon*; early 13th century) includes an anecdote of a *chigo* on Mount Hiei who pretended to sleep while the monks were making rice cakes. When the rice cakes were ready, one monk tried to wake up the *chigo* by saying, “Pardon me, would you please wake up? (*Mono mōshi saburawan. Odorokase tamae*),” while another scolds the first monk by saying, “Hey, do not disturb. The young one has fallen asleep (*Ya, na okoshi tatematsuri so. Osanaki hito wa neiri tamai ni keru*).³²¹ Another from *Uji* is about a different Mount Hiei *chigo*, a son of a farmer from the countryside.³²² One day a monk spots the *chigo* crying, so he speaks to the youth, “Why are you crying like that? Do you feel regretful that the cherry blossoms are falling?” (*Nado kōwa nakase tamō zo. Kono hana no chiru o oshū oboesasetamō ka.*).³²³ The single underline indicates deferential language referring to the speaker (monk) and the double underline indicates honorific

³²¹ SNKBZ 50, pp. 45-46.

³²² The fact that a son of a farmer is referred to as “*chigo*” which means one of the two possibilities: 1) The highest-ranking acolytes (“the *chigo*”) included youths of humble births; or 2) He is not one of “the *chigo*,” but addressed by the blanket term, “*chigo*.”

³²³ SNKBZ 50, p. 46.

language referring to the listener (*chigo*). This kind of honorific use of language towards *chigo* can be observed widely. In still another anecdote from the same anthology, the archbishop of Ichijōji named Zōyo “loves his *warawa* so much so that he says, ‘I am not satisfied that I do not get to see you very much. Become a priest and stay by my side day and night.’” The *warawa*’s response is quite telling. He says, “What should I do? I would prefer to remain in my position for now.”³²⁴ If a monk-*chigo* relationship is inherently abusive and becoming a priest is a great privilege, why would this *warawa* not jump on this opportunity? Why was he allowed to express his disagreement with the head of the *sōgō* class twice in this brief story? Furthermore, the Buddhist community’s sheer lack of secrecy about housing beautiful lay youths in their temples and the secular society’s general acceptance of this custom.³²⁵ It is undeniable that some *chigo* must have experienced tragedies, as represented by the cases of Aichiyo-maru and Aimitsu-maru as well as Senju and Mikawa.³²⁶ With that being said, the

³²⁴ Ibid., p. 190. After this, the *warawa* reluctantly takes the tonsure, but after a while, the archbishop laments his decision, which prompts the former *chigo* to say, “This is exactly why I asked you to wait! How regrettable” (*Sareba koso, ima shibashi to mōshi sōraishi mono o*).

³²⁵ Sachi Schmidt-Hori, “The New Lady-in-Waiting is a *Chigo*: Sexual Fluidity and Dual Transvestism in a Medieval Buddhist Acolyte Tale,” *Japanese Language and Literature* 43 (2009), p. 387.

³²⁶ The account of Senju and Mikawa exhibits the theme of “falling out of the master’s favor,” observed in the famous “Giō” chapter of the *Tales of the Heike*. The greatest difference is that the women are portrayed as superior to the hegemon Kiyomori: Gio and her former rival *shirabyōshi* dancer awaken to the ephemeral nature of fame and prestige and become nuns, praying for rebirth in the Western Paradise together, while Kiyomori is known to be burned in hell.

evidence overwhelmingly tells us that the *chigo-sei* is not so simple as mere sexual exploitation of the youths by powerful monks but something that confronts us to cogitate outside of our modern norms.³²⁷

One recent study on the *chigo* system detaches itself from various modern filters and approaches the issue from the perspective of universal humanities by applying the scapegoat theory developed by the French scholar René Girard (1923-). In this article, Paul S. Atkins thoroughly examines all the major research on the *chigo-sei*, including Abe (1984), Faure (1998), Hosokawa (2000), Matsuoka (2004), and Tsuchiya (2001), pays close attention to a pseudo-Chinese legend of an immortal boy (*jidō setsuwa*), three representative *chigo* tales (“A Long Tale for an Autumn Night,” “The Tale of Genmu,” and “The Mountain”), as well as Bo Juyi’s *Song of Everlasting Sorrow*. By uncovering the almost uncanny similarities between the literary constructions of the *jidō*, *chigo* and the legendary *femme fatale*, Yang Guifei, Atkins strings the three together by the scapegoat theory as summarized below:

In the *jidō* legend, the youth is a surrogate victim for the emperor. On the other hand, in the *chigo* tales, the *chigo*'s function is often to “absorb” violence in order to prevent its spread between families or rival temples. As a liminal figure—neither child nor adult, neither male nor female—the *chigo* is exquisitely positioned as a victim.

³²⁷ For example, back in the 1950s and 1960s, Japanese scholars such as Araki Yoshio and Ichiko Teiji claimed homosexuality to be unethical and unnatural, followed by dismissing the religious overtone of *chigo* tales as a mere pretext for the personal agenda of priests. See Margaret H. Childs, “*Chigo Monogatari*: Love Stories or Buddhist Sermons?” *Monumenta Nipponica*, Vol. 35 No. 2 (1980), p. 127.

Girard's remarks on the role of women as sacrificial victims seem equally apt in the case of the *chigo*: "Like the animal and the infant, but to a lesser degree, the woman qualifies for sacrificial status by reason of her weakness and relatively marginal social status. That is why she can be viewed as a quasi-sacred figure, both desired and disdained, alternately elevated and abused" (1977, 141–42). The paradox of the *chigo* being subjected to violence and, at the same time, deified in the *chigo* tales, or being fêted and simultaneously used to satisfy forbidden sexual desires in real life, turns out not to be no paradox at all. He is a sacred victim who in fiction converts violence into divine will and in the abbot's bedchamber converts the violation of monastic precepts against sexual contact into sublime ritual and communion with the sacred.³²⁸

Now our focus shall turn to the other side of the coin: literary depictions of Buddhist monks in relationships with their *chigo*. I will investigate this little examined aspect of the *chigo* system in the following section.

IV. Portrayals of Buddhist Monks in Love with *Chigo*

One of the most fertile literary sources of monk-*chigo* love is their poetic exchanges compiled in a number of anthologies, including the fourth and sixth imperial *waka* collections, *Go-shūi wakashū* (1086) and *Shika wakashū* (1151), respectively.³²⁹ In fact, many scholars have studied *chigo*'s *waka* poems, often

³²⁸ Atkins, "Medieval Japanese Imagination," p. 967.

³²⁹ Other *waka* collections that include monk-*chigo* love poems are: *Shoku mon'yō wakashu* (1185-1190), whose compilers are two *chigo* named Hoewaka-maru and Kahō-maru, *Nara-no-ha wakashū*, which has an independent section dedicated solely for poems composed by *chigo* (*warawa-hen*), and *Ansen wakashū* (1369), a private collection poems by those affiliated with Anjōji.

concluding that their socially subordinate status to their lovers and their feminine/passive roles are reflected upon the compositions.³³⁰ Nevertheless, via a meticulous examination of *Nara-no-ha wakashū* and *Ansenshū*, Hirano Tae pertinently concludes that *chigo* sometimes took up the active/masculine role, such as by sending a courtesan a love poem (during a trip to the East with his master!) that references an earlier rendezvous with her.³³¹

What are the monks' personas like, then, within their love poems for *chigo*? Tanaka claims that “[f]or *chigo*, monks must have been rulers and absolutes to whom they had to bow down,” based on *chigo*'s passive/feminine roles in *waka*, and that “there seem to be no grudging poems by monks that lament *chigo*'s changes of heart.”³³² Nevertheless, there are a number of poems that express monk's laments, grudges, and yearning for *chigo*. Consider the following examples:

Someone told me that my disciple warawa was visiting someone else, so I sent this poem in the springtime. Monk Zōe

<i>Shirazariki</i>	I did not know;
<i>waga koto no ha ni</i>	There was a heart
<i>oku tsuyu no</i>	fading along with the flowers
<i>hana ni utsurō</i>	inside the dew

³³⁰ See for example, see Higuchi Yoshimaro, ed., *Nara-no-ha wakashū to kenkyū* (Toyohashi, Aichi Prefecture: Mikan Kokubun Shiryō Kankōkai, 1959), p. 210; Tanaka Takako, *Seiai no Nihon Chūsei* (Tokyo: Yōsensha, 1997), pp. 17-20.

³³¹ Hirano Tae, “*Nara-no-ha wakashū* <warawa-hen> o yomu: Nanto no chigo to sō no uta,” *Bungaku* Vol. 11, No. 1 (2010), p. 108.

³³² Tanaka, *Seiai*, p. 18.

kokoro ari towa formed on my words.³³³

I composed this poem because it has been a long time since I saw the warawa I had cared for. Bishop Ke'i

<i>Tanomeshi o</i>	Though I trusted in you,
<i>matsu ni higo no</i>	days have passed by
<i>suginureba</i>	while I awaited you.
<i>tama-no-o yowami</i>	So my string of soul has weakened
<i>taenubeki kana</i>	and my life will certainly end soon. ³³⁴

Other examples of similar topics (*chigo*'s change of heart) include Nos. 741 and 743 of *Go-shūi shū*. Another monk sends a poem to a *chigo* who failed to visit him while the *chigo* was in the vicinity (*Nara-no-ha shū*, No. 743). In the following poem, the monk is daydreaming about his lover after their night spent together. It is quite remarkable that it is the *chigo* who expects to pay the visit to his lover, a traditionally masculine role, and the monk must await the *chigo*. Hence, the traditional view that the *chigo* is assigned the feminine/passive role may need some adjustment.

I attached this poem to the robe I returned to my close warawa, since he had forgotten it as we were saying good-byes, after he visited me.

Supernumerary Bishop Jōei

<i>Kite nareshi</i>	Though I am returning
<i>yowa no koromo o</i>	the well-worn robe
<i>kaeshitemo</i>	you wore that night,
<i>arishi sugata o</i>	I still wonder if that figure I saw
<i>yume ka to zo omou</i>	was perhaps a dream. ³³⁵

³³³ *Nara-no-ha wakashū*, No. 689.

³³⁴ *Go-shūi wakashū*, No. 733.

³³⁵ See *Shoku-mon'yō wakashū* in *Gunsho ruijū*, waka-bu 9, Vol. 154, No. 10, p. 304.

It is true that monks sometimes do compose poems that assume a “masculine” role, such as one in which the monk-poet confesses his love to a beautiful youth whom he had spotted during a ceremonial dance (*Nara-no-ha shū*, No. 724). Most poems, however, fall into gender-neutral love poems, and it would be difficult to determine if one was composed by a monk or a *chigo* without seeing the name of the poet.

Much as *waka* was one of the most important means of intellectual and leisurely activities in many Buddhist communities (especially within Nara temples), the composition of Chinese-style poems (*kanshi*), such as five- or seven-character *jueju* 絶句, was extremely popular among Rinzai Zen monks. It is no surprise that Zen monks inherited the tradition from *waka* and composed a number of *enshi* (sensual Chinese-style poems) for their young male lovers. This type of Zen literature has been regarded as a sign of secularization:

Between the time of the unification of the Northern and Southern Courts and Ōnin War, Gozan literature reached its peak.... The religiosity of their literature gradually diminished under the slogan of *shi-Zen itchi* [unity of poetry and Zen]. In fact, the indulgence in belles-letters escalated, and sensual poems for beautiful boys began to be composed.... Shinden Seiban [1380-1452; also Seihan, Shōban] was said to be skilled at lecturing on the Chinese classics, but his true sphere was in poetry. Influenced by the late Tang poetry, he sang about romantic emotions with elegant and graceful styles and diction. He also composed a number of sensual poems for beautiful boys, and they represent the common poetics of this era.³³⁶

³³⁶ Matsumura Yūji, Hayashi Tatsuya and Furuhashi Nobutaka, eds., *Nihon bungeishi: Hyōgen no nagare*, Vol. 3, *Chūsei* (Tōkyō: Kawade Shobō, 1987), pp. 150-151.

On the other hand, Katō Shūichi deemes this phenomenon a sign of the “Japanization” of Zen literature:

The third age of Gozan literature was the period in which Chinese language poetry underwent a process of “Japanizing” by the addition of the element of “love”....

However, the Zen temples of the Muromachi period did not admit women, so the objects of the monks’ love were young men, in marked contrast to the poets of the Heian court and the Chinese poets of the Tokugawa period.³³⁷

Aside from Shinden Seiban, mentioned in the first quote above, Zuikei Shūhō (1392-1473), Ōsen Keisan (1429-1493), and San’eki Eiin (mid-sixteenth century) are all known to have composed *nanshoku* poems. Moreover, the well-known *kanshi* anthology *Kanrin gohō shū* (A collection of the five-phenixes academy, 1623; compiled by Ishin Sūden), one entire volume is dedicated to love poems for adolescent boys. In the following, I will provide examples of the *enshi* found in San’eki Eisan’s *San’eki enshi* (ca. 1520) and Shinden Seiban’s *Shinden shikō* (Shinden’s poem manuscript, 1447).³³⁸ As the sensual poems of *San’eki enshi* and *Shinden shikō* exhibit great similarity in their themes, images, expressions, and allusions, one recurrent theme is the contrast between the authors’ old age and their lovers’ youthful beauty.

³³⁷ Katō Shūichi, *A History of Japanese Literature: The First Thousand Years*, trans., David Chibbett (Tokyo: Kodansha International, 1981), pp. 282-283.

³³⁸ The Chinese characters for *San’eki enshi* are 三益艶詞 (San’eki’s sensuous writings) instead of 艶詩 (sensuous poetry), as the collection includes prose texts as well.

(San'eki enshi)

謝簡

A Thank-you Note

屢對紅顏忘白頭

As I repeatedly see the youthful face with bright cheeks, I forget about my white hair.

乾坤之內好風流

Between heaven and earth we cherish our romance.

合歡夢熟一双枕

Together we share pleasures and deep dreams on a pair of pillows.

七十鴛鴦輸百籌³³⁹

Seventy pairs of lovebirds would lose a hundred chips against us.

The last line of this poem refers to the vow exchanged by the poet (or the “speaker” of this poem) and his lover will outlast (hence “winning the bet”) those of seventy pairs of lovebirds (*oshidori*). San'eki also indicates that his infatuation with the adolescent boy with rosy cheeks rejuvenates him, making him forget about his declining appearance. The sexual implication of the poem is apparent and much more palpable than that of *waka* poems.

紅綺花名仙翁。其軀裁也。紅顏青衫。實有仙風道骨。可愛矣。仍折數莖。獻上一仙丈。雲母屏下有詩云。³⁴⁰

The gorgeous crimson flower is named “old hermit.” You resemble it. With the red-cheeked face and the thin green robe, you indeed have the manner of an immortal and the bones of a Taoist. How adorable! Thus I break a few flowers by the stem, and present one to you, the elderly immortal. On the lower part of the mica screen, a poem is written that says:

白髮秋風情所鍾

Gray hair and autumn winds are what I cherish.

鏡中易變舊時容

In the mirror is my face easily changed from the old time.

仙翁分我駐顏術

The Old Hermit shared the magic of eternal youth with me.

³³⁹ San'eki Eiin, *San'eki enshi*, in *Zoku gunsho ruijū*, vol. 345, eds., Ōta Tōshirō, et al. (Tokyo: Zoku gunsho ruijū kanseikai, 1932), p. 500.

³⁴⁰ The annotator's punctuation (獻上一仙丈雲母屏下。有詩云) appears to be erroneous.

不待栢葉臺上蓉

I will not wait for your reply—the rapeseed plant surpasses lotuses.

Again, in this poem, San'eki indicates the age-defying quality of his love. Despite the repeated remarks on his aged appearance, the youth with whom the poet is smitten—the “old hermit”—rejuvenates his mind and body like a charm by a hermit. Curiously, this rather ironically named flower (*sen'nō* in Japanese) was known to be an ingredient for the elixir of life.³⁴¹ Therefore, this flower has a dual significance for the monk-*kasshiki* relationship. Not only do the rosy cheeks and underdeveloped frame visually represent the appearance of *sen'nō*, but by “tasting” the flesh of *kasshiki* (i.e. kissing, caressing, and penetrating him), the monk was able to be revived. For this reason, *sen'nō* is a stock reference in the tradition of Zen poetry.

(*Shinden shikō*)

和試筆勻 椿齡

Together we composed the New Year's poems—The Camellia Age

紅顏綠鬢少年春

The red-cheeked face and glossy side locks—the springtime of youth.

千首詩篇一日新

We newly composed a thousand poems and verses in a day.

強被韶風撩白髮

The lovely spring winds forcefully tousled my white hair.

華筵援筆愧陳人³⁴²

On the flowery rush mat, I picked up the brush, and bashfully showed the poems to the people.

³⁴¹ Yoshizawa Katsuhiko, “Sennōke—Muromachi bunka no yokō,” originally published in *Zen bunka* Nos. 185-187 (2002-2003). Now available in the homepage of International Research Institute for Zen Buddhism (http://iriz.hanazono.ac.jp/frame/k_room_f3g.html).

³⁴² Shinden Seiha, *Shinden shikō*, in *Gozan bungaku shinshū bekkān* 1, ed., Tamamura Takeji (Tokyo: Tōkyō Daigaku Shuppankai, 1977), p. 866.

Again, in this poem, Shinden contrasts his old age to the colorful, animated images of the flowery season, the exquisiteness of *kasshiki*, and the spring winds. The title, “the Camellia Age,” however, signifies longevity, for camellias were thought to survive eight thousand springs and autumns. Therefore, Shinden seems to be hinting at the similar theme as San’eki’s second poem above: extension of one’s life via relationships with a younger lover.

There are other commonalities among *enshi* by Zen monks. The most obvious is how the countenances of the *kassiki* are described: “voluptuous” (嬋娟 *sen’en* or 嬋妍 *senken*), “jade face” (玉貌 *gyokubō* or 玉顏 *gyokugan*), “castle toppler” (傾城 *keisei*), “beautiful one” (美人 *bijin* or 佳人 *kajin*) with skin as white as snow, glossy jet-black hair and brows, and crimson cheeks. Obviously, these are all cliché praises for feminine beauty. As a matter of fact, in one parallel verse (*shiroku benrei-bun*), Ōsen directly compares his lover to Yang Guifei: “When seated, you seem Yang Guifei in front of the Chenxiang Pavilion.”³⁴³ Given these expressions alone, their *enshi* could be read as love poems for women.

Nevertheless, these poems are unequivocally describing the relationships between two males. One can easily find this out due to the frequent references like “adolescent boy” (少年 *shōnen*) and “beautiful young man” (好男子

³⁴³ Ōsen Keisan, *Senpukushū*, in *Gozan bungaku shinshū* 1, ed., Tamamura Takeji (Tokyo: Tōkyō Daigaku Shuppankai, 1967), p. 867. The Chenxiang Pavilion was located in Emperor Xuanzong’s palace and famous as the place where Li Bo composed three verses to praise the beauty of the peonies and Yang Guifei (*Dai Kanwa jiten*).

kōdanshi). To represent the *kasshiki*'s underdeveloped physiques, phrases such as “thin, flexible bamboo” (繡竹 *shūchiku*) and “stalk-like” (莖々 *keikei*) are also used. Moreover, there are some codes to indicate male-male love embedded in many poems. One reference is to the Star Festival (Ch. *Qixi*, J. *Tanabata*), one of the most important days of the year for lovers in Zen temples, as San'eki remarks that every year the lovers must “celebrate the festival together and turn it into the evening of bed-sharing” in the preface to the following poem:

(*San'eki enshi*)

與君一執交 I met you once and became obsessed with you.

既数三星節 We are already celebrating our third Star Festival.

兩節巧相違 The first two occasions were different from this time.

今始約磁鐵³⁴⁴ Now we begin to promise we will be bound together like magnet and iron.

Shinden has other poems that refer to the hero of the Star Festival legend, Kengyū (p. 877, for example), while Ōsen has a parallel poem entitled *Tanabata*. The first two couplets of this parallel poem are: “Kengyū rises from the west, and Orihime rises from the east/ *Tanabata*, a festival of reunion, is approaching/ In heaven we are a pair of wings, on earth we are interlocking branches/ I feel my life extended when we converse in private.”³⁴⁵

³⁴⁴ See *Zoku-gunsho ruijū* 345, p. 513.

³⁴⁵ *Gozan bungaku shinshū* 1, p. 875. “In heaven we are a pair of wings, on earth we are interlocking branches” is a famous phrase from Bo Juyi's “Song of Everlasting Sorrow,” which, again, is an example of superimposing Yang Guifei's image onto young temple attendants. Also, the last line is the recurrent theme of “extended life.”

Recall that San'eki mentioned the flower named *sen'nō* (old hermit) in an earlier poem. According to Yoshizawa (2002-3), *sen'nō*, a summer flower, were traditionally given to one another among lovers on the night of the Star Festival, because the hero and heroine of the Tanabata legend, Kengyū and Orihime, are known to have exchanged them.³⁴⁶ Thus, the juvenile beauty of *kasshiki* resembling the old hermit, the medicinal powers of the flower, as well as the Star Festival's being the evening of lovers exchanging the old hermits—all intertwine to create a rich fabric of codes, images, and cultural significance that underlie the sensuous poems by Zen priests. Here is another example of poem referencing the old hermit by Shinden Seiban:

贈仙翁寄人 **Presenting the hermit flower to someone**

窈窕奇葩隔海雲 Luscious curve of the rare flower separates us from the rest
of the world like the ocean and the clouds.

露莖輕蹙絳羅裙 Its dewy stem and creased pedals are a crimson gossamer
skirt.

天分之朵落吟案 The cluster of flowers is a heavenly gift; they fall on my draft
of this poem.

道骨仙風可似君³⁴⁷ You embody the bones of the Taoist and the manner of the
immortals.

Note that the expression *dōkotsu senpū* (the bones of the Taoist and the manner of the immortals) also appears in San'eki's second poem above, which is still another piece of evidence for shared cultural codes for *nanshoku*.

So far, the codes for monk-*kasshiki* love embedded in *enshi* are quite distinguished from other literary texts. Nevertheless, there is a cultural reference

³⁴⁶ Yoshizawa (2002-2003). See http://iriz.hanazono.ac.jp/frame/k_room_f3g.html.

³⁴⁷ *Gozan bungaku shinshū bekkā* 1, p. 871.

that bridges *nanshoku* in Zen contexts and other Buddhist schools, particular that of the Tendai School: the pseudo-Chinese legend of Chrysanthemum Boy, an immortal boy once was a favorite of Emperor Mu of Zhou.³⁴⁸ Well noted by such earlier research as Abe (1984), Matsuoka (2004), and Atkins (2008), the *jidō* legend appears in many Tendai texts, including the *Tendai sokui hō* (Tendai accession protocols) based on which the *chigo kanjō* rites were established. This legend also functions as the origin of the Chrysanthemum Festival, resulting in another famous code for *nanshoku*.

(*Shinden shikō*)

重陽会友

Meeting a Friend on Double-Ninth Day

金節煌煌見蓐收
百年世事付東流

The golden season dazzles and the god of autumn appears.
One hundred years of worldly matters were entrusted to the eastern stream.

紫萸點綴連朝雨

Purple berries scatter like continuous morning rains.

黃菊商量九日秋³⁴⁹

Yellow chrysanthemums are traded on the ninth day of the last month of autumn.

Lastly, I would like to conduct a simple survey of the medieval *chigo* tales (*chigo monogatari*), focusing on the characterization of the Buddhist priests who are the older participants of *nanshoku*. For the purpose of this chapter, among the extant corpus of works, only the depictions of monks who unequivocally develop a sexual relationship with *chigo* will be considered. In his article, Atkins provides the following list of ten *chigo monogatari*:

“A Long Tale for an Autumn Night” (*Aki no yo no nagamonogatari*)*

“The Tale of Genmu” (*Genmu monogatari*)*

³⁴⁸ For a summary of the *jidō* legend, see Atkins, “Medieval Japanese Imagination,” pp. 957-959.

³⁴⁹ *Gozan bungaku shinshū bekkā* 1, p. 884.

“The Mountain” (*Ashibiki*)*

“Hanamitsu” (*Hanamitsu*)

“The Tale of Matsuho Bay” (*Matsuho no ura monogatari*)*

“The Tale of Mount Toribe” (*Toribeyama monogatari*)*

“The Tale of Saga” (*Saga monogatari*)*

“The Tale of Ben” (*Ben no sōshi*)*

“The New Servant is a *Chigo*” (*Chigo ima mairi*)

“The Story of Kannon's Manifestation as a *Chigo*” (*Chigo Kannon engi*)³⁵⁰

Indicated with an asterisk are stories in which a *chigo* and a monk engage in a relationship based on romantic feelings and sexual attraction. Of the stories unmarked with an asterisk, *Hanamitsu* and *Chigo Kannon engi* exhibit little *nanshoku* element. *Chigo imamairi*, on the other hand, is a love story between a *chigo* and an aristocratic lady.³⁵¹ Many of the works categorized as *chigo monogatari* exhibit religious overtones—four tales from the above list share a similar ending, in which the true identity of the deceased *chigo* turns out to be a deity (*Aki no yo*, *Genmu*, *Ben no sōshi*, and *Chigo Kannon*). Even when a human *chigo* dies in *Toribeyama*, this awakens the lover to the ephemerality of all sentient beings. Also, in *the Mountain*, the monk and the *chigo* become recluses and practice the Way of Buddha until both attain rebirth in the Pure Land.

³⁵⁰ Atkins, “Medieval Japanese Imagination,” p. 951. Other works often included in the genre of *chigo monogatari* include *Kōzuke no kimi shōsoku* (The letter from Lord Kōzuke) and *Sakurai monogatari* (The tale of Sakurai). *The Lord Kōzuke* lacks strong romantic overtones and in the *Sakurai*, the *chigo* marries the daughter of a provincial governor.

³⁵¹ For a full translation, see Schmidt-Hori, “New Attendant.”

Aside from the religious import of the vast majority of the *chigo monogatari*, another interesting commonality can be found. It turns out that, among the tales featuring a romantic relationship between a monk and *chigo*, none of the monks are portrayed as much older than the *chigo* they fall in love with, unlike Shinden Seiban (who compiled *Shinden shikō* at age 67) and San'eki Eisan, who composed seemingly autobiographical Chinese-style *enshi* about their old ages. In addition, none of the monks in the romantic tales are the masters of their lovers (i.e. *chigo*) or extremely high-ranking monks, unlike the well-known historical *chigo*-lovers such as Jinson and Cloistered Princes Kakushō and Shukaku. Curiously, in the unromantic *Chigo Kannon engi*, the *chigo*-turned-Kannon does become the disciple of the sixty-plus-year-old monk. Also, in a heterosexual love story, *Chigo imamai*, the hero of the story (i.e. the *chigo*) does have a master who is extremely high-ranking (the abbot of a temple on Mount Hiei). Furthermore, in two best-known romantic *chigo monogatari*, *Aki no yo* and *The Mountain* (Keikai and Gen'i, respectively) are not mere studious monks but are also portrayed as ferocious swordfighters. This vibrant masculinity of Keikai and Gen'i is quite dissimilar to the images of the elder Zen monk-poets and the abbots examined above.

These observations provide us with significant clues as to the reception of the pederasty within the Buddhist community. On the one hand, there is no question regarding how firmly this tradition had been established and accepted, especially within the Tendai, Shingon, and Zen schools of Buddhism. On the

other hand, there seems to be one aspect of monk-*chigo* eroticism that the most elaborate discourse of legitimization could not conquer: the aesthetic appeal.

This claim can be substantiated by the pictorial depictions of those engaged in various sexual acts with acolytes in the *Chigo no sōshi*, the aforementioned fourteenth-century collection of five erotic stories with illustrations. The first and fourth stories are of particular import. Story One features an extraordinarily loyal *chigo* of a priest too old to penetrate his beloved. This master priest, however, does not appear in the illustrations. The reason why the *chigo* is so loyal and thoughtful is because he attempts to expand his anus for his master with help from his lay attendant, Chūta. The only illustrations attached to this episode are the various ways in which Chūta assists the *chigo*, including penetration with a dildo and his own penis. In the pictures, Chūta is portrayed with a darker complexion and muscular limbs and chest in contrast to the *chigo*'s pale skin and plump figure. Even more fascinating is Story Four, which narrates how a *chigo* of an aristocratic man is approached by a low-ranking, *old* monk. The *chigo* gives in to the persistent courting and finally agrees to have sex with the "old monk," who receives a generous "make-over" by the illustrator of this scroll with an athletic body and firm, tanned skin. His feature makes a stark contrast to the sixty-plus-year old priest painted in the *Chigo Kannon engi* scroll.³⁵² Although a countless number of romantic *waka* and

³⁵² For a selection of illustrations of *Chigo no sōshi*, see Hashimoto Osamu, "Mazamaza to nikutai de aru yōna mono: *Chigo no sōshi*," Hiragana Nihon bijutsushi, *Geijutsu shinchō* 47(6), pp. 112-117. A picture from Story One is on p. 114; one from Story Four is on p. 113. For the picture

sensual *kanshi* on pederasty were circulated and appreciated within Buddhist communities, when it came down to appreciating poignant love stories and receiving erotic visual stimulation, the old and powerful were essentially banned from these media.

So far, through the survey of medieval *waka* poems, sensual Chinese-style Zen poems, romantic *chigo monogatari*, as well as the erotic picture scroll, a complex, rather ambivalent reception of the *chigo-sei* has emerged. Within the corpus of earlier research, including Kuroda (1989), Tanaka (1997), Faure (1998), and Tsuchiya (2001), textual representations of the monks in *nanshoku* relationships were virtually neglected or overshadowed by the towering historical figures like Jinson and Kakushō. Yet, when scrutinized, the Buddhist community's seemingly very public embracing of the *nanshoku* custom is in fact mixed in with a slight sense of guilt for "violating" the young acolytes as well as a sense of aversion to blatant depictions of hypersexuality of elder monks.

In the next section, I will direct my attention to a historical Zen monk, Ikkyū Sōjun (1394-1481) a cultural icon and heroic figure famous for having sex with women, including courtesans, and boasting about his experiences in his *kanshi*. His "bad boy" persona and hypersexuality that does not rely on tradition to legitimize his behavior would make a telling contrast to the monks within *nanshoku* relationships.

scroll of the *Chigo Kannon engi*, see *Nihon emaki taisei* 24 (Tokyo: Chūō Kōronsha, 1979), pp. 50-51.

V. Transcending the Celibacy Precepts: Poetics and Aesthetics of Ikkyū Sōjun

住庵十日意忙々	Ten days as an abbot and my mind is churning.
脚下紅糸線甚長	Under my feet, the red thread of passion is long.
他日君来如問我	If you come another day and ask for me,
魚行酒肆又淫坊	Try a fish shop, tavern or else a brothel. ³⁵³

Despite his “precocious but innocent prodigy” image that is prevalent in modern Japan through children’s stories and a popular TV animation series, the images that the biographical anecdotes and writings of Ikkyū Sōjun (1394-1481) project are anything but innocent. One of the most intriguing aspects of Ikkyū’s persona is the juxtaposition of his antinomianism lifestyle and presumed royal heritage, as the *Tōkai Ikkyū Oshō nempu* (Chronicle of the Reverend Ikkyū) states he was an illegitimate child of the Emperor Go-Komatsu and one of his favorite attendant, who was banished from the court due to the slander by the jealous empress.³⁵⁴ Indeed, he is a maverick madman—in his Chinese-style poems, he fearlessly criticized the secular culture of the Five Temples of the Rinzai Zen that had become of a great economic and political powerhouse thanks to its successful

³⁵³ *Kyōunshū* (*terminus ante quem*: 1467; hereafter *KS*) No. 85, entitled, “Addressed to Revered Yōsō upon My Retiring from Nyoian.” Translation is by Sonja Arntzen (*Ikkyū and The Crazy Cloud Anthology: A Zen Poet of Medieval Japan*. Tokyo: University of Tokyo Press, 1986), p. 25. In this chapter, the numbers of poems from *KS* are based on Ichikawa Hakugen et al., eds., *Kyōunshū* in *Chūsei Zenke no shisō*, *Nihon shisō taikai* 16 (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1972), pp. 273-387.

³⁵⁴ See Arntzen, *Crazy Cloud*, pp. 10-13.

money-lending business, the patronage of the military elites, among other factors. Furthermore, Ikkyū was not hesitant to boast of his erratic behavior as well as a self-claimed profound understanding of Zen. As someone who could have lived the stable life of an elite Zen monk yet fiercely rejected such a life, choosing to become a rebel instead, I posit Ikkyū as the quintessential example of covert prestige.

Unsurprisingly, corrupt monks are in most cases portrayed negatively in religious tales. For instance, a traveling monk named Rōgen and an unnamed apprentice monk of Kōryūji are both referred to as “*hakai muzan*” (breaking the precepts with no shame) in the *Konjaku* (13:4 and 13:37, respectively), and both are punished due to karmic retribution.³⁵⁵ Similarly, the *Uji* describes the premature death of an administrative monk of Yokawa named Kanō Chiin, about which his master says, “Because he was a man of *hakai muzan*, I have no doubt that he would fall into hell” (5:13).³⁵⁶

The reception of Ikkyū in the literary history could not have been any more different from that of the above examples. He has been the subject of great academic interest both in Japan and in the West as one of the most intriguing cultural heroes of premodern Japan. A large portion of his *kanshi* anthology *Kyōunshū* (The collection of Crazy Cloud) has been translated into English by Covell and Yamada, James H. Sanford, and Sonja Arntzen, each with Ikkyū’s detailed biography synthesized with the chronology and anecdotal events

³⁵⁵ SNKBZ 35, pp. 300-303 and 376-377, respectively.

³⁵⁶ SNKBZ 50, pp. 195-197.

incorporated into his poems.³⁵⁷ Aside from reconstructions of his life, a number of scholars, including the three mentioned above, have studied ikkyū's poetics represented by his trademark concepts: *fūryū* ("wind-flow") and *fūkyō* ("wind-madness").

According to Okamatsu Kazuo, approximately one in every ten poems compiled in *Kyōunshū* and one in every four poems in *Zoku kyōunshū* contains the word *fūryū*.³⁵⁸ Nonetheless, grasping the meanings or functions of *fūryū* is not an easy task. Peipei Qiu states that the precise meaning of *fūryū* or *fengliu* in Chinese is complex because the word already had multiple meanings in ancient China, and it further evolved after being introduced to Japan by blending with native Japanese interpretations.³⁵⁹ Nevertheless, Okazaki Yoshie suggests that the term generally signifies the following four concepts in classical Japanese literature: (1) ancient Chinese aesthetic observed in the pastoral poetry of Tao Yuanming (365-427); (2) erotic love between men and women; (3) a desolate, monochrome beauty embodied by Zen's emptiness; and (4) a combination of (2) and (3).³⁶⁰ While Okamatsu admits the challenge of grasping the multitude of

³⁵⁷ Jon Carter Covell and Yamada Sōbin, *Zen's Core: Ikkyū's Freedom* (Elizabeth, N.J.: Hollym International Corp., 1980); James H. Sanford. *Zen-Man Ikkyū* (Chico: Scholars Press, 1981).

³⁵⁸ Okamatsu Kazuo, "Ikkyū Sōjun ni okeru 'fūryū' no kōzō," in Akiyama Ken, ed., *Chūsei bungaku no kenkyū*, pp. 287-304 (Tokyo: Tōkyō Daigaku Shuppankai, 1972), p.287.

³⁵⁹ Peipei Qiu, "Aesthetics of Unconventionality: *Fūryū* in Ikkyū's Poetry," *Japanese Language and Literature* 35 (2001), p. 135.

³⁶⁰ Okazaki Yoshie, "Ikkyū Sōjun to Gozan Zenrin no fūryū," in *Nihon geijutsu shichō*, Vol. 2-ge (Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1948), pp. 173-196.

meanings, he suggests Ikkyū's use of *fūryū* has to be analyzed from both literary and Zen aesthetics with an understanding that it can signify both lofty beauty and raw eroticism.³⁶¹ Covell and Yamada, on the other hand, argue that Ikkyū's *fūryū* or "wind-flow" is a combination of the Taoist ideal represented by the lifestyle of "Seven Sages of the Bamboo Grove" and "some sexual connotations which had crept into China within the sixth and seventh centuries."³⁶² Although there may be subtle differences in their focuses, all in all, these scholars may agree with Qiu's conclusion:

Ikkyū's *fūryū* covers a full spectrum of meaning accumulated in Chinese and Japanese literature, from spiritual integrity to erotic beauty, and from the elegance of letters to the love of nature and rustic lifestyle. Despite the diverse usages, transcending the worldly by being unconventional is the essence of Ikkyū's *fūryū*. *Fūryū* as an aesthetic of unconventionality celebrates the freest mind, which, to the orthodox point of view, is crazy and eccentric.³⁶³

The other term strongly associated with Ikkyū's poetics is *fūkyō*, which literally means "wind's blowing madly," while *fūkyōfu* means "a deranged person" (*Dai Kanwa jiten*). Obviously, the *kyō* character is used in the title of Ikkyū's aforementioned anthology *Kyōunshū*, as "Crazy Cloud" was his self-given nickname. According to the anecdote included in *Chronicle*, on the 9th day of the 10th month of Ōei 29 (1421), Ikkyū's third master Kasō was asked to name his

³⁶¹ Okamatsu, "'Fūryū' no kōzō," p. 302.

³⁶² Covell and Yamada, *Zen's Core*, pp. 191-192.

³⁶³ Qiu, "Aesthetics of Unconventionality," p. 151.

successor, and said, “Although he is *fūkyō*, I have this Sōjun.”³⁶⁴ Akizuki Ryōkan calls Ikkyū “a man of freedom and madness” (*fūkyō no jiyū-jin*) and characterizes his *fūkyō* with (1) fearless, uncompromising personality and his dearest love and respect for his teachers; and (2) audacious professions on his transgressions, especially love affairs.³⁶⁵ Ichikawa Hakugen, on the other hand, describes the Muromachi era “the time of *fūryū* and *kyōki* (madness),” symbolized with *gekokujo* (“the low overcomes the high”). By saying this, Ichikawa indicates that Ikkyū’s *fūkyō* is a collaboration of the specific point of time in history and his captivating, charismatic persona. Just as others, Ichikawa also uses numerous poems from *Kyōunshū* to illustrate Ikkyū’s *fūkyō*, that is to say, his unorthodoxy, misanthropy, fierceness, transgressions, and corporeal love.³⁶⁶

Although these are all meticulous studies, some explain Ikkyū’s poetics and lifestyle by the keywords of *fūryū* and *fūkyō* while they exemplify these two concepts via Ikkyū’s poems and lifestyle, which is circular. Therefore, I shall attempt to contribute to the further understanding of Ikkyū’s poetics from a different angle, through the aesthetics of transgression and hypersexuality in light of covert prestige. For instance, one of the common themes observed in Ikkyū’s

³⁶⁴ Nakamoto Tamaki, ed., *Kyōunshū, Kyōun shishū, Jikaishū, Shinsen Nihon koten bunko* (Tokyo: Gendai Shisōsha, 1976), p. 386.

³⁶⁵ Akizuki Ryōmin, *Ikkyū, Shōzan, Bankei, Ryōkan: Zenmon no iryū-tachi* (Tokyo: San’ichi Shobō, 1978), pp. 15-30.

³⁶⁶ Ichikawa Hakugen, *Ikkyū: Ranse ni ikita Zensha*, NHK Bukkusu 132 (Tokyo: NHK Shuppan Kyōkai, 1970), pp. 120-168.

poetry is breaking Buddhist precepts as well as praising other Zen masters who do so.

寄大德寺僧 Address to a Monk at Daitokuji

人多入得大燈門 Many are the men who enter Daitō's gate.

這裏誰損師席尊 Therein who rejects the veneration of the master role?

淡飯龜茶我無客 Thin rice gruel, coarse tea, I have few guests;

醉歌獨倒濁醪樽 Singing drunkenly, all alone, I tip up a cask of muddy *sake*.³⁶⁷

In this poem, Ikkyū implicitly denounces his fellow Zen monks who entertain guests with a feast and premium tea in exchange for donations. Simultaneously, he indicates the superiority of his spirit even if he violates the precept to prohibit drinking alcohol (*fuonju-kai*).

贊慈恩窺基法師 Praising the Dharma Master Tz'u-en K'uei-chi

窺基三昧獨天真 K'uei-chi's samādhi alone was natural and real.

酒肉諸經又美人 Wine, meat, the scriptures, and beautiful women,

座主眼睛猶若此 The eye of the abbot was just like this.

宗門唯有箇宗純 In our school, there is only this Sōjun.³⁶⁸

³⁶⁷ KS, No. 176. Arntzen, *Crazy Cloud*, p. 123.

³⁶⁸ Ibid., No. 166., p. 120. Arntzen's note reads: "... K'uei-chi (632-81) is the official first Patriarch of the Fa-hsiang, Yogācāra, school of Buddhism in China. He was the disciple of Hsüan-tsang, the illustrious and intrepid pilgrim, who brought an enormous collection of sutras from India and with them the transmission of the Yogācāra teaching. It was for K'uei-chi to write the commentaries to these sutras and to formulate the theoretical writings of the school. A legend persists about his unconventional behavior, that, for example, he loved the sutras but could not give up wine and women" (p. 120).

The last line of this poem clearly indicates that Ikkyū identifies himself with the Chinese *hakai-sō* K'uei-chi (632-682), whom he praises as “natural and real.”

In the next poem, Ikkyū again condemns a power-hungry Zen monk—this time his own elder fellow disciple Yōsō—who violates no precepts but, Ikkyū would probably say, violates the spirit of Zen.

賀大用庵養叟和尚 **Congratulating Daiyūan's Monk Yōsō upon Receiving**
賜宗惠大照禪師号 **the Honorary Title Zen Master Sōe Daishō**

紫衣師号奈家貧 Purple robes, honorary titles, how can the house be poor?

綾紙青銅三百緡 The Imperial Edict alone cost three hundred strings of
copper coins.

大用現前麁長老 The appearance of great activity, the old charlatan,

看来真箇普州人 If you just look at him, you can tell he is really a man
from P'u-chou.³⁶⁹

This poem is of particular import for understanding Ikkyū's self-constructed *hakai-sō* persona. First of all, the title explicitly spells out the occasion in which it was composed and to whom it is directed—without reading the poem, one may expect a congratulatory note for a fellow priest, although the content could not be any farther from such an appearance. This poem is a deliberate, shocking insult, rather than one carefully crafted to hint a slight tone of disagreement—a more common and accepted way of declaring animosity towards an individual of high station. Nevertheless, precisely because of his politically charged, audacious

³⁶⁹ KS, No. 175. Arntzen, *The Crazy Cloud*, p. 121. Arntzen's notes reads: "...P'u-chou is a province in Szechwan renowned for producing robbers, thus the expression "a man from P'u-chou" was proverbial for thief" (p. 122).

attitude, Ikkyū was established as a charismatic figure. That is to say, a monk's frequenting a tavern and a brothel itself would not necessarily jeopardize the powerful Zen temples, as he could be easily dismissed as a man of folly. When he publicly denounces the establishment, however, for its culture of corruption and even presents himself as a superior being, he would definitely become a threat to the authority. By the same token, his audacity can be positively interpreted as fearlessness and unconformity, much as the literary representations of courtesans and outlaws. Moreover, unlike the cases of courtesans and outlaws, the defiance of Ikkyū has a noble purpose: to preach the true essence of Zen to the world. In other words, the juxtaposition of Yōsō and Ikkyū is analogous to that of ideals in overt and covert prestige. The overt prestige of Buddhist priests are represented by the purple robe, riches, and beautiful *chigo*, while Ikkyū's covert prestige is signified by fierce disobedience to the authority in spite of his high birth, as Ikkyū might have as well been the one who enjoys the lavish lifestyle of powerful abbots.

Another important aspect of Ikkyū's self-admitted hypersexuality is the lack of attempt to defend sex as a means of attaining Buddhist virtues, vis-à-vis how the esoteric and Zen schools systematically legitimized sex with *chigo*. Even beyond *chigo-sei*, sex can be utilized as a teaching tool (*upāya*), as widely observable in Buddhist didactic literature. I will translate and summarize one such example from *Konjaku monogatari shū* (vol. 17, no. 33):

There once was a young monk on Mt. Hiei. Although he always wished to be a scholarly monk, his mind was always distracted by thoughts on women. Every day, he prayed for Kokūzō bosatsu [Ākāśagarbha bodhisattva] to grant him with will

power. One day, on his way back from a pilgrimage, it became too dark to travel. Desperate, the young monk knocked on the gate of a nearby mansion and asked for a night of lodging. The mistress of the mansion was an amazingly beautiful lady. The monk fell in love at first sight, and after everyone fell asleep, he sneaked into her bed and tried to have sex with her. The woman told him she was a widow and she would consider remarriage, but only to a highly educated monk. Then, she asked the young priest hurry back to Mt. Hiei in the morning, memorize the entire *Lotus Sutra*, and return. After twenty days, he had completely memorized the sutra and came back. However, this time, the widow asked him to attain a complete understanding of Buddhist teachings, after which she would marry him. Three years later, the monk returned to the mansion with a mastery of Buddhist teachings. The mistress and the monk spent the night together, but he was too exhausted to have sex. In the morning, the monk woke up in the middle of nowhere. Later, the bodhisattva appeared in his dream and told the priest that everything has been his plan to make him a full-fledged scholarly monk.³⁷⁰

Again, while both *chigo-sei* and sex as a Buddhist skillful means can fall back on their respective discourse to justify themselves, Ikkyū does not seem to advocate his behaviors as a way to reach salvation or nirvana. This is another reason why his hypersexuality is associated with covert prestige. In fact, Ikkyū's amorous nature is depicted positively in legends about him that became prevalent during the Tokugawa period. One such tale is compiled in a collection *Ikkyū banashi* (The tales of Ikkyū) under the title, "On Ikkyū's infatuation with a parishioner's wife," as I will summarize below:

³⁷⁰ SNKBZ 36, pp. 370-382.

One mid-spring day, Ikkyū was enjoying *sake* inside his hermitage with a basketful of blossoms in front of him. When his parishioner's wife came to visit, Ikkyū invited her to join him. They spent a wonderful time together, and before they knew it, the sun had already set. Ikkyū suggested the woman should spend the night there since he had feelings for her. Stunned by the sage's solicitation of adultery, the woman hurried home and told her husband about the incident. The husband, being a wise man, started to laugh and exclaimed, "Ikkyū is indeed a living buddha! He is so remarkable for asking his own parishioner's wife to sleep with him," and urged his wife to go and sleep with Ikkyū. When the beautifully dressed woman arrived at the hermitage, however, Ikkyū rejected her offer by saying, "I no longer have feelings for you. Please go home right away." Back home, the husband was deeply impressed with the turn of the event, and said, "I knew this was going to happen! He is the renowned Zen master with a mind of running streams. He is truly extraordinary."³⁷¹

Ikkyū's transgressive aesthetics captivated his contemporaries, including the royalty, great masters of arts, wealthy merchants from Sakai, and aspiring monks among others. It also drove literati to materialize their adoration for Ikkyū by creating a number of legends posthumously to praise him.³⁷²

However boldly Ikkyū behaved and was so perceived, he was most importantly a devoted Buddhist priest, and without this quality, he could not have

³⁷¹ SNKBZ 64, pp. 334-337.

³⁷² There are three collections of Ikkyū legends: *Ikkyū banashi*, *Ikkyū Kantō banashi* (Eastern tales of Ikkyū), and *Ikkyū shokoku monogatari* (Ikkyū's Tales of various provinces), which are compiled in one volume as Mikame Tatsuji and Zen Bunka Kenkyūjo, eds., *Ikkyū banashi shūsei*, (Kyoto: Zen Bunka Kenkyūjo, 1993).

attracted a large body of followers as he did. The following poem expresses his fear of karmic retribution he felt on his sickbed:

病中

Composed when ill

破戒沙門八十年 A monk who has broken the precepts for eighty years,

自慚因果撥無禪 Repenting a Zen that has ignored cause and effect.

病被過去因果々 When ill, one suffers the effects of past deeds;

今行何謝劫空縁 Now how to act in order to atone for eons of bad karma.³⁷³

Whether the reader should interpret this poem at its face value may not be as important as the fact that Ikkyū represents himself as one who respects the precepts but still violates them. This is a compelling and provocative gesture towards the “laymen disguised as priests” (KS, No. 140), whom he harshly denounces, since he projects himself as one who is superior to those avaricious monks in spite of his self-admitted sins.³⁷⁴ Although Ikkyū could have practiced his ideal Zen in a desolate mountain hermitage and been content with himself, he chose to send his messages directly to the Zen establishments of his time.

Recall in the previous section we saw how common it was for Zen monks to rely on conventions and various codes for *nanshoku* to compose sensuous poems. Thus they can refer to their infatuation for *kasshiki* without using up the limited number of Chinese characters and being overly risqué. In contrast, Ikkyū’s erotic poems are more explicit as if selecting diction to most effectively provoke the reader’s emotions. Out of numerous poems he composed about his

³⁷³ KS, No. 250. Arntzen, *The Crazy Cloud*, p. 34.

³⁷⁴ Ibid., p. 116.

blind minstrel lover, Mori (or Shin), the title of a series of three poems shocks the readers: “Sipping a Beautiful Woman’s Sexual Fluids (吸美人姪水),” while the contents were far less erotic. Sanford speculates that Ikkyū chose this provocative title to intend “to signal the reader that these poems were autobiographical rather than romantic.”³⁷⁵

密啓自慙私語盟	Intimate words, private regrets, sweet promises.
風流吟罷約三生	After a song of love, a bow for future lives.
々見墮在畜生道	And should I fall and become a beast,
絶勝滂山戴角情	I will exceed the horny-headed passions of Wei-shan. [KS, 529] ³⁷⁶
杜牧口苴是我徒	Tu Mu’s nastiness is my vice too.
狂雲邪法甚難扶	I’m in a bad way, hard to help.
為人輕賤滅罪業	Despised by others even as I exhaust my karma.
外道波旬幾失途	Just one lone devil strayed from the past. [KS, 530] ³⁷⁷
臨濟宗門誰正伝	Lin-chi’s followers don’t know Zen.
三玄三要瞎驢辺	The true transmission was to be the Blind Donkey.
夢閨老納閨中月	Love-play, three lifetimes of sixty long kalpas.
夜々風流爛醉前	One Autumn night is a thousand centuries. [KS, 495] ³⁷⁸

³⁷⁵ Sanford, *Zen-man*, p. 160.

³⁷⁵ Ibid., p. 159.

³⁷⁶ Ibid, p. 159. In *Nihon shisō taikēi* version of *Kyōunshū*, these three are not considered a set.

³⁷⁷ Ibid., p. 159. □= (*kusa-kanmuri* plus 藪).

Another poem on the pleasure of oral sex with Mori reads:

姪水

Sexual Fluids

夢迷上苑美人森

I'm infatuated with the beautiful Shin from the celestial garden:

枕上梅花々信心

Lying on the pillow with her flower stamen,

満口清香清浅水

My mouth fills with the pure perfume from the waters of her streams,

黄昏月色奈新吟

Twilight comes, then moonlight's shadows, as we sing our new song. [KS, 534]³⁷⁹

Not all poems on Mori are as sexually explicit as the above examples. For instance, one portraying a peaceful afternoon with sleeping Mori by his side and his thank-you note to her in the form of a seven-character verse exemplify Ikkyū's gentle love poems.

森公午睡

Lady Mori's Afternoon Nap

客散曲終無一声

The guests have scattered, the piece is over, not a sound;

不知極睡幾時驚

No one knows when she will awake from this deep sleep.

覲面当機胡蝶戲

Face to face, now a butterfly plays.

誰聞日午打三更

Who hears the striking of the midnight watch at noon?³⁸⁰ [KS, 544]

謝森公深恩之願書

Wishing to Thank Mori for My Deep Debt to Her

³⁷⁸ Ibid., p. 160. In *Nihon shisō taikai* version, this poem has the title, "Facing an image of Lin-chi (対臨済画像)," p. 360.

³⁷⁹ Covell & Yamada, *Zen's Core*, p. 225. Their comment on this particular poem reads, "For decades Ikkyū had played the *shakuhachi*, the most demanding of musical instruments for the mouth and lips. Now he found new dimensions for the strength of his lips and tongue. By 'stamen' the poet refers to the clitoris," p. 225.

³⁸⁰ Arntzen, *Crazy Cloud*, p. 162.

木稠葉落更回春	The tree budded leaves that fell, but once more round comes spring;
長緑生花旧約新	Green grows, flowers bloom, old promises are renewed.
森也深恩若忘却	Mori, if I ever forget my deep bond with you,
無量億劫畜生身	Hundreds of thousands of eons without measure, may I be reborn a beast. ³⁸¹ [KS, 544]

All in all, Ikkyū's sensual poems, whether they are provocative or romantic, are dissimilar to ones composed by San'eki, Shinden and Ōsen in a few aspects. First, Ikkyū is *explicitly* discussing his *private* relationship with Mori. On the other hand, the others are *implicitly* discussing their *public* relationships that are based on the firmly established custom endorsed by the Buddhist community, *chigo-sei*. This inversion of mode made by Ikkyū is effective to convey his persona as a man who dares to love his lover and uncover their most private moments without fearing the consequence. The other Zen masters do boast of their relationships with their young lovers, but they do so by hiding behind the tradition and conventions of *nanshoku* references. Second of all, the relationship between Ikkyū and Mori violates his vow of celibacy, yet he was fervently revered by many to the extent that numerous legends were created after his life. Conversely, those whom Ikkyū call "laymen with shaved heads," skillfully eschew being blamed for breaking the precept, although their relationships needed a significant "make-over" in order to be aesthetically pleasant depicted in vernacular tales or erotica.

³⁸¹ Ibid., p. 162.

VI. Conclusion

In this chapter, we have examined hypersexualities of Buddhist monks, beginning with an overview of the historico-cultural underpinnings of premodern Japanese society, which fostered generally lax attitudes towards the Vinaya and precepts within monasteries. While a sub-group of Shingon School practiced Tantric Buddhism, which believed in enlightenment through sexual intercourse, and monks belonging to Shin Pure Land School married women, in the mainstream Buddhist communities, as long as monks resided in monasteries, they were effectively kept away from women.

During the medieval period, on the other hand, numerous temples, especially ones affiliated with Tendai, Shingon, and Zen schools, customarily housed, clothed, and educated youths as temple acolytes. Those beautiful youths with aristocratic or samurai lineages were the object of love and worship, as they were deified through the *kanjō* ritual and deemed to be reborn as bodhisattvas. Due to this sacralization of *chigo*, having sex with them was not considered to be a breach of their celibacy vow. Nevertheless, the current study has shown evidence that Buddhist priests were most likely to be having sex with temple attendants in general, regardless of their origins, ranks among the temple pages, or whether they were officially sacralized. Furthermore, the sexual relationships between *chigo* and monks were probably not exclusive, as evidence shows both groups engaged in sexual relationships with multiple partners.

Two most significant questions my study attempted to answer are: 1) How did the premodern Japanese society view the custom of *nanshoku* in Buddhist communities?; and 2) How did the Buddhist communities themselves view this practice? In general, there is little textual evidence indicative of the secular society's condemnation of the custom. For instance, a *chigo monogatari* that appears to be written by a lay author, *Chigo imamai*, does not depict the *chigo*-abbot relationship as something unethical or even remotely questionable. It seems reasonable to assume *chigo*'s sexual obligations to priests were generally considered a small price to pay, if anything at all, given the amount of opportunities the youths were given.

The answer to the second question is somewhat paradoxical. For the most part, the Buddhist society openly embraced having sex with lay youths, a custom protected in the name of tradition as well as by sacralization ritual of *chigo*. Nevertheless, my close examination of romantic or sensuous poetry written by monks for *chigo*, medieval short stories on monk-*chigo* romances, and the erotic illustration of the *Chigo no Sōshi* revealed a complex mixture of various evaluations for the practice. Despite the findings of previous research, monks, or the older partners in the pederasty, sometimes assumed the feminine/passive role in their *waka* poems, lamenting their favorite *chigo*'s change of hearts or anticipating their *chigo*'s next visit. However, most of the *waka* seem gender neutral love poems. In the Zen priests' sensuous *kanshi*, on the other hand, the dictions were highly conventionalized with frequent references to the poets' advanced ages, their lovers' feminine and youthful appearances, and cultural

codes for *nanshoku*, including Star Festival, Chrysanthemum Festival, and the “old hermit” flower. Lastly, I examined the characterizations of the priests depicted in romantic *chigo monogatari* and the erotica *Chigo no sōshi*. Within my corpus, all of the lover monks in the *chigo* tales are relatively young, some of them are extremely masculine, whereas none of them are of the highest ranks. In the illustration of the *Chigo no sōshi*, an intercourse scene between a *chigo* and an elderly monk was clearly avoided. These seemingly idiosyncratic findings point to one conclusion. That is to say, I would argue that the Buddhist community took pride in the beautiful *chigo* much like powerful aristocratic men and elite warriors often showcased their powers through their harems. On the individual level, monks could be as insecure about their relationships as anyone else. This came through the lamenting *waka* poems and *kanshi* that are protected by the stylized dictions and codes. Finally, the amount of pride the Buddhist community took in the custom of *nanshoku* was not powerful enough to overcome their sense of reservation towards sex between *chigo* and elderly priests. This conclusion becomes more vivid when contrasted to the hyper-sexuality of Ikkyū.

The self-portrayal of Ikkyū emerging through his *kanshi* distinguishes itself from the impressions of the sensual Chinese-style poems composed by his fellow Zen monks. He boasts about his trips to brothels, drinking *sake*, and his love affair with Lady Mori. There is no logic of justifying his behaviors—no self-serving interpretations of the Vinaya or Buddhist teachings—the only basis for his unconventional demeanors is his conviction for profound understanding of Zen.

Ikkyū's deliberate choices of living the lifestyle of *hakai-sō* despite his high birth and publically denouncing powerful Zen institutions through his poetry are a quintessential embodiment of covert prestige. His charismatic persona inspired a number of legends and he is still a household name in modern Japan, while continuing to be a subject of academic interest in literary and religious studies.

When we look back on the prevalence of monk-*chigo nanshoku* within medieval Japanese monasteries, it is difficult not to question their integrity as a center of sacred power. Nevertheless, it may not be productive to condemn the long-lasting tradition by solely judging against our modern standard, whether we take issue with the same-sex love, self-discipline of the monks, or with the difference in status and age. Interestingly, the medieval Buddhist community itself revealed how it took issue with those three aspects of the monk-*chigo* relationships in its writings. First, it is quite apparent that the homosexual component of the relationships was not a moral dilemma for them. Second, based on how sexual intercourse with *chigo* was described as a "violation" (of their celibacy precept), and the monk Sōshō issued a written oath to express his volition not to have sex with more than a hundred *chigo*, we can presume sex with *chigo* was, to some extent, associated with sinfulness. Lastly, my study suggested that the Buddhist community did take issue with sexual relationships between a monk and *chigo* who are greatly separated by age and status. The romantic *chigo monogatari* exemplify ideal relationships between a monk and *chigo*, ones built upon love and respect, much like the secular society idealized unselfish love in vernacular tales. When an outcast monk audaciously lets the

whole world know about his maddening love for his blind minstrel lady, the white-headed Zen monks' embellished praises for their boy lovers sound hopelessly uninspiring. It seems that premodern Japanese society was equipped with a generosity to accept Buddhist priests' hypersexuality. However, to embrace it wholeheartedly, the love had to be "unselfish" enough to openly violate the celibacy precept, much like the most cherished heroes of Heian love stories violated rules in the gravest ways.

CONCLUSION

The above discussions were an attempt to unveil the hidden power of women and men who lived in the margins of premodern Japanese society, primarily from the perspectives of sexual appeal and transgressive aesthetics. Simultaneously, my study probes the conventional notion of power by suggesting that prosperity, wealth, and high social status do not guarantee admiration by others. At times, it is quite the contrary. In literature, for example, historical emperors, military leaders, and elite monks, or the “alpha male” type of men, who tend to surround themselves with their objects of desire, are hardly depicted as objects of desire (whether to possess or emulate). While riches, noble lineage, and official titles can surely be recognized as tokens of attractiveness in reality, in the world of classical Japanese literature, there is a tendency to avoid directly connecting one’s sexual desirability with economic and/or political power. Rather, as are the cases of Hikaru Genji, Ariwara no Narihira, and Minamoto no Yoshitsune, among others, the sexual appeal of highborn males is usually conveyed as courtly elegance (such as excellence in *waka* poetry and music) and feminine beauty. In the romantic *chigo monogatari*, it is the younger, aspiring Buddhist priests who win the love of the beautiful *chigo*, projecting an image dissimilar to the three most famous historical *chigo*-lovers: Jinson, Shukaku and Kakushō.

To explicate, I would like to return to the concept of the bifacial structure of prestige: economical and political powers are strongly associated with such negative traits as greed, heartlessness, as well as the Buddhist notion of this-

worldly attachment. For instance, in the *Tale of Genji*, the hero reached the highest possible rank in court as a commoner, the fictional post of “honorary retired emperor,” yet the story never focuses on the political side of Genji. In the *Tale of Heike*, the two alpha males, Taira no Kiyomori and the Cloistered Emperor Go-Shirakawa (Kiyomori’s primary enemy, Minamoto no Yoritomo, is virtually non-existent in this tale), both of whom had multiple wives and dozens of offspring, could not be any farther from the idea of sex appeal.

In addition, one’s “advanced” age, a common byproduct of coming to power, seems to be another factor that prevents very powerful men from being presented as sexually attractive.³⁸² In the last chapter, I discussed the erotic tale of *Chigo no sōshi*, which included a story of an elderly monk obsessed with a *chigo*. However, the pictorial representation of the same story featured a younger monk with tanned complexion, muscular arms, and a thick chest, indicating that intercourse between a beautiful, feminine adolescent and a wrinkled man was found distasteful even among *chigo*-lovers. This severe stigma of “advanced age” is observable in the depictions of former imperial priestesses in Kamakura courtly tales, the women who lost their cachet both as sacred beings and virgins, as discussed in Chapter 1.

³⁸² In premodern Japan, when the life expectancy was much shorter than today, one’s fortieth birthday was considered a significant milestone. Simultaneously, a forty-year old person was considered “aged.” For example, at his fortieth year celebration, Genji jokes, “I should have preferred to forget old age a little longer,” while the narrator affirms that “[Genji] looked so young and handsome that one refused to believe the count of his years, and such as his grace that he hardly seemed a father” (Tyler, *Genji*, p. 590).

Thus, covert prestige is not necessarily inferior or secondary to overt prestige (hence it is bifacial), which is one of the principal findings of my research. That is to say, a historical courtesan may have found what Catherine Hakim refers to as *erotic capital* as rewarding as an imperial maiden's becoming a symbolic wife of the Great Ise Deity.³⁸³ At the same time, the sexual entertainer may have found her low birth as excruciating as being considered an undesirable old maid who has accumulated sin due to neglecting her duties as a Buddhist. As for the elite warriors, their gender ideal (i.e. hypermasculinity) was at odds with the traditional (i.e. aristocratic) masculinity, causing a mixed sense of pride for their prowess and inferiority due to their lack of cultural cachet. On the other hand, it would be unlikely for outlaws to have lived with such an inferiority complex for being unable to play a flute or read Chinese classics. There, they were able to wholeheartedly enjoy their hypermasculinity, terrorizing others, including those who occupied the upmost stratum of society. Lastly, our evidence shows that Buddhist priests were never completely free of guilt for breaking the celibacy precept with *chigo* and that they did not necessarily have

³⁸³ Catherine Hakim, "Erotic Capital," *European Sociological Review*, Vol. 26 No. 5 (2010), pp. 499-518. In addition to Pierre Bourdieu's original economic, cultural, and social capitals, Hakim has presented the fourth asset, erotic capital, which is composed of six definite (and one indefinite) elements: beauty, sexual attractiveness, sociability, liveliness, presentation, sexuality, and exclusively for women and limited to certain cultures, fertility (pp. 500-501). In my study, the erotic capital is most relevant to the analysis of courtesans, as they directly traded their sexual service and sex appeal with economic capital, although it somewhat overlaps with outlaws' machismo and Ikkyū's charisma as well.

the upper hand over their younger lovers contrary to what the previous research indicated. Now evidence shows that *chigo* sometimes left their lover for more desirable partners much like the secular, heterosexual world. In contrast, it is quite apparent that Ikkyū never felt envy for affluent abbots protected by the shogunate nor did he feel shame for being the eccentric loner known as the Crazy Cloud. Again, one cannot simply assume that covert prestige was not as valuable as overt prestige.

My study relates to some of the “blind spots” of hitherto academic research of premodern Japanese literature. However, these findings have ramifications beyond the realm of literary studies, let alone those of premodern Japan. In regard to such “blind spots” of academic research, Hakim, the aforementioned sociologist who theorized the notion of erotic capital, writes:

Why has erotic capital been overlooked by social scientists? This failure of Bourdieu and other researchers is testimony to the continuing dominance of male perspectives in sociology and economics, even in the 21st century. Bourdieu's failure is all the more remarkable because he analysed relationships between men and women, and was sensitive to the competition for control and power in relationships (Bourdieu, 1998). However, like many others, Bourdieu was only interested in the three class-related and inheritable assets that are convertible into each other. Erotic capital is distinctive in not being controlled by social class and status, and has a subversive character.³⁸⁴

She continues:

³⁸⁴ Ibid, p. 510.

Erotic capital has been overlooked because it is held mostly by women, and the social sciences have generally overlooked or disregarded women in their focus on male activities, values and interests. The patriarchal bias in the social sciences reflects the male hegemony in society as a whole. Men have taken steps to prevent women from exploiting their major advantage over men, starting with the idea that erotic capital is worthless. [...] The Christian religion has been particularly vigorous in deprecating and disdaining everything to do with sex and sexuality as base and impure, shameful, belonging to a lower aspect of humanity.³⁸⁵

Without undermining the magnitude of contributions made by past academic research, Hakim's statement appears to be accurate in that certain theses may be eschewed as being frivolous, unless the research is aimed at criticizing them. In the case of my dissertation, the erotic capital of courtesans, illegitimate violence of outlaws, and sexual relationships of Buddhist priests with their acolytes may be the theses traditionally approached with a premise that they are no more than embodiment of immorality. Nevertheless, on a positive note, all of this points to the fact that there are fertile areas of research.

In addition to re-examining well-studied Heian and medieval texts, as I attempted in this dissertation, there is much work left to do with the Edo literature, a large corpus of works produced between the seventeenth and early nineteenth centuries. After centuries of shared ruling powers between the court, bakufu, and large religious institutions, the Tokugawa shogunate of the seventeenth century exerted singular power over the people, the court, religious institutions, commercialization of sex, production of arts and texts, among others. It would be

³⁸⁵ Ibid., p. 510.

highly worthwhile to investigate how this transformation of power dynamics has affected the status of royalties, aristocrats, warriors, Buddhist monks, courtesans, outlaws, and beyond, measured from various angles, evaluated in different currencies.

Bibliography

- Abe, Yasurō. *Yuya no kōgō: chūsei no sei to seinaru mono*. Nagoya: Nagoya Daigaku Shuppankai, 1998.
- Adolphson, Mikael S. *The Teeth and Claws of the Buddha: Monastic Warriors and Sōhei in Japanese History*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2007.
- Akizuki, Ryōmin. *Ikkyū, Shōzan, Bankei, Ryōkan: Zenmon no iryū-tachi*. Tokyo: San'ichi Shobō, 1978.
- Amino, Yoshihiko. *Chūsei no hinin to yūjo*. Tokyo: Akashi Shoten, 1994.
- _____. *Akutō to kaizoku: Nihon chūsei no shakai to seiji*. Tokyo: Hōsei Daigaku Shuppankyoku, 1995.
- Arntzen, Sonja, trans. *Ikkyū and The Crazy Cloud Anthology: a Zen Poet of Medieval Japan*. Tokyo: University of Tokyo Press, 1986.
- Aston, W. G., trans. *Nihongi: Chronicles of Japan from the Earliest Times to A.D. 697*. 1896; reprinted: Rutland, VT: Tuttle, 1982.
- Atkins, Paul S. *Revealed Identity: The Noh Plays of Komparu Zenchiku*. Ann Arbor: Center for Japanese Studies, The University of Michigan, 2006.
- _____. "Chigo in the Medieval Japanese Imagination." *The Journal of Asian Studies*. Vol. 63, No. 3 (2008), pp. 947-970.
- _____. "The Stages of *Seppuku*: Performing Self-Execution in Premodern Japan." In Axel Michaels and Anand Mishra, eds., *Ritual Dynamics and the Science of Ritual I: Grammar and Morphologies of Ritual Practices in Asia*. Wiesbaden, Germany: Harrassowitz Verlag, 2010, pp. 523-534.
- Bock, Elicia Gressitt, trans. *Engi-shiki: Procedures of the Engi Era, Books I-V*. Tokyo: Sophia University, 1970.
- Bodiford, William M., ed. *Going Forth: Visions of Buddhist Vinaya*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2005.
- Bourdieu, Pierre. *Distinction: A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste*. Richard Nice, trans. Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 1984.

- Budin, Stephanie L. *The Myth of Sacred Prostitution in Antiquity*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2008.
- Butler, Judith. *Gender Trouble: Feminism and Subversion of Identity*. New York: Routledge, 1990.
- Butler, Kenneth Dean. "The *Heike Monogatari* and the Japanese Warrior Ethic." *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies*. Vol. 29 (1969), pp. 93-108.
- Cabezón, Jose Ignacio, ed. *Buddhism, Sexuality, and Gender*. Albany, New York: State University of New York Press, 1992.
- Chigo Kannon engi*. In Komatsu Shigemitsu, et al., eds., *Nihon emaki taisei* 24. Tokyo: Chūō kōronsha, 1979.
- Childs, Margaret H. "Chigo Monogatari: Love Stories or Buddhist Sermons?" *Monumenta Nipponica* Vol. 35, No. 2 (1980), pp. 127-151.
- Cole, Alan. "Buddhism." in Don S. Browning, M. Christian Green, and John Witte Jr., eds., *Sex, Marriage, and Family in World Religions*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2006, pp. 299-366.
- Covell, Jon Carter and Yamada, Sōbin. *Zen's Core: Ikkyū's Freedom*. Elizabeth, N.J.: Hollym International Corp., 1980.
- D'Etcheverry, Charo B. "Out of the Mouths of Nurses: *The Tale of Sagoromo* and Midranks Romance." *Monumenta Nipponica* Vol. 59, No. 2 (Summer, 2004), pp. 153-177.
- Ding, Li. *Ise monogatari to sono shūhen: Jendā no shiten kara*. Tokyo: Kazama Shobō, 2006.
- Dobbins, James C. *Jōdo shinshū: Shin Buddhism in Medieval Japan*. Bloomington and Indianapolis: Indiana University Press, 1989.
- Eguchi*. In Koyama Hiroshi and Satō Ken'ichirō, eds., *Yōkyokushū*. *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 58. Tokyo: Shōgakusan, 1997.
- Ellwood, Robert S. "The Saigū: Princess and Priestess." *History of Religions* Vol. 7, No. 1 (1967), pp. 35-60.
- Emura, Hiroyuki. *Ise saigū to saiō: Inori o sasageta kōjo-tachi*. Tokyo: Hanawa Shobō, 2004.
- _____. *Ise saigū no rekishi to bunka*. Tokyo: Hanawa Shobō, 2009.

- Fahs, Breanne Fahs. *Performing Sex: The Making and Unmaking of Women's Erotic Lives*. Albany: State University of New York Press, 2011.
- Faure, Bernard. *The Red Thread: Buddhist Approaches to Sexuality*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1998.
- _____. *The Power of Denial: Buddhism, Purity, and Gender*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 2003.
- Friday, Karl F. *The First Samurai: The Life and Legend of the Warrior Rebel Taira Masakado*. Hoboken, New Jersey: John Wiley & Sons, 2008.
- Fukutō, Sanae. *Heian-chō onna no ikikata: Kagayaita josei tachi*. Tokyo: Shogakukan, 2004.
- Genji monogatari*. In Abe Akio, ed., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 20-25. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1994-98.
- Gikeiki*. In Kajihara Masaaki, ed., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 62. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 2000.
- Gilman, Sander L. *Difference and Pathology: Stereotypes of Sexuality, Race, and Madness*. Ithaca: Cornell University Press, 1985.
- Giō*. In Sanari Kentarō, ed., *Yōkyoku taikan* 2. Tokyo: Meiji Shoin, 1982.
- Goble, Andrew Edmond. "War and Injury: The Emergence of Wound Medicine in Medieval Japan." *Monumenta Nipponica*, Vol. 60, No. 3 (Autumn 2005), pp. 297-388.
- Goodwin, Janet R. *Selling Songs and Smiles: The Sex Trade in Heian and Kamakura Japan*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 2007.
- Go-shūi wakashū*. In Kubota Jun & Hirata Yoshinobu, eds., *Shin Nihon koten bungaku taikai* 8. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1994.
- Groner, Paul. *Saichō: The Establishment of the Japanese Tendai School*. Berkeley Buddhist Studies Series 7. Berkeley: Center for South and South East Asian Studies, University of California at Berkeley, 1984.
- Hakim, Catherine. "Erotic Capital." *European Sociological Review*. Vol. 26 No. 5 (2010), pp. 499-518.
- Hanjo*. In Koyama Hiroshi and Satō Ken'ichirō, eds., *Yōkyokushū* 2. *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 59. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1998.

- Hara, Makiko. “*Ise monogatari* rokujūku-dan kō.” In Gotō Shōko, ed., *Ōchō bungaku to saigū, saiin. Heian bungaku to rinsetsu shogaku* 6. Tokyo: Chikurinsha, 2009.
- Hashimoto, Osamu. “Mazamaza to nikutai de aru yō na mono: *Chigo no sōshi*.” *Geijutsu shincō* 47(6), pp. 112-117.
- Heike monogatari*. In Ichiko Teiji, ed., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 45-6. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1994.
- Higuchi, Yoshimaro, ed. *Nara-no-ha wakashū to kenkyū*. Toyohashi, Aichi Prefecture: Mikan kokubun shiryō kankō-kai, 1959.
- Himeno, Atsuko. “*Yuya*.” In Matsuoka Shimpei, ed., *Nō tte nani?* Tokyo: Shinshokan, 2000.
- Hiramatsu, Ryūen. “Nihon Bukkyō ni okeru sō to chigo no nanshoku.” *Nihon kenkyū* 34 (March 2007), pp. 89-130.
- Hirano, Tae. “Nara-no-ha wakashū <warawa-hen> o yomu: Nanto no chigo to sō no uta.” *Bungaku* Vol. 11, No. 1 (2010), pp. 96-112.
- Hiraoka, Jōkai, ed. *Tōdaiji Sōshō shōnin no kenkyū narabi ni shiryō*, chū. Tokyo: Nihon Gakujutsu Shinkōkai, 1959.
- Hosokawa, Ryōichi. *Itsudatsu no Nihon chūsei: Kyōki, tōsaku, ma no sekai*. Tokyo: Yōsensha, 1996.
- Hotate, Michihisa. *Chūsei no onna no isshō: Kizoku, ryōshu, hyakushō, genin no onna-tachi no unmei to jinsei* <Shinsō-ban>. Tokyo: Yōsensha, 2010.
- Ichikawa, Hakugen. *Ikkyū: Ranse ni ikita Zensha, NHK Bukkusu* 132. Tokyo: NHK Shuppan Kyōkai, 1970.
- Ichiko, Teiji. *Chūsei shōsetsu no kenkyū*. Tokyo: Tōkyō Daigaku Shuppankai, 1955.
- Ikkyū banashi*. In Taniwaki Masachika, et al., eds., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 64. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1999.
- Imanishi, Hajime. *Yūjo no shakaishi: Shimabara, Yoshiwara no rekishi kara shokuminchi ‘kōshō-sei’ made*. Tokyo: Yūshisha, 2007.
- Imō, Yoshinobu. “*Ise monogatari* no saigū-zō.” In Gotō Shōko, ed., *Ōchō bungaku to saigū, saiin. Heian bungaku to rinsetsu shogaku* 6. Tokyo: Chikurinsha, 2009.

- Inoue, Mitsusada and Ōsone, Shōsuke, eds. *Ōjō-den/Hokke genki. Nihon shisō taikai* 7. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1974.
- Ise monogatari*. In Katagiri Yōichi, et al. eds., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 12. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1994.
- Ishida, Mizumaro. *Nyobon: Hijiri no sei*. Tokyo: Chikuma Shobō, 1995.
- Iwasa, Miyoko. *Naishinnō monogatari*. Iwanami Shoten: Tokyo, 2003.
- Kamens, Edward, trans. *The Buddhist poetry of the Great Kamo Priestess: Daisaiin Senshi and Hosshin Wakashū*. Ann Arbor: Center for Japanese Studies, University of Michigan, 1990.
- Kamo saiin-ki*. In Hanawa Hokinoichi, ed., *Gunsho ruijū* 4. Tokyo: Keizai Zasshisha, 1893.
- Katō, Shūichi. *A History of Japanese Literature: The First Thousand Years*. David Chibbett, trans. Tokyo: Kodansha International, 1981.
- Katsumata, Shiori. “Kōki monogatari ni okeru saiō no henbō.” In Gotō Shōko, ed., *Ōchō bungaku to saigū, saiin. Heian bungaku to rinsetsu shogaku* 6. Tokyo: Chikurinsha, 2009.
- Kawashima, Terry. *Writing Margins: The Textual Construction of Gender in Heian and Kamakura Japan*. Cambridge: Harvard University Asian Center, 2001.
- Kaze ni momiji*. In Ichiko Teiji and Misumi Yōichi, eds., *Kamakura jidai monogatari shūsei* 2. Tokyo: Kasama Shoin, 1989.
- Keene, Donald. *Seeds in the Heart: A History of Japanese Literature* 1. New York: Columbia University Press, 1993.
- Koiji yukashiki Taishō*. In Ichiko Teiji and Misumi Yōichi, eds., *Kamakura jidai monogatari shūsei* 3. Tokyo: Kasama Shoin, 1990.
- Kojiki*. In Yamaguchi Yoshinori, et al., eds., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 1. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1997.
- Kojidan/Zoku Kojidan*. In Kawabata Yoshiaki et al., eds., *Shin Nihon koten bungaku taikai* 41. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 2005.
- Kokin wakashū*. In Ozawa Masao, et al., eds. *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 11. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1994.

Kokon chomonjū. In Nagazumi Yasuaki, et al, eds., *Nihon koten bungaku taikei* 84. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1966.

Komatsu, Shigeto. *Chūsei gunkimono no kenkyū*. Tokyo: Ōfūsha, 1962.

_____. *Chūsei gunkimono no kenkyū*, zoku. Tokyo: Ōfūsha, 1971.

Kon, Tōkō. “*Chigo*.” *Kon Tōkō daihyōsaku senshū* 5. Tokyo: Yomiuri Shimbunsha, 1973, pp. 107-142.

Konjaku monogatari-shū. In Mabuchi Kazuo, et al., eds., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 35-38. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1999-2002.

Kōtai jingū gishiki-chō. In Hanawa Hokinoichi, ed., *Gunsho ruijū* 1. Tokyo: Keizai Zasshisha, 1893.

Koyano, Atsushi. *Nihon baishun-shi: Yūgyō nyofu kara sōpurando made*. Tokyo: Shinchō Sensho, 2007.

Kudō, Masaki. *Kodai Emishi no eiyū jidai*. Tokyo: Heibonsha, 2005.

Kufukihara, Rei. “Akikonomu chūgū.” In Gotō Shōko, ed., *Ōchō bungaku to saigū, saiin. Heian bungaku to rinsetsu shogaku* 6. Tokyo: Chikurinsha, 2009.

Kuki, Shūzō. “*Iki no kōzō*.” In Amano Teiyū, et al., eds., *Kuki Shūzō zenshū* 12 (bekkan), Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1982.

_____. *Reflections on Japanese Taste: The Structure of Iki*. Trans., John Clark. Sydney: Power Publications, 1997.

Kuratsuka, Akiko. *Fujo no bunka*. Tokyo: Heibonsha, 1994.

Kuroda, Hideo. <*Emaki*> *Kodomo no tōjō: Chūsei shakai no kodomo-zō*. Tokyo: Kawade Shobō Shinsha, 1989.

_____. *Sugata to shigusa no chūseishi: Ezu to emaki no fūkei kara* Tokyo: Heibonsha, 2002.

Kuroda, Toshio. “Chūsei no mibun-sei to hisen kannen.” In *Nihon chūsei no kokka to shūkyō*. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1975.

_____. *Nihon chūsei hōkenseisei-ron*. Tokyo: Tokyo Daigaku Shuppankai, 1993.

Kyōunshū. In Ichikawa Hakugen, et al., eds. *Chūsei Zenke no shisō, Nihon shisō taikai* 16. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1972.

Labov, William. *The Social Stratification of English in New York*. Washington, DC: Center for Applied Linguistics, 1966.

_____. "Hypercorrection by the Lower Middle Class as a Factor in Linguistic Change," in William Bright, ed., *Sociolinguistics: Proceedings of the UCLA Sociolinguistics Conference, 1964*. The Hague: Mouton, 1966.

Leupp, Gary P. *Male Colors: The Construction of Homosexuality in Tokugawa Japan*. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1995.

Man'yōshū. In Kojima Noriyuki, ed., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 6-9. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1994-1996.

Marra, Michael. *Representations of Power: The Literary Politics of Medieval Japan*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1993.

Mass, Jeffrey P. "The Kamakura Bakufu," in Marius B. Jansen, ed., *Warrior Rule in Japan*. New York: Cambridge University Press, 1995.

_____. *Yoritomo and the Founding of the First Bakufu: The Origins of Dual Government in Japan*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1999.

Matsumura, Yūji, Hayashi, Tatsuya, and Furuhashi, Nobutaka, eds. *Nihon bungeishi: Hyōgen no nagare* 3, *Chūsei*. Tōkyō: Kawade Shobō, 1987.

Matsuo, Kenji, ed. *Shisō noshintai, Kai no maki*. Tokyo: Shunjūsha, 2006.

_____. *Hakai to nanshoku no Bukkyō-shi*. Tokyo: Heibonsha, 2008.

Matsuoka, Shinpei. "Zeami nō *Eguchi* no 'Eguchi no kimi': kengen suru Fugen bosatsu." *Kokubungaku kaishaku to kyōzai no kenkyū* Vol. 27, No. 13 (1982), pp. 134-35.

_____. *Utage noshintai*. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1991; 1992.

McCullough, Helen Craig, trans. *Yoshitsune: A Fifteenth-Century Japanese Chronicle*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1966.

_____, trans. *Tales of Ise: Lyrical Episodes from Tenth Century Japan*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1968.

_____. *The Tale of the Heike*. Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1988.

Morisaki, Kazue. "Sekushuariti no rekishi." In Okuda Akiko, ed., *Onna to otoko no jikū: Nihon josei-shi saikō* 9 (Semegiau onna to otoko: Kindai jō). Tokyo: Fujiwara Shoten, 2000.

Morrell, Robert E, trans. *Sand & Pebbles (Shasekishū): The Tales of Mujū Ichien, A Voice for Pluralism in Kamakura Buddhism*. Albany: State University of New York Press: 1985.

Morris, Ivan, trans. *As I Crossed a Bridge of Dreams: Recollections of a Woman in Eleventh-Century Japan*. New York, The Dial Press, 1971.

_____. *The Nobility of Failure: Tragic Heroes in the History of Japan*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston, 1975.

Nakai, Shinkō. *Hōnen eden o yomu*. Kyoto: Shibunkaku Shuppan, 2005.

Nakamoto, Tamaki, ed. *Kyōunshū, Kyōun shishū, Jikaishū. Shinsen Nihon koten bunko*. Tokyo: Gendai Shisōsha, 1976.

Nakamura, Hajime, trans. *Budda no kotoba: Sutta Nipata*. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1958, 1976.

Nakamura, Shin'ichirō. *Irogonomi no kōzō: Ōchō bunka no shinsō*. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1985.

Nihon ryōiki. In Nakada Norio, ed., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 6. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1995.

Nihon shoki. In Kojima Noriyuki, et al., eds., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 2-3. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1994-8.

Niunoya, Tetsuichi. *Mibun, sabetsu to chūsei shakai*. Tokyo: Hanawa Shobō, 2005.

Okamatsu, Kazuo. "Ikkyū Sōjun ni okeru 'fūryū' no kōzō." In Akiyama Ken, ed., *Chūsei bungaku no kenkyū*. Tokyo: Tōkyō Daigaku Shuppankai, 1972.

Okazaki, Yoshie. "Ikkyū Sōjun to Gozan Zenrin no fūryū," in *Nihon geijutsu shichō* 2-ge. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1948, pp. 173-196.

Ōgi, Takashi, ed. *Iwade shinobu monogatari: Honbun to kenkyū*. Tokyo: Kasama Shoin, 1977.

- Ōgoshi, Aiko and Minamoto, Junko. *Kaitai suru Bukkyō: sono sekushuariti kan to shizen kan*. Tokyo: Daitō Shuppansha, 1994.
- Okutomi, Takayuki. *Yoshitsune no higeki*. Tokyo: Kadokawa Shoten, 2004.
- Ōsen, Keisan. *Senpukushū*. In Tamamura Takeji, ed., *Gozan bungaku shinshū* 1. Tokyo: Tōkyō Daigaku Shuppankai, 1967.
- Ōwa, Iwao. *Asobime to tenō*. Tokyo: Hakusuisha, 1993.
- Oxenboell, Morten. "Images of Akutō." *Monumenta Nipponica*, Vol. 60, No. 2 (Summer, 2005), pp. 235-262.
- Oyler, Elizabeth. "Giō: Women and Performance in the *Heike monogatari*." *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies*. Vol. 64, No. 2 (2004), pp. 341-365.
- _____ and Watson, Michael, eds. *Translation and Transformations: The 'Heike Monogatari' in Noh*. Ithaca, NY: East Asia Program, Cornell University, forthcoming.
- Philippi, Donald, trans. "Kojiki." in Haruo Shirane, ed., *Traditional Japanese Literature: An Anthology, Beginning to 1600*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2007, pp. 21-44.
- Qiu, Peipei. "Aesthetics of Unconventionality: *Fūryū* in Ikkyū's Poetry." *Japanese Language and Literature* 35 (2001), pp. 135-156.
- Ruch, Barbara, ed. *Engendering Faith: Women and Buddhism in Premodern Japan*. Ann Arbor, Michigan: Center for Japanese Studies, University of Michigan, 2002.
- Saeki, Junko. *Yūjo no bunka-shi: Hare no onna-tachi*. Tokyo: Chūōkōronsha, 1987.
- Sagoromo monogatari*. In Komachiya Teruhiko and Gotō Shōko, eds., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 29-30. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1999-2001.
- Saigūki*. In Hanawa Hokinoichi, ed., *Gunsho ruijū* 4. Tokyo: Keizai Zasshisha, 1893.
- Saijō, Tsutomu. "Kōso Amaterasu daijin no seisei." In Sōgō jōsei-shi kenkyū-kai, ed., *Jōsei to shūkyō. Nihon jōsei-shi ronshū* 5. Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kōbunkan, 1998.
- Sanford, James H. *Zen-Man Ikkyū*. Chico: Scholars Press, 1981.

- Sarashina nikki*. In Fujioka Tadaharu, et al., eds., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 26. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1994.
- Schmidt-Hori, Sachi. "The new lady-in-waiting is a *chigo*: Sexual fluidity and dual transvestism in a medieval Buddhist acolyte tale." *Japanese Language and Literature* 43 (2009), pp. 383-423.
- Seidensticker, Edward, trans. *The Tale of Genji*. New York: Knopf, 1976.
- Senju*. In Itō Masayoshi, ed., *Yōkyoku-shū*, chū. *Shinchō Nihon koten shūsei*. Tokyo: Shinchōsha, 1986.
- Shasekishū*. In Kojima Takayuki, ed., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 52. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 2001.
- Shimazaki, Chifumi, trans. *The Noh Volume III: Woman Noh*. Tokyo: Hinoki Shoten, 1981.
- Shinden, Seiha. *Shinden shikō*. In Tamamura Takeji, ed., *Gozan bungaku shinshū bekkā* 1. Tokyo: Tōkyō Daigaku Shuppankai, 1977.
- Shintōshū*. Kondō Yoshihiro, ed. Tokyo: Kadokawa Shoten, 1959, 1978.
- Shirane, Haruo. *The Bridge of Dreams: A Poetics of 'The Tale of Genji.'* Stanford: Stanford University Press, 1987.
- _____, ed. *Early Modern Japanese Literature: An Anthology, 1600-1900*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2002.
- _____ and Arntzen, Sonja, eds. *Traditional Japanese Literature: An Anthology, Beginnings to 1600*. New York: Columbia University Press, 2007.
- Shoku-mon'yō wakashū*. In Hanawa Hokiichi, ed., *Gunsho ruijū*, waka-bu 9, Vol. 154, No. 10. Tokyo: Keizai Zasshisha, 1902.
- Stone, Jacqueline Ilyse. *Original Enlightenment and the Transformation of Medieval Japanese Buddhism*. Honolulu: University of Hawai'i Press, 1999.
- Suzuka, Chiyono. "Yūjo gensō." In Itō Seiko & Kōno Nobuko, eds., *Onna to otoko no jikū: Nihon josei-shi saikō* 3 (Onna to otoko no tanjō: Kodai kara chūsei e). Tokyo: Fujiwara Shoten, 2000.
- Takahashi, Tomio. *Bushidō no rekishi*. Tokyo: Shin Jinbutsu Ōraisha, 1986.

- Takeda, Sachiko. "Dansō, josō: Sono Nihon-teki tokuchō to ifukusei" in Wakita Haruko & S. B. Hanley, eds., *Jendaa no Nihonshi jō: Shūkyō to minzoku, shintai to seiai*. Tokyo: Tokyo Daigaku Shuppankai, 1994, 1996, pp. 217-251.
- Taketori monogatari*. In Katagiri Yōichi, et al., eds., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 12. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1994.
- Tamura, Yoshirō. *Japanese Buddhism: A Cultural History*. Jeffrey Hunter, trans. Tokyo: Kosei Publishing Co., 2000.
- Tanaka, Takako. *Seinaru onna: Saigū, megami, Chūjō hime*. Tokyo: Jinbun Shoin, 1996.
- _____. *Seiai no Nihon Chūsei*. Tokyo: Yōsensha, 1997.
- _____. "Shohyō: Abe Yasurō cho, Yuya no kōgō." *Setsuwa bungaku kenkyū* 34 (1999), pp. 178-180.
- Tatsunami, Sadako. "Ise saiō-sei no sōshi." In Itō Seiko & Kōno Nobuko, eds., *Ōchō bungaku to saigū, saiin. Heian bungaku to rinsetsu shogaku* 6. Tokyo: Chikurinsha, 2009.
- Terasaki, Etsuko. *Figures of Desire: Wordplay, Sprit Possession, Fantasy, Madness, and Mourning in Japanese Noh Plays*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Center for Japanese Studies, 2002.
- Thurman, Robert A. F., trans. *The Holy Teaching of Vimalakīrti: A Mahāyāna Scripture*. University Park: Pennsylvania State University Press, 1976.
- Trudgill, Peter. "Sex, Covert Prestige and Linguistic Change in the Urban British English of Norwich." *Language in Society* Vol. 1, No. 2 (1972), pp. 179-195.
- Tsuchiya, Megumi. *Chusei jiin no shakai to geinō*. Tokyo: Yoshikawa Kōbunkan, 2001.
- Tsuji, Shōko. "Kon Tōkō Chigo and Kō chigo shōgyō hiden shi." *Josetsu*. No. 38, pp. 215-226.
- Tsunoda, Bun'ei. *Murasaki Shikibu to sono jidai*. Tokyo: Kadokawa Shoten, 1967.
- Tsutsumi Chūnagon monogatari*. In Mitani Eiichi, ed., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 17. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 2000.

- Tyler, Royall, trans. *Japanese Tales*. New York: Pantheon Books, 1987.
- _____, trans. *Japanese Nō Dramas*. London: Penguin Books, 1992.
- _____, trans. *The Tale of Genji*. New York: Penguin Books, 2003.
- Ueno, Chizuko. “‘Gaibu’ no bunsetsu: Kiki no shinwa rinrigaku.” In Sakurai Yoshirō, ed., *Kami to Hotoke: Bukkyō juyō to shinbutsu shūgō no sekai. Taiei Bukkyō to Nihonjin* 1. Tokyo: Shunjūsha, 1986.
- Uji shūi monogatari*. In Kobayashi Yasuharu, et al., eds., *Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 50. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1996.
- Ury, Marian, trans. *Tales of Times Now Past: Sixty-Two Stories from a Medieval Japanese Collection*. Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1979.
- Varley, Paul. *Warriors of Japan as Portrayed in the War Tales*. Honolulu: University of Hawai‘i Press, 1994.
- Wakita, Haruko. *Josei geinō no genryū: kugutsu, kusemai, shirabyōshi*. Tokyo: Kadokawa Shoten, 2001.
- Wassink, Alicia Beckford and Dyer, Judy. “Language Ideology and the Transmission of Phonological Change: Changing Indexicality in Two Situations of Language Contact.” *Journal of English Linguistics*, Vol 32, No. 1 (2004), pp. 3-30.
- Wilson, William Ritchie. “The Way of the Bow and Arrow: The Japanese Warrior in *Konjaku Monogatari*.” *Monumenta Nipponica*, Vol. 28, No. 2 (1973), pp. 177-233.
- Yoda, Mizuho. “Akikonomu chūgū.” In Sakurai Yoshirō, ed., *Monogatari o orinasu hitobito. Genji monogatari kōza* 2. Tokyo: Benseisha, 1991.
- Yoshizawa, Katsuhiko. “Sennōke—Muromachi bunka no yokō.” *Zen bunka* Nos. 185-187 (2002-2003).
- Yūjoki*. In Yamagishi Tokuhei, et al., eds., *Kodai seiji shakai shisō. Nihon shisō taiei* 8. Tokyo: Iwanami Shoten, 1979.
- Yuya. In Koyama Hiroshi & Satō Ken’ichirō, eds., *Yōkyokushū. Shinpen Nihon koten bungaku zenshū* 58. Tokyo: Shōgakukan, 1997.

Ziporyn, Brook. *Evil and/or/as the Good: Omnicentrism, Intersubjectivity, and Value Paradox in Tiantai Buddhist Thought*. Cambridge: Harvard University Asia Center for the Harvard-Yenching Institute, 2000.

VITA

Sachi Schmidt-Hori was born in Ishikawa Prefecture, Japan, and grew up in Tokyo. She moved to the United States in 1997. At the University of Washington, she earned a Master of Arts in Japanese linguistics in 2003, and completed a Doctor of Philosophy in Japanese literature in 2012. She currently teaches Japanese literature, language, and culture as an assistant professor at Furman University in Greenville, South Carolina.