Beyond Butterflies: The UndocuQueer Movement, Intersectionality, and Implications for Education

Anthony Longoria

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Philosophy

University of Washington
2018

Reading Committee:
Geneva Gay, Chair
Dafney Blanca Dabach
Veronica Velez
Wayne Au

Program Authorized to Offer Degree:
College of Education
Abstract

Beyond Butterflies: The UndocuQueer Movement, Intersectionality, and Implications for Education

Anthony Longoria

Chair of the Supervisory Committee:

Geneva Gay

College of Education

This study examined the UndocuQueer movement through documents (i.e. film, art, and poetry) to conceptualize UndocuQueer identity, experiences, and related implications for education. It used Kidd’s (2017) method of virtual ethnography in analyzing selected artifacts from prominent UndocuQueer artist and activist Julio Salgado. Additionally, ideas about multicultural education, border and critical pedagogy, Queer theory, and immigrant education were used to analyze available artifacts from the UndocuQueer movement. A hybrid methodology that blended elements of content analysis, discourse analysis, literary analysis, visual culture analysis, and multicultural education research methods was used as well. The results of the study were that the UndocuQueer artifacts expand understandings of linguistic difference, testimonios,
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

intersectionality, and enacting political identities. Suggestions for further research and school practices are also included.
# Table of Contents

Abstract .................................................................................................................................................. iii

Table of Contents .................................................................................................................................... v

Table of Figures ....................................................................................................................................... viii

Acknowledgements .................................................................................................................................. ix

Dedication ................................................................................................................................................ xii

Chapter I: Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 1

  Beginnings .............................................................................................................................................. 2

  What is the UndocuQueer Movement? .................................................................................................. 3

  Who are Queer Immigrant Youth and Who is UndocuQueer? ............................................................... 4

  Statement of the Problem ..................................................................................................................... 5

  Policy and Historical Background ......................................................................................................... 7

  Conceptual Framework ......................................................................................................................... 10

  Summary .............................................................................................................................................. 16

Chapter II: Review of Selected Research and Scholarship .................................................................... 17

  Immigration and Education ................................................................................................................... 17

  Queer Issues in Education .................................................................................................................... 22

  Critical Pedagogy ................................................................................................................................. 29

  Multicultural Education ......................................................................................................................... 31

  Social Media and Popular Media ........................................................................................................... 35

  Summary .............................................................................................................................................. 38

Chapter III: Methodology ....................................................................................................................... 39
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

Imagined Communities and Multicultural Education ................................................................. 93
Popular Culture and Multicultural Education .............................................................................. 94
Expanding Understandings through Testimonio ........................................................................... 95
Expanding Understandings of Queer Experience for Multicultural Education ......................... 97
Limitations ....................................................................................................................................... 99
Significance ..................................................................................................................................... 100

Recommendations .......................................................................................................................... 101

A Future Closer to Now ................................................................................................................... 107

References ....................................................................................................................................... 109

Appendix A: Artifact Notes Protocol ............................................................................................ 122

Appendix B: UndocuQueer Artifacts for Analysis ........................................................................ 124

Appendix C: Curriculum Vitae ........................................................................................................ 126
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

List of Figures

Figure 1. Salgado "Queer Butterfly," (2013) ................................................................. 60

Figure 2. Screenshot of Undocumented and Awkward (Episode 7), (2011) .................. 61

Figure 3. Screenshot of Undocumented and Awkward (Episode 10), (2012). ............. 63

Figure 4. "Because Frida Told Me So" ........................................................................... 65

Figure 5. "Beyonds Dreams" .......................................................................................... 66

Figure 6. "Border Gay" ................................................................................................... 67

Figure 7. Screenshot of Osito, DatDACmented Life (Episode 11), (2015) ................. 70

Figure 8. "Quiero Mis Queerce" ...................................................................................... 71

Figure 9. "Homoland Security" ....................................................................................... 72

Figure 10. "What Future? The Present is All I See" ....................................................... 73

Figure 11. "Manos Arriba" ............................................................................................... 76

Figure 12. "Arrest ICE" .................................................................................................... 76

Figure 13. Screenshot of Papers, (2009) ......................................................................... 77

Figure 14. Screenshot of Episode 9 of Undocumented and Awkawrd, (2012) ............. 78

Figure 15. Screenshot of Undocumented and Awkward (Episode 12), (2012) .......... 80

Figure 16. Screenshot of The Ashes, (2014) .................................................................. 82

Figure 17. "Save Ethnic Studies. Save Our Stories," (2011) ......................................... 86

Figure 18. "No LGTBQ Exclusion!" .................................................................................. 87
Acknowledgements

There is a veritable litany of people to thank for the formation of this dissertation. This work is never done in isolation—though the writing process often feels as such. Throughout this entire educational journey there have been victories and challenges. I twice dropped out of college during my undergraduate experience before earning a bachelor’s degree ten years ago. Community college and state-funded, public universities have often been my educational homes. I began this PhD journey and the beginnings of this study while teaching high school full time.

My parents Mary Ann Chew-Longoria and Richard Longoria have been the constant in my life to propel me through this journey and have been the safety net a child needs as they come into adulthood and beyond. Your constant love, phone and FaceTime calls, and texts have been the strength needed for getting me see the completion of this work.

Geneva Gay has been mentor, guide, and teacher through the writing of this dissertation. Your patience with my writing process, care in your feedback, and stern mentorship have helped to see this work into fruition. You are a model for true praxis and I am grateful to have had this time to work under your guidance.

This dissertation began six years ago in Dafney Blanca Dabach’s doctoral seminar. Since then, you have been a constant mentor and supporter of my work.

Verónica Nelly Vélez you have been a mentor, advocate, and hermana in this work and I am proud to have worked with you through this process. You have paved the way for Latinx scholars and I hope to follow along the path you have trod. In my time at Western Washington University you have helped ensure that I was welcomed into the community.
Thanks are in order for Wayne Au. Your work in both the community and the academy exemplify how to do this work well. I have looked up to your career and was honored that you agreed to join the dissertation committee.

Thank you to Amanda Swarr for serving as GSR and for supporting my progress through this process so consistently and supportively.

Additionally, I thank James A. Banks for his support throughout my studies and for his membership and feedback on my general exams committee.

In the College of Education’s Office of Student Services, Norah Fisher has been invaluable in helping me—and so many of us—through our degree programs. Your encouragement and support have been so important through this process. Moreover, the Office of Student Diversity and Inclusion that you help lead has been a resource invaluable to this journey. Rosa Beyene also helped with motivation and support.

Also along this journey, there have been so many colleagues and fellow graduate students that have been supportive and helped strengthen me through this path. Tao Wang has been an important collaborator and friend. Winston Benjamin, in particular, has been at times the voice of hope and reason. Renee Shank has been a great co-teacher, colleague, and supporter. Natalie White, too, was an important co-teacher and colleague. Michel Riquelme Sanderson has been an important colleague and friend through this journey. Your late-night encouragement and inspiration have been invaluable. Special thanks to my colega Luis Escamilla for believing in me and keeping me grounded in work outside of the university.

The Secondary Teacher Education Program at UW gave me many opportunities for teaching and professional growth throughout the early stages of this work. I am immensely grateful for these opportunities, and especially thank Anne Beittlers and Karen Mikolasy.
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

Charisse Cowan Pitre, my mentor, advisor, and professor during my Master in Teaching program at Seattle University has helped position some many opportunities into my lane. Your support over these years has helped make this dissertation possible.

The Secondary Education Department at Western Washington University has been my teaching home during these final stages of writing this dissertation. This dissertation would likely not have been finished without an adequate teaching load. I thank our department chair Kevin Roxas for his support during my time in Woodring College of Education. I also thank Elaine Mehary.

My students remind me constantly that I am a teacher first. Teaching gives me life—literally and colloquially. I have had the privilege of helping so many inspiring, dedicated students along their educational journeys. My thanks to all my former and current students. I especially thank my former students Giselle Alcántar Soto and Eldred Vidal Vázquez. You have been friends, encouragers, and have helped me stay grounded during this process.

Finally, I thank Jeff Hall who was along for part of this journey and supported me during the early stages of this work.
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

Dedication

For UndocuQueer youth. May we do better.
Chapter I: Introduction

The journey of the monarch butterfly crosses many national borders. Perhaps unwittingly, the monarch butterfly naturally goes back and forth across political boundaries—and the context of each nation-state’s regulations, cultural, and societal norms—in order to live out its life. This metaphor of the butterfly has come to be a symbol for undocumented activism in the United States, particularly among those who hold Queer identities—those who identify as UndocuQueer.

Shifts in the academic discourse on multicultural education have including more considerations of global migration and its impacts on their transnational implications, and the laws of nation states to regulate citizenship (Banks, 2017). UndocuQueer people help illuminate a more realistic and complicated vision of intersectional identities, especially Queer identities in the academic discourse on global migrations and multicultural education. I argue in this study that the UndocuQueer movement enacts pedagogies and reifies intersectionality in ways that build upon major theories of the field of multicultural education. Moreover, the UndocuQueer

---

1 The term “undocumented” is used here as a more humanizing term for those that live in the United States without authorization. The term is also used to more closely align with “UndocuQueer.”

2 In keeping with the APA style capitalizations of the identities Black, White, Asian, and the like, I have elected to capitalize the term Queer. While not in keeping with current APA style, I use this deviation in anticipation of its eventual inclusion and to honor the identity category as being at parity with recognition of racial and ethnic identity categories in our published academic discourse practices.

3 I retain the spelling of “UndocuQueer” as most commonly used by the activist movement.

4 There is wide variation over the best term to describe the Queer community. K-12 schooling most commonly uses LGBT (Lesbian, Gay, Bisexual, and Transgender) or LGBTQ (to include Queer or those questioning their sexual orientation). As I describe later, the use of Queer as an all-encompassing term is problematic, but remains the term most often used in the UndocuQueer movement—indeed, in most youth activism. It is decidedly an attempt to be inclusive of multiple sexual and gender identities. I use the term to more closely align with the identifications of those in the UndocuQueer movement. Nevertheless, I acknowledge the wide variation of terms used by activist movements to self-identify.
Beyond Butterflies: The UndocuQueer Movement, Intersectionality, and Implications for Education

Movement—as represented in the artifacts interrogated for this study—encompasses an imaginary for multicultural education.

**Beginnings**

A butterfly typically transitions from caterpillar to chrysalis on its way to its final, more recognized form. While in its cocoon, there are sometimes massive changes to its bodily structure, thus making it unrecognizable from its original caterpillar form. Similar to the metamorphosis of the butterfly’s transition, this study was borne out of transitions. The identities of Undocuqueer people are seemingly manifold. I initially began this research journey intending to conduct a qualitative case study on Queer immigrant youth in schools. I found, however, in the early stages of this path that there was little extant Queer-focused education theory to support a qualitative study. There are multiple educational contexts to study the experiences of Queer immigrant youth and the educational professionals—teachers, counselors, and other staff—who serve these students. I found that I was putting the proverbial cart before the horse. In order to launch what I hope to be a career investment in investigating the many educational contexts of Queer immigrant youth, I seek here to establish an apical bud on a branch for future study of Queer immigrant youth and the UndocuQueer movement.

My approach to this research endeavor is informed by my positionality as an out, Queer, Chino-Chicano researcher. I identify as a gay, genderqueer person who most comfortably identifies by the broader term “Queer.” My ethnic identity as Chino-Chicano is a newly recognized, emerging field of study in ethnic studies research (Romero, 2010). The grandson of maternal immigrants from the Pearl River Delta in China’s Guangdong Province and paternal immigrants from Zacatecas, Mexico, my experiences growing up in the midst of immigrant grandparents’ homes filled with the linguistic sounds and culinary aromas of my multicultural
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

heritage have profoundly affected my worldviews and approaches to my work. I am fluent in English and Spanish; my multilingual identity gives me access to linguistic spaces and aspects of my Latinx identity exclusive to Spanish-language proficient members. My professional identities also inform this work. I am a former high school humanities teacher and have most recently worked as a substitute teacher in two schools that serve high percentages of immigrant and multilingual populations. My current professional work encompasses teaching and supervising prospective teachers in a university teacher education program. All of these experiences and influences inform the research project that I articulate here and are highly relevant to the methodologies I use in this study. In short, the multicultural identities I hold inform my comfort with the topic and my desire to incorporate multiplicity, hybridity, and intersectionality in the methodologies and data interpretations. Nevertheless, my identities serve as both affordances and limitations in this research. I discuss these limitations in a later chapter.

What is the UndocuQueer Movement?

The UndocuQueer movement has its roots in youth activism, particularly through the organization of undocumented people through the national organization United We Dream. It is by and large a political movement that is primarily driven through social media, and led by Latinx⁵ UndocuQueer people. This political activist movement is multilingual and prolific. The movement has sought to bring voice to UndocuQueer identity. The movement highlights problems of visibility and marginalization within the larger immigrant and Queer communities.

---

⁵ I use Latinx here in an attempt to be more inclusive of multiple gender presentations and as a nod to the term used extensively in social media and UndocuQueer activism. For a scholarly commentary on the use of the term, see Diaz & Fenning (2017).
Who are Queer Immigrant Youth and Who is UndocuQueer?

Queer immigrant youth as a term is not new. However, the specific use of the term in a schooling context is innovative. Queer immigrant youth refers to individuals with multiple identities and alliances who often experience invisibility in educational enterprise. Current educational policy does not name nor adequately address the needs of Queer immigrant youth. That is to say, current educational policy does not demand that schools to identify, acknowledge, and adequately serve Queer immigrant youth.

To clarify, my use of the term Queer immigrant youth includes young people who currently reside in or have close familial ties to immigrant households. It is inclusive of U.S.-born youth—sometimes referred to as domestic students—whose immediate family consists of members who are immigrants. This distinction is important in clarifying that not all Queer immigrant youth are themselves immigrants to the U.S. Also, not all students in ELL classrooms are immigrants, but many domestic and migrant students in such classrooms reside in immigrant households and have strong ties to immigrant communities. They have internalized, enacted, and are often bound to the cultural norms and attitudes that characterize membership in such immigrant communities.

I use Chavez’s (2013) ideas about Queer migrants to theorize UndocuQueer identity. While Chavez uses the term “queer migrant youth” to describe what I call Queer immigrant youth, I assert that the term I am using refers specifically to Chavez’s “queer migrant youth” (p. 98) in schooling contexts. Thus, my conception of Queer immigrant youth is somewhat analogous to Chavez’s, but it seeks to extend the notion to a specific application in schooling. According to Chavez,
[T]he queer migrant, is an inherently coalitional subject, one whose identities and relationships to power mandate managing multiplicity. The presence of a dynamic identity and subjectivity starkly reveals the necessity of coalitional thinking to account for the complexity of people’s lived experiences. (2013, p. 9)

The contexts for understanding Queer immigrant youth and the UndocuQueer movement are situated in the types and qualities of supports that teachers and other school staff provide for such students. In order to investigate what supports are needed for UndocuQueer youth in schools, the needs for such students must be established first. To do so for this study, I first examined the story of UndocuQueer activists as told in their self-generated artifacts. Outside of the schools’ walls, there is a plethora of advocacy, activism, and art that deal with the experiences—both challenging and empowering—of Queer immigrants. Addressing a broad context for Queer immigrant youth, and their identities, and focusing on artifacts that tell their experiences outside of schools offer important lenses for understanding Queer immigrant youth within schooling context. I extend what Chavez (2013) identifies as Queer migrants’ “managing multiplicity” (p.9) in Queer immigrant youth contexts in the analyses. Efforts have been taken to define Queer immigrant youth in order to assist this research study’s definition of UndocuQueer people, especially UndocuQueer youth.

**Statement of the Problem**

Few studies in education about Queer immigrant youth in K-12 schooling currently exist in research literature. How might more research studies that examine deep investigations of experiences that typify qualitative research correct these absences? In calling for such research and theorizing, Cianciotto and Cahill (2012) argued that,
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

The experiences of immigrant LGBT youth, especially the children of undocumented immigrant parents, in negotiating a homophobic school environment also warrant inquiry. While immigrant youth of color share experiences different from white immigrant youth, it is important to understand the cultural specificities of each group’s experiences. Southeast Asian immigrants’ experiences differ greatly from those of East Asian or South Asian immigrants. Similarly, Eastern European immigrants’ experiences differ from those of immigrants from Latin America or West Africa. (pp. 156-157)

Immigrant education discourse continues to be centered around language acquisition of the host country. This emphasis is evident in recent publications on standards and language learners (Heritage, Walqui, & Linquanti, 2015; Walqui & van Lier, 2010) rather than the cultural context of immigrant students and those enrolled in ELL classrooms. At national conferences such as the National Association for Bilingual Education (NABE), program presentations continue to focus on language acquisition, rather than addressing the cultural and immigrant contexts of learning. A review of the 2015 and 2016 NABE conference programs confirm this. Exceptions to this are Dabach’s and Fones’s (2018) call for ELL teacher education to help teacher candidates create more supportive classroom environments for immigrant students.

The population of immigrant students in the United States is increasing. Based on U.S. Census data, the immigrant youth population grew by 51% between 1995 and 2014 (Child Trends, 2014). Approximately 25% of children in the United States live in immigrant households. More than half of these youth are Latinx. Forty percent of these youth have at least one parent born in Mexico. The number of undocumented youth is difficult to calculate.
Policy and Historical Background

In addition to considering relevant research and scholarship, policies affect Queer immigrant youth in schools. These regulations are both extant and failed, historical, and contemporary. Failed policies are included to highlight the terrain on which this study and contemporary Queer issues in schooling are enacted. This study occurs at a unique point in history and contexts that were not possible in earlier times.

The United States continues to have complicated and at times antagonistic history toward arriving immigrants into its borders. The Nativist movement demonstrated some of the anti-immigration sentiment forefronted in national discourse (Banks, 2009). While concentrated on late 19th-early 20th century, popular discourse continues Nativist sentiments in contemporary times. The activism explored in some artifacts used for this study may be a response to ongoing Nativist attitudes.

For Queer immigrants, the Immigration Act of 1990 (S. 358, 1990) is a key landmark national policy. The policy eliminated the use of “sexual deviant” from extant immigration law. This language was a form of prohibition of Queer immigrants—specifically gay immigrants. Nevertheless, the banning of HIV-positive immigrants represents a potentially ongoing legal issue and a way to exclude immigrants (CDC, 2009).

While not directly related to school policy, the historical controversy over same-sex marriage in the United States attests to the controversial nature of homosexuality and, by extension, Queer identities in public opinion (Klarman, 2013). Following the Obergefell v. Hodges Supreme Court decision in 2015, same-sex marriage settled the legality of such unions in the eyes of the law. One can argue that this gained legal credence for homosexual rights to equal protections under the law—especially the 14th amendment. It did not ameliorate cultural and
social oppression of Queer people. At most, Obergefell v. Hodges is a win for homosexual, heteronormative relationships, but should not be seen as a pan-Queer victory. In analyzing pan-Queerness, Bindewald, Rosenblith, and Green (2017) argued that the full implications of post-Obergefell have yet to be seen, but given historical legacies, this change may be negatively affected by potential resistances due to religious freedom.

Religious freedoms and social antagonism toward Queer rights can be seen in several failed voter initiatives and policies that sought to make invisible or illegal Queer identities in schooling. Such policies also provide an important context for situating the cultural and social experiences of Queer individuals in schooling. The 1978 Proposition 6 in California, or the Briggs Initiative, is often cited as evidence of public perceptions and the legality of Queer teachers in schools (Graves, 2012; Harbeck, 1997). The Briggs Initiative attempted to make it illegal for out gay teachers to be employed in public schools. Oregon’s 1992 Measure 9 (Yang, 1992) offers an important comparison given its regional and temporal implications. This failed measure would have made it illegal for any state employee to be homosexual and out, and to prohibit discussions or study of homosexuality in public school classrooms. Several iterations of the proposed “Don’t Say Gay” law in Tennessee (S. 49, 2011) have failed throughout the past decade. If it were passed, it would have made it illegal for educators in public schools to even say the word “gay.”

Outside of schooling, current immigration policies remain highly contentious in the United States. By 2018, the futures of undocumented people were in serious jeopardy following the policies issued by the Trump Administration. Such policies, however, were not solely responsible for creating this jeopardy. Obama-era immigration policy and practices pre-date this context. All of the artifacts included for this study were created during the Obama
administration. This climate of increasing hostility provides a relevant backdrop for understanding the contexts in which Queer immigrant youth interact with schooling. Non-school specific policies include Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) enacted by the Obama administration in 2012 (Napolitano, 2012). DACA provides a way for some immigrant youth in the United States to remain in the country, though it is not a permanent solution. DACA recipients receive a deferral of deportation. Some undocumented youth have chosen to not pursue DACA as they fear completing paperwork reveals their documentation status to the federal government and puts them—and potentially their undocumented family and household—at risk of not remaining in the United States. President Obama’s 2014 Executive Order (Ehrenfreund, 2014) intended to provide a pathway to citizenship for undocumented immigrants has recently come under several legal challenges. The Trump administration has attempted to end the DACA program and its future remains uncertain (Romo, 2017).

Activism has flourished around undocumented people using their documentation status as a form of public visibility to advance legal and political change for undocumented immigrants. Activism has developed around immigration debates in the U.S., particularly for “Dreamers” (Senate Bill 1291, 2001) or undocumented students who either cannot benefit from DACA or other current policies, such as becoming citizens or receiving in-state tuition for higher education. On the state level during the Obama administration, policies such as Arizona’s S.B. 1070 (2010) have led to public controversy and activism around documentation status. S.B. 1070 allows officers to stop and verify any person’s documentation status suspected of not having legal residence in the United States. Uncertainty and antagonism continued with President Trump’s administration’s attempts at travel bans (Trump v. Hawaii et al., 2018) and executive action to eliminate DACA (Shear & Cooper, 2017) continued to create anxiety about the futures
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

for undocumented people in the United States. By April 2018, the DACA program was in a state of political ambiguity with President Trump (Schmidt, 2018) making ambiguous and often conflicting statements about his support for and denial of the program. This vacillation puts the certainty of DACA recipients and applicants to remain in the U.S. in question. These ongoing fears remain in spite of many undocumented immigrants not qualifying for DACA.

Among immigrant communities, there has been an increase in visibility of transgender identities. In particular, Spanish-language media have increased, presenting positive visibility of transgender identities. Univision, the largest Spanish-language television station in the United States, has included programming on trans people in its news magazine shows (2013, 2014, 2015). Emerging podcasts like Radio Ambulante have featured a Queer immigrant in its offerings (Alarcón & Segura, 2018). Many of the viewers for these programs are immigrants to the country. It is then significant that an increasing visibility of Queer stories can be seen in this media realm.

By 2018, the visibility of undocumented persons in the United States was still a politically contested issue. In numerous presidential campaigns, pathways to citizenship and access to education remained national news. Education contexts became sites of resistance as some schools and school districts—notably the Los Angeles Unified School District—resisted allowing ICE officials onto their campuses. Activism continued to flourish and undocumented activists have created a movement—largely through social media—that is commonly referred to as the UndocuQueer movement.

**Conceptual Framework**

This study is grounded in principles of equity, anti-oppression, and identity development. These principles and related-reform initiatives related to Queer identities are pluralistic visions
Multicultural education is a process of comprehensive school reform and basic education for all students. It challenges and rejects racism and other forms of discrimination in schools and society and accepts and affirms the pluralism (ethnic, racial, linguistic, religious, economic, and gender, among others) that students, their communities, and teachers reflect. Multicultural education permeates schools’ curriculum and instructional strategies as well as the interactions among teachers, students, and families and the very way that schools conceptualize the nature of teaching and learning. Because it uses critical pedagogy as its underlying philosophy and focuses on knowledge, reflection, and action (praxis) as the basis for social change, multicultural education promotes democratic principles of social justice. (p. 68)

Some of Banks’s (2004) dimensions of multicultural education also were part of the conceptual frameworks, specifically prejudice reduction and knowledge construction. Prejudice reduction “describes the characteristics of children’s racial attitudes and suggests strategies that can be used to help students develop more democratic attitudes and values” (p. 5). In order to develop more democratic attitudes in schools, knowledge and perspectives of heretofore under-researched and less visible groups need to be understood.

The knowledge construction process involves helping individuals “to understand, investigate, and determine how the implicit cultural assumptions, frames of reference, perspectives, and biases within a discipline influence the ways in which knowledge constructed within it” (Banks, 2004, p. 5). Banks (1996) expands this dimension by including a typology that contains personal/cultural, popular, mainstream academic, transformative academic, and school
knowledge. This typology helps to explain how some knowledges such as the personal/cultural and popular are sometimes perceived as less valid than mainstream academic and school knowledge. Transformative academic knowledge attempts to “revise established cannons, paradigms, theories, explanations, and research methods” (p. 9).

Multiple narratives, multiple approaches, and multiple methodologies were employed in conducting the research. Its intention was to add to the research literature which asserts that students’ cultures and identities are diverse and relevant to instruction and learning in all schools. This conceptual grounding necessitated hybrid methodological approaches.

This research also included some elements of immigrant education, especially context of reception (COR) frameworks. According to Dabach (2015) a COR framework attends to the contextual aspect of contexts of reception by investigating how the contexts that greet immigrant-origin youth come to be assembled, structured, and inhabited by various actors at specific educational sites (p. 246).

She elaborated:

To further develop the COR concept in education, additional scholarship is needed that: (a) articulates how contextual differences contribute to stratification and the differentiated incorporation of immigrants and their children, (b) accounts for distinct levels of policy (federal, state, and local policies and their enactment), and (c) examines actual sites of contact in significant contexts for immigrant incorporation—such as schools—where immigrants are both received and interact with consequential others on a recurring basis. (p. 246)

Another element in the theoretical framework of this study was Queer theory. According to Jagose (1996):
Clearly, there is no generally acceptable definition of queer; indeed, many of the common understandings of the term contradict each other irresolvably. Nevertheless, the inflection of queer that has proved most disruptive to received understanding of identity, community and politics is the one that problematises [sic] normative consolidations of sex, gender and sexuality—and that, consequently, is critical of all those versions of identity, community and politics that are believed to evolve ‘naturally’ from such consolidations. By refusing to crystallise [sic] in any specific form, queer maintains a relation of resistance to whatever constitutes the normal. (p. 99)

The inherent conflicts that arise in using a theoretical framework that intentionally defies and, at times, embraces contradictions makes this research endeavor all the more critical and strengthens the power of the analyses provided.

A concept that underlies this study is intersectionality. Crenshaw (1991) is generally credited with coining the term in her work on the interactions among gender, race, and class. According to her, intersectionality is “a way of framing the various interactions of race and gender in the context of violence against women of color. Yet intersectionality might be more broadly useful as a way of mediating the tension between assertions of multiple identity and the ongoing necessity of group politics” (p. 1296). I applied the concept to multiple identities within the UndocuQueer movement. This multiplicity necessitated hybrid methodologies. This hybridity is an extension of the concept Fotopoulou (2012) developed in her research. She wrote:

...hybridity may be a useful way in which to foreground the doing of social research and the production of responsible, political and dynamic knowledge. We may think of the research setting as itself a site of intrasecting complexities, between disciplinary power systems and the shifting boundaries of the academy and activism. Through
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

decconstruction, ethnography, self-narratives, case studies or other creative methods, multilingual and multicultural hybridity may facilitate the common values underpinning queer studies and studies of intersectionality. Queer and feminist researchers could this way employ queer studies and intersectionality not only for academic and research purposes but also as political tools in the creation of epistemologies, histories and practices of resistance (p. 29).

The conceptual framework for this study was necessarily hybridized and drew upon multiple theories in order to accommodate the multicultural nature of UndocuQueer people and intersectionality.

With regard to culture and cultural communities, I used Anderson’s concept of imagined communities (Anderson, 1983) and Appadurai’s (1996) conception of global cultures to examine the nature of UndocuQueer identities that include the shared values that arise without physical interactions with other members of the community. Anderson (1983) argued that imagined communities are shared identities based in part, though not exclusively, on print media. I incorporated Anderson’s concept to attempt to describe the nature of UndocuQueer identity as one bound by shared values that arise without necessary physical interactions with other members of the community. This concept was used to examine the complexities between imagined community and nationality, since immigrants, by definition, are not automatically nationals of a given host country. Appadurai’s (1996) conception of the “social imaginary” helped in considering the role of social media and activism of and within the Queer immigrant community. He theorizes the social imaginary as possibilities co-constructed by constituent members of a society to build its terms and conditions—or to critique and remake it. To support this concept, Appadurai theorized that media and technology help to shape its formation.
Lastly, I used some ideas from critical and border pedagogies. Specifically, this study draws upon critical theory’s vision for the multiple contexts for education and the importance of political contexts in its endeavors. Kincheloe (2004) elaborated:

...proponents of critical pedagogy understand that every dimension of schooling and every form of educational practice are politically contested spaces. Shaped by history and challenged by a wide range of interest groups, educational practice is a fuzzy concept as it takes place in numerous settings, is shaped by a plethora of often-invisible forces, and can operate even in the name of democracy and justice to be totalitarian and oppressive (p. 2).

Related to political contexts, Kincheloe (2004) emphasizes critical pedagogy’s aim to resist “dominant power” (p. 35). He expanded this idea thusly,

Critical pedagogy is dedicated to resisting the harmful effects of dominant power. Advocates of critical pedagogy work to expose and contest oppressive forms of power as expressed in socio-economic class elitism, Eurocentric ways of viewing the world, patriarchal oppression, and imperialism around the world (p. 34).

He continued later in his argument:

Critical pedagogy moves students, workers, and citizens to question the hidden political assumptions and the colonial, racial, gender, and class biases of schooling and media education. Critical pedagogy induces students to question these power plays that lead to human suffering (pp. 34-35).

Border pedagogy is an outgrowth of critical pedagogy. It seeks to engage students in challenging borders that arise both in schools and society (Giroux, 1991). It contends that students use language and culture to engage in the work of challenging and remaking schools
and society (Kazanjian, 2011). Given that the UndocuQueer movement seeks to disrupt and question nation-state borders, border pedagogy added some appropriate features for understanding the potential pedagogies of the UndocuQueer movement.

**Summary**

In this chapter, an introduction to the background of this study was presented. In the current political climate, UndocuQueer people have become increasingly visible through activism against anti-immigration policy and sentiment. The UndocuQueer movement grew out of this activism. This study looked specifically at selected works of activist artist Julio Salgado and poet Yosimar Reyes. Relevant historical and policy developments affecting UndocuQueer people were reviewed. The conceptual framework for this study drew upon knowledge construction and prejudice reduction, intersectionality and hybridity, context of reception, and critical pedagogy to understand UndocuQueer experiences.
Chapter II: Review of Selected Research and Scholarship

In this chapter, a review of research and scholarship relevant to this study is presented thematically. The review is organized by the broad theme of immigration and education, Queer issues in education, critical pedagogy, and multicultural education. The chapter concludes with relevant research and scholarship on social media that influenced the research design for this study.

Immigration and Education

The contexts for migration to the United States are complex. Portes and Rumbaut (2014) provided a comprehensive overview and analysis of immigration in the United States, especially for understanding historical developments, attitudes, and policies. They primarily used government data such as immigration and census statistics, historical records, and scholarship in sociology of immigration. The authors pointed to nativist fears—or conservative, U.S.-centric and anti-immigrant sentiment—as major roadblocks for immigration policy reform and immigrant experiences in the U.S., and that undocumented immigration is built on corporate needs for labor. They also argued that anti-undocumented immigrant policy benefits from nativist fears about terrorism and perceived threats to supplanting U.S. culture and the English language.

Additionally, Portes and Rumbaut (2014) suggested that home language is often the least likely to have survived assimilation. They explained that:

Fears of linguistic and cultural fragmentation, like fears of ethnic radicalism, play well in the press, and harping on them has made the fame and fortune of many a pundit.

However, historical and contemporary evidence indicates that English has never been seriously threatened as the dominant language of the United States and that—with some
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

230 million monolingual English speakers—it is certainly not threatened today. The real threat has been to the viability of other languages, which have mostly succumbed in the wake of American-style assimilation (p. 256)

Further, these authors identified the primarily monolingual U.S. school system as a major means of assimilation that works to reduce immigrant cultural capital. The school curricula and training for administrators and teachers should be changed to cultivate a pro-immigrant and multilingual school environment. In an assimilation system, immigrants often abandon some or all of their home cultures to become part of the dominant culture. Rather than assimilation, Portes and Rumbaut (2014) proposed a form of selective acculturation that they called “Americans, plus” (p. 389). Immigrants engaged in this selective acculturation are “endowed with knowledge of other languages, familiar and comfortable with other cultures, and, hence, able to move more easily into an increasingly globalized world” (p. 389).

While this study was not conducted in a school setting, research related to schooling was still relevant because of its potential benefits or problems for immigrant youth and the UndocuQueer movement. Roxas (2008) studied Somali Bantu high school students attending schools in a Midwestern U.S. city. In this qualitative study, he examined family contributions to students’ school experiences and the struggle some students experienced. He found students had more difficulty navigating school systems if their families—as immigrants—were not previously familiar with U.S. school systems, or did not feel welcomed at school. He also found language was a persistent barrier to schooling success.

Stanton-Salazar (2001) examined Mexican-origin and immigrant youth in California school systems. This study provides context for understanding how students and their families navigate schooling and how social networks support student success. He found youth are more
successful in school when they have institutional agents to help them navigate the system. These institutional helpers are not related and do not have insider cultural knowledge, yet they can offer support through their professional roles. He found that counterstratification, or efforts to build networks and supports for themselves or others similar in culture and social class to themselves are key. Yet, there are roadblocks to this. Stanton-Salazar explained further that:

institutionalized and community-generated counterstratification initiatives must contend not only with the material ravages and media-hyped mythologies of class, racial, and gender exclusion, but also with the defensive and oftentimes skeptical and rebellious character or low-status adolescent youth cultures. It is important to emphasize that most alienated youth are not located on the extreme end of the defiant individualist continuum; nonetheless, counterstratification initiatives usually must contend with negative adolescent network orientations born of long-standing embeddedness in alienating, accommodationalist, and resource poor social webs. (p.260)

Institutional supports for immigrant students also have been examined by others. For example, Roxas (2010) studied the practices of teachers who taught Somali Bantu students. He found their cultural scripts, or the subtle ideological assumptions and stereotypes reinforced in classrooms ultimately worked against the school success of immigrants. Teachers operated on assumptions that immigrant refugee students need protection and assimilation, that a high school diploma would be a panacea to cultural differences, and assimilation was the end goal of their education in the U.S. schooling system. These negative stereotypes immigrants face in the schooling system create tensions between assimilation and selective acculturation.

Dabach (2015) examined teacher practices in a traditional high school civics class. She considered teachers to be agents of the state in a public education system and enactors of
contexts of reception (COR). COR examines how immigrants are received in a host society. Dabach’s qualitative case study demonstrates how teachers with students of varying immigration statuses—citizens, with documentation, and undocumented—engaged in discussion about the 2012 presidential election and immigration. She concluded that teachers can use knowledge of students’ immigration status in positive ways to support classroom discussion. This practice demonstrated that students regardless of immigration status can engage in meaningful civic education when, in part, teachers attend to the diverse identities and experiences of students.

Suarez-Orozco (2000) and Suarez-Orozco, Yoshikawa, Teranishi, and Suarez-Orozco (2011) used mixed research methods to examine the experiences of 400 recently arrived immigrant youth. Their methods included quantitative and qualitative descriptive data, interviews, and school records. They called this study the Longitudinal Immigrant Student Adaptation Study, or LISA. They found multiple factors contributed to immigrant youth success, but many youth faced adversity from schools with low expectations and violence. Most influential to this adversity were overburdened parents experiencing their own economic struggles, intolerant teachers, and the challenges of learning English.

Olsen (1997) investigated Madison High School (a pseudonym) and found that immigrant students faced complex racialization within their schooling experiences. Students often experienced tracking and exclusion within the school system. This study also detailed some of the complex navigations immigrant students face as English language learners, especially tensions between learning English and giving up linguistic and cultural capital within their own communities (Olsen, 2000).

Cantú (2009) was one of the first scholars to blend an analysis of immigration and sexuality. He presented a framework for the study of intersections of immigration, sexuality
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

(eespecially Queer identities), race and ethnicity. His work is among the first to use the phrases “[q]ueer political economy of migration” (xv) and “queer immigrants” (pp. 25-26) in the research literature. His work critiqued contemporary scholarship for its exclusion of sexuality contexts in the investigation of migration. He argued that sexuality is an important framework for understanding power, privilege, and identity construction. However, Cantú did not investigate education nor youth in his work.

Another useful tool developed by Cantú (2009) is the “queer standpoint” framework which he described as follows:

Thus, the ‘queer standpoint’ perspective makes visible the heteronormative power infused not only in to U.S. immigration policy but also into the academic discourses of migration itself. This means that sexuality, as a dimension of power, has in fact shaped all migration in its practice, regulation, and study in profound yet “invisible” ways. The queer standpoint reveals not only how “homosexuality” as a marginal sexuality influences migration but also how “heterosexuality” as a normative regime shapes the social relations and processes of migration (p. 26).

The concept of liminality appears frequently in scholarship on immigration. Van Gennep (1960) is generally credited with coining the term “liminality.” In his study on rites of passage, he equated transitional spaces in identity development with the concept of liminality. Liminal spaces exist between generally recognized stages of one’s life span or physical spaces designed for fixed categories of people. If immigrant identity is seen as a developmental, staged process, then liminal spaces are important sites for understanding intersections and developmental sites of transition.
According to Suarez-Orozco et al. (2011), immigrant youth experience liminality as part of their adaptation to U.S. culture. They experience a sense of not belonging to concrete groups, and being caught in interstitial spaces, or the uncertain and undefined boundaries between groups. The research team argued that the liminality undocumented students experience due to their citizenship status causes harmful effects. Related to this concept is what Anzaldua (1987) called “nepantla.” It means “in the middle,” and was used to describe feelings of being caught between multiple cultures, the anxiety experienced, and the new cultures that may emerge from these negotiations.

**Queer Issues in Education**

When investigating Queer issues, intersections with gender should be considered. Gender is different from sex. Gender is based on social norms and expectations that may be different from one’s apparent sex at birth. One may choose to perform the gender one feels most comfortable with regardless of biologically-based sex attributes, such as genitalia. Butler’s (1990, 1993) concept of gender is particularly salient because of the iterative nature of gender performativity. In this conception of gender, there are repeated practices that reinforce the delineation between gender and gender expectations. That is to say, men’s behavior prompts other men’s behavior in a society, but also outlines the limits to what such behavior might encompass before it is perceived—and potentially ostracized—as women’s behavior. Such practices are often subtle and implicit. This conception of gender is important for understanding inquiries of transgender identities.

Gender and sexuality are considered in some analyses as being two sides of the same coin. Borrowing from Queer theory, researchers in education have used notions of heteronormativity—the presumed heterosexuality and traditional male and female gender roles
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

throughout a society—to critique and guide understanding of gender and sexuality in K-12 classrooms (Blumenfeld, 2013; Meyer, 2012). The inclusion of Queer issues in the curriculum has more recently been suggested in the research literature (Nelson, 2009; Pascoe, 2012; Schmidt, 2010). Blumenfeld’s (1994) typology is used to distinguish among gender roles, sexual orientation, sexual behavior, and sexual identity. He proposed these distinctions to achieve more nuance in discussion of sexual identities in educational contexts. Blumenfeld explained that gender roles are often separate from sexual orientation and are more fixed for masculinity, but more fluid for femininity.

Masculinities, or the manifestation, practice, and enforcement of traditional male behaviors are relevant to understanding how gendering works in schooling. Masculinities have been researched in secondary schooling contexts by many researchers (for example, Martino, 2012; McCready, 2010; Pascoe, 2012). McCready (2010) studied Black male and Queer youth in a high school in the Bay Area of California. He found that these youth often performed masculinity to satisfy cultural norms or felt ostracized from some schooling due to their sexuality and gender identities. His findings also revealed that assumptions about expected heteronormativity are made in the school curriculum. Pascoe (2012) and McCready (2010) examined school contexts for masculinities and gay male identities. In both studies, assumptions were made and normalized around male masculinity and heterosexual expectations that oppress young Queer men.

Pascoe’s (2012) concept of the “fag discourse” has influenced the research and scholarship on policing masculinity among adolescents in schooling contexts. Policing gender is behavior that targets any non-standard behavior that does not fit in with expected gender performance standards. For example, were a boy to wear nail polish to school—typically a body
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

decoration used by girls—teasing or violence toward him would constitute gender policing. In her qualitative study of gender policing among an all-boy group of friends at River High School (pseudonym) in northern California, Pascoe found that adolescent males used homophobic terms such as “fag” to enforce appropriate masculine behavior among themselves. The adolescents, who were at times jocular and serious, did not see their language as homophobic, but as a way of policing each other’s behavior. While her study focused on the behavior of the adolescents themselves, further research is needed to examine how other youth might participate in this gender policing.

Queer identities are manifold and emerging. While Queer identities are increasingly visible in mainstream society, there is little research on how they develop in youth. Important to this research is Cass’s (1984) model for lesbian and gay identity development. Cass conducted interviews with gay and lesbian individuals about their coming out publicly and their development in accepting their sexual orientation. Using these data, she theorized that gays and lesbians move from confusion about their identity, to comparison to others’ perceived sexual identities, to tolerance that they may be different, to acceptance of and pride in their sexuality, to synthesis of their sexual identity among other identities. A critique of this model is that it predates the increased visibility of Queer identities in mainstream culture and is a product of a specific historical moment in which the safety and social acceptability of being “out” cannot be compared to contemporary times. Moreover, Cass did not include transgender, bisexual, or other Queer identities. Yet this model is an important tool in helping researchers understand the potential stages of identity development for those with a Queer identity.

Talburt (2004) wrote an essay on future directions for educational research on youth. In it she contended that educational research runs the risk of not including youth perspectives,
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

experiences, and creativity in its theorizing and reporting about LGBT youth. To address these exclusions, she argued that educational researchers need to actively seek Queer youth’s own perspectives and to use them to complicate and reimagine existing scholarship.

The UndocuQueer movement recently emerged in research and scholarship although it is still under-researched. Seif (2011) wrote about the emergence of Queer-focused action within Latino youth undocumented activism. She found that desires for activism were strong among youth, and social media were used to organize protests and communicate across geographic distances. She suggested that social media may be a medium for undocumented youth to share personal stories without the potential risk of being physically present at protests.

Pennell (2016) examined briefly the UndocuQueer movement and artist Julio Salgado in her research on Queer cultural capital. She used the UndocuQueer movement as an example for what she called, “transgressive cultural capital,” and described it as “the ways in which communities (queer or other minoritized groups) proactively challenge and move beyond boundaries that limit and bind them, creating their own reality” (p. 329). Pennell also argued that activist movements, such as the UndocuQueer Movement involve more than protest and ideological resistance in creating opportunities that transcend oppressive experiences. These “spaces” are productive and make meaningful connections across existing activist movements.

Most discussions of immigrant students in public schools inevitably center around issues of language maintenance, loss, and language acquisition. Two assumptions about youth in English Language Learners (ELL) classrooms are apparent in the scholarly literature. Immigrant students are perceived as English learners and are presumed to be heterosexual and cisgender (McCready, 2010; Nelson, 2010; Pascoe, 2012; Schmidt, 2010). Some scholarship has examined how sexuality intersects for immigrant youth. For example, Nelson (2010) conducted an
ethnographic study of Pablo, a 25-year-old immigrant student in a community college ELL classroom. Pablo’s dilemma is deciding whether to disclose his gay identity as he navigates the seemingly taboo nature of gay topics in the ELL class, both informally and through the curriculum. Nelson also discussed the assumption of heterosexuality in the ELL classroom, and the possibilities the new country allows for Queer youth to explore queer identities. Nelson’s study focused on a Queer ELL student far older than public school youth. Nevertheless, its themes—especially Pablo’s struggles with and navigating the proverbial closet—are potentially applicable to other educational settings and ages of students. In an earlier study, Nelson (2009) interviewed, through focus groups, more than 100 ELL teachers. She also used classroom observation and teacher interviews. Her conclusions offered a framework for understanding how language learning can support multiple sexual identities in the classroom and work. Particularly salient for the present study is Nelson’s conclusion that Queer identities can be supported in the ELL classroom. In her work, Nelson used the term “gay immigrant,” that is not inclusive of multiple Queer identities, and gender performance identities, such as transgender, LGTBQ, and Queer. Yet, her research was highly influential in the genesis of this study, and has been an important framework for helping to pioneer English language learning and immigrant-specific contexts for addressing of Queer identities.

Other researchers also have studied gender and immigration in educational contexts. A salient example is a two-year qualitative study conducted by Stritikus and Nguyen’s (2007) that investigated the gender expectations of immigrant youth in public schools in the Pacific Northwest. Vietnamese immigrant youth shared with the researchers their challenges in navigating the less restrictive gender expectations in schools compared to the more restrictive gender expectations in their home culture. The study emphasized the reinforcement of gender
roles in both school and home cultures. These actions suggested that for immigrant youth the school site can be an important place for them to question and understand gender and gender identity.

Cruz (2006, 2008, 2012) has written research on Queer migrant youth. Her research used the phrase “Queer migrant youth.” Cruz (2012) used testimonios with Queer youth to offer them opportunities to insert their own experiences into the curriculum. For Cruz, testimonios are systematic ways for youth to share their stories in meaningful ways. In testimonios, listeners have a role to play as one is being delivered, rather than the traditional role of a listener as passive observer. Cruz argues that testimonios offer an opportunity for migrant youth of color to have further voice in school systems to “talk back” (p. 464) to larger discourses.

Cianciotto and Cahill (2012) conducted a survey of Queer youth experiences in schools. Drawing heavily on GLSEN data and meta-analysis, this text is important as a survey of Queer identities and experiences in K-12 schooling. Among their conclusions, they call for more research on immigrant youth and wrote the following:

The experiences of immigrant LGBT youth, especially the children of undocumented immigrant parents, in negotiating a homophobic school environment also warrant inquiry. While immigrant youth of color share experiences different from white immigrant youth, it is important to understand the cultural specificities of each group’s experiences. Southeast Asian immigrants’ experiences differ greatly from those of East Asian or South Asian immigrants. Similarly, Easter European immigrants’ experiences differ from those of immigrants from Latin America or West Africa. (pp. 156-157)

Ryan (2002) conducted a comprehensive review of literature and scholarship published between 1972 and 2002 on Queer youth of color in schooling. Of particular importance to this
study is Ryan’s inclusion of immigrant youth of color and the nuance such identities provide to discourses about Queer youth of color. She explained:

Many youth are reared in immigrant families and are themselves immigrants who are adjusting to a new mainstream culture with different social and gender roles, and media representations of sexuality. Values and beliefs from their countries of origin also inform behavior, collectively through the influence of their family and ethnic community, and individually, through internalized representations that shape attraction and desire. (p. 19)

Queer of color scholarship also influenced this study. Quesada, Gomez, and Vidal-Ortiz (2015) edited a collection of Latino activist personal narratives. The activists recounted their experiences of racism, discrimination, and activism. Many are founders of their own activist networks or organizations. The volume speaks to a variety of counternarratives against the notion that the LGBT community in the U.S. is cohesive and without intersections. While the ideas and analyses presented in the text offer historical perspectives on Queer Latino experiences, there are gaps in cross-gender and citizenship viewpoints. Also, the volume provides historical perspectives on political organizing, but not contemporary ones, especially artistic and social media output of activists.

Mayo (2014) surveyed scholarship on Queer youth and education. Most salient from her discussion is Queer youth participation in online communities. She argued that online communities provide necessary communication with other Queer youth, yet rural-urban divides may further perpetuate class and regional differences. These rural-urban divides affect access to technology which creates inequities. Without access to online communities due to the costs of technological equipment, such as computers or smart phones, and the subsequent mainstream insider knowledge about the most fashionable websites and online communities more likely held
by urban youth, rural youth run the risk of being left behind in access to potentially Queer-positive online communities. Nevertheless, she found that online communities contribute to validating Queer identities for youth.

**Critical Pedagogy**

Critical pedagogy emphasized liberation from oppressive systems of power and privilege. Paulo Freire (2000) is generally credited with inspiring the contemporary field of critical pedagogy. His assertion that education can liberate and bring about “conscientization” imagines that students can (and should) recognize oppressions and take action against them. In this framework, educative work teaches through actions. That is, learning occurs through action itself, not through merely passively acquiring knowledge about oppression then taking prescribed actions. This distinction makes it difficult to enact; however, its proponents generally agree its critical nature is what makes its outcomes worthwhile.

According to Kumashiro (2002), criticalness for antioppressive pedagogy is a version of critical pedagogy. It involves self-examination for potential actions and effects, especially those that are unintended or unseen. Practices of antioppressive education include education for the other; education about the other; education that is critical of privileging and othering; and education that changes students and society. Kumashiro’s framework suggests specific steps educators should use in enacting social justice education. He recommended:

Efforts that explicitly attempt to address multiple oppression and multiple identities, and that keep goals and boundaries fluid and situated. In other words, what is produced or practiced as a safe space, a supportive program, a feminist pedagogy, or a culturally relevant pedagogy cannot be a strategy that claims to be the solution for all people at all
times, but is rather a product or practice that is constantly being contested and redefined (p. 38).

Thus, what makes the approach he outlined critical is the iterative nature of its practices.

Giroux (1992) envisioned critical pedagogy as action that incorporates youth culture, popular culture, and new technologies. He wrote that “[e]ducators who refuse to acknowledge popular culture as a significant basis of knowledge often devalue students by refusing to work with the knowledge that students actually have” (p. 182). Furthermore, critical pedagogy must use technology to help others:

[U]se these technologies as part of a counternarrative of emancipation in which new visions, spaces, desires, and discourses can be developed that offer students the opportunity for rewriting their own histories differently within rather than outside of the discourse of critical citizenship and cultural democracy. (Giroux & McLaren, 1994, p. 51).

For the field of critical pedagogy, teaching and learning are not exclusive to schooling. McLaren (2003) emphasized the role that the curriculum plays in this context:

The curriculum represents much more than a program of study, a classroom text, or a course syllabus. Rather, it represents the introduction to a particular form of life; it serves in part to prepare students for dominant or subordinate positions in the existing society.

The curriculum favors certain forms of knowledge over others and affirms the dreams, desires, and values of select groups of students over other groups, often discriminatorily on the basis of race, class, and gender (p. 86).

In critical pedagogy, the use of popular culture is encouraged. Giroux and Simon (1992) wrote:
The value of including popular culture in the development of a critical pedagogy is that it provides the opportunity to further our understanding of how students make investments in particular social forms and practices. In other words, the study of popular culture offers the possibility of understanding how a politics of pleasure serves to address students in a way that shapes and sometimes secures the often contradictory relations students have to both schooling and the politics of everyday life. If one of the central concerns of a critical pedagogy is understanding how student identities, cultures, and experiences provide the basis for learning, we need to grasp the totality of elements that organize such subjectivities (p. 182).

**Multicultural Education**

A field of study and practice that grew out of earlier ethnic studies and multiethnic curriculum movements, multicultural education is still emerging or developing (Banks, 2004). Gay (1983) traces its lineage out of political activism in the 1960s to its next iteration from multiethnic to multicultural education in the 1970s. She wrote:

Thus, as the idea grew to conceptual maturity, multicultural education came to mean both content and process, curriculum and pedagogy, ideology and policy. Three essential ideological orientations emerged: teaching ethnically different students differently, using insights into ethnic pluralism to improve all educational decision making, and teaching content about ethnic groups to all students (p. 562).

While the field of multicultural education has grown to consider multiple cultural identities beyond ethnic identity, the basic principles Gay described remain as key orientations.

Multicultural education encompasses curriculum, school reform, instruction, and pluralism in schools. Scholarship has sought to theorize the field, identity, constituent group,
issues and experiences that fall within its purview (Chapman & Grant, 2010). It also includes scholarship on practitioner tactics for curricular and school reform. A theoretical framework key to multicultural education is Banks’s (2004) dimensions that include content integration, knowledge construction, prejudice reduction, equity pedagogy, and an empowering school culture. Prejudice reduction and knowledge construction were introduced in the preceding chapter. Content integration concerns the incorporation of multiple cultural representations into the curriculum. Equity pedagogy is the modification that teachers or school systems use to address the needs and academic achievement of various cultural groups. Empowering school cultures is associated with school reform that ameliorates or eliminates oppressive barriers within a school system. The dimensions relate to this study by providing a framework that was used to help understand pedagogical practices in UndocuQueer artifacts.

While oppression exists within the school system, multicultural education scholars argue for educators themselves to look at their own practice for reform. Pang (1988) wrote:

Education is a lifelong process, and understanding our response to ethnic diversity is part of that process. Change is possible: the responsibility for self-examination clearly lies within the educational community as part of our dedication to all children. Prejudicial expressions and behaviors found within school point to the existence of racism. Educators need to scrutinize the structure, policies, and practices of schools for ethnic prejudice and educational inequities.... These are all complex issues, which will not be easily solved, but the first step in the challenging journey to meaningful reform is a true commitment to self-appraisal (p. 379).

Self-appraisal is not meant to merely name oppressive behavior, but to plan for action informed by student and community characteristics and needs. Some scholars refer to these as
responsive pedagogies. These practices are somewhat analogous to Banks’s (2004) equity pedagogy dimension of multicultural education. Such practices acknowledge that there are diverse students and experiences in schools. Therefore education must incorporate such plurality throughout various aspects of the educative process. Gay (2010) expanded this concept in her scholarship on culturally responsive teaching. She defined it as,

using the cultural knowledge, prior experiences, frames of reference, and performance styles of ethnically diverse students to make learning encounters more relevant to and effective for them. It teaches to and through the strengths of these students (p. 31).

Ladson-Billings (2009) presented the results of an ethnographic study of the teaching practices of eight teachers of African-American youth. She argued that effective teaching for the students is culturally relevant. This practice does not intend to focus on culture to the detriment of other classroom practices. Instead, cultural diversity is engaged in meaningful ways that enhance learning. Gay (2002) illuminates this clearly in her call for teachers to develop a “cultural diversity knowledge base” (p. 106):

The knowledge that teachers need to have about cultural diversity goes beyond mere awareness of, respect for, and general recognition of the fact that ethnic groups have different values or express similar values in various ways. Thus, the second requirement for developing a knowledge base for culturally responsive teaching is acquiring detailed factual information about the cultural particularities of specific ethnic groups (p. 107).

Another key practice of educational responsiveness is building caring relationships with students. Noddings (1992), a philosophy of education scholar often cited by multicultural education researchers, noted that:
“[w]hen we discuss teaching and teacher-learner relationships in depth, we will see that teachers not only have to create caring relations in which they are the carers, but that they also have a responsibility to help their students develop the capacity to care” (p. 18).

Practicing care does not exclude other practices in the classroom. Rather, teachers are expected to live out their roles in loco parentis. According to Noddings these practices have reciprocal benefits for students, their teachers, and the classroom community.

Related to the practice of care is Duncan-Andrade’s (2009) notion of critical hope. He argued that educators should engage in critical care in tandem with holding students to high academic standards. This practice of care includes meeting the social-emotional and basic needs of students. Educators should not ignore the contexts and needs students bring to the classroom. If students are hungry, they should be fed. If they need more visual aids during lessons, they should be provided. If students’ identities are represented in the curriculum, they will feel validated. Thus, scholars argue that being responsive to student needs is a necessary practice of multicultural education.

Sleeter and Bernal (2004) connected critical pedagogy to multicultural education. They contended that both fields share some mutual goals albeit with limitations. They argued for four main implications which are conceptual tools for understanding power, ideology and social class; tools for analyzing globalization; tools for analyzing power and empowering students in the classroom; and tools for analyzing language, literacy, and power. For the latter, they wrote that “language and culture are part of each other; the fields need bridging, and critical pedagogy is one bridge” (p. 243). They indicated that an analysis of language from a power or dominance perspective complements multicultural education perspectives on language. They noted, however, that critical pedagogy is limited in its mostly theoretical, and not practitioner-oriented
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

They also expressed that multicultural education has more directly addressed race, ethnicity, and gender.

Social Media and Popular Media

Social media platforms became increasingly abundant by the late 2000s. Today, millions of users worldwide post updates about their lives, photos from life events, links to news stories on current events they are passionate about, and artworks they have created. Some methodologies have been developed to guide their use in research. Kidd (2017) studied social media artifacts of political movements in his “virtual ethnography.” He examined online controversies and issues of identity (sexuality, disability, gender, class, and race) through case studies of social media users involved in social media activism. He described these research subjects as “marginalized by society and who embrace their marginalized identities as a form of empowerment...as both artists and activists who are using the creative tools of social media to challenge and transform the world around them” (p. 29).

Among the political movements Kidd (2017) examined was Black Lives Matter, a social media-driven political activism movement, a response to police shootings of Black people. Hashtag #BlackLivesMatter stimulated political activism by connecting and mobilizing large groups of people. Hashtags allow social media users to catalogue their own posts thematically or topically so that other users can easily find posts. Kidd argued that movements like Black Lives Matter use social media to help people address persistent problems—such as racism—in new ways and create new sets of problems by adding new language and points of contention for political movements.

Kidd (2017) also studied Queer activism that used social media. On these he wrote:
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

The use of social media for creating new narratives of sexuality and identity is crucial to their acts of resistance. And they do this despite the dangers of bullying and harassment. The dangers of social media may be precisely why these artists are utilizing it. Through social media, creative work can be shared with lightning speed. This makes social media a surprisingly effective tool for undermining assumptions and changing minds. (p. 95)

Further details of Kidd’s (2017) methodology and their use in this study are discussed in the next chapter.

Straubhaar (2015) used social media in his study of Brazilian activism in Rio de Janeiro among educational non-profit organizations that provide after-school and outreach services to low-income students and their families. His research focused on what he called “elites” or those that directed such organizations and belonged to the highest social class. He described his difficulties gaining access to research participants due to institutional gatekeeping, such as being perceived as a lower social class since he is a White, North American outsider and his subsequent inability to socially and professionally network to gain access to such individuals. To deal with this, he supplemented more traditional forms of data collection through the examination of social media activities of the participants to develop and triangulate data. Social media such as LinkedIn and Facebook helped him establish professional networks to gain institutional access to participants. He claimed that social media are important alternatives when there is limited face-to-face access to participants.

Cortés (2004) wrote about the influence of popular media on understanding cultural, social, and ethnic diversity. In reviewing scholarship that examined multicultural representations in the media, he identified three types of scholarship: empirical, projective, and theoretical. Most salient in this typology is his category of projective scholarship, or that which “attempted to
suggest how different audiences may or are likely to construct personal knowledge from specific media” (p. 220). Cortés (2000) examined contemporary popular media to unpack its hidden meanings and messages. He used Banks’s concept of knowledge construction to outline ways media affect multicultural knowledge construction. These are,

- media provide information about diversity;
- media help to organize multicultural information and ideas;
- media disseminate diversity-related values;
- media help to shape multicultural expectations;
- and media present models of diversity-related behavior. (pp. 216-217)

As part of his methodology, he used a personal multicultural media journal in which he kept track of all the media he consumed during a calendar month. This included news and drama television programs. He used content analysis to examine this record for the ways media “taught” multiculturalism. Cortés (2000) found that mass media often referenced each other and created new meanings sometimes emerged these cross-cultural references.

Other scholars such as Dumas (2013, 2014) and Duncan-Andrade (2009) have used popular culture and media as techniques for promoting (or not) equity and justice in education. Dumas (2013) analyzed the 2010 documentary film Waiting for Superman to look for potential misrepresentations of Black students and families in popular media. Dumas used references to Richard Wright’s 1940 novel Native Son to support his analyses. In his essay on Black suffering in schools, Dumas (2014) used Octavia Butler’s 1979 novel Kindred to support his claim that scholarship needs to show all aspects of such suffering regardless of its emotional impact. Duncan-Andrade (2009) used the lyrics of Tupac Shakur and the use of “hope” in the Barack Obama’s 2008 presidential campaign to develop his notion of critical hope—discussed earlier—
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

in education. These examples demonstrate a tradition of using social media and popular media in research and scholarship.

Summary

This chapter presented research and scholarship selected for review for this study. UndocuQueer people are under-researched in the literature and scholarship. Nevertheless, scholars have researched various aspects that concern UndocuQueer people. Scholarship on immigrants and education have concluded that problems with cultural and linguistic difference, assimilation, documentation, and feelings of liminality comprise immigrant youth experiences in and out of schooling. Scholarship on Queer issues in education emphasizes the links between sexuality and gender, theorized identity development, and has proposed theoretical frameworks and practices for serving the needs of Queer youth of color. Critical pedagogy and multicultural education were addressed in this chapter. Critical pedagogy focuses on systems of power and privilege in education. After a brief overview of its development, multicultural education scholarship was presented with a focus on culturally responsive pedagogies. Finally, social media and popular media scholarship were presented for methodological background.
Chapter III: Methodology

In this chapter I describe the methodology for this study. After presenting the research questions that guided this study, a rationale for methodologies used is included followed by the selection and description of all artifacts examined, and by data collection and data analysis strategies.

Research Questions

The research questions examined in this study were:

• What are key themes of the UndocuQueer experience as represented in public digital artifacts produced by UndocuQueer artists and authors?
• In what ways does the UndocuQueer movement instruct and teach? What pedagogical techniques does the movement employ?
• What are the potential conversions of UndocuQueer movement artifacts and techniques to K-12 research and schooling? What are the implications for the field of multicultural education?

Research Methods

The research methodology used in this study is what Kidd (2017) called “virtual ethnography” (p. 25) to investigate social media movements and digital identity. He used a combination of qualitative and ethnographic techniques to analyze marginalized identities in and through social media. His work is an outgrowth of his book Pop Culture Freaks (2014) in which he began to investigate social media and popular culture. While other methodologies exist in the emerging field of social media and digital research, Kidd’s (2014) investigation of online social activism of marginalized people such as Queer activists and the Black Lives Matter movement makes his research methodologies particularly appropriate for this study.
Kidd (2017) outlined three key principles to virtual ethnography. These are: the ethnographer needs to be immersed in the field; the ethnographer needs to avoid cynicism; and the ethnographer needs to get off the beaten path. By being immersed in the field, Kidd argued researchers must spend “several hours per week in their digital environments” (p. 178). In order to avoid cynicism, he contended that researchers must consider all voices in social media, including those that might be perceived as distasteful. Finally, he recommended that ethnographers are thorough in examining multiple social media contexts on a theme or topic.

To investigate online social movements, Kidd (2014) began by examining news reports of political movements and identified associated themes for political organizations. He also used associated hashtags—for example, #BlackLivesMatter for the Black Lives Matter movement—to find relevant social media content. After reviewing an organization’s official website, he reviewed its official Twitter or other social media accounts. From there, he reviewed their social media posting history and paid particular attention to the associated individuals in the movement. When new individuals emerged that he had not investigated, he followed their social media accounts and looked at their social media history—including previous posts and reposts. If central individuals emerged for a movement, he focused on their output. All artifacts in his research are social media content. To analyze his visual artifacts, he used close reading; however, for his adaptation of the concept for virtual ethnography he provided the following context:

as a virtual ethnographer, deeply concerned with the issues of context, I have limited access to the original context for [an] image. But the technological reproduction of the image allows it to be viewed in a multitude of new contexts, offering a wide range of new
possible interpretations and impacts. My work as a virtual ethnographer...has been to interpret the image through a range of possible lenses (p. 106).

Kidd (2017) acknowledged that social media researchers need a high level of familiarity with the medium so as not to “miss cultural signals along the way” (p. 27) when conducting research. To do this, he described his daily social media process and reflected on the years of using various social media platforms. He emphasized that a researcher should not be a novice in social media use in order to conduct virtual ethnography. He included a report of his social media history and practices in his methodology and asserts that this “autobiographical information” helps to relay “a strong understanding of the many different contexts within social media and the Internet” (p. 27).

Data Sources and Data Collection

In keeping with Kidd’s (2017) methodology, I describe my history of use and current social media practices in order to make explicit my expertise in understanding social media as a researcher. I then describe the process for selecting the artifacts I examined for this study. My first uses of social media began in 1998, while a high school student, with my early experiences with a home personal computer and using email and discussion boards as occasional ways to communicate with others. At this time, I also began participating in gay chat rooms and other affinity spaces that existed exclusively in an online context. By 2006, I was using emerging social media platforms like MySpace. In 2007, I began using Facebook, Twitter, and YouTube as ways to share details about my daily life, and to socially connect with other users. Currently, I use Facebook, Instagram, Twitter, YouTube, Snapchat, and WhatsApp in my daily life. As a result, I am familiar with the literacies, nuances, and problems with social media. I drew upon this knowledge as I investigated the artifacts.
I began following presentations of the UndocuQueer movement—particularly its online presence. By subscribing to Facebook, Twitter, YouTube, I have been able to keep up with the enormous output of art, collaborations, workshop notices, and general activism of Julio Salgado, and the movement broadly. I followed Salgado, Dreamers Adrift, associated artists and activists. When new posts by artists or activists unfamiliar to me were posted, I started following those people. These practices are in line with Kidd’s recommendations for virtual ethnography. Additionally, the social media artifacts for this study were vetted through Kidd’s criteria for evaluating social media sources. Kidd (2017) recommended the following questions as guidelines:

What is the purpose of the site or account? Who is the audience? Where does the money come from? How does any single post sit within the larger context of the information shared on this site or platform? (pp. 80-81).

As I continued to follow the UndocuQueer movement’s social media presence, I began to collect and catalogue artworks, videos, and posts made in public online. These practices followed the conventions Kidd (2017) outlined for “collecting virtual ethnographic sources through social media” (p. 132). Due to the “ephemeral nature” of social media, he recommended that researchers screen capture and save social media posts and images in order to document them for later review (p. 132). This is especially important for social media that may be later deleted or revised. Following these conventions, I often screenshot public posts and saved them in computer files according to date and author or artist. I followed the social media posts of Dreamers Adrift, Julio Salgado, Yosimar Reyes, and Favianna Rodriguez. I examined the posting histories of the social media of key individuals and began to save links to websites, social posts, and screenshots of further posts.
There are not many physical artifacts to collect for investigating UndocuQueer experiences. Visibility within mainstream discourses is sparse and Queer immigrant identities are not easily accessed through research-designed field experiences. There simply are not many opportunities to directly observe or interview such people and their experiences, particularly in K-12 school settings. Moreover, Institutional Review Board (IRB) processes at both the university and school district level present barriers to gaining site entry into existing and relevant spaces. Nevertheless, artifacts exist for the general public that tell the stories of and provide visibility of UndocuQueer identities. Individuals and their identities were examined in this study to synthesize and bring coherence to the sources. They provide forums that cross physical and cultural borders. Most artifacts used in this study were produced by UndocuQueer individuals themselves. Cultural taboos around Queer identities in multiple immigrant communities place major constraints on researchers interested in studying this community. Public artifacts are an important alternative to more traditional research methodologies.

Choosing artifacts for this study was a critical step. I had collected many social-media and online-based artifacts to examine. I used my own personal knowledge of the UndocuQueer movement, scholarship, and informal conversations with educators and activists to identify the artifacts from all that I had collected. I chose to center my selection of artifacts for this study on the work of Julio Salgado and his many collaborations and associated activists. He is one of the most prominent individuals who has garnered national attention in multiple media venues. Moreover, Salgado has been prolific in his artistic creations. An undocumented gay artist from Los Angeles, California, Salgado is primarily a visual artist who participates in multiple social media video projects in addition to writing for internet-based magazines (zines) and social media. He has been the focus or included in previous commentary on the UndocuQueer
movement in research literature (Chavez, 2010; Pennell, 2016; Seif, 2011, 2014). In addition to Salgado’s individual works, I selected some key collaborations as well as poetry by Yosimar Reyes, a collaborator and UndocuQueer poet. Salgado’s direct involvement or close-association with the artist was a key criterion for including artifacts in this study. I chose artifacts that would help answer the research questions and that I believed represented a range of UndocuQueer experiences.

In spite of Salgado’s prolific output and notoriety, there are limitations focusing primarily on his work. He is a singular voice, but I believe he represents an accurate voice for the UndocuQueer movement. Moreover, because of his output and popularity, I believe he is a strong choice for understanding the pedagogy of the UndocuQueer movement, and its implications for education.

**UndocuQueer Artifacts for Analysis**

The specific artifacts examined for this study, along with the authors and a brief description included the following:

1. **Artwork by Julio Salgado:**

<p>| “Arrest ICE” (no date). | In this painting a woman is arresting a US Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) officer. She is dressed in a white T-shirt and her hair is pulled back into a ponytail. She looks directly at the viewer. The ICE officer, taller than she is, has his hands behind his back. His face has no detail. |
| “Beyond Dreams” (no date). | This artifact is the most explicitly sexually provocative of all artifacts examined for this study. It represents a part of Salgado’s art that is bawdy. In the painting, Salgado wears a |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Image Title</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Manos Arriba” (no date).</td>
<td>A young woman looks to the camera as she flips off the viewer. She wears lace underwear and red arm-length fingerless gloves. Her hair covers her naked chest and torso. She wears a cross around her neck. The caption reads, “Manos Arriba,” or hands up.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Homeland Security” (no date).</td>
<td>Two people are physically supporting an international border entrance. One person is dressed in flashy drag queen attire and the other is dressed in gay male leather attire. They are gesturing to the viewer to come toward the border entrance. A banner in the foreground reads, “Come in, gurl.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“No LGBTQ Exclusion” (no date).</td>
<td>Using an outline of a butterfly as a lens, this painting features several people of color wearing shirts that read, “I am undocumented,” a pink triangle, and the international trans sign (a blending of the Roman Mars and Venus symbols for male and female). Behind them are signs that read,</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Beyond Butterflies: The UndocuQueer Movement, Intersectionality, and Implications for Education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Painting Title</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“UndocuQueer.”</td>
<td>The caption on the painting reads, “Out of the closets! Out of the shadows! Into the streets! No LGBTQ exclusion!” At the bottom of the painting is the quote from Audre Lorde: “There is no such thing as a single-issue because we do not live single-issues lives.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“No Sir I Will Not Show You My Papers”</td>
<td>In this painting a woman wearing a pink bow with a stern-faced stare is confronting an ICE officer. Two people flank her side. The caption reads, “No sir, I will not show you my papers.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Because Frida Told Me So”</td>
<td>Salgado is the central figure in this painting. He wears a shirt that reads, “Because Frida Told Me So.” A portrait of Frida Kahlo hangs in the background. Also in the background is a pink triangle—a symbol typical of Queer activism.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Save Ethnic Studies. Save Our Stories”</td>
<td>This painting is a direct response to the controversy over the dismantling of the Tucson Public Schools ethnic studies program. It was popular on social media when it was released.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Queer Butterfly”</td>
<td>Salgado’s most famous painting, this image has become synonymous with the UndocuQueer movement. A shirtless Salgado has his arms spread out in front of him in a typical pose of Catholic saints. Behind him are butterfly wings with opposing bilingual text that detail parts of UndocuQueer identity.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Quiero Mis Queerce”</td>
<td>Two figures dressed in formal dress typical of quinceañeras.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(2014).</td>
<td>hold each other’s arms. The two have switched gender roles. The man wears a dress and the woman wears a man’s suit. A banner at the top of the painting reads “Quiero mis Queerce,” or “I want my Queer quinceañera.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“What Future? The Present Is All I See” (2014).</td>
<td>In this painting, a brown-skinned man’s face is in portrait. From his temple, his head has been opened up and various artifacts of his hopes and dreams as an UndocuQueer person stream out. The caption reads, “What future? The present is all I see.”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Despite the Pain” (2015).</td>
<td>Five people of color straddle the international border fence. One person holds a can, a woman wears a hijab, the central person wears a shirt that reads, “We exist,” and two other people flank the central figure. The border fence has a message spray painted onto it that reads, “Bigger than any border.” The caption at the top reads, “Despite the pain, tears, criminalization, erasure, and heartache, we exist!” The image was created to celebrate International Migrants Day (December 18).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Destroy White Supremacy” (2015).</td>
<td>A woman with wooden stick—typically used for Mexican piñatas—is beating down a computer monitor that shows a news feed about protestors. The painting features the text, “Destroy White supremacist laws beliefs and actions now!”</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Border Gay” (2016).</td>
<td>This painting features a shirtless Salgado at the southern</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>United States border.</strong> He is flipping off the viewer as sunglass-covered face cocks to his right in a non-chalant gesture. Taped to the wall behind him is a shirt that reads “Maricón” or “fag.”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Papers (2012).</strong></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>This edited book (Manuel, Pineda, Galisky &amp; Shine, 2012) was made to accompany the feature-length documentary of the same name. Salgado illustrated each undocumented youth to accompany their personal testimonies of undocumented experiences. These include UndocuQueer immigrants Mohammed, a 22-year old from Iran and Salvador, an 18-year-old that discussed his coming out story.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

II. Poetry by Yosimar Reyes:

The following poems were published in Xavier’s (2008) poetry anthology of Queer Latinx poetry. It includes Reyes’s most famous poem “For Colored Boys Who Speak Softly,” which he has frequently performed at slam poetry events and readings. The poems analyzed for this study are:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>“Eres Un Rio (Un Poema Pa’ Un Poeta)” (2008).</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In this 64-line poem the speaker uses the metaphor of a river to speak to himself about the adversities he has faced. The poem is bilingual and Spanish is not translated into English.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th><strong>“For Colored Boys Who Speak Softly” (2008).</strong></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>In this 99-line poem, the speaker repeats the line “For colored boys who speak softly,” at the beginning of many stanzas. It details various aspects of UndocuQueer identity. Bilingual text is not translated into English.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Beyond Butterflies: The UndocuQueer Movement, Intersectionality, and Implications for Education

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Poem Title</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Queer Atzlan” (2008)</td>
<td>This 23-line poem focuses on the feelings of being an outsider in the Latinx community due to the speaker’s Queer identity. The poem’s bilingual text is not translated into English.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“R(e)volution” (2008)</td>
<td>This 76-line poem condemns global economic exploitation, gender and religious oppression, and violence around the world.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Silent No Longer” (2008)</td>
<td>In this 40-line poem, the speaker calls for UndocuQueer people to be visible through resistance. Bilingual text is not translated into English.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### III. Video Collaborations:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Video Title</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“The Legalities of Being” (2012, 3:54)</td>
<td>This YouTube video collaboration between Salgado and Reyes shows Salgado illustrating imagery inspired by Reyes’s poem “The Legalities of Being.” Reyes reads his poem in voiceover. The poem speaks about the DREAM Act and details struggles undocumented people experience across generations, the politicization of border policies. In the second half of the poem, he recounts his grandmother’s experiences as an undocumented person and how it affected Reyes’s own experiences as an undocumented person.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“The Ashes” (2014, 2:43)</td>
<td>This YouTube video collaboration between Salgado and Reyes shows Salgado illustrating while Reyes recites his poem “The Ashes” in voiceover. Reyes uses the metaphor of ashes to</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
relate the experiences of undocumented people that have been burned by colonization and border policies. Salgado’s drawings are inspired by the imagery in the poem.

| “Papers” (2009, 1:35:00). | This feature-length documentary with director Anne Galisky recounts the stories of undocumented youth in the United States. The key theme is the uncertainty undocumented youth face once they turn 18. Salgado illustrated youth for an accompanying book that records the youths’ stories. The documentary features Jorge, an UndocuQueer Latinx college student. |

IV. YouTube Dreamers Adrift content:

These videos are part of Dreamers Adrift, a collective of media publications co-founded by Julio Salgado. They are released through YouTube, but also distributed through other social media such as Facebook and Twitter. Most of the content is semi-autobiographical and often includes a humorous message to make social commentary on the experiences of UndocuQueer people.

<p>| “Undocumented and Awkward Episode 7” (2011, 1:24). | In this video, Salgado and a friend are at a bus stop. When an Asian man arrives at the bus stop, Salgado and his friend begin to gossip about the man in Spanish. The man overhears them and tells them in Spanish that he is in fact Latinx and speaks Spanish fluently. Like all of the videos in the Undocumented and Awkward series, the video ends with an ironic punchline. |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Video Title and Series</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>“Undocumented and Awkward Episode 9” (2012, 1:31).</td>
<td>This video is a drag parody of YouTube rant videos. Salgado and Iñiguez—roommates and co-founders of Dreamers Adrift—are dressed in light drag, no makeup, and blonde wigs. They parody the negative perceptions of undocumented immigrants in the United States through multiple stereotypes about immigrants from the Americas.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Undocumented and Awkward Episode 10” (2012, 2:30).</td>
<td>At a party, Salgado and friends are having a conversation around a table about California voter propositions that may affect undocumented people. One of the guests uses the word “faggot” to which Salgado immediately corrects the guest about his offensive language. The ensuing discussion surfaces the complexities of being undocumented and Queer.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Undocumented and Awkward Episode 12” (2012, 2:14).</td>
<td>In this video a college student is outed as undocumented by college staff during a financial aid fair at a college. The video relates both the challenges of getting financial aid as an undocumented person and the danger of being outed in a public setting.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Undocumented and Awkward 2.0 Episode 1” (2015, 3:37).</td>
<td>In this video, a group of college students are introducing themselves for a summer session activity. The video exposes the diversity within immigrant communities and assumptions even immigrants make in others’ perceived backgrounds.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>“Osito: DAT DACAmented Life,”</td>
<td>In this Dreamers Adrift series video, Salgado and his roommate—a heterosexual undocumented man, talk about</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**Data Analysis**

Content analysis was the primary analytic tool used in this study. Weber (1990) defined content analysis as “a research method that uses a set of procedures to make valid inferences from text” (p. 9). These procedures are text encoding, creating lists of key words and
concordances, and category counts. Text encoding involves any procedures researchers engage in inputting data used for analysis into software or other media to prepare for analysis. After this, analysis proceeds to create lists of repeated words or themes across multiple texts. From this analysis, the researcher generates lists or records the numbers of artifacts that contain repeated words, themes, or other concordances. Weber further suggested that this content analysis can be used to analyze popular culture.

Following these conventions, I began to analyze data by first “encoding” the artifacts selected for this study into an Excel spreadsheet to assist content analysis. This involved inputting each artifact by name, date (if available), author, and any initial details that seemed noteworthy. These included basic, non-interpretative content features such as uses of bilingualism in texts and genre (painting, poetry). I also reviewed paintings, social media posts, poetry, and films I had collected and encoded into the document. I chose to review artifacts on a computer—rather than print paintings out—in order to preserve the fidelity of the medium of distribution. As I proceeded to initially analyze data, I created new columns in the Excel spreadsheet to note concordances and to keep track of category counts. While this procedure served to keep track of non-interpretive analytic data, it was not sufficient in keeping track of deeper analyses. I proceeded thusly.

Krippendorf (2010) defined text-driven content analysis as “fishing expeditions” (p. 340) in order to find emergent themes for texts and to develop or refine research questions. He defined problem-driven analysis as using guiding research questions to select texts for analysis. All of these analyses aimed for intertextuality, or connections and coherence across texts. Using Krippendorf’s (2010) criteria for text-driven and problem-driven content analyses, I identified key intertextual words and categories for analysis based on my research questions and themes.
that emerged from my review of research and scholarship. These themes, which formed the basis of the findings discussed in the next chapter, were used to systematically analyze all artifacts. The themes were schooling, Queer identities, liminality, intersectionality, testimonios, and intertextuality. They were input into the Excel spreadsheet for concordances and category counts (noted as an “X” or left blank in each category cell on the spreadsheet). Where a simple yes or no to a category was not sufficient, I included a narrative note in the cell. A brief overview of the themes is presented here (please refer to the preceding chapter for more detail). For the theme of schooling, I primarily relied on the literature reviewed on immigration and education, and on multicultural education. I primarily looked for representations of youth and schooling experiences. This also included experiences of liminality (van Gennep, 1960; Suarez-Orozco, 2011). For the theme of Queer, I looked for representations of sexuality, gender, gender expression, and marginality (Jagose, 1996; Muñoz, 1999). For intersectionality, I looked for representations of multiple identities, being caught between cultures or identities, and belonging to multiple communities (Crenshaw, 1991). For testimonios, I looked for representations of the self or highly personal revelations (Cruz, 2012). This theme also included examining ways artifacts might instruct. For intertextuality, I looked for ways artifacts referenced each other or other texts common to UndocuQueer narratives (Butler, 1993; Hall, 1997).

Text-driven analyses of the artifacts were conducted to find further themes that emerged within and among artifacts. As analysis proceeded, some additional themes emerged from my immersion in analyzing the texts. These themes were generated from the artifacts themselves. These initial assertions were validated by ensuring that intertextual categories appeared in at least three different artifacts in order to proceed with further analysis. For example, I found that linguistic difference appeared in 12 artifacts. This finding, which appeared in more than three
artifacts, allowed me to proceed with further analysis. I used these themes to target other specific artifacts for analysis. I kept notes of these intertextual categories and coding in the Excel spreadsheet. Also, I checked to see if my assertions were consistent with relevant theory (Merriam, 2009).

I used a dual-layered analysis for each artifact. The first layer of analysis is described above. After identifying valid intertextual elements, I applied hybrid versions of virtual ethnography, content analysis, discourse analysis, and art history to further analyze the artifacts. The goal of this analysis was to answer the research questions and to achieve a unified, qualitative profile of UndocuQueer experiences. I proceeded to use a multi-stage open coding strategy to analyze the artifacts (Ryan & Bernard, 2003). In this process I collapsed similar categories into unified wholes or deleted categories that did not meet minimum criteria. For videos clips and visual art, I created initial annotations of such artifacts to assist in the textual analysis and recording these on the Excel spreadsheet to assist this process. Next, I reviewed whether the initial list of intertextual categories was indeed matched across at least three artifacts. If they matched, I revisited the specific passages or parts of the respective artifacts to visually verify that the matches were applicable. Following this, I pursued the intertextual category for further applicability by using other parts of the multiple methods (described individually below). I called this next level of analysis the hybrid analysis. If the intertextual category did not provide a match across at least three texts, I did not immediately abandon the category. Rather, it was coded as a secondary intertextual category to revisit in the future. Once intertextual categories were determined, I conducted the hybrid analyses based on the particular features of the artifact. For example, for visual artifacts I used visual analysis (Sturken & Cartwright, 2001) to analyze the artifact for applicable evidence to support the intertextual
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

categories and to ensure validity of the assertions. In this process, I examined and took notes on the artifact composition, form, textual features, mood, and style. I noted similarities in color, composition, and theme. I also used D’Alleva’s (2012) recommendations for “reading” art. These were identifying denotative and connotative elements, identifying codes and symbols, identifying intertextuality, or references to other paintings or texts, and determining the intended audience. These analyses were written into “field notes” on my encounter with the artifact.

Following the completion of these analyses, I wrote short narratives of the findings and included them in the Excel spreadsheet.

An additional analysis was conducted using hybrid methods that included elements of discourse analysis (Gee, 2014) to reveal a deeper meaning of artifacts. In particular, I incorporated the situated meaning tool and the intertextuality tool. The situated meaning tool is used to determine the specific context of language. This tool is vital in understanding cultural language. The tool asks researchers to determine “what specific meanings do listeners have to attribute to these words and phrases given the context and how the context is constructed” (Gee, 2014, p. 159). Since many artifacts included language used in their respective communities—Queer-specific language, shorthand used by undocumented people, and Spanish-language colloquialisms—the situated meaning analysis assisted in determining whether community-specific language was being used or more commonly shared definitions. This assisted in accurately recording concordances across artifacts. For example, in Salgado’s “Border Gay,” the use of the Spanish word “maricón” or “fag” might be seen as offensive or self-hating. A cursory coding might have placed it in a category about “negative perceptions of self.” But using the tool—which demands the researcher to interrogate what context is used for language—helps
determine that the word is being used in its reclaimed sense and as a marker of pride for one’s identity.

Intertextuality demands that researchers “ask how words and grammatical structures . . . are used to quote, refer to, or allude to other ‘texts’. . . or other styles of language” (Gee, 2014, p. 172). The intertextuality tool was useful in identifying connections and explicit references among artifacts and popular culture that were important to understanding embedded messages. They also assisted in identifying new or unfamiliar language, experiences, and connections. Rather than coding for “intertextuality,” I noted in my Excel spreadsheet the specific references to other artifacts by name. This tool also assisted me in noting potential references to popular culture or commonly known literature that were subsequently examined for analysis. In this way, the tool served in generating additional contexts to consider for analysis. This methodological hybridity, in line with the multidisciplinary nature of the field of education, helped me in triangulating data. I included these analyses in the Excel spreadsheet to keep track of notes, open coding, and annotation of texts (Merriam, 2009).

All videos and audio programs (social media, feature film) generated transcripts for analysis. I used the YouTube captions automatically generated for videos to create transcripts for the social media videos used: the Dreamers Adrift content “Undocumented and Awkward,” “Osito,” and the video collaborations between Julio Salgado and Yosimar Reyes. For the feature film documentary Papers (2009), I used the included captions on the DVD to create transcripts for review and analysis. As I watched videos, I took notes on impressions, key narratives, and any action—both visual and auditory—in the background that a transcript might not capture.

Many of the artifacts I chose for this study were generated in Latinx and Spanish-language communities. I also focused on a subset of the Queer immigrant population. My own
Spanish ability helped me to understand texts outside of and in comparison with English language discourses. Despite these restrictions, the results of the analyses may have asserted broader application given that experiences of Latinx immigrants are not exclusive to Latinx populations. Also, efforts were made to accurately represent artifacts as closely to their original presentation as possible, including translations from Spanish to English.

I used a protocol form (Appendix A) to record notes, reactions, and other data for analysis of each artifact. These protocols were used to help triangulate the data analyses and findings. I used these notes for both the initial intertextual analysis and for use in the hybrid analysis steps.

**Summary**

This chapter presented the research design and methods used to analyze UndocuQueer artifacts selected for this study. The artifacts were primarily drawn from the artistic output of Julio Salgado and Yosimar Reyes. Brief summaries of artifacts examined for this study were presented. Virtual ethnography was used for research design and analysis. Additionally, content analysis, discourse analysis, and art history methods were used to analyze data. The study aimed to identify key themes of UndocuQueer identity, the ways the UndocuQueer movement instruct and teach, and potential conversions to K-12 research and schooling.
Chapter IV: Findings

The findings of this study were derived from artifacts related to the UndocuQueer movement, primarily the work of Julio Salgado. The research questions guiding this study sought key themes of UndocuQueer experiences, pedagogical techniques of the UndocuQueer movement, and potential conversions to K-12 research, schooling, and multicultural education. The major themes identified include linguistic difference, personal/self, liminality, intersectionality, and enacting the political. Additional key features found in artifacts from the UndocuQueer movement also are reported.

Language and Linguistic Difference

Bilingual text features were evident in most artifacts for this study. This is not surprising given that the artifacts are generated in the Latinx community. One of the most salient examples of this is in Julio Salgado’s (2013) Queer Butterfly (Figure 1). The artist portrays himself as a human-butterfly hybrid. Shirtless with his hands splayed out and body posed in a welcoming gesture reminiscent of Catholic saint iconography, Salgado’s body is filled in with a hue of pink that I frequently referred to in my notes as “Julio pink.” He uses this color consistently throughout his art. Language and linguistic difference are present throughout the text features in Salgado’s art. In “Queer Butterfly,” terms appear on each side of the figure’s butterfly wings. Situated on opposing wings, Salgado includes the words: migrant, queerness, love, family, unity, and peace. Each word has the Spanish equivalent on the opposing wing. Translation problems arise with these text features. They suggest inequality between the two languages. For example, Salgado places the Spanish word “jotería” opposite the English word “queerness.” In Spanish, “jotería” roughly translates to “things gay people do.” This word has impolite connotations and is generally considered derogatory. It is derived from the Mexican Spanish term for “faggot,”
and can be used to ridicule heterosexual men’s feminine behavior. In English, “queerness” has a broader meaning as “things Queer people do” and is not generally considered derogatory. While it is derived from the word “Queer,” a term formerly derogatory in English, it is used as a more benign descriptor. Both words might be considered colloquialisms, and do not directly translate cleanly. This suggests a tension in linguistic difference.

*Figure 1.* Salgado “Queer Butterfly,” (2013).

The bilingualism in this image is different from that which Reyes (2008) employs in his poetry. For example, in “For Colored Boys,” he writes:

For colored boys

I will remind my people

Que somos diferente

Que somos gente

Con cultura

Con orgullo

Con poder

We are people and with the people we stand

Breaking borders and stereotypes
Reyes offers no translation. This is a common use of bilingualism in Chicano texts. Anzaldúa (1987) in *Borderlands/La frontera* used bilingual text that was intentionally not translated. While Saldgada’s bilingualism is an opportunity to consider the problems with translating terms across cultures, Reyes insists the reader must encounter the text—and therefore the UndocuQueer voice—as one that is not translated. Moreover, he uses Spanish in the text to signal that he is speaking directly to “my people,” (p. 73), or those that do not need translation. The in the Spanish text translates to: “We are different/We are people/With culture/With pride/With power.” This refusal to translate and accommodate English readers and those without bilingual abilities in Spanish can be considered a form of implicit resistance.

Figure 2. Screenshot of *Undocumented and Awkward* (Episode 7), (2011).

Linguistic difference is not always presented as benign. The YouTube series, “Undocumented and Awkward,” is a semi-autobiographical collection of video shorts that often include a humorous message to make social commentary about the experiences of UndocuQueer people. In Episode 7, Salgado, an unnamed friend, and an unnamed man are waiting at a bus stop. Salgado and his friend appear to be Latinx. The other person, a man, at the bus stop appears to be East Asian. Salgado and his friend begin to speak in Spanish with each other about the man
with the following dialogue (on-screen English translation captions in the video and original Spanish presented for context):

Salgado: Since when do Chinese people here ride the bus?/De cuándo acá los chinitos usan el bus también?

Friend: Since they’re stingy./Desde que son codos.

Salgado: I find it so annoying that folks here who have proper documentation and a license could drive to school, while we’re forced to take the bus because we don’t have documents. And here they are, taking up space./¡Ay! Me cae tan gordo que la gente teniendo papeles y teniendo licencia puedan ir manejando a la escuela. Y uno que no tiene papeles tiene que tomar el bus. No más están haciendo ocupando espacio.

Friend: I bet he’s got a car at home, but just doesn’t want to pay for gas./Te apuesto que el carro lo tiene en casa, pero solo no quiere ponerle gas.

Salgado: Stingy people./Gente coda.

They assume the other man does not speak Spanish and proceed to speak disparagingly about his perceived Chinese identity. The Spanish dialogue in the video is presented with English subtitles. The conversation continues until the two decide they must ask the man for the time. Salgado asks him in English and the actor responds in Spanish:

Man: Yes. It’s 2 o’clock in the afternoon./Sí. Son las dos de la tarde.

Salgado (to his friend): He speaks Spanish./Habla español.

Friend (to Salgado): You think he understood us?/Nos entendía, ¿güey?

Man (to both of them): Yes, I understood you. And you know what? I’m also undocumented. And I don’t have a license. That’s why I’m here waiting for the
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

bus. /Sí, los entendí. ¿Y sabes que? También soy indocumentado. Y no tengo licencia. Por eso estoy aquí esperando por el bus.

The man further reveals that he is in fact Peruvian, not Chinese as the pair had assumed. Salgado and the friend look directly at the camera as the title sound clip of “awkward” is played. This artifact complicates linguistic difference by highlighting assumptions that may be at play about who shares linguistic difference and who does not.

Figure 3. Screenshot of Undocumented and Awkward (Episode 10), (2012).

Episode 10 of “Undocumented and Awkward” exhibits a nuance of the variety of linguistic difference within the undocumented community. Some words appear to be taboo for some members. At a party, Salgado and a guest are discussing California voter propositions that may negatively affect undocumented people. The guest finishes discussing the latest news about the propositions and makes a comment about anti-immigrant activists. The dialogue proceeds:


Salgado: Really?

Guest: What?

Salgado: The “F” word? I mean do you really need to use the “F” word?

Guest: Sorry. Those faggots.
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

Salgado: You’re still using it.

Guest: What are you talking about? What? Faggots? No, no, don’t get me wrong. I totally didn’t mean it in a homophobic way.

The exchange appears to finish. Then Salgado continues:

Salgado: Ok, so you equate gay with ‘stupid’ and ‘dumb?’

Guest: I’m not saying that gay people are stupid. I don’t know man. I feel like whatever I say...

Salgado: You’re just being a hypocrite...

Guest: I’m not being a hypocrite!

Salgado: You’re going around...

Guest: We were just talking about immigrants’ rights. We are not talking about homosexuality here.

Salgado: Dude, if you’re for social justice issues, it should be all across the border. No pun intended. Just don’t use that word. Drop it. I’m Queer, man!

The abrupt ending of the exchange suggests that language can cause division within the community. Even in English context, Salgado explains that certain words are too taboo or offensive to ever be tolerated within the UndocuQueer community.

The personal/Self

In Salgado’s (2013) Queer Butterfly (Figure 1), an examination of the personal, the self, is the primary subject. This is a shirtless depiction of the artist with butterfly wings fully spread out behind him. Downcast eyes, the artist appears to be in a moment of deep inner reflection. The half-nakedness and reflective gaze suggest a deeply personal image. Nothing else fills the composition but Salgado. His art is characterized by a flat two-dimensional style reminiscent of
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

comic strip art. Very little three-dimensional elements such as shading and perspective are employed; rather coloring tends to be flat. This flatness suggests a raw and spare quality, because Salgado’s paintings frequently have a subject with few details beyond it. There seems to be no need for anything extraneous because the expression of the self seems to be sufficient for the art.

Figure 4. “Because Frida Told Me So”

In “Because Frida Told Me So” Salgado again uses himself as subject. Seated solo and provocatively in a bedroom, he looks off to the right side. This coy gaze is filled with smug energy. The personal in this painting suggests that Salgado wants to tell the viewer something about himself, but has chosen to let the mise en scene speak for his inner thoughts. Behind Salgado, various items exist including a table with mug and flower pot, a taped poster that reads, “Illegal Faggots Against Borders!,” a pink triangle poster—a symbol of gay pride,—and a poster of the recording artist Selena. Salgado’s portrayal of himself is not intentionally flattering. In this painting, he is seated 3/4 toward the viewer. His pose mimics the same pose as Selena’s, but from the viewer’s angle, Salgado’s chubby body contrasts with her slim body. This gives a sense of reality and honesty. Further, this vulnerability is characteristic of UndocuQueer artifacts. This is documented more in the testimonio section.
Figure 5. “Beyond Dreams”

In “Beyond Dreams,” Salgado appears in a more provocative pose than in “Because Frida Told Me So.” Clad in a graduation gown—Julio Pink—his tongue is stuck out. He leans on an ionic-style column. He is dressed in a graduation gown that is open to display a nearly naked body. On his body, a short bawdy poem details things he sometimes does. There is a clash of statements. Salgado juxtaposes more quotidian activities like reading and drawing with protest and sex. In wearing a graduation gown, Salgado asserts here that UndocuQueer people are graduating from the schooling system. The gown is falling off his shoulders and reveals a poem written on his provocatively posed body. These images suggest a shedding of a metaphorical skin to reveal a more personal side. Behind him are a fence, three helicopters, and a disembodied mouth with saliva coming out of it.
Figure 6. “Border Gay”

In “Border Gay,” Salgado is standing in front of a border fence. He is shirtless and dressed only in black knee-length pants. Taped to the border fence behind him is a red shirt with the word “maricón,” a Mexican Spanish pejorative slur for “faggot.” The middle finger on both hands are raised in a defiant gesture. There are text features on the left-hand side of the image that read:

When your body is Queer and brown
They will want to Build fences Around you
Choose a side Brown or Queer
But borders are Not natural to us

I AM MANIFESTATION THAT ALL BORDERS WILL FALL
We are both moon and sun
We are everything in between
You cannot divide land
And you can not
Make me choose

In this text, Salgado represents the self explicitly through the use of the word “body.” He frequently shows flesh as representations of the self. In this painting, the text reinforces this visual metaphor and indicates that Salgado is highlighting experiences that are personal and body-bound. Being often nearly naked in depictions of himself in paintings further demonstrates explicitly revealing his innermost self. This vulnerability is a key feature in UndocuQueer narratives.

In “Silent No Longer,” Reyes (2008) moves from using the pronoun “I” to “We” in the course of the poem. In doing so, he shifts from a sense of the personal to the collective. Most powerful in this poem is its closing line, “Somos, Seremos, We are and We will Continue to BE DEFIANT!!” (p. 71). The non-standard capitalizations in the line punctuate the urgency that culminates in three exclamation points to end the poem. While potentially histrionic, this unique play with capitalization and punctuation represents a personal style. Reyes suggests, however, that the personal is not singular or individually owned. Rather, he suggests there is a collective identity within these personal representations of the self. Perhaps in a previous generation, some of these artifacts would be distributed in zines, newsletters, or private groups. That these artifacts are available to the public suggests a collectivism that is not dominated by a solely individualistic imperative. The collectivistic rhetoric celebrates rather than deny individual experiences.
There is another representation of self in Reyes’s transformation from “I” to “We” in the poem. He identifies as two-spirit, an indigenous identity similar to Western notions of transgender identity. This identity is similar to some nonbinary gender expressions in which some Queer people reject stereotypical genders, and is inclusive of multiple genders.

**Liminality**

Being caught between cultures is the cornerstone of liminality. In “Border Gay,” (Figure 6) Salgado explicitly demonstrates liminality by being depicted at the international border. Caught between national borders, the uncertainty of documentation status and immigration policy, and gender and sexuality norms, Salgado speaks to the liminality of UndocuQueer experiences through text features and imagery of the border fence. He does not suggest that his experience of liminality is passive or compulsory. His middle fingers to the viewers, note wearing a shirt, and the text features suggest an agency in experiencing liminality. Rather than bemoaning being caught between worlds, between expectations of documentation status, sexuality, and gender expression, he defiantly embraces them.

Reyes (2008) speaks to liminal experiences in “For Colored Boys who Speak Softly” when he writes:

- This is the broken spirits speaking for a better day
- So in the tenderness of our words we carry blades
- To cut ourselves free from gender roles
- Build a life free from social norms
- Redefine humanity and sexuality through our own terms (p. 71)
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

Reyes echoes Salgado’s acceptance of liminality in this section of the poem. The imagery of blades cutting oneself away from societal gender roles and social norms suggests agency, not passivity, helplessness, or despair.

Figure 7. Screenshot of Osito, Dat DACAmented Life (Episode 11), (2015).

Salgado and Jesus Iñiguez, a co-founder of Dreamers Adrift, discuss receiving their Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) authorization cards in this semi-autobiographical video. These cards allow them to work in accordance with U.S. employment laws and give legal authorization to remain in the country. Their status, however, is uncertain and they speak about this feeling of liminality in the following dialogue:

Julio: It’s finally here. Do you feel different?

Jesus: Not really.

Julio: I guess we should make that appointment with the Social Security office?

Jesus: Then the DMV. And then I get my green card.

Julio: And start paying taxes. But really though. I feel some sort of type of guilt.

Jesus: Guilt? Why?

Julio: I have this thing now that others don’t have, my parents don’t’ have. I guess we’re sort of, kind of privileged now?

Jesus: Yeah, I know what you mean, man. I’m just a regular brown guy now. I can’t talk about undocumented issues no more.
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

Julio: Dude don’t.

Jesus: Dude yes. I mean yes and no, I guess.

Julio: Yes and no is the best way to describe it.

Jesus: It’s like we’re almost there, but not really.

The feelings of liminality after receiving their DACA cards are emphasized by the simple language they use. Jesus’s last line in this excerpt highlights a new liminality that DACA created. It is ironic that this liminality is created from an intervention that was intended to alleviate the uncertainty of being undocumented.

Expanding Intersectionality

UndocuQueer artifacts examined in this study revealed identities more complicated than undocumented and Queer, race and ethnicity, rather than these larger sociological categories.

Figure 8. “Quiero Mis Queerce”

“Quiero Mis Queerce” (Figure 8) depicts two brown-skinned people dressed in typical quinceañera dress. One person is dressed in a typical masculine suit as he plays the role of
chambelán, or escort. The other person is dressed in dress typical of more formal events like quinceañeras and high school proms. However, the person wearing the dress has masculine features, including markedly broad shoulders and chest hair. The painting plays on gender norms, such as the cultural expectation that only Latinx women must have a quinceañera. The two people in the painting appear to have the same face, though the figure on the left has a beard. The two figures’ clothing and grooming suggest a difference. The two figures look into each other’s eyes which suggests a connection and longing to be the other person. Reading the painting this way, Salgado suggests transcending cultural gender norms and that masculinity can be as visible as femininity, and this transcendence entails navigating deep cultural expectations.

Figure 9. “Homoland Security”

Salgado’s “Homoland Security” (Figure 9) demonstrates intersectionality through its representation of multiple identities. Two people are holding up the international border fence. A banner—in classical Western painting style—declares “Come in, gurl.” This colloquial rendering of “girl” evokes the language of some drag queens of color. The two people are
dressed in ways that challenge gender norms. One figure evokes classical drag queen attire—a feathered wig, a Rubenesque body in a skimpy tube top and mini-skirt, and thigh-high platform pink boots. The other figure is dressed in leather gear including a leather choker, form-fitting leather pants, and boots, but no shirt. The Queer and brown bodies in the painting compound notions of intersectionality by including the transgression of national borders. It is not enough that complex gender and racial representations abound in the painting. The two people are transcending both physical nationalistic borders and borders of gender and sexuality. These are not typically images seen in public discourses on documentation and immigration.

Figure 10. “What Future? The Present Is All I See”

Salgado expands on his concern with intersectionality most explicitly in “What Future? The Present is All I See” (Figure 10). A portrait of a shirtless brown-skinned man stares straight at the viewer. He has phenotypical facial features typical of indigenous Mexicans—a wide nose, large, luscious lips, and a wide and round face. From the forehead up, there appear to be visual representations of what occupies his mind. A rainbow flows out of his head. This is the classic
symbol for gay pride. A dollar bill, representations of a nuclear family, a condom wrapper, and two music eighth-notes symbolize other concerns. A condom wrapper suggests concerns with sexual health. “No Papers” appears on its own at the top edge of the images. All of these representations speak to the multiple layers of UndocuQueer identity, longings, and concerns. Yet, these intersectional elements do not appear to be in conflict with each other. Instead, they are part of a complex whole.

In the poem “For Colored Boys who Speak Softly,” Reyes (2008) writes,

> For those who speak softly  
> I will recognize  
> That there is more than one wound to heal  
> More than one struggle that we feel  
> But this ignorance  
> Blocks us from seeing the bigger picture,  
> The greater evil (p. 72)

The use of “recognize” suggests there are features of UndocuQueer identity, some of which are infused with pain. In acknowledging “more than one struggle that we feel,” he alludes to multiple forms of marginalization.

UndocuQueer artifacts suggest intersectionality is not merely categorizing or naming multiple identities. Rather, it includes complex tensions, longings, visibilities and invisibilities, and identity features that transcend traditional sociological categories.

**Politicizing Identity**

As an activist movement, it is not surprising that UndocuQueer artifacts politicize identity. In Salgado’s work, political messages are often explicit. For example, in “Border Gay”
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

(Figure 6) two middle fingers pointing at the viewer seem an afterthought compared to the accompanying text discussed earlier. “Manos Arriba” (Figure 11) also features middle fingers pointed at the viewer. The title translates to “hands up,” the command police give to a suspect before apprehension. Wearing panties, a cross around her neck, elbow-length gloves, and cascading hair covering her bare breasts, the woman points her middle fingers at the viewer in a daring gesture. The title’s irony contrasts the woman’s seeming compliance with the idea of “hands up” with her vulgar gesture of flipping off the viewer. This gesture politicizes identity by suggesting that while an UndocuQueer person might comply with a command from a person of authority—such as a police officer—but still demonstrate agency through defiant gestures.

Identities are politicized and expected power is unbalanced in Salgado’s “Arrest ICE” (Figure 12). The painting shows a woman arresting an Immigration and Customs Enforcement (ICE) officer. She is dressed in a white T-shirt. Her hair is pulled back into a barely visible ponytail while her forehead-level bangs rest in a relaxed part. Her brown skin contrasts with the white skin of the officer. The officer’s face is blurred. The woman’s head is at the officer’s chest level and the painting is framed to focus on her. For many in the Latinx community, tías and primas—or aunts and cousins—dress this way. Salgado provocatively uses this imagery to reimagine power dynamics. He seems to ask the viewer through this representation, what if those we might stereotypically arrest actually arrested the law enforcement officer? This interrogation of power dynamics is inherently political.
In the 2009 feature-length documentary film *Papers*, UndocuQueer activist Jorge, a Latino college student, discusses his participation in activism for undocumented rights and its effect on his identity. He says,

> Being part of this cause, fighting for it, being an activist for it, makes me part of something. And when you’re part of something, you feel like you belong. You feel you are part of something that’s special. And you’re making a small change. You’re just making your community better. The passion to be out there, be outspoken, make it known not only for yourself, but for your community. That’s what motivates me. The people in
there. My friends. We’re really close. They inspire me to come out here and be as open
as I can out in the community.

Figure 13. Screenshot of Papers, (2009).

Using Humor and Irony

Salgado politicizes identity through employing provocative images and this is often
achieved through humor and irony. Irony is often evoked in the YouTube web series
Undocumented and Awkward. A repeated feature is a sound clip and running gag of a unison
chorus speak-singing a descending major second of the line “awkward.” Each episode features
an ironic ending that, while humorous, also presents a moral lesson.

Episode 7 employs deep irony to communicate its messages. The unexpected Latinx
identity and Spanish-speaking ability of the perceived East Asian man at the bus stop
demonstrates one of the artifacts’ strongest messages of irony. Salgado challenges the viewer to
interrogate assumptions about who is undocumented and who is Latinx. Irony is used to uncover
assumptions about UndocuQueer people that might not be immediately apparent. There is an
implicit pedagogical agenda in this video.
Figure 14. Screenshot of Episode 9 of Undocumented and Awkward, (2012).

In Episode 9 of “Undocumented and Awkward,” Salgado and an unnamed friend parody racist rant YouTube videos. Dressed in drag, they wear wigs and display mannerisms consistent with stereotypes of feminine behavior. The video’s description on the YouTube website—written by Salgado—emphasizes that this is a parody video in stating, “Shit White Racist Girls from Arizona Say.” The video begins with Salgado looking into the camera—physically within inches to the camera lens in an extreme close-up—and the following dialogue:

Friend: I don’t know if this is working. Girl, is it recording? Can you see me?

Salgado: All I see is a bunch of cute blonde hair.

Friend: Stupid, that’s you.

Salgado: That’s so funny. Oh my God! I can be so ditzy sometimes and uneducated about things. So this video is really fucking important. This video is about the new Arizona [inaudible attempt to say “legislation”].

Friend: This is all for you fucking illegals to go back to your own damn country.

Salgado: Take you burritos and take them back to Mexico.

At this point in the video, two presumably Latino men enter the scene. The women exclaim in surprise that the men must be “illegals” from Mexico and flee from the room. The two men then state that the women must be mistaken and that they are not even Mexican.
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

The hyperbolic nature of the dialogue and acting in the video underlie a deep mocking of the negative stereotypes and anti-immigrant sentiments UndocuQueer people face. The lack of makeup in their drag performance, the shiny and fake nature of the wigs, the exaggerated valley girl accents, and the exaggerated expletives and racist assumptions in the dialogue point to irony and humor. One does not expect Latino actors to utter the racist dialogue in the video. The men’s ironic revelation that they are not Mexican is also unexpected.

Salgado also uses irony in “Arrest ICE” (Figure 12). It is unexpected that an ordinary middle-aged woman—colloquially referred to as a “tía”—to arrest an ICE officer. The woman looks at the viewer with a half-smile which further reinforces the unexpected nature of the imagery. In Mexican culture, a tía is typically seen caring for family members. The line between irony and humor is as blurry as the officer’s face. This demonstrates that UndocuQueer conceptions of irony and humor are sometimes simultaneous.

In “Beyond Dreams” (Figure 5), Salgado uses irony as well. Him leaning on an ionic column is potentially unexpected given his provocative pose, the vulgar nature of the poem written on his body, and his brown skin. The sexual nature of his extended tongue and the disembodied, salivating mouth in the right quadrant of the painting is unexpected imagery for a man wearing graduation regalia. The irony in the painting does highlight contrasts between the juxtaposed images.

The Pedagogical Potential of the UndocuQueer Movement

Some of Salgado’s work has a decidedly pedagogical aim. In Episode 7 of “Undocumented and Awkward,” Salgado uses humor to teach important lessons about assumptions. Salgado and his companion stereotyping the assumed East Asian man as an outsider suggests that even UndocuQueer people make dubious claims about who are outsiders.
and insiders. The moral in the story seems to be careful about assumptions made about undocumented status, language, and economic privilege.

By its very nature, the UndocuQueer movement is instructive. In Episode 12 of “Undocumented and Awkward” an actor portrays an undocumented college student waiting in line to speak with financial aid advisors. The advising session is being held in a public setting with many other students. When the actor finally reaches the advisor, she asks him several uncomfortable questions. The scene proceeds thusly:

Advisor 1: Do you have financial aid?
Student: I don’t have financial aid. I’m an AB 540 student. AB 540?
Advisor: AB 540? (turns to ask a colleague a question) Do you know what an AB 540 student is?
Advisor 2: Those are students who are illegal.
Advisor 1: Oh, so you’re an illegal student?
Student: No, I’m not an illegal student. It’s not how you say it. It’s actually undocumented student. AB 540 student.
Advisor 1: Oh, ok. So you’re an undocumented student.
At one point in the 2-minute video the advisor asks for proof of identification and the student can only provide a school I.D. and a consular document. The dialogue continues:

Advisor 1: So we’re in the United States, sir. Not Mexico.
Student: I know my geography. We’re in the United States. It’s my government, it’s a Mexican consulate card. It has my name, my birthdate, my address...
Advisor 1: Again though, sir. We’re in the United States of America.
Student: I know we are. I know geography. Can I just talk to your supervisor, please?
Advisor 1: Sir, we’re really busy right now.
Student: I need to pay for my classes though.

When another student asks why the waiting line is not moving the advisor reveals that the actor is “undocumented.” The video ends somewhat uncharacteristically compared to other videos in the series. There is no ending with actors looking at the viewer or strong imagery to deliver the pedagogical punchline. Instead, the actor leaves the line having been outed as undocumented. The scene goes on quietly until the characteristic “awkward” sound clip is played. This change in ending points to a pedagogical possibility about the emotional pain an undocumented person might feel when outed publicly. The description for the YouTube video reinforces this pedagogical agenda. It states that “Being outed as ‘illegal’ isn’t fun. Particularly if your status is announced in public around folks you don’t know.” This pedagogical intention seems straightforward. Yet, a close viewing of the video reveals that viewers are being instructed in more subtle ways. In correcting the financial aid advisor to use the term “undocumented” and her immediate use of it, the video provides a model for how to use more inclusive language. The advisor immediately uses this preferred term. Granted, her subsequent behaviors are problematic,
but her quick change implies more socially just practice. Further, in explaining to the advisor the conundrum of not having a U.S.-issued government document to prove identity, the video demonstrates how seemingly everyday practices or requests for government identification present barriers for undocumented people. This is inherently instructive, although.

**The Pedagogy of Testimonio**

When representations of the self-dominate an UndocuQueer artifact, the artist is enacting a testimonio (Cruz, 2006, 2012). Several of Salgado’s works convey narratives about the self that go beyond simply stating what the self is. This form of storytelling is most strongly testimonio. Salgado appears as the central figure in many of the artifacts that do so. Painting himself into his art is a personal testimony within a collective context. UndocuQueer experiences are highly personal, yet collective.

Salgado and Reyes present highly personal presentations of themselves. These are more than simple storytelling. Testimonios, too, are political acts. The testimonios in UndocuQueer artifacts instruct viewers and readers about UndocuQueer identity and experience. In keeping with Cruz’s (2012) framework for testimonios, the artifacts invite viewers, readers, and listeners to actively engage, or “to travel,” (p. 462) rather than passively listen. Viewers and readers co-construct the testimonio. Artists and writers do this through powerful imagery and deeply personal revelations. Thus UndocuQueer artifacts are pedagogical in nature.

*Figure 16. Screenshot of The Ashes, (2014).*
In the YouTube video, “The Ashes” (2014), Salgado illustrates Reyes’s spoken poem, and the poem itself is a strong testimonio. Reyes’s voiceover in the video speaks to his experiences when he says,

I have looked through the pages of the history books for recollection of my past. But in them there is an absence of my grandmother’s tongues. This is where we stand. Small as this obsidian stone among structures that took over our temples and homes. This is how we speak. That’s a small Queer, undocumented voice trying to rewrite history they erased when they lynched us from trees, massacred our dreams, and made us doubt that we have existed since the birth of humanity.

The video finishes with the following lines:

There are boys and girls like me on these streets. We are the ones you left behind. The ashes after the fire. We are still here. Slowly burning. The foundations of your empire.

Looking directly at the camera at the end of “Undocumented and Awkward” Episode 7, Salgado invites the viewer to ponder the video’s message. His look seems to ask the viewer—in the testimonio sense—“Did you travel?” These invitations are present in many of the artifacts examined in this study. UndocuQueer artifacts do not simply offer a personal story. As in Episode 7, the viewer is invited to ponder and play an active role in the storytelling. UndocuQueer artifacts demand a role less passive than is typically expected in other forms of popular media. These demands make testimonios instructive and political in nature.

**Citations and Intertextual References through Popular Culture**

Butler (1990) posits that gender performativity—the general behavioral expectations for the gender binary categories of man and woman—encompasses a complex set of practices that have historically been reproduced across generations. These then serve to reinforce gender
norms, expectations, and limitations. UndocuQueer artifacts included in this study playfully engage this concept by enacting intertextual connections with popular culture.

Depictions of popular culture in Salgado’s “Because Frida Told Me So” (Figure 4) include a strong representation of the late recording artist Selena. An ostentatious portrait of the recording artist actively connects to Latinx culture. Selena is a strong cultural icon and her image in the painting signify intertextual connections with mainstream Latinx culture. Idolized for her femininity, Selena has become a Queer icon among Queer Latinx. Again including himself in the image, Salgado reinforces this stereotype and playfully engages with it to ground his art in a familiar symbol of gender and sexuality within the Latinx community.

Intertextuality can be seen in many of Salgado’s other artworks as well. A nuance of Salgado’s art is the repetitive use of what I call “Julio pink.” It hearkens to the iconic pink triangle of the Queer community. This color also alludes to a ubiquitous color often found in comforting and celebratory artifacts of Mexican culture. This is the color of conchas, a type of Mexican sweet bread, and papel picado, a traditional household decoration made from cut-out paper.

Intertextuality has a strong presence in Yosimar Reyes’s poetry. Using heavy allusions to canonical writers and classic Western poetics, Reyes weaves not only an activist agenda into his poetry, but a poetry that can withstand the strict scrutiny of literary criticism. He sometimes makes allusions to Langston Hughes’s “The Negro Speaks of Rivers” in his imagery and repetition of “I’ve known...” throughout his poetry. Reyes (2008) cites Hughes’s poem in his own “Eres Un Rio (Un Poema Pa’Un Poeta)” and uses imagery of a river. His poem begins with:

Eres un río lleno de verdades tan pesadas
como las piedras al fondo de tus pies
Your words have healed so many cicatrices
left by confused men (p. 77).

The Spanish rendering of “river” evokes a bilingual intertextual exchange. Reyes uses the river metaphor to speak to the UndocuQueer experience:

You are a river so strong that society can’t hold you back
because nature must take its course
and like truth water is difficult to hold captive (p. 78).

He ends the poem with the stanza:

For being that river,
That water,
That resistance,
That voice...that gives me meaning (p. 78).

In using the river metaphor, Reyes engages the reader in evoking Hughes’s poem, and helping them understand UndocuQueer experiences through the same metaphor.

**Calls for Activism and Social Justice**

In Salgado’s 2011 “Save Ethnic Studies. Save Our Stories” (Figure 17), a woman with brown skin is raising her left fist. She is holding classics of Latinx literature including *Zoot Suit* and *The House on Mango Street*. This is Salgado's commentary on the Tucson, Arizona ethnic studies program controversy made famous in the documentary film *Precious Knowledge* (2011). This artwork has been widely used in social media posts by organizations such as Rethinking Schools to represent the drawn-out and eventual legal victory that halted the Arizona legislature’s ban on the Ethnic Studies program. The use of Salgado's work suggests a larger connection between the UndocuQueer movement and other social justice movements.
In Episode 7 of “Undocumented and Awkward,” the call for activism and social justice is both complex and buried beneath an entertaining veneer. A superficial viewing might reveal nothing more than an entertaining one-minute video. Salgado, however, is exposing the negative assumptions those in his own community of UndocuQueer activists might have about outsiders. In effecting social justice, UndocuQueer artifacts do not shy away from being critical of themselves. The activist elements are not always subtle in UndocuQueer artifacts.

Explicit or implicit, activism in some artifacts demonstrate that UndocuQueer art is not for its own amusement or merely for leisure. There is no art for art’s sake in Salgado’s work and Reyes’s poetry. There is real pain from real experiences that are recounted in UndocuQueer artifacts. Salgado enacts activism through his personal testimony and through the use of self-narrative. The artifacts demonstrate a roadmap for how to be activists.

UndocuQueer artifacts demonstrate that activism is achieved through visibility. The creators of the artifacts used in this study do not use pseudonyms, noms de plume, or anonymity. Related to representations of the self, the artifacts present UndocuQueer activism that decidedly outs and makes visible its artists and creators. Further, visibility for undocumented or Queer
identities sometimes make one potentially at risk to danger. As a true praxis of the undocumented activist phrase, “undocumented and unafraid,” the visibility of autobiographical UndocuQueer art and poetry enacts an ethic of activism.

![Figure 18. “No LGBTQ Exclusion!”](image)

For example, Salgado’s “No LGBTQ Exclusion!” (Figure 18) includes the message, “Out of the Closets! Out of the Shadows! Into the Streets!” The artifact encourages UndocuQueer people to come out and be visible in their activism. The diverse people seen in the painting are physically close to each other. This proximity suggests that being visible should not be a solitary process. With their smiling faces, the tone in this image is welcoming compared to more aggressive images like “Border Gay” and “Manos Arriba.”

In *Papers* (Figure 13), Jorge (2009) recounted his participation in undocumented activism, actions that pushed him to be more public about being UndocuQueer. He said,

For me talking about it started changing my emotions, started changing my mood, the way I saw things—my place in my education. When I started becoming more active it’s almost like I started removing these shackles that I was carrying with me. On one part, as
an undocumented student, I’m at the margins. And as an LGBT member in the Latino community, I feel I’m always at the margin of that. I’m always at two borders at the same time. If I didn’t let my dad hold me back then why would I let a law hold me back? Being visible benefitted the activism that Jorge engaged in himself. In stating that he would not let his dad hold him back, he referred to the childhood experiences he recounted in the film about his father’s constant rebukes over his perceived feminine behavior.

Summary

After analyzing the selected UndocuQueer artifacts for this study, several themes emerged that were presented in this chapter. Themes were seen across multiple artifacts. Many of the artifacts engaged in issues of bilingualism and problems that emerge from linguistic difference. The artists Julio Salgado and poet Yosimar Reyes often used personal stories as the subject of their art and poetry. Many artifacts expressed liminality and intersectionality. Other sets of artifacts presented or argued for politicizing one’s identity. Many artifacts used humor and irony. The artifacts demonstrated a pedagogical potential in helping to teach viewers about UndocuQueer experiences. Some of these artifacts—using personal stories—demonstrated testimonios. Some artifacts used citations and intertextual references to popular culture and other UndocuQueer artifacts. Finally, many artifacts contained calls for activism and social justice.
Chapter V: Summary, Discussion, and Recommendations

Summary

A summary of the study, discussion, and recommendations for future research on the UndocuQueer movement are presented in this chapter. The focus of this study was to identify key themes of UndocuQueer experiences, pedagogical moves of the UndocuQueer movement, and potential conversions to K-12 research, schooling, and education. The theoretical lenses framing this study drew upon knowledge construction and prejudice reduction, intersectionality and hybridity, contexts of reception, and critical pedagogy to understand UndocuQueer experiences. Research and scholarship reviewed for this study were drawn from broad categories of immigration and education, Queer issues in education, critical pedagogy, and multicultural education. Virtual ethnography, art, poetry, and videos created by UndocuQueer artist Julio Salgado and poet Yosimar Reyes were analyzed. This analysis blended techniques from content analysis, discourse analysis, and art history. The findings of the study identified the themes of linguistic difference, personal/self, liminality, intersectionality, humor and irony, testimonios, and enacting the political.

Discussion

Connecting the UndocuQueer movement to education, while necessary, does not provide a direct translation of action. Nevertheless, UndocuQueer artifacts suggest some potential conversions. First, I name and contextualize connections to research and scholarship. These include intersectionality, encoding and decoding, the pedagogical potential of the UndocuQueer movement, expanding the imaginary for multicultural education, expanding the use of popular culture in multicultural education, and expanding immigrant and Queer implications for
multicultural education. Next, implications for education in schooling and non-school contexts are discussed.

**Intersectionality**

The UndocuQueer movement expands understanding of intersectionality primarily through its multifaceted narratives. It is impossible to understand these artifacts—and therefore, the movements itself—as a monolithic identity or as a singular movement. While Crenshaw (1991) did not include in her conceptualization of intersectionality documentation status and transnational identities, the findings of this study support some of her claims. She claimed that intersectionality allows for a critique of oppressive forces and marginalization because “it may be easier to understand the need for and to summon the courage to challenge groups that are after all, in one sense, ‘home’ to us, in the name of the parts of us that are not made at home” (p. 1299).

The findings of this study confirm this theorizing in that the UndocuQueer artifacts focus on marginalization and oppression. These issues were evident most explicitly in Jorge’s testimonio in the documentary *Papers*, “Undocumented and Awkward Episode 10,” “Homoland Security,” and “Border Gay.”

Crenshaw (1991) also argued for agency in intersectional identities and for marginalized people to name themselves. As she explained,

Subordinated people can and do participate, sometimes even subverting the naming process in empowering ways. One need only think about the historical subversion of the category "Black" or the current transformation of "queer" to understand that categorization is not a one-way street. Clearly, there is unequal power, but there is
nonetheless some degree of agency that people can and do exert in the politics of naming (p. 1297).

The findings of this study confirm that UndocuQueer people name their identities in spite of lacking agency at times and in some circumstances. This was primarily seen in “Queer Butterfly” and “Undocumented and Awkward Episode 12.”

The findings support van Gennep’s (1960) notion of liminality as part of a rite of passage or potentially a developmental process. Liminality describes UndocuQueer people’s experiences of feeling caught between the uncertainties of being undocumented, and is a feature and expression of intersectionality. Experiencing conflict and attempting agency over so-called gray areas between larger norms speaks to the existence of multiplicity at play. For UndocuQueer people, this multiplicity is present in impositions placed on them and within their own self-identities. Liminality illuminates the multiple social norms, documentation complications, racial hierarchies, and gender and sexual norms that affect UndocuQueer people. Further, the findings suggest that experiences of liminality are common to UndocuQueer experiences.

Muñoz (1999) extended Crenshaw’s (1991) conception to include Queer identity. He suggested that “disidentifications” (p. 8) can help explain ways minoritized groups respond to hegemonic discourses. These disidentifications are extensions of intersectional experiences that amplify the contexts that must be considered in these interactions with hegemonic discourses. Disidentifications can be seen as a Queer of color version of Crenshaw’s intersectionality. The findings support Muñoz’s assertion that disidentifications respond to a larger discourse on what it means to be undocumented, Queer, and a person of color. UndocuQueer artifacts do not just speak back to larger discourses on documentation status, gender and sexuality norms, and racial
divisions. They transform these discourses to challenge and enhance collective understanding of the constitutive identities.

The Pedagogical Potential of the UndocuQueer Movement

For the UndocuQueer movement, pedagogical potential refers to the ability of artifacts to instruct or teach. Findings of this study indicated that the UndocuQueer movement demonstrates strong pedagogical potential through its use of paintings, poetry, film, and social media, especially YouTube. These artifacts help to teach outsiders about the experiences and needs of the UndocuQueer community. These artifacts are often playful, ironic, sometimes contentious, and almost always provocative.

The findings of this study also suggest that the UndocuQueer movement demonstrates pedagogical potential through its use of popular culture. The artifacts provide insight into the schooling experiences—positive and negative—of UndocuQueer people. An example from the artifacts is Reyes’s criticisms of and recommendations for better schooling experiences in “The Ashes” in collaboration with Salgado. These criticisms included his family’s suffering under colonialism and the omission of his identities in his schooling.

The findings of the study also confirm Kincheloe’s (2004) assertion that education occurs in multiple sites, not exclusively in schooling. The artifacts teach in non-traditional settings. Further, the artifacts enact caring and culturally responsive pedagogies by attending to self-knowledge and demonstrating messages that are expected to help the viewer grow—even when the messages are challenging. Moreover, the artifacts show how UndocuQueer people might resist dominant power. This is seen in the many calls for visibility throughout the artifacts examined for this study.
Imagined Communities and Multicultural Education

The findings of this study confirm Anderson’s (1983) concept of imagined communities and Appadurai’s (1996) concept of the social imaginary. UndocuQueer artifacts present a community whose members, although connected through social media, are not necessarily physically interacting with each other. The artifacts confirm that communities are constructed without this physical interaction to envision and name their own community, including its terms and conditions. The artifacts also support Anderson’s (1983) assertion that imagined communities are constructed through shared media and Appadurai’s (1996) assertion that media, migration of people and cultures, and technology create new global cultures.

Along with the notion of imagined communities, the findings of this study confirm theories of imaginaries, especially in decolonizing and transformative endeavors (Perez, 1999). UndocuQueer artifacts often portray a fictional world where their identities and experiences are seen as valid. While not real, these possibilities help to demonstrate conditions that would make UndocuQueer desires present in reality. These can be seen most strongly in Salgado’s paintings “Quiero Mis Queerce,” “Homoland Security,” and “Arrest ICE.”

In earlier multicultural education scholarship, Gay (1983) made the following observations:

The future of multiethnic education is in some ways more uncertain and challenging than it was when this discipline emerged. One kind of political expediency gave it birth; another, coupled with economic and ideological constraints, threatens its existence. Whereas much of the history of multiethnic education to date has been devoted to its justification and conceptual clarification, its future will require long-range pragmatic planning, practical models for implementing ideas, and demonstrations of its
effectiveness (both in terms of student performance and of fiscal expenditures). The major challenges for the future of multiethnic education are to translate theory into practice, to institutionalize the concept, and to provide hard evidence of its efficacy” (p. 563).

Perhaps a more expansive imaginary will help meet these challenges. Imaginaries help to envision the realm of possibilities and support globalized and globally-informed efforts to transform how people collectively think about boundaries and borders. (Appadurai, 1996). The possibilities the UndocuQueer movement offers to multicultural education are manifold. A key possibility is expanding the boundaries of intersectionality, and education for justice, equity and excellence to UndocuQueer populations.

**Popular Culture and Multicultural Education**

The UndocuQueer artifacts examined in this study are a hybrid of popular culture and personal and cultural knowledge. Banks (1996) contended that personal and cultural knowledge are derived from personal experiences in “home, family, and community cultures” (p. 9), and popular knowledge is “facts, concepts, explanations, and interpretations that are institutionalized within the mass media and other institutions that are part of the popular culture” (p. 9). The findings of the study add that popular knowledge, in the form of social media artifacts, can be generated from personal and cultural knowledge in meaningful ways that add to knowledge about UndocuQueer people. Since the findings suggest that UndocuQueer people challenge mainstream assumptions about immigrants and Queer people, insights gained and associated individuals and artifacts could lead to transformative academic knowledge.

The findings of this study confirm Cortes’s (2000) argument that media teach about diversity, especially in helping viewers construct knowledge about others different from
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

themselves. UndocuQueer artifacts, especially the Dreamers Adrift content on YouTube, provide media consumers with images and personal narratives that are often humorous and provocative, and that offer an appeal and accessibility to potential viewers.

Expanding Understandings through Testimonio

Cruz (2012) described testimonios as offering spaces for LGBTQ youth “to talk back to the larger discourses of poverty and criminalization” (p. 463). Other conditions and experiences can be added to these as was evident in the art and poetry of Salgado and Reyes. The findings of this study support Cruz’s theory of testimonios, especially in representations of self and artifacts that directly look at the reader or break the fourth wall in videos and actors look directly at the viewer. UndocuQueer artifacts used testimonios to help expand what it means to be Queer, a person of color, and a transnational person. They personified Cisneros’s (2017) claim that UndocuQueer is a reminder of what is uncontainable within single-axis identity frameworks. Umbrella terms such as LGBTQ and undocumented do not account for the centrality of gender, sexuality, and immigration status to undocuqueer immigrants’ understandings of themselves (pp. 15-16).

Therefore, there are necessary links between the UndocuQueer movement as expressed in art, poetry, film, and social media, and education, identity, agency, empowerment, and liberation.

Expanding Understanding of Immigrant Experiences

The UndocuQueer artifacts examined for this study supported Olsen’s (2000) assertions that immigrant students navigate complex tensions between home cultures, linguistic and ethnic identities, and dominant culture as represented and reproduced through education systems. Artifacts of the UndocuQueer movement increase understanding of these tensions and navigations by presenting more complex representations of them. They affirmed the claims of
Beyond Butterflies: The UndocuQueer Movement, Intersectionality, and Implications for Education

Scholars such as Pennell (2016) and Seif (2004, 2011, 2014). UndocuQueer artifacts demonstrate simultaneous anxiety and ownership of being undocumented and Queer, and the dangers that such visibility might invite.

Using Hall’s concept of encoding and decoding (1997), the findings of this study highlighted the interplay between Salgado’s artwork, Reyes’s poetry, and the larger discourses of undocumented and Queer activism. Embedded in UndocuQueer artifacts are messages about engagement with common signifiers within the general Queer culture and, simultaneously, exclusion, marginalization, oppression, and resistance of Queer individuals and communities.

Language can be a strong context of reception and rejection. Using Portes’ and Rumbaut’s (2014) assertion that language is least likely to survive immigrants’ assimilation to the United States, UndocuQueer artifacts demonstrate an active resistance to this fate. The fact that multiple artifacts are presented bilingually demonstrate persistence of linguistic difference. Additionally, scholarship in immigrant education has frequently advocated for family engagement and positive roles in schooling experiences (Stanton-Salazar, 2001; Stritikus & Nguyen, 2007). UndocuQueer artifacts suggest that family attitudes may be negative toward Queer identities. How might families support UndocuQueer youth positively if they hold negative attitudes toward Queer identities? The findings of this study point to how negative language cultivates and facilitates negative attitudes. Presumably, the converse could be true, too.

Scholarship also suggests that teaching practices may affect immigrant contexts of receptivity in schools (Dabach, 2015; Nelson, 2009, 2010). Negative Queer attitudes can create antagonistic environments for UndocuQueer youth in schools. These experiences may be compounded by anti-immigrant sentiments within the society at large due to tense political
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

climates. The findings suggest that such sentiment and government policies affecting undocumented people worsen these feelings. Stanton-Salazar’s (2001) notion of cultural broker suggests a potential role for UndocuQueer artifacts in the identity development, education, and political socialization of Queer immigrant youth. Since most of the artifacts used in this study are available online and through social media, and many contemporary youth are familiar with these communication outlets, they would be readily accessible to them. Therefore, these artifacts and artists could help ameliorate negative conditions and serve as cultural brokers for other UndocuQueer people.

**Expanding Understandings of Queer Experience for Multicultural Education**

Pennell (2015) recommended an asset-based understanding of intersectional Queer identities rather than a singular one in which the transgressive cultural capital of undocumented Queer people can enhance their competencies and contributions. The findings for this study provide specific examples of these possibilities and their positive benefits. The artifacts and the individuals who created them could be models of empowerment and resistance for others to emulate.

Valentine (2007) writes about trans identities as crossing borders and that although some risk is involved, such identity fluidity is necessary. As he explained,

My point is that this risk enables rather than prevents attending to the real, embodied risks that transgender-identified people face on a day-to-day basis. In order to take this risk, I have suggested that we should attend to a central question in contemporary social theory: what is the relationship between gender and sexuality? (pp. 249-250).

The artifacts examined for this study point to a need to extend Valentine’s parameters to include race, ethnicity, class, citizenship, and documentation. Without including these complexities in
research, scholarship, teaching, and learning there is a danger of essentializing the complex identities and experiences of UndocuQueer people.

Pascoe’s (2012) notion of the fag discourse also was evident in the artifacts. For example, Jorge’s discussion of his father’s ridicule over his perceived effeminate behavior in Papers and Salgado’s engagement with the word “fag” in “Because Frida Told me So” and “Undocumented and Awkward Episode 10” illustrate this idea. UndocuQueer men appear to suffer equally in the fag discourse, and experience it bilingually. Thus, the fag discourse may transcend linguistic difference.

Implicit in the artifacts are condemnations of dominant narratives about queerness. It is not sufficient to call the UndocuQueer movement simply a Queer of color initiative. Nor is it adequate to call the movement solely a Queer endeavor. Rather, the artifacts convey collective notions of queerness. The findings suggest that UndocuQueer experiences challenge the binary of White Queer and Queer of color. It is this active refashioning of queerness that defines UndocuQueer identity. Jagose (1996) pointed out, resistance to a singular, dominance definition of Queer is in itself a Queer (or queered) endeavor.

There is a danger here in envisioning UndocuQueer identity and the UndocuQueer movement as solely a queering endeavor concerned with traditional understandings of queerness as experiences of sexuality and gender. This essentializes the complex, multidimensional experiences, marginalization, and identities UndocuQueer people experience in the United States. This means, for example, that one must consider how experiences of UndocuQueer people are simultaneously Queer, gender, class, and undocumented encounters. According to Chavez (2010) centering undocumented rights helps to understand the intersectional nature and needs of Queer undocumented people.
Limitations

While using social media to consider social movements and marginalized identities is useful for analyzing complex contemporary issues, there may be temporal limitations of investigating social media as there are trends to contend with and new media that continue to change the way humans interact with each other. Within ten years there may be new forms of communication and new media to investigate UndocuQueer issues. Nevertheless, social media remains a popular form of communicating in today’s world and represents a constantly emerging source of data to investigate.

The study focused on the work of Julio Salgado and Yosimar Reyes. The narrow focus on their artistic output may provide limited perspectives. Other artifacts such as speeches, television interviews, and personal letters and emails may provide further insight into their work. Also, there are many artistic artifacts to examine, and this study did not include all of them by these and other undocumented activists and artists. Since Salgado and Reyes are Mexican, this study only considered Latinx contexts. Organizing and activism by other ethnic UndocuBlack individuals and groups could provide additional depth and scope to the findings of this study.

The results of this study can only be generalized to theory. A methodological limitation is that this study did not include interviews and other validating techniques with the artists or member checks with them on interpretation of their artifacts. While such methods may provide insights, the findings presented in this study still offer perspectives on the artifacts.

Researcher bias may have affected the study results. While I hold identities similar to UndocuQueer people, my own experiences as an outsider may have limited the analysis of artifacts. Care was taken to include multiple methodological approaches and triangulation. The researcher’s immersion and familiarity in social media output of Salgado and Reyes, following
the conventions of Kidd’s (2017) methodology of virtual ethnography, also helped to compensate for this limitation. While limitations exist, the findings of this study provide important contexts for UndocuQueer people and experiences.

**Significance**

This study adds to the body of literature on the value and potential of using art in education research. The findings suggest that artistic works can provide valuable insights into the experiences of marginalized groups. Art potentially provides researchers access to narratives that sometimes are not accessible through traditional forms of communication such as written correspondence, or numerical data and interviews. Artists and poets presumably have agency over the works they create and distribute. Examining theme provides researchers with a developed and intentional presentation of an artist’s inner thinking. This study offered some methodological guidance for conducting such research. Furthermore bilingual artifacts in this study provided insights into experiences not readily available to those who do not speak Spanish.

Using social media to examine social movements and marginalized identities is a relatively new research approach and could be used in other endeavors. The use of social media artifacts also provides methodological guidance for future research. The use of 21st-century artifacts from new forms of media require new methodologies for different contextual orientations and purposes, such as education. This study might help develop new methodologies to conduct such research. It also provides some new insights on UndocuQueer experiences that illuminate current understandings of UndocuQueer intersectionality. Thus, it identifies some UndocuQueer experiences that need further research.
Recommendations

The results of this study have educative implications in contexts inside and outside of traditional schooling settings. One of these is joy. In artifacts such as “Homoland Security” and “Because Frida Told Me So,” there are portrayals of playfulness and celebration of UndocuQueer identities. Rather than shaming, pathologizing, or hiding their identities, UndocuQueer people are portrayed as celebrating, embracing, and being decidedly visible in artistic portrayals. The artifacts demonstrate that supporting UndocuQueer identities demand engaging in the joy the UndocuQueer artifacts articulate. The implications for educators is to caution against pathologizing or portraying UndocuQueer individuals and their experiences as pitiable or tragic.

Taking direction from the artifacts, educators should embrace celebrating UndocuQueer people. One way to do this is to engage in humor. This is not flippant humor, unnecessary sarcasm, or humor for humor’s sake. Nor is this to condone or sustain negative attitudes or stereotypes about cultural groups in the name of humor. Rather, encouraging students to find the humorous and positive aspects in the portrayals of their culture in assignments and inviting humor as an authentic way to engage in classroom discourse could create learning environments where UndocuQueer identities are celebrated.

Connected to humor is irony. UndocuQueer artifacts present ironic elements in Salgado’s “Arrest Ice” and “Undocumented and Awkward Episode 7.” These artifacts suggest that UndocuQueer people engage in irony to celebrate visibility and to facilitate activism about increasing their rights. Using this type of irony in school settings demands engaging in deep analysis of context, because it cannot be cursorily assessed. This provides opportunities for educators to help students to simultaneously engage their academic and personal ironies they portray and detect in their own cultural contexts. Creating opportunities for these analyses can
help students practice high-order thinking about the contexts and meanings of the multiple layers of their own identities. This deep self-knowledge could create more understanding of the complexities of UndociQueer experiences and marginalities among their peers.

The findings of this study suggest that sexuality is a necessary and embraced component of UndociQueer identity and expression. In “Beyond Dreams,” Salgado openly embraces sexuality with his half-naked body and provocative pose. Because UndociQueer artifacts do not shy away from embracing overt sexuality this suggests that educators should acknowledge and appropriately engage in studies of sexuality. This means not denying that UndociQueer identities include sexual desires and practices. Therefore, educators should help students engage in open and frank discussions of sexuality that are appropriate for the age level of their students. Creating a climate that openly affirms rather than denying or criminalizing sexual identities might help UndociQueer youth feel more welcomed in a school setting.

Other curricular reforms could help accommodate and support UndociQueer youth. In social studies education, the normative expectation of citizenship is challenged by UndociQueer identity. UndociQueer artifacts could be used to challenge students’ thinking about the complexities and responsibilities of citizenship. Care should be made in making sure UndociQueer youth are not outed about their documentation status without their consent. In the current political climate, educators should be careful not to unduly harm students by publically exposing their documentation status. Educators could enrich their classroom instruction about UndociQueer issues by using artifacts such as Yosimar Reyes’s poetry in English language arts classes.

The hidden curriculum is another area for incorporating UndociQueer identities into teaching and learning. UndociQueer artifacts suggest that certain assumptions, attitudes, and
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

actions in schooling create oppressive experiences. Assumptions about normative gender, sexuality, and documentation status are particularly salient in sites of inequitable practices that affect UndocuQueer people in schooling. Teachers should examine the implications of their instruction for making it more inclusive, and for not perpetuating marginalization. Is their bathroom policy equitable to multiple genders? Do their classroom decorations and room layout favor one group over another? Perhaps being more adaptive and analytical of self-knowledge will do less harm to UndocuQueer students.

A paradigmatic shift away from framing immigrant students as primarily language learners may help improve school-based supports for UndocuQueer youth. State-level data collection on Queer students rather than relying on GLSEN and other non-governmental agencies could help to better identify Queer students and determine how to respond to their needs more effectively. Curricular reforms that include insider Queer voices and perspectives also are needed. Since these identities and experiences are multidimensional, curricular content and instructional strategies should include cognitive, emotional, social, political, psychological, personal, and collective competencies. For example, the findings of this study might provide background for developing scripts that support UndocuQueer youth in schools, and help ameliorate feelings of liminality for these youth.

Teacher education is also an important avenue for supporting UndocuQueer students in schools. Teacher education programs should include consideration of UndocuQueer youth in coursework, along with knowledge of why and how school-based supports, such as Gay-Straight Alliances, are important for creating safe and affirming learning environments. UndocuQueer people might be more fully supported in the schooling system if teachers are trained to routinely consider cultural contexts and multiple marginalities. Some scholars such as Ovando, Combs,
and Collier (2006), and Kolano and King (2015) recognize the value of including techniques in preservice teacher education for supporting ELL and other immigrant students, and reframing their identities, experiences, families, and cultures. This continued work could be beneficial for UndocuQueer youth.

Educators are not exclusively located in K-12 school systems. Higher education and non-teaching contexts can benefit UndocuQueer people, too. The findings of this study can help higher education faculty to adjust their curriculum to include intersectional identities; critique normative assumptions about students; and revise syllabi and course expectations accordingly to monitor classroom discourses that harass or marginalize UndocuQueer people. The artifacts used in this study also could illuminate reforms and practices that could support UndocuQueer people in higher education. Intersectional identities also could be supported by adjusting language on brochures and websites to include the intersections of gender and sexuality. Diversity recruitment and retention efforts in higher education as well can benefit from incorporating UndocuQueer perspectives in their decision-making and outreach efforts.

Education does not only occur in schooling contexts. There are educative efforts in ongoing professional development and other workplace settings. UndocuQueer people do not cease being in the world once they have graduated or transitioned out of their formal school settings. The findings of this study can help expand professional development efforts such as diversity trainings, new worker orientations, and equal opportunity programs. Professionals who work in direct service jobs with people who are UndocuQueer—especially in law, medicine, and social work—could benefit from using UndocuQueer artifacts and contexts. These could improve techniques used in hiring practices, policies, and worker benefits. As the “Osito”
episode “Dat DACAmented Life” suggests, UndocuQueer people have complex feelings of liminality about their rights to work.

The UndocuQueer movement demonstrates that the intersectionalities of race, ethnicity, sexuality, gender, and documentation status are important identities that young people carry with them into their schooling experiences, and are often marginalized because of them. In order to understand these experiences better, new identity development models are needed. Currently, there is no major theory on Queer-inclusive identity development. The findings of this study suggest that some identity development models may be enhanced by Queer intersectionality. Liminality should be included in these models. These identity development models can help practitioners in create supportive and affirming schooling environments for Queer youth, and help researchers understand and test assertions about Queer identity contexts for UndocuQueer youth. For example, an identity development model could help researchers understand how UndocuQueer immigrant students experience Queer identity development differently from their domestic peers.

There also is a need for more interdisciplinary work on Queerness between education scholars and their colleagues in gender studies, sociology, ethnic studies, political science, and psychology. Scholarship about gender and sexuality, transnational issues, and youth activism can be incorporated more seamlessly into educational considerations when more collaborations across disciplines are enacted.

The field of education extends beyond traditional academic scholarship to include practitioner-oriented and practitioner-led research, teaching, and learning. Among these extensions are action research, policy development, and various assistants who work daily and directly with UndocuQueer youth. Including their perspectives in future research, scholarship,
and teaching will be enlightening and enhancing for those who are involved directly in providing services and supports for these youth.

While this study focused on Latinx communities and UndocuQueer experiences, there are other undocumented communities that are engaging in national-level identity activism and agency. One of these is the UndocuBlack movement. This primarily online and social media-driven activist movement has similar origins and functions as the UndocuQueer movement. Both are influenced by the United We Dream movement. UndocuBlack activism includes testimonios and storytelling that should be carefully studied. The results could complement the findings of this study and provide a more complex portrayal of the overall UndocuQueer movement. UndocuBlack activism also could illuminate the fact that undocumented people come from many parts of the world, not just Latin America, as many mainstream views in the U.S. seem to assume. Moving beyond Latinx narratives in future research will help broaden and enrich understanding of the multifaceted, multicultural, and multiracial nature of UndocuQueer experiences.

Not enough is known about UndocuQueer people and youth, and how to best serve their identity and educational needs. Research such as this study may help researchers and practitioners to better understand and serve this community. There are pedagogies enacted in the UndocuQueer movement that are insightful and may be worthy of emulation by teachers in schools. Educators can learn more about a community by understanding its issues and ideologies as embedded in and transmitted through artifacts. This study highlights the complex world at play in the UndocuQueer movement. The insights revealed about challenges of identity development and lived experiences are paramount to maximizing the psycho-emotional well-
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

being, sociopolitical agency, and human dignity, individually and collectively, of UndocuQueer people.

A Future Closer to Now

It is impossible to predict with certainty what the future holds for UndocuQueer people. Given the current political climate in U.S. politics, and uncertainty of programs such as DACA and Temporary Protected Status (TPS), the options for UndocuQueer people to remain in the United States free from law enforcement harassment, and having access to work documentation, and state-sponsored services are indeterminate. While legal advances like Obergefell v. Hodges (2015) have ensured some legal rights for some members of the Queer community, many more are needed to serve all UndocuQueer people. As more visibility increases, legal, social, and cultural changes may follow. That UndocuQueer experiences are under-researched by educators suggests opportunities for reform in teacher preparation and practice, changes to curriculum, teacher practice, and social change broadly. Policy has been the site of social change and major protections for UndocuQueer people, yet they may have little effect on their everyday school-based realities. Researchers are encouraged to examine school-based experiences of UndocuQueer people and youth to better understand and determine what interventions and practices serve them best.

Furthermore, educational practices need to incorporate intersectionality beyond race and ethnicity, and Queer immigrant youth beyond ELL. The UndocuQueer movement suggests that there are pressing needs to make visible and change paradigms and practices to ensure better futures for UndocuQueer youth in schools and communities.

Queerness is dynamic. UndocuQueer identities are dynamic. The UndocuQueer movement is dynamic. This study provided snapshots of some of this dynamism through
selected authors, artists, and artifacts. Other researchers may find confirming, conflicting, and even innovative results in future investigations. Hopefully they will critically interrogate the present and future findings. There are many more voices in here, now, and next that this study was not able to consider. Today’s butterflies might yield to more powerful metaphors in the future. Hopefully listening to, considering, and making social and educational changes will be made that build a more welcoming and empowering future for UndocuQueer people.
References


BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION


BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION


doi:10.1177/0042085917721953


BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION


BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION


BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION


BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION


BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION


BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION


### Appendix A: Artifact Notes Protocol

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Title</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Speakers</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What are the key features? What is the story here?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What are my reactions to this story/how do I interact with this story?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What are the implications for schooling?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Connections to other artifacts</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Connections to research literature</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>What have I noticed in subsequent viewings/encounters?</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
</table>

123
### Appendix B: UndocuQueer Artifacts for Analysis

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Artifact Category</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Author</th>
<th>Year</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Artwork</td>
<td>Arrest ICE</td>
<td>Julio Salgado</td>
<td>no date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Manos Arriba</td>
<td>Julio Salgado</td>
<td>no date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Beyond Dreams</td>
<td>Julio Salgado</td>
<td>no date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Homoland Security</td>
<td>Julio Salgado</td>
<td>no date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Migration is Beautiful</td>
<td>Julio Salgado</td>
<td>no date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No LGBTQ Exclusion</td>
<td>Julio Salgado</td>
<td>no date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>No Sir I will not show you my papers</td>
<td>Julio Salgado</td>
<td>no date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Selena Inspired</td>
<td>Julio Salgado</td>
<td>no date</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Save Ethnic Studies. Save Our Stories.</td>
<td>Julio Salgado</td>
<td>2011</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Queer Butterfly</td>
<td>Julio Salgado</td>
<td>2013</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Queerce</td>
<td>Julio Salgado</td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>What Future? The Present is all I see</td>
<td>Julio Salgado</td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Despite the pain</td>
<td>Julio Salgado</td>
<td>2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Destroy White Supremacy</td>
<td>Julio Salgado</td>
<td>2015</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Border Gay</td>
<td>Julio Salgado</td>
<td>2016</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>For Colored Boys Who Speak Softly</td>
<td>Yosimar Reyes</td>
<td>2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Queer Atzlan</td>
<td>Yosimar Reyes</td>
<td>2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>R(e)volution</td>
<td>Yosimar Reyes</td>
<td>2008</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Silent no longer</td>
<td>Yosimar Reyes</td>
<td>2008</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Other Texts</th>
<th>Papers</th>
<th>Salgado, Illustrator</th>
<th>2012</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Legalities of Being</td>
<td>Collab. With Reyes</td>
<td>2012</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>The Ashes</td>
<td></td>
<td>2014</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Video</th>
<th>Papers</th>
<th>Feature-length documentary; dir. A Galisky</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undocumented and Awkward Ep. 7</td>
<td>Dreamers Adrift</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>For Colored Boys</td>
<td>Yosimar Reyes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Dreamers Adrift Ep. 8</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undocumented and Awkward Ep. 7</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undocumented and Awkward Ep. 9</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undocumented and Awkward Ep. 10</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undocumented and Awkward Ep. 12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Undocumented and Awkward 2.0 Ep 1</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Osito Ep. 11</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Osito Ep. 12</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Appendix C: Curriculum Vitae

A Longoria
anthony.longoria@me.com

Education

Candidate in Philosophy (ABD)
Curriculum and Instruction: Multicultural Education
University of Washington, Seattle

Dissertation Title: Beyond butterflies: The UndocuQueer movement, intersectionality, and implications for education
Supervisory Committee: Geneva Gay, chair; Wayne Au, Dafney Blanca Dabach, Veronica Velez, and Amanda Swarr

Master in Teaching - 2010
Secondary Education
Seattle University

Bachelor of Arts in English (concentration in literature);
Minor in History - 2008
San Francisco State University

Washington State Residency Teaching Certificate with endorsements in English language arts, history, and social studies

Teaching Experience

Instructor – Western Washington University, Woodring College of Education, Secondary Education Department – 2015- present
  • Full-time, Non-Tenure Track Faculty, 2016-2018
    o Affiliated faculty, Education and Social Justice Minor
    o Instructor for core equity and methods courses in Master in Teaching and undergraduate teacher education program
    o Instructor for Education and Social Justice minor courses
  • Instructor for SEC 411 Philosophical Foundations of Education, Autumn 2015
    o Undergraduate-level course in philosophy of education
    o Students engage critically with current educational policy and practices
    o Designed course and adapted for teacher education students’ needs
  • Instructor for SEC 512 Seminar in Philosophy of Education, Winter 2016
  • Instructor for SEC 426 Social Studies Methods, Spring 2016
BEYOND BUTTERFLIES: THE UNDOCUQUEER MOVEMENT, INTERSECTIONALITY, AND IMPLICATIONS FOR EDUCATION

• Instructor for FAIR 314 Critical Pedagogy, Spring 2016

Pre-doctoral Teaching Associate - University of Washington, Seattle - Teacher Education Program, College of Education - 2013-2016
• 0.75 FTE, Co-instructor for English Language Arts (ELA) methods course, Fall 2014
  o Prepared students for unit planning and advanced methods
  o Incorporated student-generated case studies and workshop approach
• 0.5 FTE, TA for ELA methods course 2013-2015.
  o Advocated for and designed Queer issues in the ELA classroom component.
  o Lead taught and co-taught multiple class sessions
• Served as university supervisor for 6 teacher candidates in ELA and social studies.
  o Formally evaluates and provides improvement feedback for teacher candidates.
  o Assists students in preparing for edTPA
  o Engages in instructional coaching
  o Attends, co-facilitates, and co-presents multiple weekly professional learning community meetings for instructional coaches
• Reviewed applications and interviews incoming applicants.

Graduate Student Instructor, University of Washington, Seattle - Teacher Education Program, College of Education – Summer 2013; Summer 2014; Summer 2015; Summer 2016
• 0.5 FTE
• Taught one section of graduate-level course Multicultural Teaching for secondary teacher candidates, Summer 2013.
• Co-taught two sections of Multicultural Teaching, Summer 2014
• Incorporated and advocated for inclusion of focus, readings, and instructional activities on Queer issues in Education
• Facilitated reflection section for field-based seminar in addition to instructor duties (2013).

Adjunct Faculty - Seattle University, College of Education – 2013-2015
• Instructor for EDUC 520 Social Justice in Professional Practice, Autumn 2013, Winter 2014, Autumn 2014
  o Foundational graduate-level, all-college required course in social justice
  o Students in school counseling, community counseling, special education, teaching English as a second or other language, school administration, and school psychology programs
  o Weekly use of online learning management software to enrich classroom learning (course is not online or distance learning).
Students engage in deep thinking about their identity, client/student identity, critical social justice applications in their profession, critical engagement with communities, and cross-cultural learning.

- Co-instructor for TEED 5022 Culturally Responsive Teaching, Master in Teaching course, Winter 2015, Spring 2015
  - Second of 2-course series
  - Students pursuing elementary and secondary endorsements
  - 10 class hours embedded in larger general methods course

Teacher – Garfield High School, Seattle, WA – 2010-2012
- Taught Advanced Placement (AP) World History (9-10), United States History (11-12), and Honors World Literature and Composition (10).
- Instruction served urban school with students in gifted-education, students of color, and students served by IEPs and 504 plans.
- Incorporated development of writing skills, critical thinking, and use of visual culture, intellectual history, and multicultural perspectives into lessons presented.
- In first year teaching AP World History (3 sections, 79 students), 80% received score of 3 or better (national average is 50%). Students consistently scored higher than the national average throughout service.
- Served as cooperating teacher for Seattle University MIT observation and peer-coaching interns.
- Served as cooperating teacher for University of Washington-hosted teacher education exchange student from Norway completing three-month teaching internship in world history.
- Collaborated with Seattle University faculty and students to create a civil rights service-learning project with US History class.
  - Students interviewed community elders and presented oral history research to Seattle University Master in Teaching (MIT) students and faculty.

- Paschal Sherman Indian School is a rural K-9 school in north-central Washington that serves the Confederated Tribes of the Colville Reservation.
- Taught seventh, eighth, and ninth-grade writing classes
- Taught sixth-grade reading class (for gifted students).
- Students earned higher WASL (HSPE) scores in writing over previous year’s cohort.
- Received emergency credential at request of school.
- Volunteer service qualified for Americorps Education Award.
Publications and Papers Presented at Peer-Reviewed Conferences


Presentations at Practitioner and Regional Conferences


Han, J. & **Longoria, A.** (2013). Transforming schools into culturally responsive communities. Seminars in English. Chongqing, China: Southwest University (西南大学).