INFORMATION TO USERS

This manuscript has been reproduced from the microfilm master. UMI films the text directly from the original or copy submitted. Thus, some thesis and dissertation copies are in typewriter face, while others may be from any type of computer printer.

The quality of this reproduction is dependent upon the quality of the copy submitted. Broken or indistinct print, colored or poor quality illustrations and photographs, print bleedthrough, substandard margins, and improper alignment can adversely affect reproduction.

In the unlikely event that the author did not send UMI a complete manuscript and there are missing pages, these will be noted. Also, if unauthorized copyright material had to be removed, a note will indicate the deletion.

Oversize materials (e.g., maps, drawings, charts) are reproduced by sectioning the original, beginning at the upper left-hand corner and continuing from left to right in equal sections with small overlaps. Each original is also photographed in one exposure and is included in reduced form at the back of the book.

Photographs included in the original manuscript have been reproduced xerographically in this copy. Higher quality 6" x 9" black and white photographic prints are available for any photographs or illustrations appearing in this copy for an additional charge. Contact UMI directly to order.
Analyzing free jazz

Westendorf, Lynette, D.M.A.

University of Washington, 1994

Copyright ©1994 by Westendorf, Lynette. All rights reserved.
Analyzing Free Jazz

by

Lynette Westendorf

A dissertation submitted in partial fulfillment
of the requirements for the degree of

Doctor of Musical Arts

University of Washington

1994

Approved by

(Chairperson of Supervisory Committee)

Program Authorized
to Offer Degree  School of Music

Date  May 18, 1994
In presenting this dissertation in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Doctoral degree at the University of Washington, I agree that the Library shall make its copies freely available for inspection. I further agree that extensive copying of this dissertation is allowable only for scholarly purposes, consistent with "fair use" as prescribed in the U.S. Copyright Law. Requests for copying or reproduction of this dissertation may be referred to University Microfilms, 1490 Eisenhower Place, P.O. Box 975, Ann Arbor, MI, 48106, to whom the author has granted "the right to reproduce and sell (a) copies of the manuscript in microform and/or (b) printed copies of the manuscript made from microform."

Signature ____________________________

Date May 23, 1994
University of Washington

Abstract

Analyzing Free Jazz

by Lynette Westendorf

Chairperson of the Supervisory Committee: Professor Richard Karpen
School of Music

More than thirty years after the first experiments in free jazz, this style of music is still little known outside of a small circle of admirers. In spite of its influence on the larger field of jazz and on the foundation of jazz studies programs in many institutions, free jazz does not yet enjoy a long tradition of serious attention in scholarly circles, due perhaps to the improvised nature of the music, the tendency of free jazz practitioners to defy categorization, and difficulties in separating the music from historical events, particularly the civil rights movement and the development of black nationalism.

Analyzing Free Jazz is not intended to be a comprehensive history of the free jazz movement or of the work of any individual artist, but rather an examination of several stylistically diverse works within their respective cultural contexts, as well as a documentation of the process of examination. The first two chapters provide a background to the analyses and address a variety of topics, including the origin and influence of free jazz and its relationship to the blues and earlier jazz styles; early innovators and a general description of various musicians' methodologies; later and current free jazz practitioners, including some of the lesser-known figures; the black nationalist
movement and other political factors surrounding the development and criticism of free jazz; the treatment of free jazz in scholarly literature and brief descriptions of important publications; the techniques of traditional jazz; and a discussion of analytical techniques appropriate to jazz. Chapters 3 through 5 provide analytical treatment of three works: Ornette Coleman's "Lonely Woman" (1959), John Coltrane's "India" (1961), and Cecil Taylor's Indent: "Second Layer" (1973). Each composition is examined in its entirety, utilizing transcriptions, diagrams, and some graphic representations. Emphasis is placed on rhythmic treatment, method of development, formal structure, and the use of contrast. Also discussed is Coleman's concept of harmolodic theory, Coltrane's adaptation of Indian aesthetic and technique, and the poem which accompanies Taylor's work.
# TABLE OF CONTENTS

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Section</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>List of Figures</td>
<td>ii</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part I. Background</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 1 - Free Jazz: Its Origin and Influence</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Early Innovators</td>
<td>2</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Description and Method</td>
<td>5</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>The Roots of Free Jazz</td>
<td>11</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Black Nationalism and Free Jazz</td>
<td>16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Later and Current Practitioners of Free Jazz</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 2 - Formulation of Analytical Method</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Free Jazz in the Scholarly Literature</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Techniques of Traditional Jazz</td>
<td>40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Analytical Techniques Appropriate to Jazz</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part II. Analytical Applications</td>
<td>61</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 3 - Ornette Coleman: &quot;Lonely Woman&quot;</td>
<td>62</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 4 - John Coltrane: &quot;India&quot;</td>
<td>83</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 5 - Cecil Taylor: <em>Indent</em> - &quot;Second Layer&quot;</td>
<td>125</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Time Line</td>
<td>133</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><em>Indent</em> (the poem)</td>
<td>154</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Chapter 6 - Summary and Conclusions</td>
<td>156</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bibliography</td>
<td>165</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix A - &quot;India&quot;</td>
<td>175</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Preface to the Compositions</td>
<td>185</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix B - &quot;Bleysphemous and Hadenistic&quot;</td>
<td>188</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Appendix C - &quot;Sestina Kyrie&quot;</td>
<td>227</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
**LIST OF FIGURES**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Number</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>3.1</td>
<td>Ornette Coleman's &quot;Lonely Woman&quot;</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.2</td>
<td>(a) Subdivision of measures within the formal outline of &quot;Lonely Woman&quot;</td>
<td>68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>(b) Subdivision of measures within the solo</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.3</td>
<td>Alto sax voice leading and registral transfer</td>
<td>69</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.4</td>
<td>Alto sax melody at second ending</td>
<td>70</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.5</td>
<td>Imperfect unisons between sax and cornet</td>
<td>72</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.6</td>
<td>Free rhythmic pace in &quot;Lonely Woman&quot;</td>
<td>73</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.7</td>
<td>Motivic evolution in Coleman's solo</td>
<td>75</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.1</td>
<td>Gesture-types in John Coltrane's &quot;India&quot;</td>
<td>92</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.2</td>
<td>Head of Coltrane's &quot;India&quot;</td>
<td>96</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.3</td>
<td>Gestures 1-5</td>
<td>97</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.4</td>
<td>Gestures 1-5 with graphic representation</td>
<td>99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.5</td>
<td>Gesture 1 and variation</td>
<td>100</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.6</td>
<td>Variations on mixolydian gestures</td>
<td>101</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.7</td>
<td>Gestures following the head in &quot;India&quot;</td>
<td>102</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.8</td>
<td>Gestural embellishment of the head</td>
<td>103</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.9</td>
<td>Coltrane's practice of motivic expansion</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4.10</td>
<td>Mixolydian modality combined with chromaticism</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

I would like to express my appreciation to Professors Richard Karpen, Jonathan Bernard, Diane Thome, William O. Smith, and Sandra Bordin for their participation in behalf of this dissertation. I am especially indebted to Jonathan Bernard for his direction, insight, and editorial expertise, and to Richard Karpen for his unfailing artistic integrity. Thanks to Gregory Davis and Roger Lewis for their careful reading of "Bleysphemous and Hadenistic," to composers Ken Benshoof and Sumiko Sato, and to poet Carolyn Kremers. Many friends and associates expressed their encouragement and interest in the research portion of this dissertation, several of whom carefully read my drafts and generously offered their own expertise: particularly, Chuck Smart (former Dean of Students at Antioch College while Cecil Taylor was there in 1973); members of Chris Waterman's Jazz Readings seminar (Robert Reigle, Andy Bartlett, Ken Morrison, and Christian Asplund); Alice Coltrane and Elizabeth Hoffman. For expertise and the suggestion of important resources, thanks go to Marc Seales, Ed Pias, and Richard Nunemaker. I would especially like to thank my parents, Richard and Berniece Westendorf, my Grandmother, and my brothers for their continued faith and encouragement over the years. Finally, this work is dedicated to my husband and son, Richard and Reuben Hart, whose enduring interest, loving support, and good cheer have made my work easier.

Analyzing Free Jazz is written with the intention of informing a broad range of readers, from scholars specializing in jazz, to scholars who usually work in other kinds of music, as well as jazz (and other) musicians who know the repertoire well. It is my hope that this work will also be informative for the interested lay reader.

* * *
Previously published material is reprinted by kind permission of the copyright holders as follows:

"Lonely Woman" by Ornette Coleman, © 1960 by MJQ Music, Inc. Used by permission.

"India" by John Coltrane, © 1977 by JOWCOL Music. Used by permission.

Transcription for soprano saxophone of "India" (WJC-198), © 1973 by Andrew's Musical Enterprises, Inc. Used by permission.


PART I. BACKGROUND
CHAPTER 1

FREE JAZZ: ITS ORIGIN AND INFLUENCE

Early Innovators

The innovation of free jazz as an offshoot of the jazz genre is most frequently attributed to saxophonist Ornette Coleman as a result of his 1960 release of *Free Jazz*, the composer's only attempt at large-scale structural unity and, in spite of a mostly fixed tempo, a monumental effort to break away from previous stylistic, formal, and thematic norms. The recording features a double quartet of two woodwinds (Coleman on alto sax, Eric Dolphy on bass clarinet), two trumpets (Don Cherry, Freddie Hubbard), two basses (Scott LaFaro, Charlie Haden), and two drummers (Billie Higgins, Ed Blackwell). A 36-minute extended improvisation recorded without prior rehearsal, overdubbing or splicing, *Free Jazz* combines collective improvisation with individual solos, accompanied by the improvised support of the fellow players. Both solo and accompaniment are guided entirely by the interplay between the members of the ensemble; solo and accompaniment frequently mesh, resulting in a variety of contrasting textures and occasional erratic transitions.

Ornette Coleman's background provides an interesting backdrop for his experiments in freedom. A largely self-taught musician hailing from Fort Worth, Texas (b. 1930), he began writing in his teens, but his unorthodox style, experiments in intonation, and efforts to create a new sound more often than not alienated other
musicians and prospective employers. In the late 1950s, after several years of scuffling in road bands and irregular day work, he became acquainted with a group of musicians in Los Angeles, including Don Cherry, Charlie Haden, and Billy Higgins. A mutual interest in Coleman's compositions and his attempts at freedom of expression resulted in two recordings, *Something Else!* (1958) and *The Shape of Jazz to Come* (1959). An extended New York engagement in 1959 received both scorn and praise, but the latter from the likes of Leonard Bernstein, Gunther Schuller, and John Lewis helped launch Coleman's career.¹

Coleman's instrumental and stylistic influence grew until it extended well into the jazz community, particularly to saxophone players like Pharoah Sanders, Archie Shepp, and John Coltrane. John Coltrane was born in 1926 in North Carolina, and spent his formative years with rhythm-and-blues bands until he joined Dizzy Gillespie in 1949. His individuality first began to show with Miles Davis in 1955, his brash sound a remarkable contrast to Davis' trumpet. The next five years were spent mostly with Davis and Thelonious Monk². By the early 1960s he was a formidable figure on the jazz scene, known for extending the technical limits of harmonic improvisation and for the

¹Free jazz and aleatoric avant-garde music have much in common, including the rejection of fixed norms of structure, direction, tonality, and theme. The philosophies of John Cage and Ornette Coleman regarding freedom of expression and negation of predetermined musical outcome are remarkably similar. Cage's denial of personal intention and his introduction of indeterminacy coincide closely with Coleman's harmolodic theory, which regards all artistic components as entirely equal, without fixed order, key, sequence, or tempo.

²This period of time (1956-57) is one of importance in Coltrane's personal life. Fighting an alcohol and drug addiction, he was fired by Miles Davis for arriving drunk at a gig, after which he was consumed for several months in addiction. In mid-1957, he went through withdrawal and thereafter proclaimed his spiritual awakening, one which made a significant impression on his artistic output.
introduction of non-western techniques. His interest in free jazz came from a constant, innate desire for a new approach to playing and culminated in the recording of *Ascension* (1965), a forty-minute long turbulent collective improvisation (featuring seven horns, including two additional tenor saxcs, two bassists and drummer) that exuberantly brandishes Coltrane's "sheets of sound" technique.\(^3\) The chapter titles of John Litweiler's *The Freedom Principle: Jazz After 1958* are appropriate here. The chapter on Ornette Coleman is called "The Birth of Freedom", the chapter devoted to Coltrane "The Passion for Freedom."\(^4\) Furthermore, Coltrane's influence extends far beyond the early development of free jazz; he fulfilled the role of a pioneer for the so-called "second generation,"\(^5\) and his influence is still felt more than twenty-five years after his death in 1967 at the age of forty.

One other driving force in the avant-garde jazz movement comes from a strikingly different background, that of the conservatory. Pianist Cecil Taylor (b. 1933) received his training at the New York College of Music and the New England Conservatory, following a childhood of intensive study. His first influences came from early-century European composers, the impressionists, Bartók and Stravinsky, his introduction to the

---

\(^3\)Coltrane's "sheets of sound," a term coined by jazz critic Ira Gitler in "John Coltrane: "Trane on the Track," *Down Beat*, Vol. 25, No. 21 (October 16, 1958): 17, involved extreme velocity of playing, aggressive slurred arpeggios, harsh attacks, relentless bold tone, and apparent frantic effort to play every possible intervallic combination. Coltrane often used modal scales, incorporating the extreme ranges of the instrument and irregular metric divisions of the bar.


\(^5\)Ekkehard Jost, *Free Jazz* (Graz, Austria: Universal Edition, 1974), p. 11. Although Jost does not specifically name the members of the "second generation," horn players Pharoah Sanders, Archie Shepp, John Tchicai, Albert Ayler, Wayne Shorter, Joe Henderson, and Roscoe Mitchell are but a few who were influenced greatly by Coltrane.
world of jazz coming as a young adult. Two pianists who made an early impression on him were Lennie Tristano and Dave Brubeck, for their sense of line and harmonic density respectively.\(^6\) But his later introduction to the bebop school of Bud Powell and Horace Silver proved to be a far greater influence. A pianist of extraordinary technical facility, Taylor actually began his experimental stage in the mid-1950s when he used jazz ballads as points of departure for his intensely percussive and energetic improvisations. His greatest contribution to the new music was his abandonment of typical rhythmic patterns associated with swing, the repetitive rhythms instead replaced by raw energy. More than any other free jazz artist, Cecil Taylor consciously blends the original African-American roots of jazz with modern European musical development.

**Description and Method**

Jazz becomes "free" when accepted modes of rhythm, harmony, form, and melody are abandoned in favor of streams of inventive improvisation. In an ensemble environment, this occurs over a collective of rhythmic support, seemingly unrehearsed and themeless (in the traditional sense), held together primarily by the sensitivities of the musicians.\(^7\) Not unlike what had already taken place in western art music, free jazz artists began to think of prior musical norms as too confining and thus abandoned them in effort

---

\(^6\)Jost, *Free Jazz*, p. 67.

\(^7\)While extended free improvisation is fundamental to free jazz, the *modus operandi* of the composition or performance may involve the use of predetermined melodic fragments, rhythmic, or harmonic cues to help determine the overall form and duration of a work. According to the liner notes for *Free Jazz*, the guide for each soloist was a brief ensemble part which introduced him and which gave him an area of music pitch (Ornette Coleman, *Free Jazz* (Atlantic 1364-2); liner notes by Martin Williams). This "ensemble part" was apparently what Coleman called "harmonic unison;" the idea was for the horns to play individual notes spaced registrally so as not to sound as harmonies but rather a different kind of "unison."
to expand the palette of the artist. Within the movement, however, some musicians were more than willing to incorporate aspects of older styles, but on their own terms. Some artists combine the free jazz manner of improvisation with other, contrasting types of music, such as folk melodies and indigenous music, as did the Native American saxophonist Jim Pepper and the former Moroccan-based pianist/composer Randy Weston. Carla Bley combines tonal and free jazz idiosyncratically, while Charlie Haden overtly uses his music as a vehicle for social and political statement. Over the past three decades, from the Coleman/Taylor/Coltrane roots of free jazz, jazz artists incorporating free improvisation have brought enormous variety to the genre.

As is true in most art music, formal and structural aspects of free jazz are difficult characteristics to define. Some observations can be made, however. Throughout jazz history, the use of extended forms has been rare. The norm has remained with works of short duration in simple forms, such as the A-A-B-A song form, variations on "theme-improvisation-theme" (jazz musicians prefer the term "head" instead of theme), and most commonly, the twelve-bar blues. This phenomenon is easily explained; after all, most jazz artists have had their roots in the blues, if not as part of the African-American community, then as observers of the musical traditions of it. The basic blues progression has taken many turns, from the classic blues of Billie Holiday and the country blues of Leadbelly to the regional styles of New Orleans (King Oliver), Chicago (Jelly Roll

---

8Some exceptions exist, however. Classically trained ragtime composer James P. Johnson wrote several extended works; his contemporary, Scott Joplin, who took great care to balance the formal aspects of his ragtime pieces, also wrote an opera. Duke Ellington, Mary Lou Williams, Dave Brubeck, and others have composed sacred music in larger forms, and Charles Mingus, band-leader, composer and bass player, has also written in extended forms.
Morton), or Kansas City (Count Basie). Indeed, the basic blues form was at the heart of the bebop and cool jazz of the 1940s and fifties, albeit with complex and varied development in harmony, melody, and phrasing.

The variety with which the revolution in jazz approached form and structure is well reflected in the work of Coleman, Coltrane, and Taylor. Prior to the recording of *Free Jazz*, Coleman remained loyal to the twelve-bar blues form, but clearly without the usual harmonic implications of the blues progression. He took, rather, a nondiatonic approach to harmony, centered "around" a given tone in nonfunctional usage; his melodies often feature irregular phrase lengths, nontempered intonation, and a strikingly conversational character. His improvisations often develop from small cell-like structures to chains of motives and do not always conform to the number of bars or chord changes laid out in the head. In "Congeniality" from *The Shape of Jazz to Come* (recorded one year before *Free Jazz*), a theme-improvisation-theme form is used. The atypical nature of the short theme is striking, consisting of short contrasting phrases in varied rhythms, stopped with fermatas and breaths. This tendency is more pronounced on "Lonely Woman," in which the hauntingly beautiful melody defies the meaning of bar line; this rhythmic implication, in tandem with melodic accents and phrasing, creates the elastic feel of the tune.9 The *Free Jazz* recording experiment was an attempt to create a new kind of extended work, the thirty-six minute duration in contrast to the typical five- to ten-

---

9Perhaps this was the quality of Coleman's music that prompted fellow saxophonist James Clay to comment that it was "written wrong" when Coleman would supply written scores with "odd combinations of notes per bar," as is cited in Valerie Wilmer, *As Serious as Your Life* (London: Serpent's Tail, 1992), p. 69. It is precisely this individual approach to music that contributed to the Coleman sound; he obeyed few conventions, notational or otherwise, but instead appeared to have heard the music in a distinct way.
minute length of most of his earlier tunes. Within the broad parameter of individual solos by members of the octet, Coleman devised a structure to accommodate a ten-minute solo for himself, five-minute solos for each of the other three winds, five minutes each for the bassists, and five minutes for the drummers to share. Tempo was to be maintained by the basses; the solo sections were separated by ensemble passages, some of which were written out, others featured the "harmonic unisons" discussed above. The players were provided with tonal material whose timing was not fixed; keen player interaction was of the essence and was in part accomplished by Coleman's improvised motivic chain-associations and the musicians' response. This hearkens back to the roots of jazz in call-and-response patterns. In spite of the absence of harmonic, rhythmic, and textural variety, the expressive aspect of the music is maintained remarkably well, due especially to Don Cherry and Eric Dolphy, whose facility within the style is particularly consistent and focused. Coleman's attempt to expand jazz structure was nothing less than groundbreaking, and afforded the musicians involved a forum for the development of their own ideas on extended form.

_Free Jazz_ can be considered as something of a prototype for John Coltrane's _Ascension_, recorded in 1965. Coltrane's improvisational style had already stepped beyond the bounds of traditional form and harmony. The utilization of modal material

---

9Martin Williams, liner notes for Coleman, _Free Jazz_ (Atlantic 1364-2).

10Jost, _Free Jazz_, p. 59.

11Lineup includes Coltrane, Pharoah Sanders, and Archie Shepp on tenors; Dewey Johnson and Freddie Hubbard (who also played on _Free Jazz_) on trumpets; Marion Brown and John Tchicai, altos; McCoy Tyner, piano; Art Davis and Jimmy Garrison on basses; and Elvin Jones on drums. Two takes were made.
along with his quest for intensity had expanded typical ideas of melody and instrumental timbre; the addition of brazen honking, squeals and shrieks, the extension of the upper partials, and force of delivery to his already bold tone marked Coltrane's sound. There are striking differences between the two composers and their large-scale experiments, however. *Free Jazz* is a polyphonic sum of the individual parts and their mutual interaction--each player's contribution can be clearly heard on its own and understood as such. In *Ascension*, however, the entire sound mass so overpowersingly dominates that any individuality detected seems almost coincidental. *Free Jazz* employs a single structural level created by the sequence of soloists and their manner of improvisational interaction; *Ascension* employs a collective improvisation/solo framework, superimposed by a modal structure that facilitates changes in rhythm, motion, and register.\(^{13}\) Moreover, the density created by the rhythmic, timbrel, and registral independence of the eleven players combined with the velocity and aggressive nature of the music does not make for easy listening--this is *not* pretty music.\(^{14}\) It is, however, music of extraordinary emotional content, a prime ingredient in successful efforts at free jazz improvisation.

A word on instrumentation is appropriate, specifically regarding the role of piano in free jazz. The traditional role of the piano, for the most part, has been harmonic. This is especially true of its use in jazz--along with the bass and drums, it is considered part of the rhythm section. Unlike the wind instruments used in jazz, the piano does not hold

---

\(^{13}\) Jost, *Free Jazz*, p. 88.

\(^{14}\) The full scope of Coltrane's diversity can be appreciated by also hearing the sheer beauty of his playing, for example on *My Favorite Things* (his use of soprano sax popularized the instrument) and *A Love Supreme*. 
the same potential for variety of tone color, nonfixed pitch representations, smears of
sound, overtone playing, etc., particularly at loud volumes or in tandem with thick texture.
While percussive use of the instrument is common in jazz, only rarely is it used in an
exploratory gestural way, perhaps due to the technical virtuosity demanded.\textsuperscript{15} In his work
with Coltrane, pianist McCoy Tyner would often lay out entirely during the saxophone
solo, partly because any harmonic or melodic support was either unnecessary or
unwanted, and also to avoid any conflicting direction in the music.\textsuperscript{16}

The one truly unique pianist of the style is Cecil Taylor, who must be considered
the champion of free jazz piano. With complex multi-layered melodies, clusters,
nonfunctional harmonies, and aggressive energy, he uniquely avoids any connection with
the traditional harmonic use of the instrument. Well familiar with the use of dissonance,
Taylor's first recording in 1956 preceded Ornette Coleman in the avant-garde; by the mid-
sixties, he had departed completely from the use of any aspect of jazz that was remotely
commercial, including rhythmic swing, bebop melodic articulation, or blues form. In
contrast with Coleman and Coltrane, whose free innovations were often either departures
from or hybrids of typical jazz "tunes" (the most notable exceptions being \textit{Free Jazz} and
\textit{Ascension}), Taylor's music contained no such remnant of the preceding generations'
influences. \textit{Early Evening} (oboe, trumpet, alto, piano, bells, two basses, drums) was

\textsuperscript{15}Some of the gestures and sound structures attempted in free jazz are not unlike those by the European
composers Boulez, Stockhausen and Barraqué, some of whose piano works demand the greatest of technical
skills. While their piano music has had modest success with certain virtuoso pianists, it is most often
written for either solo piano or piano with small ensembles.

\textsuperscript{16}Frank Kofsky, \textit{Black Nationalism and the Revolution in Music} (New York: Pathfinders Press, Inc.,
1970), p. 214 and p. 231 (in interviews with both McCoy Tyner and John Coltrane). Tyner reiterated this
recorded in 1966 and reveals diverse influences, from Stravinsky to Monk and Ellington. With it Taylor turns the free jazz method of collective improvisation into the sound of modern classical music, but delivered from the jazz musician’s methodology. A seemingly timeless multi-layering of angular polyphony, curtly articulated and non-goal oriented, gives this elegant work an "un-jazzy" sound, which prompted more than a few queries as to whether Taylor's music was really jazz, in spite of the composer's background, the compositional method, and community of musicians.\textsuperscript{17} In another composition, *Unit Structures* for alto, trumpet, bass clarinet, piano, two basses, drums (1966), Taylor marries spontaneity with precise formal construction by using short self-contained models that are repeated, extended, transposed, reversed, and interrupted by contrasting passages, sections for solo, and collective improvisation.\textsuperscript{18} Cecil Taylor’s music requires repeated listening to begin to penetrate its workings, as surface activity and intensity tend to obscure the formal design.

The Roots of Free Jazz

Free jazz is the product of both tradition and innovation. As with other developments in art, literature, science, and historical writing, succeeding generations of practitioners, although schooled and competent in their predecessors' styles and practices,

\textsuperscript{17}A word regarding the economics and politics of jazz at that time may be of interest. While composers under the roof of the classical tradition could receive support from universities and foundations, most jazz artists, and certainly the avant-garde of jazz, were still dependent exclusively upon the public. Taylor, and many other artists of the new music, had considerable difficulty maintaining a livelihood. There was also resentment within the black jazz community against racial bias. Even the enormously popular Duke Ellington, who performed numerous times abroad as a spokesman for American culture, became the subject of controversy when he was snubbed by the Pulitzer Prize committee in 1966. (See Kofsky, p. 10.)

\textsuperscript{18}A detailed analysis of *Unit Structures* is found in Jost, *Free Jazz*, pp. 78-83.
often feel little emotional bonding to earlier styles, a result of being removed from the actual development of them. While absolute rejection may not always be the case, a need to create something that answers the needs of the present generation of artists in its response to the world becomes the prime motivation for some. Simultaneously, there often exists a strong cultural bonding with one's artistic ancestors, as is the case with the European roots of art music in America. The same is true with free jazz musicians, whose roots can be traced back through the history of jazz to early African-American music on the continent.

The decade that preceded the free jazz revolution encompassed a multiplicity of expression. While free jazz can be seen as a reaction to the predictable and confining norms of the jazz tradition, that tradition itself was extremely diverse by the 1950s, claiming such styles as cool jazz, hard bop, swing, the new Afro-Cuban sound, mainstream, and the beginnings of its offshoot "third-stream." Jazz had become modern. Historians view these diversities in modern jazz in widely contrasting lights, depending upon their own points of view. For example, cool jazz is viewed by some as a refreshing departure from the bebop school, which is criticized for its complex harmonic changes, extended angular melodies, irregular phrasing, and excessively rapid tempi. On the other hand, hard bop is sometimes described as a reaction to the often bland nature of cool jazz, an endeavor to recapture emotional depth in the music. When cool jazz was developing on the West coast and hard bop on the East, various big swing bands were still criss-crossing the country in what was to become a futile effort to survive in the face of a diminishing market; the smaller ensembles of both bebop and cool jazz were in part a
necessary reaction to the difficult economics of trying to support large groups of musicians. Furthermore, the popularity of the jazz sound had led to the rediscovery of many earlier jazz and blues artists, in addition to the development of a commercial mainstream—singers, ensembles, and composers who straddled the fence between jazz and popular music.\(^{19}\)

There is another side to this historical coin, one that views jazz evolution in social, economic, and racial terms as well as artistic. Regarding the development of bebop in the 1940s, it is often said that bop was an African-American reaction to the increasing commercialization of swing. In turn, West coast jazz was a style that developed and was played mostly by white studio musicians based in Hollywood;\(^{20}\) this movement, from which came cool jazz, is often viewed as a reaction to bebop (notwithstanding the innovations of Miles Davis).\(^{21}\) While historians and critics decline to go so far as to label jazz or any single movement in jazz as the exclusive property of either a white or black community, there is one point of agreement—that jazz is an indigenous American art form, the invention of which is attributed to the African-American community.\(^{22}\)


\(^{20}\)Gordon, *West Coast Jazz*, p. 50.


The connecting thread found woven throughout the African-American jazz community and its various styles is that of the blues. Besides the twelve-bar form, there are other distinct characteristics of the blues that were assimilated into jazz—elements such as harmony (an atypical major/minor blend), rhythm (offbeat playing, rhythmic freedom and patterns of syncopation), melody (influenced by vocal gestures and inflections), variation (a combination of ornamentation and improvisation), improvisation, call-and-response patterns (rooted in work songs and shouts), the performing practice of taking "breaks" between phrases, and perhaps most important, emotion without sentimentality and with a sense of history. A sense of history in African-American terms, of course, includes slavery, menial work, poverty, discrimination, and disadvantage. Blues lyrics, among other things, are purveyors of oral tradition and often display hidden meaning—this is reminiscent not only of the Underground Railroad during slave times, but the tradition of African talking drums, intended to convey content that only insiders would understand.

According to historian Frank Tirro, "'Blues' refers to a style of music, a type of performance, a musical form, and a state of mind."

In fact, a grounding in the blues is frequently considered a prerequisite for authenticity in jazz.

The earliest recordings of the blues date from the 1920s, but even after the Civil War as the written history of African-American music began to develop,

Oral tradition suggests, since sound recordings are not available from this period, that black singers had inflections, rhythmic subtleties, distinct pitch,

---


vibrato, and timbrel elements that are closely akin to the vocal and instrumental sounds in the early days of jazz—sound qualities that differ substantially from those same elements as they appear in the European tradition.24

And while black musicians of the late nineteenth century also produced popular music (minstrelsy, ballads, vaudeville, brass bands), religious music (especially in the choral tradition), and art music (both symphonic and opera), it is the blues tradition, with its African roots, which most influenced the development of jazz, including the future of free jazz.

The marrying of the blues with jazz is well documented and beyond the scope of this paper. A few comments on the influence of the blues on free jazz specifically, however, are in order, especially regarding performance practice. Originally, to perform the blues meant to sing the blues. Even after the instrumental blues came into being, the melodic delivery carried many vocal inflections. One of the most influential aspects of blues singing style (and the instrumental blues melody line) is the separation of the melody line from elements of accompaniment, rhythm, and harmony, its freedom from exactness intended to enhance the emotional impact of the music. Not only is metric placement of the melody freely interpreted, so are the melodic figures themselves, in ornamental variation of the call-and-response feature. (This idea is particularly relevant to free jazz, as manifested in the development of collective independence, interpretive freedom, and extended instrumental technique.) Performance freedom in the blues also extends beyond vocal or melodic delivery and rhythmic interpretation. Even the twelve-

bar form is more of a guideline than a fixed entity—phrases are often truncated or extended to fit the lyrics, changes of harmony often happen in atypical places, and accents occur irregularly or shift from one verse to another. Instrumental breaks are not always of fixed length, but depend greatly upon the emotion of the song at any given time. This idea of expressivity is another critical element in free jazz, as is the idea of playing with a sense of history, which leads us to the relationship between the black nationalist movement of the 1960s and the development of free jazz.

**Black Nationalism and Free Jazz**

To suggest that there was any single cohesive political philosophy that existed among members of the free jazz community would be a mistake, considering their varied personalities, backgrounds, and experiences. But to dismiss the effects that the turbulent political climate in the United States of the late 1950s and sixties played upon the artists of the day would be to ignore a vital link to the understanding of the era and its art.

Jazz has always served as an expression of people and of their environment.²⁵ Nearly all writers of jazz history mention this living connection between jazz artists and their communities, and the conscious effort by musicians to reflect both physical and cultural realities in their music. It has been argued that the continued isolation of African-Americans as a society (particularly after Emancipation, in communities such as New Orleans' Storyville, Chicago's South Side and New York's Harlem) significantly contributed to the cohesive development of music as a vital aspect of culture rather than

---
as a commodity. It has also been argued that the dominant culture's willingness to embrace the art of African-Americans but not the people themselves reflects a perpetuation of the "blacks as property" mentality. Nearly a century after Emancipation, African-Americans living in the ghettos and projects in the 1940s, fifties, and sixties were still keenly aware of discrimination in education, voting rights, public access, employment, housing, transportation, health care, and political equity. As bebop of the 1940s developed during World War II, the country was witnessing the first large-scale civil rights activities—demonstrations in Washington for equal employment, insurrections in Harlem and Detroit, and united protests against the blatant racism of Jim Crow laws.\textsuperscript{26}

The 1950s saw the NAACP suit in Brown vs. the Board of Education (decided by the Supreme Court in 1954), the Montgomery bus boycott, the rise of the late Dr. Martin Luther King, Jr. (1956), and the Little Rock, Arkansas, school-integration crisis in 1957.\textsuperscript{27} Internationally, people were keenly aware of events in Africa during the 1950s—the independence from colonial powers in Eritrea, Morocco, Sudan, Tunisia, Ghana, Cameroon, Chad, Republic of the Congo, Gabon, Ivory Coast, Mali, Mauritania, Nigeria, Senegal, Somalia, and Togo. Furthermore, by the late 1950s, a kind of solidarity had begun to develop with some of America's white youth, particularly those associated with the beat generation, who were openly anarchistic and critical of the unequal access to the realization of the philosophy of life, liberty, and the pursuit of happiness. And into the 1960s, not only did the country see the rise of influential black leaders such as Dr. King,

\textsuperscript{26}Kofsky, \textit{Black Nationalism and the Revolution in Music}, p. 56.

\textsuperscript{27}Kofsky, \textit{Black Nationalism and the Revolution in Music}, p. 38.
Medgar Evars, and Malcolm X, it also witnessed their assassinations.

By virtue of being a traveling population, black musicians were perhaps more aware of the state of racial affairs in the country than nonmusicians. Many performers expressed resentment at discrimination in wages, housing, transportation, and working conditions. Difficulties arose in some towns if bands were mixed. Musicians were routinely harassed and in some cases terrorized by hostile police officers. Often they were in actual fear for their lives. Club owners and agents regularly exploited black musicians in bookings and recordings, paying them relatively little, while themselves amassing sizeable profits. Perhaps worst of all, those musicians who publicly spoke out about their political philosophies were blacklisted and in some cases kept out of work for months at a time. In spite of the honors and successes attained by many African-American jazz artists, many more lesser-known artists struggled bitterly with the racial double standard.

If this was true with jazz in general, free jazz artists were dealt a double blow, by virtue of the music that they were creating. The white critical establishment of the day dubbed the avant-garde jazz revolution as "anti-jazz" and was particularly harsh with those who overtly expressed their political philosophies in the music, either by song title or on record liner notes.28 In 1958, Sonny Rollins' pro-civil-rights liner notes to his *Freedom Suite* LP for Riverside Records (not surprisingly his last recording with the

---

28Furthermore, the most prominent critics such as Leonard Feather and Ira Gitler were employees of the recording companies for whom they regularly wrote jazz LP liner notes, their critical impartiality being, therefore, seriously compromised. Kofsky's chapter "Critiquing the Critics: The State of Jazz Criticism" (pp. 71-97) sheds considerable light on the subject. See also LeRoi Jones, "Jazz and the White Critic," *Down Beat*, Vol. 30, No. 23 (August 15, 1963): 16.
label) were censored and the name changed (to *Shadow Waltz*) by the management. In 1961, singer Abby Lincoln and Max Roach recorded *We Insist: The Freedom Now Suite*, which was scathingly criticized in "Down Beat" magazine by critic Ira Gitler who said, "we don't need the Elijah Muhammad type of thinking in jazz." Coltrane's LP *The New Wave in Jazz* was to have been entitled *New Black Music*. Others such as bassist/composer Charles Mingus and Sun Ra created independent record labels to avoid dealing with the establishment recording industry. In 1960, in response to several musicians' feelings of poor treatment and lack of compensation at the Newport Jazz Festival, a rival festival was organized by Mingus, involving Max Roach, Coleman Hawkins, Yusef Lateef, Ornette Coleman, Don Cherry, and others. This eventually led to the establishment of the Jazz Artists' Guild. Other artists' collectives, such as the Association for the Advancement of Creative Musicians, the Jazz Composers Guild, Collective Black Artists, Jazz and People's Movement, and Jazz Composers Orchestra Association met with mixed success over the years but nevertheless helped encourage and maintain artistic integrity. Resentment of the almost exclusively-white hiring practices by recording studios prompted Cecil Taylor to call for a boycott of jazz clubs and recording companies, and even Dizzy Gillespie, an enormously successful and well-established musician of the previous generation, suggested that increasing dissatisfaction

---


of blacks could lead to a revolution. 33

The combination of the political climate in tandem with the radical effort toward freedom of expression placed free jazz in the musical "underground" of jazz. It is hardly surprising, then, that steady venues were rare. But in spite of lack of financial opportunity for artists, the movement continued to develop. The 1964 "October Revolution in Jazz," a four-day festival in a New York coffee house organized by trumpeter Bill Dixon, featured music day and night, with over twenty groups and many more sidemen, some famous, some lesser-known. 34 African-American critic LeRoi Jones organized a "New Black Music" concert in March of 1965, one month after the assassination of Malcolm X and three months before the recording of Ascension. Coltrane's participation in the event, which also featured Archie Shepp, the Ayler brothers, and Sun Ra's "Solar Arkestra," gave a boost of solidarity to the movement from this icon of jazz. These and other events have a prominent place in the social history of free jazz. 35 The vitality of the new music, in regard to ideals as well as sound, has influenced musicians and composers from the 1960s to the present, as we shall see in the discussion of the music of a few later practitioners of free jazz.

33Kofsky, Black Nationalism and the Revolution in Music, p. 120. The need to address these issues was apparently recognized by the editors of Down Beat, who published "Racial Prejudice in Jazz" in 1962, followed by "The Need for Racial Unity in Jazz: A Panel Discussion," Vol. 30, No. 9 (April 11, 1963): 16-21.

34Of related interest is an interview with Bill Dixon in Robert D. Rusch, Jazztalk (Secaucus, New Jersey: Lyle Stuart, Inc., 1984), pp. 121-175. For a double review of the festival, see Dan Morgenstern and Martin Williams, "The October Revolution: Two Views of the Avant Garde in Action," Down Beat, Vol. 31, No. 30 (November 19, 1964): 15. For additional information on free jazz activity in New York, see LeRoi Jones, "Apple Cores" on p. 21 of the same issue.

35Jost, Free Jazz, pp. 84-85.
Later and Current Practitioners of Free Jazz

Nearly three decades after the 1964 "October Revolution in Jazz," the compositional and improvisational methods along with the cultural and sociopolitical connections of free jazz continue to be evident in the evolution of the genre, in the United States and around the world. It would be unwise, however, to overlook other influences upon the free jazz genre or to forego mention of some of the lesser known members of this diverse musical community. For example, the music of composer Anthony Braxton, like Cecil Taylor's but even more extreme in its avant-garde tendencies, has much in common with music of the classical avant-garde. Educated at the Chicago School of Music, Braxton was greatly influenced by the music of John Cage and Karlheinz Stockhausen. His first recording was made in 1968, after he had become affiliated with the Association for the Advancement of Creative Musicians in Chicago.\(^{36}\) Braxton has been active in the European new jazz community; his compositions, many named with formulae, are often based upon mathematical constructions. Aurally, they suggest a process whereby melody has been gradually replaced with textures; rhythmic motion is decidedly absent. It is this lack of rhythmic vitality, an integral aspect of all jazz music including free jazz, which has prompted critics to associate Braxton's music with European improvised music.

Native American tenor saxophonist Jim Pepper (1941-1992) combined Plains Indian stomps, chants, and peyote songs with both lyrical tunes and free jazz

\(^{36}\)AACM musicians have always been disturbed by the comparison to the classical avant-garde which they view as stemming from the continuing white need to point to white precedents for all black musical activity (Wilmer, *As Serious as Your Life*, p. 113). Of interest to note, also, is Braxton's denial that he is closely associated with the music of AACM (Jost, *Free Jazz*, p. 174).
improvisation. Unlike many urban Native Americans, he was raised with a strong sense of cultural heritage and did social work for a time with Alaskan Indian children. Originally encouraged by Ornette Coleman, Pepper also recorded with Paul Motian, Carla Bley, Don Cherry (who was responsible for a surge in Pepper's career in the early 1980s), and Charlie Haden's Liberation Music Orchestra (LMO).

Composer, arranger, bandleader, and keyboardist Carla Bley (b. 1938) was an early member of the Chicago free jazz community and a founding member of the Jazz Composers' Orchestra Association. Her compositions have combined free jazz with elements of theater, electronic and rock music, folk melodies, and marches, orchestrated in her unique and original style. Her jazz opera, *Escalator Over the Hill*, sets a Paul Haines libretto and was recorded in 1971 with support from the nonprofit Jazz Composers Orchestra Association. It features a host of jazz artists, including Charlie Haden, Paul Motian, Gato Barbieri, John McLaughlin, Roswell Rudd, and Michael Mantler, as well as rock musicians Jack Bruce, Linda Ronstadt, and many others. Known more for her writing than for her playing, Bley's distinctive style is often very whimsical and extraordinarily bold, combining polyrhythms, overlapped gestures, expressive interpretive characteristics, and atypical brass arranging. She has been a longtime collaborator of Charlie Haden's, and her arrangements play a large part in the sound of the Liberation Music Orchestra.

Bassist and composer Haden has worked extensively with Ornette Coleman, and was involved with the *Free Jazz* recording in 1960. Since then he has been a major figure in the development of free jazz, playing with many of the important names. His
own work with the LMO has spanned nearly three decades and draws upon cultural, social, and political themes in a free jazz context. *Liberation Music Orchestra* was recorded in 1969 and was inspired by anthems from the Spanish Civil War, scenes from the 1968 Democratic Convention in Chicago, and Che Guevara's death in 1967. *Ballad of the Fallen* was recorded in 1983 and is dedicated to the ongoing struggle for freedom in El Salvador. *Dream Keeper* from 1991 is inspired by civil rights struggles in America, South Africa, and El Salvador. Haden's social and political philosophies are an essential element in the music of LMO, whose music is repeatedly dedicated to efforts of human rights and justice.

A word is in order regarding the influence of jazz in general outside the United States. World War I introduced American music to Europe, including jazz. Sidney Bechet went to London and Paris in 1919 and was the first jazz musician to receive considerable acclaim in Europe. Later, Louis Armstrong and Duke Ellington became enormously popular there. As jazz styles expanded and developed in the United States and sound recordings and radio became widely available, each new sound was received with open arms on the Continent. Throughout the history of jazz, many artists have used their success abroad as fuel to kindle their recognition at home. Many names in jazz eventually adopted cities like London, Paris, and Amsterdam as home bases, finding greater respect and renown among European musicians and jazz aficionados.  

Free jazz improvisation particularly has been profoundly influential; anyone attending jazz

---

37 Of related interest is *The Reception of Jazz in America*, in which author James Lincoln Collier addresses the myth that jazz was first taken seriously by Europeans.
performances by European musicians can usually expect at least some free jazz
improvisation. In the former Soviet Union during the 1950s, jazz was an underground
activity that functioned as a symbol of political opposition, even after Stalin ordered the
confiscation of all saxophones in the late 1940s. Later, as rock became the music of the
underground, jazz became more accepted and its practice more open. The Azerbaijani
Vagif Mustafa-Zadeh, considered the most virtuosic Soviet jazz pianist, combined jazz
improvisation with indigenous folk music. Mustafa-Zadeh began his jazz studies in the
1960s, following the styles of Oscar Peterson, Bill Evans and Thelonious Monk; before
his death in 1979 at the age of thirty-nine, he received the first prize for composition at
the Monaco international jazz festival. The instruments, recordings, and styles of jazz
became popular elsewhere around the world, from Asia to Africa and South America.
When a 1960 Ornette Coleman session, for example, was first released--in 1975--it was
in Japan. Brooklyn-born pianist and composer Randy Weston’s success in Africa caused
him to relocate to Morocco in 1968 as a base for touring the Continent; during the mid-
1970s he achieved considerable success in Europe. A musician particularly dedicated to
his African heritage, only in the past few years has Weston received more than limited
success in the United States. The Super Rail Band of Mali marries the polyrhythmic

---

39 According to Richard Steitz, author of Russian Popular Culture in a radio interview, National Public

University, 1991), p. 75. Of related interest is an article by Robert L. Doerschuk, "Twelve to Watch," in
Keyboard, Vol. 19, No. 9 (September, 1993): 71, in which he predicts that Mustafa-Zadeh’s daughter Aziza,
age 24 at the time of publication, will be one of tomorrow’s jazz piano giants.

drumming, dance, and singing of North Africa with extended high-energy brass and woodwind improvisations. Hermeto Pascoal of Brazil has combined Brazilian folk melodies with electronic instruments, brass, woodwinds, and percussion, to produce a complex music in multilayered textures of superimposed meters and rhythms.\textsuperscript{41} Argentinean tenor saxophonist Leandro "Gato" Barbieri became active with European, American, and African free jazz artists in Europe, recording, among others, with Don Cherry, Steve Lacy, Carla Bley, Charlie Haden, and Abdullah Ibrahim.

In the next chapter, attention will be given to a few examples of the treatment of free jazz in scholarly literature, followed by a description of some of the techniques of traditional jazz, to highlight both the similarities and differences of free jazz and to aid in its definition as jazz music. Thereafter I will focus on the formulation of my analytical method, which will include a discussion of traditional analytical techniques appropriate to free jazz, as well as some less traditional methods that are particularly relevant to the music at hand.

\textsuperscript{41}Pascoal, an albino unable to tolerate exposure to the sun, learned music as a child while his parents worked in the fields. At his performances, he invites purchasers of his recordings to copy them for their friends, the dissemination of the music more important than the profits.
CHAPTER 2
FORMULATION OF ANALYTICAL METHOD

Free Jazz in the Scholarly Literature

Since the 1920s, jazz has been the subject of hundreds of books and articles, published in the United States and many countries worldwide. Most of the writing pertains to history, biography, discography, or pedagogy, but jazz is also beginning to be the subject of serious criticism and analysis. With the purpose of laying a foundation for later more detailed observations, the following is a general discussion of some of the books and articles relative to jazz criticism, as well as some of the more important works written on the subject of free jazz specifically.

The "worthiness" of jazz as a subject for critical analysis has often been argued with considerable differences of opinion. Frank Kofsky states that his book, *Black Nationalism and the Revolution in Music*, was written because not three (white) academics out of a hundred of his acquaintances believed that jazz music was of sufficient moment to merit a "serious" study (i.e., one with a lot of footnotes).\(^1\) An academic himself, Kofsky writes with some bitterness of the difficulty in finding a publisher, due to the controversial nature of his book. Occasionally in the past, jazz has been the subject of aesthetic criticism within the broader context of "popular" music. The German

\(^1\)Kofsky, *Black Nationalism and the Revolution in Music*, p. 5. Parentheses and quotation marks by Kofsky.
philosopher Theodor W. Adorno, for example, whose writings on music focused on its relation to society, wrote repeatedly (and with considerable contempt) on jazz. In his *Introduction to the Sociology of Music* he criticized the "resentful" jazz listener, jazz's lack of "exact musical terms" (i.e., notation), and its appeal as entertainment music (which he likened to spectator sport or addiction); he dismissed the phases of jazz ("swing," "bebop," and "cool jazz") as mere advertising slogans.\(^2\) In response, in a recent issue of *The Musical Quarterly*, Theodore A. Gracyk convincingly and with great detail refutes Adorno's opinions, showing that not only was Adorno careless in classification of form, harmony, and technique in jazz, but he failed as well to understand the significance of improvisation and its relationship to the compositional process, not to mention the life and culture of jazz artists. Gracyk does allow Adorno some leeway, stating that his opinions were formed mostly in the 1930s during the swing era, but nevertheless will not forgive him his ignorance of Louis Armstrong, Billie Holiday, and Coleman Hawkins, all of whom predate swing. In short, Adorno's ignorance of the jazz tradition leaves him unqualified to criticize it.\(^3\)

Recently, however, more detailed research has been conducted in jazz theory, criticism, and analysis.\(^4\) A great deal of current writing is being devoted to various

---


\(^3\)Theodore A. Gracyk, "Adorno, Jazz and the Aesthetics of Popular Music," *The Musical Quarterly*, Vol. 76, No. 4 (1992): 526-542. I include this brief discussion not only because Adorno's influence on modern academic aesthetics has been significant, but also because his writings on jazz are mentioned frequently in the literature.

\(^4\)Interestingly, publication of most of the latter group has been abroad, according to the listing in the *New Grove Dictionary of Music and Musicians*. 
controversies surrounding jazz, its history, audience, and evolution. For example, there is increasing criticism of the anecdotal, patronizing, and often racist manner in which some authors and editors have treated jazz artists. In a recent essay regarding three different autobiographies written by Louis Armstrong (one ghost-written, two heavily edited), William H. Kenney III cites specific instances of editorial control that changed not only the language but also the meaning of the author's intent, in misguided efforts to "improve" Armstrong's spoken and written language. Another debate continues about the reception of jazz, whether it found its first real devotees in Europe or America and whether American audiences have, until recently, ignored jazz. On a related topic, there is another argument as to exactly who comprises the jazz audience. Are they black or white, young, old, male or female? This argument is interesting because again, it is being drawn, in part, on lines of color, and stems from the ongoing debate over which movements in jazz were African-American and which were not. It has been asserted by certain critics that African-Americans as an audience are not devoted to jazz, because more white people attend clubs and concerts. Others have countered that the statistics are distorted, there being far more whites than blacks in the country, and that per capita a greater percentage of African-Americans listen to jazz. To further complicate the issue, economics has been factored in, with the high cost of cover charges and drinks being cited as a reason for the smaller number of non-white listeners in clubs. Significantly, there is also a debate concerning whether "popular" jazz (containing little or no

---

improvisation or innovation) is really jazz, or just the recording industry's creation at the expense of the "authentic" art. More recently, significant criticism and charges of racism have emerged in essays and at conferences regarding the lack of funding for jazz, the absence of coverage of jazz in the mainstream press, and especially, the lack of a significant inclusion of jazz artists in awards and prizes in which substantial monies are offered. For example, only three jazz artists have ever been elected to the American Academy of Arts and Letters (Duke Ellington in 1970, Dizzy Gillespie shortly before his death in 1992, and Max Roach as an Honorary Member in 1992). Until 1970, only one Guggenheim Foundation award had been awarded to an African-American jazz artist (Ornette Coleman); and in order for a work to quality for the Pulitzer Prize in Music, it "must convey the American spirit, but...must be composed in the educated European tradition." The problem here seems to be not so much that jazz artists are ineligible for awards and prizes, but rather that there are no major prizes created specifically for jazz.

Since 1970 several significant books and articles exclusively pertaining to free jazz have been written, from varied and interesting perspectives. In Frank Kofsky's *Black

---


7Since 1970, the list also includes Charles Mingus, Mary Lou Williams, Sonny Rollins, Keith Jarrett, Thelonious Monk, Anthony Braxton, Steve Lacy, James Newton, and David Murray.

8Gary Giddins, "The Evolution of Jazz," in *New Perspectives on Jazz*, p. 42. As of 1992, no jazz artist had received the Pulitzer Prize, although the Presidential Medal of Freedom was given to Duke Ellington, Count Basie, James H. (Eubie) Blake, and Mabel Mercer. Mr. Giddins erroneously states that jazz artists do not get elected to the American Academy of Arts and Letters (see above); according to the Academy, while the emphasis is certainly placed on western art music, there is an increasing awareness that a mechanism should be established for greater consideration of jazz artists.
Nationalism and the Revolution in Music, the author traces the music and lives of key figures--Albert Ayler, Cecil Taylor, Archie Shepp, John Coltrane, Elvin Jones, McCoy Tyner--and also the development of the black nationalist movement of the 1960s, its effect upon the music and significantly, the music's effect on the movement. In an often angry and adversarial tone, Kofsky makes no bones about his opinion: from the beginning, every important innovation in jazz has been by African-American musicians who saw their creations stolen, commercialized, and marketed by whites. With apparent exhaustive knowledge of the material, he especially takes on the almost exclusively white critical establishment (to which he belongs), including journalists, editors, record producers, booking agents, and club owners, citing numerous instances of the blacklisting of musicians who held openly political opinions, the labeling of free jazz as "anti-jazz," and various conflicts of interest involving jazz critics under the employ of both record producers and prominent journals, such as Down Beat and Jazz. In spite of its lack of objectivity and documentation, Kofsky's book is both enlightening and provocative, especially considering the tenor of the times in the 1960s when free jazz developed and the economic difficulties which free jazz artists endured.

In another book, As Serious As Your Life: The Story of the New Jazz, British author Valerie Wilmer writes in great detail of the lives and music of the leading figures in free jazz--Ornette Coleman, John Coltrane, Cecil Taylor, Sun Ra, Albert Ayler, Archie Shepp, Bill Dixon, Chicago's Alternative Society, and the Jazz Composers Guild. Her

---

9Kofsky, Black Nationalism and the Revolution in Music, pp. 16-23. In Kofsky's opinion, only three white jazz musicians merit the title of "innovator" (musicians so influential that a significant number of imitators follow their style)--pianist Bill Evans and bassists Charlie Haden and Scott LaFaro (pp. 18-19).
book includes many unusual and revealing photographs taken by the author herself, a thorough biographical section of numerous sidemen and associates of the free jazz musicians, a comprehensive bibliography, and a welcome section on women's involvement with both the music and the musicians. This is particularly enlightening, because although the feminist movement was strong in the 1970s, promoting increased awareness of women's status in society in general, it is questionable whether the advances made had much effect on the lives of minority women.\(^{10}\) Wilmer's first-hand knowledge is drawn in part from interviews and correspondence, and in spite of inadequate scholarly citation, her writing demonstrates insight and credence. The subjects of race and black nationalism play a vital role in this book, as do economics, journalism, the recording and television industries, and various political activities within some of the collective groups. She chronicles, for example, an ongoing series of interesting demonstrations in 1970 orchestrated by the Jazz and People's Movement involving several television shows (and their millions of home viewers) hosted by Dick Cavett, Merv Griffin, and Johnny Carson. The intent of the demonstrations (prompted by a Cavett interview with British actor Trevor Howard, who casually complained that there was no longer anywhere in New York to hear jazz) was to focus not only on the way television ignored jazz in general but

\(^{10}\)With few exceptions, jazz musicians are not generally portrayed in a kindly light regarding their treatment of women. Many instances of blatant exploitation and prejudice (both racial and sexual) are cited. Particularly disconcerting is the double standard held by many black jazz musicians, whose struggles along racial lines did not extend to matters of gender. Notable exceptions are Albert Ayler and John Coltrane. Ayler worked and recorded with composer/pianist/harpist Mary Parks (known professionally as Mary Maria); Coltrane's wife Alice, a practicing pianist prior to their marriage, performed widely with him during his late career. After his death, she continued in music, making many recordings on her own.
African-American musicians in particular.\textsuperscript{11}

In \textit{The Freedom Principle: Jazz After 1958}, John Litweiler delivers a detailed and well-documented history of the major free jazz figures, a few minor players, free jazz in Europe, and jazz music after the free jazz movement. More than a traditional "who and where" book, it examines specific musical characteristics associated with individual musicians and includes a selected discography. It also explores the personalities and lives of the musicians and their communities. The book contains an entire chapter devoted to Eric Dolphy, whose importance is often overlooked. Dolphy, whose initial recognition came with Chico Hamilton and Charles Mingus, played extensively with John Coltrane and was featured on Ornette Coleman's \textit{Free Jazz}. He was a gifted multi-instrumentalist who introduced the bass clarinet to the world of free jazz.\textsuperscript{12} Also of note in Litweiler's book is the chapter on free jazz in Europe, which chronicles not only the expatriation of many American musicians but the development of an outstanding community of European players and composers, most of whom have never performed in the United States. According to Litweiler, this development was occasioned by an expansion of the European club scene during the 1960s while the number of jazz clubs in the United States was declining.\textsuperscript{13}

The exploration of criticism and analysis pertaining to free jazz has resulted in

\textsuperscript{11}Wilmer, \textit{As Serious as Your Life}, pp. 215-227. I would like to thank Marc Seales, professor of jazz at the University of Washington, for bringing both the Wilmer and Kofsky books to my attention.

\textsuperscript{12}Dolphy's virtuosity, versatility, and character inspired great respect for him from many quarters. He also crossed the line into third-stream and contemporary art music, performing works by Schuller and Varèse. He died of heart failure in Berlin in 1964 at the age of thirty-six, the result of diabetes.

several articles of note. In "Jazz and Modernism: Changing Conceptions of Innovation and Tradition," Mark S. Harvey examines several modernist trends which occurred in the history of jazz, including the development of the 1960s avant-garde. His discussion explores many avenues, including the role of the avant-garde in the separation of jazz from popular music, the relevance of experimentation, the relativity of culture, and the role of criticism in artistic activity. He observes that innovation is the primary aesthetic principle in jazz, but also focuses on its connection to tradition. Regarding free jazz, Harvey offers that it is the most truly "modern" development in jazz, one whose artists were calling for a cultural revolution, one which conceived of innovation in terms of both a radically new aesthetic and a radical reclaiming of the larger cultural, social, and political tradition.\footnote{For further information on the set-theoretical operations see John Rahn, Basic Atonal Theory (New York: Schirmer Books, 1980). Of related interest is a review of Rahn's book by Robert D. Morris in Music Theory Spectrum, Volume 4 (1982): 138-154, in which Morris defines multiplicative operations in relation to jazz transformations.}

Two recent analytical articles are worthy of detailed comment at this point, the first entitled "Pitch-Class Transformation in Free Jazz" by Steven Block.\footnote{Steven Block, "Pitch-Class Transformation in Free Jazz," Music Theory Spectrum, Vol. 12, No. 2 (1990): 181-202.} In this article, the author uses set-theoretical methodology to reveal pitch-class transformations in the music of Cecil Taylor, John Coltrane, Anthony Braxton, and Ornette Coleman.\footnote{Mark S. Harvey, "Jazz and Modernism: Changing Conceptions of Innovation and Tradition," in Jazz in Mind, pp. 128-147.} Specifically, Block focuses on excerpts of music, mostly improvisation, from which he
identifies gestures according to set-type, ascribing to the pitch-sets specific qualities, such as chromatic, octatonic, whole-tone, or diatonic. He then identifies instances of transformation which can be shown to be the result of multiplicative, transpositional, and inversional operations. This article shows the author's genuine interest in the music and his ability to examine (in considerable detail) brief segments of difficult music. There are problems, however, with several aspects of Mr. Block's approach. For example, he appears to be prone to extracting only those examples which can be proven by his method, while omitting significant portions of his own transcriptions from comment. Furthermore, the transcriptions from which his examples are drawn are such minute portions of the works represented that any broader observations about the compositions as a whole are not possible. In his transcription of Cecil Taylor's "Tales (8 Whisps)," two segments featuring piano (one indicating drum rhythm) are extracted from a seven-minute piece involving seven players. The music is transcribed in mostly sixteenth and thirty-second notes. Tempi within the segments vary from $\dot{\nu}=176$ to $\dot{\nu}=336$, and within each segment the tempo changes several times. At most, each segment represents only a few seconds of music, overlooking not only what the other six musicians were playing, but also most of Taylor's improvisation. Additionally, alluding to the work's closing notes, Block suggests that pitch-class transformations can be heard as substitutions of functionally diatonic behavior, a claim which I find questionable considering the velocity, density, complexity, and intensity of Taylor's improvisation on this piece. Block's comments on John Coltrane's *Ascension* are equally problematic.\footnote{Reference to *Ascension* was made in Chapter 1.} He identifies the
occurrence of half a dozen sets related by the "T,M" operation within Coltrane's first solo, and thereafter concludes, "It is clear that a specific series of operations can describe the relations between the pitch-class sets in an improvisation," overlooking the fact that *Ascension* involves eleven players, and is nearly forty minutes long. Tenor player Archie Shepp said of the piece:

> It starts at a high level of intensity with the horns playing high and other pieces playing low. . . . It builds in intensity through all the solo passages, brass and reeds, until it gets to the final section where the rhythm section takes over. . . . it creates various surfaces of color which push into each other, creates tensions and countertensions, and various fields of energy. . . . The emphasis was on textures rather than the making of an organizational unity.  

It is obvious that Block's intent regarding his analyses of Taylor and Coltrane was to limit his examination to brief portions of music viewed in light of specific procedures. It may be that a more comprehensive application would indeed show on a larger scale the presence of the transformational activity that he demonstrates; however, his tendency to make global conclusions based upon limited observation, while ignoring other large-scale considerations, says very little about the music or the intentions of the composer. There are other problems in this article as well, including several errors in the execution of his operations as applied to the music of both Anthony Braxton and Ornette Coleman. 

---

19Block, "Pitch-Class Transformation in Free Jazz," 190.

20David Wild, liner notes for *The Major Works of John Coltrane* (Impulse GRD-2-113), p. 6. Shepp's comments are from an interview with A.B. Spellman which was published with the original 1965 release (Impulse AS-95).

21Example 5b on page 195 shows "progressions of all-interval tetrachords" identified by Mr. Block in Braxton's 

\[
\begin{align*}
&M \quad 489 \\
M & \quad 70--2--\quad (TH--B) \\
M & \quad \quad .
\end{align*}
\]

The T₆ operation, not T₃ as is shown, maps tetrachord \(\{11, 10, 8, 4\}\) into \(\{8, 7, 5, 1\}\), and \(\{8, 7, 5, 1\}\)
unfortunate error exists in the transcription of the head of Coleman's "Lonely Woman" which is shown on page 196. Beside the fact that the melody is incorrectly scored in half-time relative to the bass introduction, Block has written the tune in fixed measures of 4/4 meter (in simple half, quarter and eighth notes) which, given even the most liberal interpretation, carries with it specific rhythmic and metric characteristics. The actual music is considerably different. While it was obviously never Mr. Block's objective to analyze elements of rhythm and meter in this article, to thus wedge Coleman's unique and elegant music into such a tight corner is, I believe, misguided, particularly since Coleman's treatment of rhythm in "Lonely Woman" is central to the character of the music.

Another example of free jazz analysis is found in Lewis Porter's "John Coltrane's A Love Supreme: Jazz Improvisation as Composition." Porter begins with an introductory look at Coltrane's method, discussing his treatment of motives (both rhythmic and melodic), modal applications, manner of "self-dialogue," means of development, and performance practice, which often included long stretches of improvisation. In his analysis of A Love Supreme, Porter examines all four sections of the thirty-three minute

22I will discuss these rhythmic and metric elements of "Lonely Woman" in my analysis in Chapter 3.

23Lewis Porter, "John Coltrane's A Love Supreme: Jazz Improvisation as Composition," Journal of the American Musicological Society, Vol. 38, No. 3 (1985): 593-621. A Love Supreme was recorded in 1964 with Coltrane's quartet: Coltrane, tenor; McCoy Tyner, piano; Billy Higgins, bass; Elvin Jones, drums. It is one of Coltrane's most successful recordings, establishing him as a kind of cult figure. I consider this work as representative of the transition into Coltrane's free jazz of Ascension.
work: "Acknowledgement," "Resolution," "Pursuance," and "Psalm." He provides a Tonal Plan that indicates pitch centers and patterns of symmetry. Included in his discussion of each section are specific details of the use of pentatonic scales and departures from them; prevalent motives and intervals, and their development; formal arrangements; transpositions; importance of Coltrane's use of instrument range, especially pertaining to structure; occurrences of dramatic changes in the music; and, aspects of piano, bass, and drum accompaniment. Mr. Porter is fortunate enough to have at his disposal a concert recording of the music, which he is able to compare with the studio version. Many musical transcriptions are provided, which clarify the author's written points. Of particular interest is his discussion of the final section "Psalm," which is an improvised instrumental setting of a sixty-six line poem written by Coltrane, the subject being his thanks to God.  

In the setting, Coltrane plays the poem word for word, according to the natural phrasing of the text. Porter provides a transcription of part of the poem, with a comparison of Coltrane's melody line to the tonal techniques of African-American preaching traditions, as outlined in a paper by Jeff Titon called "Tonal System in the Chanted Oral Sermons of the Reverend C. L. Franklin." Mr. Porter's article offers even the reader to whom A Love Supreme is well known new insight into one of the composer's most beloved works. The author provides specific detail to demonstrate his opinions, as well as ample information to assist the reader who may not be familiar with

---

24 Coltrane's turn to spirituality in 1957 following his recovery from addiction is well known; his philosophy apparently served as a guide for his life thereafter. His sense of humility and respect for others is often mentioned by fellow musicians and associates.

Coltrane's music or even jazz music in general.

By far the most comprehensive work to date on this particular subject is the book *Free Jazz* by Ekkehard Jost. The author describes the book as intending to be a critical exploration of the essential musical directions of free jazz, and introduces it with a discussion of the pioneers of free jazz, its classification as "black music," and the development of free jazz in Europe.26 Discussions of dozens of works and performers are included as are thorough analyses of many pieces. Jost's contention that critical musical analyses benefit from socio-psychological and historical considerations is evident, as is his exhaustive knowledge of dozens of works by John Coltrane, Charles Mingus, Ornette Coleman, Cecil Taylor, Archie Shepp, Albert Ayler, Don Cherry, Sun Ra, and many others, including some of the musicians involved in Chicago's Association for the Advancement of Creative Musicians. Each chapter is thoroughly footnoted and provides numerous transcriptions with critical commentary on all aspects of the artists and their music, including artists' personal histories, influences, stages of development, stylistic and technical characteristics; most significant contributions and pivotal works; and recording output, sidemen, and associations. Jost incorporates a variety of analytical tools in *Free Jazz*. His transcriptions identify and illustrate many fine points of the artists' styles, including elements such as modality and its evolution within a given work; motivic treatment and phrase construction; melodic shape and motion; exploitation of extremes of articulation, dynamics, activity or register; intensity of dissonance; quality and use of tone color, variance in intonation and extremes of emotion; asymmetry of rhythm,

irregular pulsation, and rhythmic independence in context of metric function; harmonic permutation; techniques of arpeggiation; use of texture and tension as an element of form; and definition of structure. Also of particular interest are graphic representations of music in means other than actual notation, a tool for musical analysis worthy of greater exploration in light of the extreme difficulty posed when examining improvised music, or any other music whose point of departure is not a written score.\textsuperscript{27} He uses graphic means to depict a unique manner of articulation used by Archie Shepp (whose first significant experience came in recording with Cecil Taylor in 1960), in effort to help demonstrate the differences between jazz and non-jazz methods of attack.\textsuperscript{28} Utilizing an electronically produced readout, he explains similarities of period construction and dynamic differentiation in the improvisations of saxophonist Albert Ayler, a player whose use of non-fixed pitch poses particular difficulty to notation by traditional means.\textsuperscript{29} Also in graphic representation, Jost accounts for the kinetic impulses in Cecil Taylor's music by defining a new musical quality of energy, a combination of parameters of time, intensity, and pitch.\textsuperscript{30} Jost's creative use of vocabulary and musical terminology in the definition of sound is meaningful and precise, and his insightful comments on many of the physical aspects of playing, such as instrumental idiosyncrasies, breath control, and


\textsuperscript{28}Jost, \textit{Free Jazz}, p. 107.

\textsuperscript{29}Jost, \textit{Free Jazz}, p. 126.

\textsuperscript{30}Jost, \textit{Free Jazz}, p. 70.
embouchure aid in the understanding of various musicians' sound qualities. He sheds light on many of the compositions with his understanding of a broad range of musical styles, cultural and philosophical influences, and specific non-western techniques. Throughout the book, the author often comments on subtle similarities and differences in style among the musicians whose music he analyzes, making each chapter valuable over and above the main subject at hand. Jost's book concludes with a substantial reading list and discography.

As Mr. Jost suggests in the introduction to Free Jazz, one disadvantage of writing about music that is current is that it is in continual transformation;\textsuperscript{31} likewise, so is the literature about it. Certainly, the preceding discussion of free jazz in the scholarly literature is not intended to be exhaustive in scope, but rather should offer the reader an introduction to some of the research and writing that has been and is being conducted on the subject. The following section will continue with a short commentary on the some of the characteristics and techniques of traditional jazz music, so that the reader can understand both the differences and similarities between jazz and Euro-American music, since the latter forms the pedagogical standard of modern music education. The chapter will conclude with a comparison of traditional and non-traditional analytical techniques, in preparation for the analyses in the subsequent chapters.

**Techniques of Traditional Jazz**

As we have seen, one component of free jazz is its departure from the expected

\textsuperscript{31}Jost, Free Jazz, p. 7.
norms of jazz music. This departure may be extreme or it may be slight. Tonality in free jazz, for example, may be avoided entirely, or elements of pantonality or polytonality may be suggested. Counterpoint is often prevalent. Sometimes in a piece of music, a transformation from tonal jazz to free jazz occurs gradually or in layers within the music. A discussion, then, of jazz tonality in general is in order, since there are certain melodic and harmonic differences from the "common practice" norm. I will also examine some of the criteria which contribute to the definition of jazz, various performance practices and mannerisms, as well as specific rhythmic and metric devices.

One characteristic that contributes to the sound of jazz is the presence of melodic "blue" notes. While normal functional tonality usually reflects either the major or minor mode, jazz sometimes combines the two into what is called a blues scale. There are several different forms of blues scales, but each features at least one lowered scale degree (from the diatonic major), typically the seventh or third. Furthermore, the fifth is also frequently lowered, thereby introducing a diminished quality. As a result, in the key of Bb-Major for example, Db, Fb and Ab are additional components of the scale. The "leading tone," which plays such a large part in the definition of mode in common practice tonality, tends to be replaced with either scale degree two, scale degree six, or the "sub-tonic" (lowered seventh) in jazz melodies, especially at the cadence. The harmonies that result from the use of blues scales differ considerably from their common

---

33 John Litweiler in Ornette Coleman: The Harmolodic Life (pp. 69-70) suggests the following simple guideline: "TONALITY: restriction to a single tonal center ("key") as fulcrum point; POLYTONALITY: division of center between a restricted number of tonalities, usually two or three, as more will give the impression of——PANTONALITY: where all tonalities are possible, i.e. roughly as defined by George Russell. not Arnold Schoenberg whose method forms the basis of what became popularly known as ATONALITY: where all tonalities are essential."
practice cousins. Seventh and ninth chords are used prominently. The quality of the
ninth when used in a dominant chord may be either minor or augmented; the quality of
the fifth may also be augmented. Furthermore, added sixths and ninths are common in
tonic and subdominant triads; the use of the eleventh and thirteenth is also common,
especially with the supertonic and submediant triads. In addition, there are numerous
instances of the alteration (lowering or raising) of these harmonic elements, as well as
chord superimposition and substitution, especially in cadential preparation. Altered
dominants and half-diminished seventh chords are common. Sequence patterns and their
transposition contribute greatly to the harmonic variety found in jazz progressions. Some
of the most common progressions involve patterns based upon the circle of fifths (such
as ii-V7-I), but other relationships are also used, such as modulation by major or minor
thirds or by half-steps.33

Modal resources are frequently used in jazz, such as the so-called "church" modes,
as well as the whole-tone, pentatonic, and other exotic scales. Modal jazz usually
involves fewer chord changes than diatonic jazz, thereby allowing greater freedom for
exploration of melody. Harmonies unique to each mode form distinctive background
color over which solos are played, and it is within the context of the improvised solo that
most of the modal exploration occurs. A number of important performers and composers

33For further reading, see Jerry Coker, Improvising Jazz (Englewood Cliffs, New Jersey: Prentice-Hall,
Inc., 1964); Leonard Feather, Inside Jazz (New York: Da Capo Press, Inc., 1977); Avril Dankworth, Jazz:
An Introduction to its Musical Basis (London: Oxford University Press, 1972); David N. Baker, Advanced
Improvisation Vol. II: Rhythmic and Harmonic Concepts (Chicago: Maher Publications, 1974); John
Mehegan, Tonal and Rhythmic Principles: Jazz Improvisation I (New York: Watson-Guptill Publications,
1984); George Russell, The Lydian Chromatic Concept of Tonal Organization (New York: Concept
have been associated with the innovation of modal jazz, including Miles Davis, John Coltrane, Gil Evans, Wayne Shorter, and Randy Weston. Big band composer Toshiko Akioshi has made use of pentatonic scales, traditional instruments, and other elements of Japanese music in her compositions; composer Thelonious Monk often made use of the whole-tone scale. The use of extreme chromaticism is typically associated with the development of bebop in the 1940s and certainly figures in the free jazz movement as well.  

The use of non-fixed pitches and atypical articulation are other aspects which contribute to the sound of jazz. Many players, especially wind and string players who have the technical capacity, have explored variations in intonation as a means of jazz expression. Free jazz musicians have exploited these techniques to an enormous extent, with the idea that any sound possible is a sound available for musical use. But even in the earliest days of jazz, atypical articulation and rhythmic interpretation helped to define the difference between what was jazz and what wasn't. In reference to bandleader James Reese Europe's 1919 recordings, R. Reid Badger defines evidence for jazz interpretation as "those slight alterations (smears, slurs, rhythmic or dynamic shifts), occasional "blue" notes, tonal coloration (use of mutes), and improvised or paraphrased breaks." Pianists, who by nature of their instruments have no flexibility of intonation, have sometimes developed elaborate cluster techniques which give the illusion of pitch-bending. Another performance practice especially defined by pianists is the use of intervallic playing,

\[34\] Jazz and improvising musicians, as well as many composers, have made extensive use of Nicolas Slonimsky's *Thesaurus of Scales and Melodic Patterns* (New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1947).

\[35\] R. Reid Badger, "James Reese Europe and the Prehistory of Jazz," *Jazz in Mind*, p. 31.
particularly associated with left-hand chord "comping." McCoy Tyner, first known for his work with John Coltrane, was particularly fond of playing left-hand stacked fourths, with the chord root in the soprano, the fifth in the tenor, and the ninth in the bass. In free improvisation, left-hand parallel planing is a common and useful technique. Interestingly, exploration of pitch has also been associated with many jazz drummers, whose concern for color, melody, and harmony is added to those rhythmic, metric, and textural elements typically associated with drumming. Coltrane's drummer Elvin Jones became particularly skilled at melodic playing, as did Max Roach; Andrew Cyrille, who played with Cecil Taylor, consciously modeled his playing after African drumming techniques, whose melodic significance has already been mentioned.

Another performance technique of interest is that of the call-and-response practice. This involves the practice of a player immediately responding to another player's improvisation, often playing "in fours" or "in eights" (four- or eight-bar phrases). This back-and-forth dialogue can become highly animated and often depicts a competitive atmosphere among players. It gives musicians the opportunity in improvisation to make a clear statement of their musical sentiments in a given piece, in reaction to the style and mood of the music. This practice has been particularly important to free jazz improvisation and helped contribute to the development of collective improvisations which

\[36\] With the exception of the solo styles (ragtime, stride, and boogie), jazz pianists typically avoid the root position chord in the left hand, relying upon the bass player for that task, and thereby allowing for greater harmonic diversity. The lack of the third in Tyner's stacked-fourth chords also avoided the necessity for major or minor definition.
so depict the spirit of free jazz music.\textsuperscript{37}

Other extended techniques exist in jazz (particularly in bebop, fusion, and free jazz) whose usage parallels contemporary art music. The use of melodic chromaticism in bebop, for example, is often accompanied by irregular phrase construction, unprepared or unresolved dissonances, and shifted rhythmic accents. In addition to being highly chromatic, bop melodies often make use of wide intervals, contributing to the exploration of register and timbre. Sometimes a player will shift the melodic line a half- or whole-step away from the key center, creating a dissonant chromatic shift. Certainly in free jazz, many artists have explored some of the same questions as their twentieth-century classical counterparts—questions concerning ensemble, texture, dissonance, timbre, form, and freedom of expression. Ornette Coleman's string quartets have been compared to Bartók's, for example (although Coleman rejects this comparison).\textsuperscript{38} Some of the ideas explored by John Cage (such as noise as music, exploration of duration over rhythm and meter, texture, and aleatoric determinacy) can be seen not only in the work of Coleman, but other artists such as John Coltrane, Cecil Taylor, Carla Bley, and others. In the late 1960s, artists like Miles Davis and the group Weather Report began to explore electronic techniques in the jazz fusion style. A little-known 1980 collaboration between Davis and Karlheinz Stockhausen is discussed in a recent article by Barry Bergstein in \textit{The Musical

\textsuperscript{37}Of related interest see Michael J. Budds, \textit{Jazz in the Sixties: The Expansion of Musical Resources and Techniques} (Iowa City: University of Iowa Press, 1990).

Quarterly. And even an early fusion work such as Davis' *Bitches Brew* (1969) offers many audible parallels in form, use of texture, and mood to Stockhausen's *Kreuzspiel*.

Before the discussion of jazz rhythmic devices, a logical question might now be asked: If some jazz styles can be so closely compared to Euro-American art music (or other musical styles for that matter), what makes the music jazz? A great deal of animated discussion has been devoted to this question with no definitive answer, but it may be enlightening to refer to some of the written opinions. In *Jazz Styles: History and Analysis*, Mark Gridley has condensed four common views: (1) jazz music needs to be associated with the jazz tradition; (2) jazz needs to project a swing feeling; (3) jazz music needs to be improvised; and (4) jazz needs to contain improvisation and project a swing feeling. But certainly, not all swing is jazz, nor is all improvisation. Many swinging bands came out of the jazz tradition that are more appropriately classified as pop or commercial dance bands rather than jazz, such as the Glenn Miller Orchestra and the bands of the Dorsey brothers; lack of improvisation is the defining factor in their non-jazz

---


40Davis' "Bitches Brew" (26:59) was created in the studio, the result of recording, overdubbing, and electronic manipulation (tpt., s. sax., b. cl., 2 e. pno., el. gt., bs., cl. bs., perc., 2 dr.). Stockhausen's "Kreuzspiel" (11:30) is a tightly controlled serial composition (pf., ob., b. cl., 3 perc.). In spite of differences in length, instrumentation, and method of creation, both pieces are loosely constructed ABA form; in each case the opening material returns at the end after a region of contrast, and the evolution between regions is essentially seamless. The change of texture in each work is gradual, and are actually a reverse image of each other; "Bitches Brew" begins thinly textured, grows in shape, and thins again at the end, while "Kreuzspiel" begins rather thickly textured, thins in the middle, and grows again at the end. Each work has a distinct sense of forward motion, propelled by subtle and gradual changes in timbre, dynamics, and motion; the character of each work is a result of the "themeless" evolution of sound.

41It may also be helpful to note that for a period of time in the 1920s and thirties, some writers referred to all popular non-classical music as jazz.

status. Vocal groups such as the High-Lows and the Andrews Sisters were also influenced by the jazz tradition, but their carefully constructed harmonies and arrangements featured no improvisation, and cannot really be called jazz. Even pop singers such as Frank Sinatra are often marketed under the jazz classification, but again the relationship is questionable. Regarding the projection of swing feeling, other American musical styles have also depicted this rhythmic interpretation, such as bluegrass, Western swing, rhythm and blues, boogie-woogie, and the 1980s acoustic innovation "New Grass." Many other types of music are improvised, too, including Flamenco, Indian classical music, fiddle music, many indigenous styles from around the world, and even rock and roll; improvisation was certainly vital in the lives of our European musical ancestors, although nowadays the ability to improvise is rarely given emphasis in classical training.\textsuperscript{43} New Grass players like mandolinist David Grisman and guitarist Mike Marshall are certainly jazz influenced and play a swinging improvised style; the problem here seems to lie in the string-band instrumentation. Similar difficulty is encountered when string quartets like the Kronos and Turtle Island Quartets play jazz styles and standards. Furthermore, some jazz is entirely composed and arranged, with jazz improvisation forming an extension of the composed sections; this is true even of some of Duke Ellington's music. Even these few examples demonstrate the difficulty in patently accepting any of the above views as entirely accurate in defining jazz. In an article written with Robert Maxham and Robert Hoff, Gridley considers the definition of

\textsuperscript{43}Bach's improvisational skills are well documented, as are Beethoven's, whose deftness at the keyboard won recognition for him before his compositional talent became known. The late Vladimir Horowitz was very adept at extemporaneous show at the piano, but the ability seems to be dying with his generation.
jazz from a different angle, using three approaches.\textsuperscript{44} First, a strict definition requires both improvisation and a swing feeling. The second approach labels jazz according to family resemblances, suggesting that since an exact definition is impossible to attain, it is fair to include all styles that have ever been called jazz. The third category approaches jazz as a dimension, in which the amount of "jazzness" is determined by the extent to which a variety of elements (swing, improvisation, blue notes, tradition, etc.) are present. The authors argue each point convincingly with many contrasting ideas, pointing out the strengths and weaknesses of each. They conclude that while scholars may find it useful to use the strict definition, the general public will likely continue to use the second, and ardent jazz fans and players will most likely adhere to the jazzness idea.\textsuperscript{45}

In spite of the difficulty in forming a single definition of jazz, one issue is not in dispute: rhythmic vitality is at the heart of what we call jazz, and part of that vitality is called "swing." At times the two terms jazz and swing have been often used interchangeably, particularly among critics.\textsuperscript{46} The ability of jazz musicians to play in "swing time" is presumed. Swing time is derived from an unequal interpretation of two eighth notes, rendered in a 2:1 ratio, or the "long-short" of a triplet. Swing is usually in 4/4 meter, with normal primary and secondary accents. Traditional swing phrases are

\textsuperscript{44}Mark Gridley, Robert Maxham, Robert Hoff, "Three Approaches to Defining Jazz," \textit{The Musical Quarterly}, Vol. 73, No. 4 (1989): 513-531.

\textsuperscript{45}It goes without saying that the aesthetic integrity and community acceptance of any work of art is based upon complex aesthetic and cultural criteria which can ultimately only be defined within the appropriating community itself.

\textsuperscript{46}To further confuse the issue, one critical school mentioned by Leroy Ostransky in \textit{Understanding Jazz} denotes swing as the commercialization and prostitution of real jazz (p. 27).
typically symmetrical in shape with congruent harmony and melody. While the notation of the eighth notes is normal, interpretive written instructions are often included ("Swing it!"), but sometimes playing in swing is simply understood by the players. Normal eighth note interpretation is indicated by instructions like "even 8ths" or "straight 8ths."

Syncopation is an important ingredient, as is the ability of musicians to attack slightly ahead of or behind the beat. But swinging is more than a specific placement of the beat, and in fact, does not necessarily mean playing in "swing time." Swing at times also implies a spirited kind of performance; what Gridley calls "rhythmic lift" musicians are likely to call a "groove."

Another important jazz rhythmic technique occurred with the bebop revolution of the 1940s. The bop beat called for an entirely different set of accents and articulations than typical swing rhythm. While swing time accents utilized the normal downbeat along with primary and secondary accents, bop accented the upbeats. Furthermore, bop changed the symmetrical two- and four-bar phrases into asymmetrical phrase lengths. Combined with a greater use of unresolved melodic dissonance, an increased tempo in the music, and rapid passing chords and harmonic substitutions, the result was the radical sound of bebop. By 1940s standards, the invention of bebop (by modernists like Charlie Parker,

---

47 Swing music published for the general public is sometimes written in the triplet figure (quarter note + eighth note in an eighth note triplet) or in the dotted eighth + sixteenth figure. Early swing charts were usually written in the latter, but never with the intent of the strict 3:1 ratio. Composers attempting to combine swing and non-jazz styles often encounter difficulties when the music is attempted by non-jazz musicians, but the former rhythmic figure is nevertheless an approximation of the feel.

48 As early as 1919, the term (along with "sway" and "surge") was used in reference to regular rhythmic pulsing. See T. L. Rickaby, "Getting the Swing of it," The Etude, Vol. 37, No. 11 (1919): 734.

49 Gridley, Jazz Styles... p. 6.
Thelonious Monk, Bud Powell, and Dizzy Gillespie) made greater demands on audiences and performers alike.  

Polyrhythm, or the superimposition of disparate rhythmic or metric figures, is another technique at which jazz musicians are particularly adept. The African heritage of jazz is evident in the use of this device, not only on the part of drummers but the rhythm section and soloists as well. A jazz rhythm section features the piano, bass, and drums (and possibly guitar or percussion). It is the charge of this group to maintain meter, tempo, and harmony for improvising soloists. But within this broad mandate, members of the rhythm section may also interpret the meter and harmony quite freely, exploring such elements as instrument range, texture, dynamics, melody and countermelody, phrasing, etc. Sometimes the actual beat is only implied, with articulations occurring all around it in patterns of varying length and complexity. The end result becomes a dynamic interplay of ideas, each player making an individual statement while supporting the rest of the ensemble. This idea of rhythmic freedom is essential to free jazz, which retains the importance of pulse, but devalues the importance of meter.

It is apparent that the music from which free jazz departs is itself a very flexible music. In the analyses in the coming chapters, we will examine (among other things) the many ways in which free jazz both utilizes and departs from these traditional jazz

---

50 In the opinion of Mark S. Harvey ("Jazz and Modernism," *Jazz in Mind*, p. 136), "Bop was... a self-conscious attempt to exclude white musicians... and to reassert the importance of the black musician... on artistic terms."

51 Dean, *New Structures in Jazz*... p. 10. In his chapter "Rhythmic techniques," the author identifies rhythmic innovations by many musicians, including Sonny Rollins, Bill Evans, Dave Brubeck, Ornette Coleman, Andrew Hill, Elvin Jones, John Coltrane, Miles Davis, Cecil Taylor, Tony Oxley, John McLaughlin, and many others.
techniques, with the question in mind as to what makes free jazz jazz. Before our examination of the music, however, I would like to discuss some techniques of musical analysis and how they may be relevant to jazz specifically.

Analytical Techniques Appropriate to Jazz

The idea of musical analysis brings to mind certain established techniques normally associated with the practice. Many generations of musicologists, theorists, analysts, and composers have contributed to the development of these methods, which through use have shed light (both technical and aesthetic) on countless works of music. Because of the dynamic nature of music and our (lack of?) understanding of it, analysts are continually modifying standard analytical models and developing new ones. By historical standards, the analysis of jazz is a fairly recent activity, but within the past twenty years scholars have begun to contribute in earnest to this growing body of work. Most traditional means of analysis apply adequately to traditional jazz, provided care is taken to address any tonal or rhythmic idiosyncrasies in the music. But free jazz is another matter altogether, on account of the generally non-tonal nature of the music and the lack of a written score. Due, therefore, to the intricacies of both the music of free jazz and its evolution, critical analysis demands a variety of analytical means.

Tools of functional analysis address questions of musical syntax. Common practice formal and harmonic procedures deal with elements in jazz that are typical to other western music, such as tonality, melody, theme, voice leading, accompaniment, phrase structure, modulation, harmonic rhythm, cadential formulae, and formal characteristics. Questions of balance, texture, orchestration, register, dynamics, duration,
character, and mood are also relevant. Other twentieth-century compositional techniques that have also been used in jazz—atypical scales, polyharmony and polyrhythm, unique metric and rhythmic usage, quartal and secondal harmony, pandiatonicism, free counterpoint, atypical sonorities, and microtonality—can be discussed by established method and terminology. Schoenberg's twelve-tone system of composition helped define atonalism and serialism, and set the stage for the development of atonal set theory, which may prove to be valuable in free jazz analysis. (Some jazz technique books now feature sections on twelve-tone improvisation.) As discussed above, some analysts are beginning to look at set theory as a means of grappling with the issues of free jazz. At first hearing, this method would seem appropriate for a work like Cecil Taylor's Enter Evening, a rather static, pointillistic ensemble piece from 1966 with clear European influences. In this case, however, the question of scope comes into play. In order for pitch-class methods to be really meaningful on a global scale, they are best applied to complete musical statements (typically short works such as Berg's Op. 4 or Schoenberg's Op. 19). Enter Evening is nearly eleven minutes long; it is also an improvised piece with no written score, which compounds the problem. A complete and accurate transcription of such a work is an extreme challenge (if not an impossibility). But as has been previously mentioned, many instances of free jazz occur in the context of more traditional jazz, and many are of relatively short duration. A recently recorded example can be found on the soundtrack of Naked Lunch, a film based upon the William Burroughs novel for which

52See Chapter 1.

53For an example of pitch-class analysis applied on a larger scale, see Janet Schmalfeldt, "Berg's Wozzeck: Harmonic Language and Dramatic Design (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1983).
Howard Shore and Ornette Coleman composed the music.\textsuperscript{54} Coleman's improvisations are interjected throughout the orchestrated soundtrack in succinct segments; perhaps light could be shed on Coleman's harmolodic theory (which will be discussed in Chapter 3) by means of the operations of atonal theory.

Another well-established analytical method is Schenkerian analysis.\textsuperscript{55} Though originally created to interpret eighteenth- and nineteenth-century tonal works, this method has been adapted to fit the complexities of post-tonal music. Works by twentieth-century composers from Webern to Gershwin have been analyzed using the Schenkerian principles of prolongation and structural classification. Felix Salzer in \textit{Structural Hearing} (1952) observed that the consonant/dissonant concept of earlier music appears to be supplanted by the idea of dissonances of varying degrees of intensity, adding that the tonic-dominant axis is not the only framework for directed motion.\textsuperscript{56} This view of dissonance will, I suspect, be important in the analysis of free jazz, since the vitality of the music depends so much on the use of musical tension and release. By nature this method examines essentially complete musical statements, and relies on the analyst's hearing of the music.\textsuperscript{57}

\textsuperscript{54}Howard Shore and Ornette Coleman, \textit{Naked Lunch}, (BMG 35614-2), 1992.

\textsuperscript{55}Heinrich Schenker (1868-1935) developed a method of graphic analysis by which large-scale musical structure is identified (acquiring heightened significance), along with musical middle- and foreground. The mechanics rely on a combination of linear and harmonic criteria. Modern approaches to Schenkerian analysis play a prominent role in the music theory divisions of American universities, but omit the philosophical content in Schenker's writings, in which he talks (among other things) of music as art, the necessity of art in life, music as language, and physical response to music.


\textsuperscript{57}For examples of Schenkerian analysis of modern music, see James Baker, "Schenkerian Analysis in Post-Tonal Music," \textit{Aspects of Schenkerian Theory}, edited by David Beach (New Haven: Yale University Press, 1983), pp. 168-185, in which Baker demonstrates the idea of prolongation by the identification of
In spite of enormous changes in compositional techniques and musical development, most modern music still utilizes some type of written score, which analysts use as a point of departure when discussing music. Free jazz, however, is not a notated music. A product of improvisation, rhythmically complex, often thickly textured and rapidly performed, this music is extraordinarily difficult to reduce from recorded sound to paper. Jazz analysts often spend many hours making partial or complete written transcriptions of solos, rhythms, architecture, melodic shape, gestures, and other essentials of the music, but (as can be imagined) complete accuracy is always a problem. Indeed, this may be one of the reasons so few jazz pieces are considered for analysis. Ironically, lack of written representation by necessity forces the analyst to approach the music in other ways, thereby avoiding the common pitfall of analyzing the score without analyzing the music. But even when representations (transcriptions of solos, formal sections, tempi, ensemble, etc.) of jazz works are made, the problem still exists of how best to consider those elements which are not conducive to notation, but nevertheless are vital to the music.

The idea of music evoking narrative is not new, and neither is the notion of narrative (or descriptive) analysis. Robert Schumann's poetic style of criticism is well

underlying linear connections in the whole-tone construction of Scriabin's "Enigme" Op. 52, No. 2. For an example of Schenkerian methodology as applied to jazz, see Steven Larson, "Schenkerian Analysis of Modern Jazz, Vol. 1" (Ph.D. dissertation, University of Michigan, 1987). In this work, the author has analyzed several jazz compositions, including different versions of Thelonious Monk's "Round Midnight" as interpreted in recordings by Monk, Oscar Peterson, Bud Powell, and Bill Evans.

The problem of analyzing non-notated music extends beyond jazz. Increased activity in computer generated music, renewed interest in *musique concrète*, and ethnomusicological research are beginning to force the issue in academic circles. And even such jazz scores that do exist are not readily available; few libraries have even a token selection.
known, if only for those works in which he detected poetic qualities. English composer and music scholar Donald Tovey’s *Essays in Musical Analysis* (1935-39) helped to set the standard for English musical writing early in the century. He provided considerable insight into the workings of dozens of chamber, orchestral and choral works, concertos, and symphonies with vivid, image-laden prose, at the same time providing ample musical excerpts to support his ideas. Many of Heinrich Schenker's graphic examples are sprinkled with descriptive prose intended to underscore the meaning of the graph. And philosopher/writer Susanne K. Langer, whose work in part focused on the identification of form, would often use mythological narrative and poetic description to demonstrate a point. While she argues against music as language (and states unequivocally that music has no literal meaning), she nevertheless agrees that it may be a presentational symbol of the emotive quality of language, in other words, it is a language of feeling. Nor is the idea of descriptive narrative and music an anachronism. In *Musical Analysis and the Listener*, Nicholas Cook uses colorful imagery to help define his ideas on musical imagination; this thesis is an attempt to address his perceived discrepancy between analytical techniques and musical perception. The evolution of Cook's ideas resulted in *A Guide to Musical Analysis* (an activity he views as practical rather than theoretical), in

---


60 Susanne K. Langer, *Philosophy in a New Key*, (Cambridge: Harvard University Press, 3rd ed., 1979), p. 232-36. Langer's ideas are ripe for application to current problems in music. Unfortunately, while her work seems to be acknowledged and respected by those who teach aesthetics and criticism, her writings are not (as least from my experience) actively studied and applied in the academic curriculum.

which he demonstrates considerable descriptive methodology.62 According to a recent article by Richard Littlefield and David Neumeyer in *Music Theory Spectrum*, there are no fewer than five current classifications of music-narrative study. The authors argue that given that music is a temporal art, it seems natural to speak of it as narrative, having narrativity, or being arranged following certain archetypal narrative patterns.63 They continue:

Narrativity, of a verbal or musical text, requires goal-directed motion, a transformation of the initial situation during the course of actions, and logical or causal entailment between beginning and end, all under the control of a "deep structure" or *combinatoire*, a set of organizing functions that controls a textual surface.64

There are two main reasons why I think the idea of descriptive narrative may serve well as an analytical approach appropriate to free jazz. First of all, there is a consistent opinion voiced by free jazz artists that they are endeavoring to express something with the music. Ornette Coleman explained this succinctly by stating that "...a D played in a passage representing sadness should not sound like a joyous D."65 Eric Dolphy said, "This human thing in instrument playing has to do with trying to get as much human warmth and feeling into my work as I can. I want to say more on my horn than I ever

---


64Littlefield and Neumeyer, "Rewriting Schenker...," p. 39.

could in ordinary speech."\textsuperscript{66} John Coltrane called his music "...an expression of higher ideals."\textsuperscript{67} And nearly every piece recorded by Charlie Haden's Liberation Music Orchestra is either entitled for, dedicated to, or based upon the music of oppressed or struggling peoples--certainly the raison d'\'etre is, at least in part, the story behind the music. The second reason has to do with a melodic technique of jazz invention--the vocalization of the melodic line. This practice of melodic playing, the result of both interpretive and technical facility, is integral to the jazz sound.\textsuperscript{68} In his biography of John Coltrane, Bill Cole makes a connection between this aspect of Coltrane's playing and the philosophy and techniques of African Yoruba and Ibo musicians, who are expected to follow specific guidelines called "Inflexional Correspondence between words and tune" in order to retain the "meaning in song as in speech." Among the concepts applied are emphasis on tone and tone-specific patterns, high-mid-low registral differentiations, correct inflection, and liberal use of onomatopoeia, with the idea being that understanding is gained through the hearing.\textsuperscript{69} John Coltrane's rendering of the final movement of \textit{A Love Supreme} as discussed earlier expresses this idea precisely--the content of the composer's spiritual testimony is voiced by means of narrative technique. One additional point is relevant


\textsuperscript{67}Kosky, \textit{Black Nationalism and the Revolution in Music}, p. 227.

\textsuperscript{68}Horn players have experimented with a variety of technical means in effort to achieve a vocalized tone--variations in breath pressure; alternative fingerings; and experiments with embouchure, reeds, and mouthpieces. Bass players develop their singing tone by utilizing techniques such as variances in left hand touch, pressure, and vibrato; varying right hand positions in relation to the bridge and neck; and sliding between notes.

here. In her essay "Jazz Isn't Just Me: Jazz Autobiographies as Performance Personas," Kathy Ogren focuses in part on recurring themes which surface in the writings of jazz artists, themes which can be compared to literary motifs such as "the godmother," "the traveler," "the journey," "the trickster," and "a sense of home." She contends that there is a geographical basis for formulaic aspects of jazz stories, whose delivery is in part influenced by oral performance traditions that rely on understanding and participation with audiences.  

Two good examples of this type of symbolism, albeit on a somewhat deeper level than the motifs mentioned above, can be seen in John Coltrane's poem A Love Supreme, discussed earlier, and the accompanying poem to Cecil Taylor's Indent, a serious and difficult work which alludes in part to ideas of racism, identity, and justice (Taylor's work will be discussed in Chapter 5). It seems to me, then, that if artists both overtly and by more subtle means demonstrate the connection between common cultural identity and their artistic expression, the analyst should try to honor the spirit in which the music was created by keeping a watchful eye out for specific instances where that content can be articulated. As critic Amiri Baraka (LeRoi Jones) states bluntly in his essay "Jazz Criticism and Its Effect on the Art Form," "...no analysis is valuable without the critic's being at least familiar with the premises and presumptions of the work and its creator, as well as the real-life context it issues from." Renée Cox argues similarly in "Recovering Jouissance: An Introduction to Feminist Musical Aesthetics," calling for more attention to the relationships of personal, social, and cultural conditions of the

---

70Kathy Ogren, "Jazz Isn't Just Me: Jazz Autobiographies as Performance Personas," Jazz In Mind, p. 114-121.

71Amiri Baraka, "Jazz Criticism and Its Effect on the Art Form," New Perspectives on Jazz, p 55.
composers to the nature and structure of musical compositions themselves. She emphasizes a physical connection between works of art, their creation, and reception, contending that a greater integration between life and art is in order. This idea of immediacy with the physical is consistent with the opinions of many free jazz artists, whose bonds with the traditions and aesthetics of their African heritage are strong.

The question therefore arises: How does this idea—that culture and identity are relevant in musical analysis—affect analysis? As an example, I would like to turn briefly to Rose Subotnik with a look at her essay "On grounding Chopin," in which she discusses her assumption of a relationship between music and society, and the mutually supportive notions of artistic structure and the experience of life. She contends that what Chopin demonstrates rather explicitly is that structure need not be internally generated to be perceptually coherent, and that style is of greater importance to intelligibility than is form. In her discussion of Chopin's Etude in E Major (Op. 10, No. 3) and his Ballade in G Minor, she compares the composer's short, self-contained fragments with the transitory nature of reality and the sense of physical immediacy. Referring to the "sensuous identity" of the music, Ms. Subotnik focuses her analysis on the surface of the music, suggesting that Chopin succeeded in projecting individuality, and that his fluency and eloquence purveyed a mastery of his ability to communicate, as well as an

---


articulation of emotion. As we turn, then, to specific discussions of several free jazz works, attention will be given as to how elements of personal style figure into a meaningful analysis.

Certainly, there are numerous and diverse elements that ought to be considered in analysis. In order for an analysis to be comprehensive, it must address sufficient specific musical criteria to give a sense of what the composer did and what the analyst's interpretive intent is. In addition, the analysis must answer a variety of questions. Is the musical work unique? Does it exhibit obvious influences? How does this work represent musical style? Does the analysis provide some perspective on historical context? Why did the composer create this music? What was happening in the composer's life that may have inspired or influenced the writing? How is this music experienced by the listener? That is, are aesthetic responses to the music discussed, in addition to musical "nuts and bolts"? Has the analyst gained insight into the music, and is that insight conveyed to the reader? As we turn our attention to three free jazz works--Ornette Coleman's "Lonely Woman," John Coltrane's "India," and Cecil Taylor's "Second Layer" from Indent, I submit that a broad approach to the analysis of free jazz will provide a perspective conducive to the understanding not only of the music, but also the artists and the social, political, and historical times in which they lived.

75Subotnik, "On grounding Chopin," Music and Society, p. 130.

76The reader should note that Chapters 3 through 5 may be considered independently from each other. Terminology that may be specific to one chapter may not necessarily have the same connotation in all chapters. Such is the case, for example, with the term gesture, which is used to identify specific music events in the analysis of John Coltrane's "India," but which may be used as a more general term in the other chapters.
PART II. ANALYTICAL APPLICATIONS
CHAPTER 3
ORNETTE COLEMAN: "LONELY WOMAN"

Recorded in 1959 by the Ornette Coleman Quartet (Coleman, alto sax; Don Cherry, cornet; Charlie Haden, bass; Billy Higgins, drums), this work from The Shape of Jazz to Come is one of Coleman's most beautiful and well-known pieces.¹ Of this recording the composer said: "Music is for our feelings. I think jazz should try to express more kinds of feeling than it has up to now."² This philosophy is well depicted in "Lonely Woman." Composed five years earlier in 1954, this piece was apparently conceived while Coleman was on lunch break from his department store job in Los Angeles. Walking down a street, he saw a painting of a tearful "bourgeois, wealthy-looking white lady sitting with the most sad and lonely expression. . ."—the result is "Lonely Woman."³

"Lonely Woman" is a short work, just under five minutes in duration. Formally, the piece is in an A-A-B-A song form, followed by Coleman's solo, and a repeat of the song with a varied B section and ending. The melody or "head" of the song features alto

¹"Lonely Woman" is one of three examples of Coleman's work featured on the Smithsonian Collection of Classic Jazz (CBS Records RD 033 A5 19477); it was also recorded by the Modern Jazz Quartet in a John Lewis arrangement (see Litweiler, Ornette Coleman: The Harmolodic Life, p. 96); bassist Charlie Haden also recorded it with Quartet West on In Angel City (Verve/PolyGram 837 031-2).

²Ornette Coleman, liner notes for The Shape of Jazz to Come (Atlantic 1317-2), compact disk. Liner notes by Martin Williams.

³Litweiler, Ornette Coleman: The Harmolodic Life, p. 36.
and cornet in tandem (albeit loosely) throughout, with the exception of the fourth phrase which the alto takes alone. An introduction by the bass and drums begins the piece; it ends with a bass and drums diminuendo. Within this conventional framework, however, the music is anything but typical. Ornette Coleman's ingenuity can be observed in aspects of the form, phrasing, melody, harmony, intonation, expression, tone, and rhythm. There is also a unified performing aesthetic evident within the ensemble which suggests a sense of total abandon juxtaposed with intent awareness on the part of the players. The result is an understated cohesiveness of sound, deceptive in its apparent simplicity, entirely original, and intriguingly challenging to render in traditional notation. Figure 3.1 features a transcription of the piece.4

Before entering into a discussion of the musical aspects of "Lonely Woman," a word is in order regarding the relationship of the score to the music. Whether Ornette Coleman presented this piece from a sketch or from a lead sheet is a matter of speculation. In all likelihood, at least a general representation of the melody and harmony was probably written; after all, the tune was five years old when it was recorded. What is almost certain, however, is that any score which Coleman may have made came after the tune was invented, and was intended to be more of a reminder of the tune rather than a strict depiction of an ideal performance. The reason for this is not only Coleman's unorthodox approach to writing music, as has been mentioned, but also the fact that jazz is a music originating in oral tradition. In any event, only the most general aspects of any

4With the exception of the introduction, I have used dotted bar lines in favor of traditional bar lines in my transcription of "Lonely Woman," in effort to call the reader's attention to the metric and rhythmic freedom of the music. The transcription features the complete saxophone and cornet parts, the cymbal rhythm during the introduction, and the bass line during the introduction and ending.
Lonely Woman

Copyright © 1960 by MJQ Music, Inc. Used by permission.

Figure 3.1 Ornette Coleman's "Lonely Woman." Transcription by the author.
Figure 3.1 Continued
performance can be depicted in the written representation of sound—notes, rhythm (if strictly applied), and approximate interpretive information. Nuances of color and emotion can only be experienced by hearing and feeling the actual music. And while my transcription of "Lonely Woman" may represent my hearing of the recording of the piece, it is intended to be viewed only as an approximation of reality, in much the same way as a map serves to portray a landscape. These differences between reality and representation will be referred to throughout my discussion of the piece.

The first hint of the flexibility inherent to "Lonely Woman" is provided in the bass/drums introduction. An initial pulse is established in the first four bars, after which a general forward momentum is begun by drummer Billy Higgins on the ride cymbal, in what is initially an eighth/two sixteenths figure, but immediately varies in pattern. Meanwhile, bassist Charlie Haden begins with a four-bar melodic D-minor riff, which, when repeated, is placed slightly behind the established beat. This falling behind sets the tendency for the rhythmic freedom which is to unfold throughout the piece. The expectation set up by the twelve-bar introduction is for the A-A-B-A song form to follow a continued pattern of four-bar multiples. This is not the case. Figure 3.2 shows a simple sketch of the form.

The A section, comprised of six phrases, is fifteen bars long; the B section is nine

---

A lead sheet version of "Lonely Woman" was published in A Collection of 26 Ornette Coleman Compositions (New York: MJQ Music, Inc., 1968), p. 21, which features the tune in the A section, select bass harmonies, and the cornet harmony in the B section. Also in the same volume is a vocal version, with lyrics by Margo Guryan (pp. 22-23). While my reading coincides with most aspects of the published music, it differs in other elements, including some rhythmic placement and one instance of melody. I have also included the B section melody, Coleman's solo, the variation of the B section at the repeat of the tune, and the final ending.
bars long, the first four of which contain three short statements, the remaining five bars, a single statement. Both endings contain three-bar cadences. Another expectation is set up by the A-A-B-A song form in regard to the solo. Typically, the form of the solo would duplicate the form of the song. Again, the convention is foiled. Coleman's solo begins with a twenty-three measure section (comprised of fourteen melodic statements), clearly divided into eighteen- and five-bar sections. The parallel to the B section follows, signaled by the cornet harmony and stricter time keeping on the hi-hat. Expectation is also challenged here, with the twenty-two bar section split into ten- and twelve-bar segments, comprised of fifteen melodic fragments. Normally, this final twelve bars of the solo would resemble the return of the A section of the music. While the length does not differ greatly (twelve measures in the solo compared to fifteen in the return of A in the song), there is no hint of similarity either in theme or in the shape of the music.

Closer examination of the tune of "Lonely Woman" readily explains the asymmetry of form. The head is comprised of six phrases of irregular length; of these,
only the cadence exhibits typical rhythmic and harmonic characteristics. Coleman's conversational delivery can easily be imagined here as a kind of question-and-answer, like the lines of a short dialogue. The first two phrases are comprised of three bars each, and while the second phrase (or answer) clearly balances the first, Coleman does so without exact rhythmic repetition. The third phrase ends with expansion of the octave to a tenth, at which point the alto sax, heretofore on the bottom, makes a registral transfer up to Bb for the fourth short phrase, which is played solo. Figure 3.3 shows the voice leading and transfer of register. The two instruments break away from their octave doubling in the fifth and climactic segment of the melody, instead descending in parallel chromatic sixths to complete the phrase. Cadential gestures for both first and second endings complete the tune.

![Figure 3.3 Alto sax voice leading and registral transfer](image)

The composer's use of the D-minor modality in "Lonely Woman" is original, in the head as well as in the solo. The tonic is outlined in the first two bars of phrase one, followed by the falling tritone C#-G, which suggests the dominant A7. I use the word "suggest" here, since harmonic rhythm is by no means implicit, due to several factors: the linear nature of the alto, cornet, and bass lines; the tendency of the phrases to end on rhythmically weak beats; and an absence of downbeat emphasis on the part of the players, particularly bassist Haden and drummer Higgins. The second phrase completes the
dominant outline, reinforcing tonic harmony with the return to D, while in the third phrase
the melody alludes to both the major and minor forms of the dominant (with both C# and
C-natural); the tonic D-minor is again realized at the end (the low B in the alto can be
heard as an added sixth). The added sixth in the alto jumps up to Bb in a transfer of
register; the Bb-D-F triad can easily be heard as an embellishment of the falling dominant
(minus the third), E to A. The cornet resumes the higher position in the fifth phrase,
which comes to rest on the dyad F#-A, posing a brief modal shift from minor to major,
perhaps to balance the earlier major/minor dominant shift. The preceding chromatic sixths
again can clearly be heard as a falling embellishment. The three-bar first ending not only
redefines D-minor, but balances the first two phrases in length, harmony, and shape,
although the latter two aspects are in diminished form. The second ending delivers a more
elaborate cadence featuring another registral transfer, a device which Coleman uses often.
Here the voices cross, with the alto taking the upper part on the Ab-G before joining in

![Figure 3.4 Alto sax melody at second ending](image)

unison D. Figure 3.4 shows the saxophone melody (without the cornet part). Notice the
similarity of this to the opening melodic motive, in a unifying gesture to complete the
repeated tune.
The B section of the tune is identified in the head (as well as the solo) with an ascending chromatic line in the cornet; there is also a new metric emphasis in the bass and drums, with a steady hi-hat quarter note and accentuated downbeat in the bass. The cornet's ascending line falls on beat one of each of the first four bars, over which the saxophone juxtaposes three rising-and-falling motives in another interesting rhythmic counterpoint. Coleman's tone is harsh and whining here, his intonation inexact; the phrasing is choppy, and many of the notes fall off at the end, as if the music were paint smeared on a canvas. The close dissonance between the horns increases the dramatic tension, which is released and balanced beautifully in the next five bars by a long, smooth, scalar descent from D, in which the saxophone gently purrs in contrast to the preceding barks. The two halves of this section again recall a conversational tone, the first part aggressive and pointed, followed by the calm and sensitive response. The two horns resume their octave doubling for another round of the A section to complete the tune. This doubling is worth comment, as the inexact manner of performance cannot be accurately written in score form. The "unison" which occurs between the saxophone and cornet is slightly offset, but to attempt to notate the music based upon subdivisions of the beat would be a mistake, since it would lead to the conclusion that attack was intended to occur at a precise time. These imperfect unisons, in tandem with the absence of metric accent, contribute to the elastic feel of the music. Figure 3.5 shows these imperfect unisons in the return of the first three phrases of the head after Coleman's solo. In the figure, the alto sax is shown entering slightly ahead of the cornet in some of the octaves; the amount of time offset by each irregular entrance varies from event to event. The
Figure 3.5 Imperfect unisons between sax and cornet

perception of these irregularities may be partly a result of Don Cherry's method of attack, which is initially very soft, followed by an immediate crescendo; again, this is an aspect of the music which defies traditional notation.⁶

The element of "Lonely Woman" which best exhibits Coleman's unique approach to music—and unequivocally places this piece under the free jazz umbrella—is the rhythm. According to one observer:

The easiest way to distinguish between conventional jazz and its offshoots is to describe the improvisation in conventional jazz as being based on tunes in time. The simple mechanics are that the improvisation is derived from the melody, scales, and arpeggios associated with a harmonic sequence of a set length played in regular time.⁷

At first appearances from looking at the transcription, one could easily be tempted to classify this piece as conventional—a song using a standard form and an identifiable (if uncommon) phrase structure and melody. But after repeated listenings, the listener will

---

⁶Jost uses the term "heterophonic" unison in reference to this type of doubling. He suggests that its use by Coleman as well as Thelonious Monk may have been an influence on Cecil Taylor's Unit Structures (see Free Jazz, p. 79).

concede that only part of the story is told by the transcription. The rhythmic freedom
with which the quartet presents the music is both subtle and elusive, and most certainly
is not based on a tune in exact time. There are slight variations within the repeated
versions of the A section, the aforementioned unpredictable disparities between the
unisons, fractional anticipations and delays in the tempi, and free avoidance of traditional
sectional delineations in the phrasing and structure. Indeed, the irregular number of bars
within each section is due to the pacing of uneven phrase lengths, whose character is
derived from shape, tone color, and the avoidance of conventional strong and weak beats
(in fact, the idea of "beat" altogether). The rhythmic factor might even be more
appropriately thought of as \emph{time}. The treatment of time and mood in "Lonely Woman"
is distinctly different from the rhythmic and interpretive freedom inherent in a Brahms
trio, for example, where there is an elasticity of tempo determined by the romantic
performance practice, in which all the players are expected to push or pull on the time
together, with identical accuracy of attack and release, articulation, dynamics, gesture, and
tone. Coleman's composition, however, reveals a different practice, in which each
member of the ensemble is expected to move through the time of the piece at his own
natural pace, with his own quality of sound. Figure 3.6 is intended to illustrate the idea

\begin{figure}[h]
\centering
\includegraphics[width=0.5\textwidth]{figure3_6.png}
\caption{Free rhythmic pace in "Lonely Woman"}
\end{figure}
of this free rhythmic pace. Each line of the sketch contains 15 events, which begin at the same time and end in close proximity, but the pace of the events in each line is rarely duplicated. Such is the case in "Lonely Woman." This tendency to play according to the natural gait of the music is exhibited in the segmentation of Coleman's solo gestures, which are inclined to be short and well delineated. With these concepts in mind, a look at Coleman's solo will illustrate the composer's unique technical methodology in regard to improvisation in this music.⁸

The development of the solo is based upon Coleman's use of motivic chain-associations,⁹ and it is the unfolding of the composer's motivic cells that contributes to the rhythmic placement of the solo gestures. Coleman's usage of motive manipulation as a means of development is well known. What Jost calls motivic chain-associations, John Litweiler calls motive evolution, which he describes as the composer's modification, transmutation, replication, and polymerization of the melodic germ cell, which may be as small as three notes and whose essence involves its shape.¹⁰ Figure 3.7 indicates the evolution of motives in Coleman's solo in "Lonely Woman."

In Figure 3.7, divisions made according to melodic groupings, based upon the natural breaks in Coleman's solo, are abstracted from the original, "normally" notated transcription. Each melodic "gesture" is identified by numbers and separated from the

---


⁹A term coined by Ekkehard Jost, Free Jazz, p. 50.

¹⁰Litweiler, Ornette Coleman, The Harmolodic Life, p. 57.
Figure 3.7 Motivic evolution in Coleman's solo

others by the double bars; "cells" are labeled in sequence--A-1, A-2, etc.; a gesture may contain more than one cell. While the proportional spacing of notes within the gestures is not intended to convey their exact rhythmic delivery, repeated listenings will verify the natural rise and fall of the lines in the music. The reason for this has to do with the
mechanism of the composer's motivic development, which is the driving force behind the shape and balance of the music.

Like the prior music in "Lonely Woman," Coleman's solo is centered around the tone D, but with strong emphasis on the A as well. The traditional functionality inherent in this supposed tonic/dominant relationship is absent, however, due to the lack of standard formal constructs associated with diatonic function—equal phrase lengths, periods, sequences, harmonic progression and rhythm, steady metric gait, cadences, and accompaniment. Rather, it is more appropriate to think of D and A as gravitational centers toward which the music is drawn, in a manner not unlike the Hypo-/Hyper-Dorian model, but without restriction to an exact scale. Structurally, there is a logical balance within the solo based upon this concept—gestures 1-10 lead (loosely) from A to D, gestures 11-14 reinforce D, while the remaining fifteen gestures gravitate freely back to A.\textsuperscript{11} The motivic ideas which are developed in the solo contain common characteristics, among which may be \textit{shape, pitch, pacing, consistency of emotion, and sense of direction.} The transformation of ideas typically involves the addition, omission, or substitution of one or more of the notes within a cell, as well as the creation of new cells formed as a result of the combination of cells. In addition, Coleman may refer to a gesture located several links back in the chain, a practice which Jost observes as contributing to the creation of larger musical contexts.\textsuperscript{12} Yet the similarities between gestures both avoid

\textsuperscript{11}Jost suggests that Coleman overcomes a tonal center's monotonous tendency by the integration of two stylistic traits: (1) a new kind of \textit{motivic improvisation} leading to (2) temporary shifts to \textit{secondary tonal centers} (\textit{Free Jazz}, p. 48).

\textsuperscript{12}Jost, \textit{Free Jazz}, p. 50.
redundancy and defy expectation, instead creating logical stepping stones along the way to a unified whole. Coleman's sense of spontaneity also allows him to go with a new idea which may come along in the music--follow his fancy, so to speak--as the chain takes on new shapes and color as it forms.

The solo begins with a barking attack on the first note, but remains introspective through the "A" cells (A-1, A-2, etc.). A-1 begins as a falling line whose character is defined by both its shape and the presence of the "F descending to A" motion, qualities maintained from one cell to the next. The B-1 gesture, with which A-2 is begun, becomes the ending of A-3, with an emphasis on the note G, which is transposed up an octave to introduce A-4. C-1 is a reshaped A-3, from which point the solo begins to increase in intensity and rise in register, the result of the transfer from C-1 to C-2. The first and last notes of C-3 receive particular stress, with a harsh wailing glissando off the E. D-1 is an inverted variation of C-3, but with a B-natural in place of the Bb used earlier. Here is an instance in which Coleman seems to be taken with the sound of a particular note (the B-natural), as gestures 8-10 take on an almost merry lilt compared with the rising stridency of the previous three gestures. Thus far throughout the head, the bridge, and the second-ending cadence of the song, the Bb has been the note of choice. The sound of the B-natural seems to be of special interest to Coleman, who stays with it until gesture 19 as the melody approaches the prominent H-1 cell. As the solo descends to D in gesture 10, the first gravitation has occurred, and the music remains solidly centered on the tone D, with a pentatonic feel to the lines. This D-region also exhibits the most metrically regular sense of time within the solo, with a slight swing,
consistent anticipation of the beat, and second closing on D in Gesture 14. The regularity of this region is not accidental, since it introduces the clear formal delineation of gesture 15, which corresponds to the B-section of the original song. At this point the cornet and bass begin their chromatic ascent, implementing a metrically straight eight-bar section in the accompaniment, over which the saxophone continues on its way with rhythmically irregular (and increasingly chromatic) gestures, until cell H-1, which corresponds to the downbeat of the ninth bar of this bridge section. There is a parallel momentum within the sax solo beginning at gesture 15, one which serves the same purpose as the accompaniment--structural delineation, increased drama and dynamics, and a general feel of lift in the music, caused by the rise in register in gestures 15-17. Gesture 18 (cell G-1), the falling G-C# tritone, is a reminder to the listener that this solo is connected to the head of the tune. Another important factor enters the picture here, one of the embellishment, an approximation of which is included in the transcription, but which nevertheless can only be appreciated with hearing. While the presence of glissandi, "split" attacks, and grace notes has been heard occasionally thus far, Coleman is clearly exploiting these elements here to signal an important point in the music. His scoops and slides in and out of the notes, combined with a edgy, piercing sound on the instrument, lead to a cacophonous arrival at the D (cell H-1). The downbeat falls in the middle of this gesture (#20); Coleman's tone and hold on the D, followed by the falling A, marks a point of drama in the solo. The prominence given to cell H-1 is further evidenced in the subsequent gestures, as the placement of stress within the cells seems to propel the rhythmic pace to the end of the solo. This rhythmic and dynamic emphasis, placed
strategically within gestures 21-28 (indicated by the arrows), is accompanied by a consistent tone quality which matches the "falling D to A" of the H-1 cell. In gestures 25-27, these accented notes (C-C#-D) form a final ascending chromatic passage, which accompanied by a pressing-forward in the pace, leads to G-2 and the high point of the solo. The falling G-C# tritone is followed in gesture 29 by an immediate return to a light and casual air.

The repeat of the song after the solo continues to develop the rhythmic freedom with which this work is defined. A variation in the B-section of the coda (measures five-eight of the coda) features a series of descending glissandi in both the cornet and alto sax, after which a slight pause in the horns is detected before the final return of the head. The ending of the last presentation of the tune involves a long slowing in the pace of the horns, while the bass and drums maintain their own steady time. The mood is gentle and casual, finally drawing to an end with a rising line in the bass as the tune fades away.

It would be an oversight to consider Ornette Coleman's compositional and improvisation style in "Lonely Woman" without also taking a look at the contributions of bassist Charlie Haden and drummer Billy Higgins. It was Coleman's good fortune to join forces with them at the same time in 1959; he had already been working with Don Cherry. Unlike most bassists whose manner of playing was based on functional harmony, Haden was a participatory player whose independent lines were devoid of harmonic implications.\(^{13}\) This style is evident throughout "Lonely Woman" and is integral to the sense of rhythmic freedom inherent in the music. While Haden's initial melodic entrance

\(^{13}\)Jost, *Free Jazz*, p. 47.
at the fifth measure outlines D-minor, his treatment of the modality is linear throughout the head and solo; only in the B-section of the tune is harmony heard in conjunction with meter. Haden's linear style is characterized by elongated attack, overstated sustain, slide between notes, and the avoidance of repetitive phrase lengths. In addition, the meter is further confused by Haden's "false" downbeats, accents that occur irregularly, independent from the melody or supposed bar lines. His arrival at high D, which occurs twice (first at the end of Coleman's solo and again at the end of the piece), highlights the structural significance of those two points. Drummer Billy Higgins has been characterized as a melodic drummer who plays in time, but with "the bottom taken off" the rhythm in such a way as to suggest freedom.\textsuperscript{14} Interestingly, this rather inexact description is quite easily defined in "Lonely Woman." For the most part, Higgins' playing features an irregularly pulsating ride cymbal played gently over a steady but unaccented hi-hat; the lack of repetitive pattern and emphasis on the higher timbres of the cymbals (the bass drum is essentially inaudible) result in a light sense of forward motion devoid of accentuated beat. The independence of Higgins' role is further highlighted, since the alignment of the hi-hat with the melodic lines of the other three players is of seemingly little importance. Regarding this metric flexibility, he offered:

\ldots the ride cymbal on the top is very important. \ldots if you play different rhythms on the top, the horn player is more or less freed to the point where, if he wants to play something on the downbeat or the upbeat, it's no hassle because you can turn the beat around very easily.\textsuperscript{15}

He reserves the use of tom-tom rolls for structural points in the music and the B-section

\textsuperscript{14}Wilmer, \textit{As Serious as Your Life}, p. 158.

of the tune, at which point he punctuates the hi-hat while laying off the ride cymbal altogether. During Coleman's solo, Higgins creates changes in color by the addition of occasional pointillistic accents on the snare, tom-toms, and ride cymbal.

The contributions of Haden and Higgins helped to expand the role of the rhythm section beyond that of providing accompaniment. Most certainly, their styles contributed to the development of Ornette Coleman's, particularly at this early stage of his career. However, there is one additional element which may help to explain Coleman's approach to jazz--his concept of harmolodic theory. According to Coleman, this concept of playing (involving the equal treatment of harmony, melody, and rhythm), allows a person to use a multiplicity of elements to express more than one direction.\textsuperscript{16} As with most artistic concepts, the idea evolved over time, but was apparently first implemented with the recording of "Lonely Woman."\textsuperscript{17} Coleman states simply that being harmolodic means that all parts are equal; melody is multiple unison, and form only exists as a result of the relationship between parts.\textsuperscript{18} One can imagine how difficult it must have been for him to find players who could adapt to this concept in practice, since up until that time, traditional jazz practice adhered to the notion that musical freedom and artistic expression occurred \textit{in context with} predetermined structure based on harmonic function. Don Cherry explains that rather than treating a note according to any supposed function, "In the

\textsuperscript{16}Litweiler, \textit{Ornette Coleman: The Harmolodic Life}, p. 131. The word itself is a contraction of "harmony, movement, and melody" (see p. 171).

\textsuperscript{17}Litweiler, \textit{Ornette Coleman: The Harmolodic Life}, p. 42.

\textsuperscript{18}Ornette Coleman, liner notes for \textit{Naked Lunch} (Milan/BMG 7313835614-2). Music from the original soundtrack, composed by Ornette Coleman and Howard Shore, recorded with the London Philharmonic Orchestra.
harmolodic concept, you're reaching to the point to make every note sound like a tonic.\textsuperscript{19}

Charlie Haden recalls:

Technically speaking, it was a constant modulation in the improvising that was taken from the direction of the composition, and from the direction inside the musician, and from listening to each other...\textsuperscript{20}

It would seem that playing harmolodically, then, involves a state of mind and feeling more than any specific technique. But in spite of the lack of specificity in technical description, these notions shed light on many of the unique aspects of Coleman's music, as well as his aesthetic philosophy.

The lyrical beauty in "Lonely Woman," combined with the rhythmic elasticity, the conversational quality of the melodic line, the heterophonic treatment of octave doublings, the linear approach to harmony, the variety of tone color, and method of associative development are but a few of the elements which have rendered significance to Ornette Coleman's music. Writing in the 1960s, critic Nat Hentoff stated: "Ornette Coleman is making a unique and valuable contribution to tomorrow's music because of the startling power of his playing to reach the most basic emotions."\textsuperscript{21} In any event, his music is certain to be the subject of increased attention in the future. His sound and method also provide a distinctive contrast to those of John Coltrane and Cecil Taylor.

\textsuperscript{19}Litweiler, \textit{Ornette Coleman: The Harmolodic Life}, p. 131.

\textsuperscript{20}Litweiler, \textit{Ornette Coleman: The Harmolodic Life}, p. 132.

CHAPTER 4
John Coltrane: "India"

John Coltrane's "India" was recorded in November, 1961 at the Village Vanguard in New York. A nearly fourteen-minute work featuring Coltrane on soprano sax, Eric Dolphy on bass clarinet, McCoy Tyner on piano, Jimmy Garrison and Reggie Workman on basses, and Elvin Jones on drums, it was originally released on the Impressions LP in 1963. Two additional versions recorded the same week have subsequently been released, one on Coltrane "Live at the Village Vanguard 11-03&05-1961 and John Coltrane From the Original Master Tapes." The former recording actually contains two takes of the piece, one a remixed version of the original Impressions take, and a second take which utilizes the additional input of Garvin Bushell on oboe and bassist Ahmed Abdul-Malik on the Arabic oud. The latter recording features Bushell and Abdul-Malik as well. The greater part of my discussion will focus on the original Impressions version.

The 1961 Village Vanguard sessions capture Coltrane's live sound during the

---

1The Impressions recording number is Impulse A-42; it was reissued on CD in 1987 as MCA Impulse MCD-5887 (© 1977 JOWCOL Music. Used by permission.) Coltrane "Live at the Village Vanguard 11-03&05-1961 is a 1991 reissue on two CDs, listed as Impulse MCVI-23004-5. John Coltrane From the Original Master Tapes was released on CD in 1985 as MCA Impulse MCD-5541.

2The liner notes to John Coltrane From the Original Master Tapes erroneously credit Dolphy as playing the saxophone instead of bass clarinet.
middle period of his development. By this time he had become known for delivering extended solos, particularly when playing live, and "India" was a vehicle not only for his solo and modal exploration, but also for his use of the soprano saxophone, an instrument with which he had begun to experiment the previous year. His interest in the music of India was genuine, and followed naturally upon the heels of his study of Hinduism. In fact, according to pianist McCoy Tyner, the group was very interested in the music of India, and sitarist Ravi Shankar and his tabla player Alla Rakah were originally scheduled to appear at the Village Vanguard sessions. Unfortunately, a tour took them to the west coast at the time, so Coltrane used the oboe and oud in their places. Nevertheless, drummer Elvin Jones had briefly met with Alla Rakah to discuss their upcoming performance. The oboe and oud in two versions of the recording pay homage to the

---

3From 1949 to 1959, Coltrane played with a number of important people, including Dizzy Gillespie, Johnny Hodges, Miles Davis, and Thelonious Monk; his development at that time centered on the vertical exploration of harmony. His middle period is generally considered to begin in 1960 with the creation of his first quartet. It is during this stage that his experiments with modal and eastern influences began. His final period, 1965-67, is most extremely represented by Ascension, and what Jost terms sound exploration (Jost, Free Jazz, pp. 96-97).

4With his recording of My Favorite Things, both Coltrane and the soprano sax came to the public eye. Prior to that time, Steve Lacy, who unfortunately has gained only limited public recognition, was one of the few ever to use the soprano sax as a jazz instrument. Their common predecessor was Sidney Bechet, whose playing Coltrane greatly admired.

5Wilmer, As Serious As Your Life, pp. 144-145.

6Shankar, in turn, was interested in western music, particularly in jazz because of its improvisational aspects. The May 6, 1965 issue of Down Beat features an article on the master sitarist, who had recently given a recital at the Hollywood jazz club, Shelly's Manne-Hole. One of Coltrane's sons, now a jazz saxophonist himself, is named for Shankar. Coltrane's 1961 recordings of "India" as well as Africa contributed to the music community's increased awareness of non-western cultures and philosophies.

7According to McCoy Tyner, interviewed by the author, Seattle, Washington, October 15, 1993. While Mr. Tyner could not say for certain, one could speculate that this meeting may have been the source of Elvin Jones' knowledge of specific Indian drumming techniques. What a pity the intended performance with Ravi Shankar and Alla Rakah did not occur.
sound of Indian music, with the oboe opening the introduction in a mixolydian-mode improvisation and the oud presenting a continuous G-D drone throughout, although it becomes obscured as the intensity of the music builds. A particular technique of Indian drumming, the tihai, is also used by Elvin Jones in the Impressions take, to be explained later.

We will never know the exact extent to which John Coltrane was attempting to emulate Indian music; it is beside the point in any event. It will be of benefit to the reader, however, to know a bit about the music of India, not only to aid in the understanding of the Coltrane's (and his ensemble's) methodology, but also to observe several similar characteristics between this music and jazz. The history of Indian classical music (only one of many genres of Indian music) has been traced to between the second and fourth millennia B.C. Over the centuries, it developed into a highly complex system inseparable from Islamic and Hindu religious ideology, and during the eleventh and twelfth centuries began to become regionalized into northern and southern systems. In modern times, it has developed into an art music that may be independent from religious, although not necessarily philosophical or spiritual, considerations. The most popular instrument of Indian music is the sitar, a stringed instrument with movable frets and a set of sympathetic strings below the main strings. Also well known is the tabla, a two-headed set of tuneable drums played with the hand. Music is usually taught from master to pupil, and by all accounts truly takes a lifetime to master.

Improvisation plays a key role in Indian classical music, particularly in the northern style. The music is based upon a melodic form rather than harmonic, and the
basic melodic form is called the *raga*, which is a collection of ascending and descending tones created from both fixed and variable divisions of intervals within the octave; other factors are also relevant, such as emphasis of a particular tone, microtonal variation, or note order. There are twenty-two *śrūtis* within an octave, which are divided among seven *svaras*, although the subdivision of these intervals is not fixed. The raga is formed only during performance, and is embellished and developed according to the artist's skill and discretion. The rhythmic momentum of the music is called the *laya*, which is distinct from rhythmic cycles called *talas*, or organized groups of beats and accents which form the basis for rhythmic improvisation. Indian music takes considerable time to unfold, beginning slowly, increasing in speed and texture as it progresses. After the improvisational development, the musicians come back together with a type of down-beat stress, called the *sam*. This is often immediately preceded by the *tihai*, a drumming technique consisting of a short rhythmic pattern repeated three times, which signals the completion of the cycle or form.\(^8\) Western musicians are more likely to be familiar with the idea of the raga than any other element of Indian music, although something like the rhythmic *laya* had also developed in free jazz. Certainly, Elvin Jones was aware of the significance of the *tihai*, as exhibited by his use of it in "India," and an argument can also be made that Coltrane was intending to devise a type of raga in his introduction to the

---

\(^8\)My thanks to percussionist and free jazz expert Ed Pias, a graduate student in percussion at the University of Washington, for bringing this information to my attention, and for pointing out its use in "India." In a lecture/demonstration at UW on March 30, 1993, he also pointed out Elvin Jones' use of the *tihai* in "Chasin' the Trane," recorded the same week as "India" at the Village Vanguard. I would also like to thank Robert Reigle, graduate student in ethnomusicology and jazz saxophonist, for bringing to my attention the usage of a similar device in African music; see A. M. Jones, "Yeve Cult Music," *Studies in African Music* (London: Oxford University Press, 1959), p. 119.
piece.

The core of the ensemble on "India" is made up of (what was to become) John Coltrane's renowned quartet, McCoy Tyner on piano, Elvin Jones on drums, and Jimmy Garrison on bass. Coltrane would become known for adding various other musicians to the ensemble, often in the middle of sessions or gigs, and apparently it was his fascination with the Indian water-drum, essentially a drone instrument, that led him to augment the group with a second bass player.⁹ (He had been playing with Reggie Workman prior to the Vanguard sessions.) Another reason for the addition of the second bassist, again according to Tyner, was to establish the "counterrhythm feel," so as to avoid the sense of a downbeat accent in the music. Jost discusses this in his comments on "India," observing that the bassists' accent distribution, which varies throughout the piece, "jeopardizes the fundamental rhythm."¹⁰ Eric Dolphy, who was also interested in eastern tonalities and the music of Ravi Shankar, was originally scheduled to join the group for only three nights, but ended up staying through a European tour.¹¹

My discussion of the music will focus mainly on John Coltrane's playing, although the contributions of his fellow musicians will not be overlooked. Some attention will be directed to Dolphy's solo. Several aspects of Coltrane's methodology will be covered.

---

⁹Wilmer, As Serious As Your Life, p. 36.

¹⁰Jost, Free Jazz, p. 30.

First, I will identify a number of types of Coltrane's musical gestures which recur in various permutations throughout the piece. Secondly, I will discuss Coltrane's method of melodic variation, which contributes significantly to the production and cohesiveness of his musical material, after which I will examine how the use of both his gestures and melodic variation contribute to the structure of the piece.

Before embarking further on the musical discussion of "India," it may be of interest to look at what some of the critics were saying about Coltrane's music at this time. The recordings made at the Village Vanguard in November, 1961 were his first live recordings, and Coltrane "Live" at the Village Vanguard 10 was given a double review in Down Beat the following April. Ira Gitler, the same critic who praised the saxophonist's individuality (and coined the "sheets of sound" phrase) in 1958, takes a different view of Coltrane's solo on "Chasin' the Trane":

Coltrane may be searching for new avenues of expression, but if it is going to take this form of yawps, squawks, and countless repetitive runs, then it should be confined to the woodshed. Whether or not it is "far out" is not the question. Whatever it is, it is monotonous, a treadmill to the Kingdom of Boredom. There are places when his horn actually sounds as if it is in need of repair. In fact, this solo could be described as one big air-leak.

Critic Pete Welding takes a more philosophical view:

In recent months Coltrane has been engaged in a sort of musical constructivism, shattering and fragmenting his thematic materials only to refashion them along almost syntactical lines, exploring at considerable

---

12This LP (Impulse 10) is not to be confused with the Coltrane "Live" at the Village Vanguard 11-03&05-1961 which features the two versions of "India." Even though "India" was recorded during this week, it was not released until 1963 with the Impressions LP.

13Ira Gitler, "Trane on the Track," 17.

length (and sometimes apparently aimlessly) their melodic and rhythmic potentials to the fullest. . . That it is a daring and perilous technique may be seen in his work here.\textsuperscript{15}

He goes on in reference to "Spiritual" and "Softly":

On these pieces there is a continuity and logical flow of a high order that can be appreciated fully only in comparison with the disjointed, inconclusive meanderings that constitute the sprawling solo morass on \textit{Chasin'}. . .\textsuperscript{16}

In continued reference to this piece he refers to its "gaunt, waspish angularities, its irrevocable intensity, raw, spontaneous passion. . ."; he concludes that it is "one of the noblest failures on record."\textsuperscript{17} In a review of another late 1961 performance of the quintet (Coltrane, Dolphy, Tyner, Workman, Jones), John Tynan says, "I happen to object to the musical nonsense being peddled in the name of jazz by John Coltrane and his acolyte, Eric Dolphy." He continues, "They seem bent on pursuing an anarchistic course in their music that can but be termed anti-jazz."\textsuperscript{18} Tynan's epithet came to be a kind of rallying cry of the free jazz community against the critical establishment.

I am unaware of any review of "India." Perhaps its perceived exoticism would have tempered such strong reactions. In any event, my purpose for including these remarks is not merely to point out how unimpressed certain critics were with what these players were doing at the time, but rather to draw attention to the acknowledged aspect of \textit{noise} in Coltrane's playing--because it is precisely the noise factor (what Jost refers to


\textsuperscript{16}Welding, "Double View of Coltrane 'Live'," 29.

\textsuperscript{17}Welding, "Double View of Coltrane 'Live'," 29.

as "modal disorientation")\textsuperscript{19} which contributes so extensively to the gesture-types to be identified later in this chapter. Furthermore, noise plays a role both in the melodic development of "India," and in the formal architecture of the piece.

The idea of atypical sound in jazz has already been discussed. But while noise in music may be difficult (or impossible) to define, even mainstream jazz players and conservative aficionados acknowledge its importance in the art form. In regard to "India," McCoy Tyner referred to the quality of contrast in the music. "Contrast is the thing--you do one thing and then contrast it." He also emphasized the freedom aspect in jazz improvisation, adding, "Self-expression is the epitome of what jazz means."\textsuperscript{20} A few weeks after the recording of "India," Coltrane expressed his own feeling when he said, "I've... been looking into these approaches to music--as in \textit{India}--in which particular sounds and scales are intended to produce specific emotional meanings."\textsuperscript{21} In John Litweiler's opinion, "India" depends first on the establishment, and then the abolition of beauty.\textsuperscript{22}

I have divided the music of "India" (sans Dolphy's solo) into musical "gestures," based on my hearing of the piece. All gestures are labeled sequentially with Arabic numerals. Gestures in Coltrane's second solo are labeled with an "R" (R-1, R-2, etc. for

\textsuperscript{19}Jost, \textit{Free Jazz}, p. 51.
\textsuperscript{20}From the October 15, 1993 conversation with the present author.
\textsuperscript{22}Litweiler, \textit{The Freedom Principle}, p. 95.
"Return"). Division between gestures is, for the most part, determined by the rests between them. A gesture is defined simply as "a musical thought or entity complete unto itself," and may vary in length, style (or type), articulation, tone, dynamic quality, rhythm, pitch, etc. In addition, gestures (or groups of gestures) will also be labeled according to the type of musical characteristic/s that they depict. For example, the fifth "musical thought" is labeled Gesture 5, and it is a "Modal/Melodic" type of gesture—that is, its predominant musical characteristic is melodic and depicts the mixolydian mode of the piece. There are many "Modal/Melodic" gestures in the music. Gesture 28 is a "Jagged/Sawtooth" type of gesture, depicted by abrupt angular motion comprised of large skips. There is a quality of noise involved here, as there is with all gesture-types excepting "Modal/Melodic." Figure 4.1 features a complete listing of gesture-types and their descriptions, and an example of each. I have also included a graphic representation of my own device for several of the gesture-types.

My purpose for including a graphic representation is an attempt to address the problem of notation in regard to this music. Of course, notation in jazz is rarely (if ever) intended to approximate real sound, but rather is intended to act as a reminder of the music, either for the purpose of study or reproduction. In spite of Mr. White's impeccable rendering of "India" (not to mention his own skill as a saxophonist and his recognized authority on the music of John Coltrane), the use of fixed pitches and rhythms in

---

23 Transcription by Andrew White, "India" from Impressions, #WJC-198, Vol. 5, No. 8, Andrew's Musical Enterprises, Inc. © 1973 (see appendix A). I have transposed his printed transcription (written in two sharps for the soprano saxophone to concert pitch. I have retained Mr. White's use of the natural sign on the seventh scale degree to depict the mixolydian mode. His use of parentheses around a note or group of notes appears to indicate an approximation of the actual sound.
MODAL/MELODIC gestures depict primarily the G-Mixolydian modality.

UPWARD AND/OR DOWNWARD SWEEP gestures depict rapid runs in primarily step-wise motion.

REPETITIVE gestures depict rapid repeated motives.

SLIDE/BEND gestures depict microtonal shifting or glissandi.

Figure 4.1 Gesture-types in John Coltrane's "India"
Jagged/Sawtooth gestures depict abrupt angular motion comprised of large skips, or rapid arpeggiated, up and/or down motion.

Scream gestures depict shrieked notes in the altissimo register at a loud dynamic level.

Chromatic Shift gestures depict a line shifted up or down from G-mixolydian. The shift may be true chromatic or microtonal.

Figure 4.1 Continued
conventional notation implies a certain specificity that is inadequate to fully describe Coltrane's sound. As musicians, we are taught that a note (any note) in a particular rhythmic placement means only that note and rhythm. Although stylistic differences and artistic interpretation may add slight variances to the result (i.e. jazz swing or the rubato in romantic music), on the whole, this method works perfectly well for many kinds of music. But in the context of improvised music where non-melodic characteristics are employed (often at a rapid speed), and where the score is a transcription created after the fact, a completely accurate representation of all musical factors may not be possible.

Indeed, depending upon the purpose, notes and rhythms may not even be desirable except as a most general guideline. What the listener hears is not dependent upon the pitches or exact rhythm, but rather upon other factors, such as the shape and the effect of the phrase. In the case of "Upward and Downward Sweep" Gesture #3, even the most discriminating ear hears mainly an ascending/descending blur of notes (which may or may not become more exactly definable as pitches with specific rhythmic placement with subsequent hearings). In "Repetitive" gesture-types, as with Gesture #R-8 (the eighth gesture after the Return, in Coltrane's second solo), the rapid repetition of small motivic cells becomes the focal point of the music. These two gesture-types are often combined into longer wholes, as can readily be heard in the music. The gesture-type identified as "Jagged/Sawtooth" frequently is combined with the "Sweep" gesture, as is the "Chromatic Shift," which is more than the addition of non-modal tones. In this gesture-type, whole chunks of melodic line seem to take an excursion away from the G-mixolydian mode, often in microtonal deviations from the tempered scale; speed may or may not be
important in "Chromatic Shift" gestures. The other gesture-type dependent upon microtonal usage is the "Slide/Bend" type, in which Coltrane's changes of fingering result in subtle variations of pitch and color. These types are generally descending in direction, and are separate from the use of a scoop or slide into (or off of) a particular note, which is an effect also used a great deal throughout the solos. One final gesture-type is the "Scream," which Coltrane judiciously saves and strategically places so as to play an important structural role in the development of his solos. Trumpeter Freddie Hubbard recognized the importance of this aspect of Coltrane's playing when he said of other tenor players, "They think he was screamin' but he was playing ideas."24 Indeed, Coltrane and his fellow musicians were not only pushing their own limits, but those of the listening audience and the jazz community itself.

"India" is a showcase for the solos of Coltrane and Dolphy, and at the first level may be indicated as such. The work opens with a duple-time bass and drums vamp. With a light sound, Jones establishes the tempo on the snare and ride cymbal (quarter note = ca. 200). It is important to note that while tempo is established and duple/quadruple is certainly assumed, the members of the ensemble take great care to avoid any hint of a downbeat or rhythmic periodicity. What is established here, and maintained throughout the entirety, is not unlike the Indian laya, which Derek Bailey refers to as "the forward movement sense as opposed to the mathematical understanding of the rhythm."25 The basses enter with an off-beat G-D vamp (with D as the lower note),

24Rusch, Jazztalk, p. 23.

thereby suggesting the modal character of the piece, which is verified as G-mixolydian both by background piano chords and Coltrane's introduction to the twelve-bar head. The basses play exclusively on the G-D drone throughout the entire piece, which is in itself unusual, and while they exhibit extensive rhythmic flexibility, their melodic limitation solidly keeps the modality in place. The head of the piece is played in two-part harmony on saxophone and clarinet, as shown in Figure 4.2. A certain playfulness is exhibited in the head, indicative perhaps of Coltrane's and Dolphy's philosophy that there "should be some raggedness about what they played."\(^{26}\) Prior to the head are the first five gestures--Coltrane's raga--followed by a sixteen-bar soprano solo, a return to the head (without repeats), after which Coltrane's first extended solo begins. Short by Coltrane standards of the day, at least for live playing, this solo lasts for just over four minutes before Eric Dolphy presents a 3½-minute bass clarinet solo, followed again by another three minutes by Coltrane before the return to the head and ending.

Figure 4.2 Head of Coltrane's "India"

Gestures 1-5 form the introduction to the head, and can be seen in Figure 4.3. I have informally called them "Coltrane's raga" because this short section contains the

Figure 4.3 Gestures 1-5

ingredients for all of the gesture-types (with exception of the "Scream," which will be discussed later) previously identified. While we can only speculate whether this was Coltrane's intention, the fundamental role of the raga is nevertheless fulfilled—that is, it
provides the material from which the rest of the music is derived. This is achieved in two ways. First, in this opening section, Coltrane establishes the types of gestures which make up the greater part of his solos. For example, Gesture 4, a "Repetitive" gesture-type, occurs only eight times in the entire piece (as Gestures 4, 32, 62, R-2, R-3, R-8, R-13, R-51). While many factors may vary--motive, pitch, length of the gesture, number of repetitions, rhythm, register, direction, context (which other gesture-types combine with it)--the listener can readily identify the key element, that of the rapidly repeated motive.\textsuperscript{27}

The same is true with all the other gesture-types. Figure 4.4 shows the same opening music as seen in Figure 4.3, but with the non-melodic gesture-types depicted in graphic representation. This example is included to afford the reader not only a visual image of the general shape and motion of the phrases, but also a different look at the contrast between melody and noise in the opening music.\textsuperscript{28}

The role of the raga is also fulfilled in another way with this music: the opening gesture is a model for other instances of Coltrane's method of melodic variation, through which much of the material of the solos is formed by what I have termed melodic "expansion" and "contraction."\textsuperscript{29} In Coltrane's manner of lengthening or shortening a

\textsuperscript{27}I had originally called this a "circular" gesture, because it sounded as if a circle was being carved out of the music, not unlike the cyclical sound of a wheel going around or an Australian bullroarer. The circular notion is suggested when the repetitions occur at high speed.

\textsuperscript{28}It is important for the reader to understand that in no way is the term \textit{noise} intended to be pejorative in regard to this music. On the contrary, non-melodic (in this case non-modal) musical expression is a vital part of the aesthetic of free jazz, one which is, at least in the case of John Coltrane's "India," logically planned and structurally vital. For further reading see Budds, "The Expansion of the Sound Vocabulary of Instruments," in \textit{Jazz in the Sixties}, pp. 26-27.

\textsuperscript{29}In this exercise, Andrew White's transcription has been invaluable. While graphic representation, accompanied by a clear description, may better indicate the general shape and motion of a gesture, notation is essential to observe the minute rhythmic expansions or contractions (the variance of an eighth note, for
motive or phrase, he achieves remarkable aesthetic and thematic cohesiveness, providing consistency of shape, register (and therefore timbre and often tone), and rhythmic figuration. Because of the expansion and contraction factors, no gesture recurs as an exact replica of any other—the music sounds the same, only different. This is aided by the modal quality of the music, which enables a variation to occur at any scale degree. Many similarities will be obvious in the next few examples, and few remarks will be
necessary. It may also be of benefit to the reader to refer ahead to formal outline (as seen in the Structure of Gestures in Figure 4.17) to clarify the placement of the head and solos.

![Gesture 1](image1)

![Gesture R-1](image2)

**Figure 4.5** Gesture 1 and variation

Gesture 1, seen in Figure 4.5, is the longest gesture of the piece, and although it is divided into two parts by a rest (obviously for a breath), the musical idea continues through the short sweep at the end. An elegant and beautiful phrase, spanning nearly the whole range of the instrument, this could certainly have been what Litweiler meant when he referred to the "establishment of beauty." This melodic gesture is easily identifiable, due to its pace, length and modality, and continuous sense of direction. A variation of it appears as Gesture R-1, when Coltrane begins his second solo. The similarities are recognizable, and are labeled in bold lower-case letters. Even though R-1 is shorter, within the variation certain characteristics are slightly longer, such as the approach to a,
and the distance between a and b. The distance between b and c, however, is contracted slightly in the second gesture, and because R-1 serves a different purpose than its opening counterpart, Coltrane avoids completing a variation of the entire melody. Instead, he breaks off into an extended section of non-melodic gestures, no doubt because he is just beginning a solo instead of preparing for the head as with Gesture 1. Notice the motivic and rhythmic variances between the two gestures. What is remarkable is Coltrane's ability to make such logical and subtle changes while retaining the essential character of the

(Gesture 5)

(Gesture 18)

(Gesture 30)

(Gesture 49)

(Gesture R-11)

(Gesture R-55)

Figure 4.6 Variations on mixolydian gestures
gesture. (Keep in mind that nearly ten minutes of music, including Eric Dolphy's solo, separate these two gestures.)

Six different gestures are shown in Figure 4.6, the first of which (Gesture 5) immediately precedes the first occurrence of the head. In spite of variances in register, pitch, and rhythm, there are many similarities among the gestures which contribute to their general relationship. They all outline in some fashion a G7 chord, consistent with the mixolydian mode of the piece, and there is also a regularity of shape, pace, and duration. In Figure 4.6, letter a indicates what I hear as the primary note of the gestures—the first long note; b indicates notes of longer rhythmic duration which, in each case, precede a falling motive at the end.

![Figure 4.7 Gestures following the head in "India"](image)

The head in "India" appears three times; the first is without ornamentation, as seen earlier in Figure 4.2. Figure 4.7 shows the gestures which conclude the head in each of its three appearances. Letter a indicates the last motive of the head, which is followed
in each instance by upward motion. The first two gestures end with the long duration on A followed by the distinctive rising B-D in the soprano's high register. While Gesture R-50 also exhibits the upward motion, it ends with a falling motive not unlike those in the previous set of examples. The difference here is one of function. In R-50, Coltrane is looking to the end of the piece, while both Gestures 6 and 11 are at the beginning of solo sections. The third time around is more simply stated, using less figuration and volume, with a general broadening of the sound. Figure 4.8 also refers to music in the

![Figure 4.8 Gestural embellishment of the head](image)

head, as it is embellished in the second and third appearances. Gesture 10 occurs just before Coltrane's first solo; R-49 as the head returns after his second solo. Similarities between shape and motive are evident.

Figure 4.9 gives a particularly good example of Coltrane's practice of motivic expansion. The similarities between the gestures are obvious, as evidenced by range, long-note/short-note activity, and overall shape. The musical idea expressed in Gesture 7 is split into two ideas in Gestures 12 and 13, the motivic activity indicated by letter b is expanded "at both ends" in Gesture 13. Notice also the retrograde of Gesture 12 in the closing of Gesture 13.
Figure 4.9 Coltrane's practice of motivic expansion

Figure 4.10 features two gestures in which Coltrane combines the mixolydian modality with chromaticism. Letter a again shows similarities in pitch, shape, and rhythmic figuration. In spite of the difference in register as the two gestures begin, they are of nearly the same duration, and they both exhibit primarily eighth-note rhythm. Each starts in the mode, and then departs into a similar chromatic pattern before returning to the familiar falling motive.

Figure 4.10 Mixolydian modality combined with chromaticism
Figure 4.11 Variations on Gesture 13

Figure 4.11 exhibits a group of gestures (45, 46, R-6) in which chromatic shifting is again demonstrated; each relates to a gesture we have already examined, Gesture 13. As we have seen before, Coltrane begins with a long note, labeled with letter a. Letter b begins in stepwise motion in a descending direction, while letter c again suggests the G7 chord. Each of the subsequent gestures vary in interesting ways. While Gesture 45
descends at letter b, it also rises again, and letter c varies a note (Bb) from the modality. Following immediately is Gesture 46 which is closer to the original, but with a kind of "turn-around" in pitch between a and the beginning of b. R-6 is highly chromatic, as are many of the gestures in Coltrane's second solo. Letter b, while exhibiting the same descending shape and stepwise motion, is expanded considerably from the other three gestures. Letter c is interesting in each of the four gestures—in each instance there is similarity in shape and rhythmic figuration, outlined on differing inversions of the G7.

Figure 4.12 Gestures with contrasting functions

Figure 4.12 shows another group which strongly outlines the G7, but with varying functions due to shape. Gesture 15 is a rhythmically syncopated melodic gesture, one
which is modal and stable sounding. However, Gestures 39 and 40, in spite of their similarity in pitch and rhythm, suggest a continuation, due to the rising sequential nature of the two. Gesture R-12 combines 39 and 40 into one thought, and again sounds less stable. Gesture R-25 most clearly expands 39, while R-26 exhibits the self-contained sound of the b section of Gesture 15, again due to the general rising/falling shape.

Figure 4.13  Short gestures in two-gesture groups

We have already seen, as in the case of Gesture 13 (Figures 4.9 and 4.11), that gestural characteristics can relate differently to different groups of gestures. Gestures 39 and 40, as seen in Figure 4.13, again show how a gesture or group of gestures can relate to more than one group. Coltrane seemed to use short gestures in groups of two, perhaps as a balancing device. The similarities among the two-gesture groups are apparent.
Notice again the longer initial note, and how the eighth-note rhythmic figuration suggests the strong sense of down beat. This clear establishment of pulse is not frequently encountered in "India," but it occurs more often in short gestures than in longer ones.

Figure 4.14 Gestural variation

Gesture R-23 is shown again in Figure 4.14, with an example of how Coltrane departs from the short falling gesture into a more elaborate demonstration. The two b gestures (48 and R-24) have much in common, in spite of rhythmic differences. Following the long initial note—B in both instances—each demonstrates eighth note activity with similar rising and falling motives on the second and fourth beats, introduction of accidentals, and an eventual rising motion followed by a fall and resumption of the mode.
Figure 4.15 Gestures which precede the peaks in John Coltrane's solos

Similar characters between the gestures in Figure 4.15 are not quite so striking. The initial long note is again represented by a, with b pointing out the falling motive which is so common. The entire process is severely contracted in Gesture R-27, which is then varied and sequenced in R-28. I have included these gestures because they all serve the same purpose—to introduce the climax points of Coltrane's solos. Earlier I mentioned the significance of the "Scream" gesture-type in regard to the formal construction of "India." Throughout the piece, Coltrane's solos are propelled toward the high register, where he peaks three times, repeatedly shrieking and screaming until the tone of the soprano saxophone breaks up.\(^{30}\) This occurs twice in his first solo and once in the second solo, and is emphasized not only by the high register, but also by ensemble intensity and volume. These three peak areas are rather extended, as shown in Figure

\(^{30}\)This breaking up of the sound quality results in a rough tone, which can be caused by a variety (or combination) of factors, including embouchure manipulation, variation in reed pressure, and the addition of the voice or multiphonics, which adds to the sound not only natural harmonics but noise elements as well. My thanks to Robert Reigle for demonstrating this for me.
4.16. Many consistencies are demonstrated within these peak areas, as can be seen by a comparison of the letters a - f. The real test lies with the ear, of course. The audible similarities are remarkable; there is no doubt to the listener that the music has reached maximum energy and intensity.

Figure 4.16 Three peak areas in Coltrane's solos in "India"
Now that the reader is aware of the origin and evolution of much of the material of Coltrane's solos in "India," it will be of interest to observe the logic of the overall structure. As mentioned earlier, I compared the types of gestures based upon their predominant function. The melodic musical phrases are labeled as the "Modal/Melodic" gesture type, and the myriad types of noise are labeled as "Sweep," "Repetitive," "Slide/Bend," "Jagged/Sawtooth," "Chromatic Shift," and "Scream" gesture types. While these various gestures types are easily distinguishable, each having its own properties, the basic function of each is much the same—to contrast the melodic music, and, in the case of the "Scream," to achieve maximum energy in the high register of the instrument. Figure 4.17 is a graphic depiction of the entire gestural structure of "India." (It is strongly advised that the reader again listen to music while following the Structure of Gestures chart, as the natural form of the music will become evident.) It is interesting to note, as the form is broken down, the symmetry and proportion within many of the sections, a logical balance between melody and noise.

Page 1 of the Structure of Gestures features the introduction, comprised of the rhythm section introduction and the first ten gestures. Gestures 1 through 5, as discussed before, provide both the melodic and non-melodic material which Coltrane later develops. Notice how Gestures 2 and 5, both short melodic gestures, balance Gestures 3 and 4. Following the twenty-four-bar head, Gestures 6 through 9 are a kind of introductory solo (divided into melody, followed by noise, returning to melody) before the head is repeated. Page 2 shows the first section of Coltrane's first long solo, through the first peak. Gestures 11 through 20 are primarily melodic, following the initial jagged upward sweep.
"India" by John Coltrane - Structure of Gestures, Page 1

NOTE: Gestures are divided according to natural musical divisions, not number of measures. The approximate length of the gestures (in measures) is indicated in parentheses. Gestures are labeled as "Noise," "Melody," or both, according to their primary function.

Figure 4.17 Structure of Gestures chart
Figure 4.17 Continued
Figure 4.17 Continued
Figure 4.17 Continued
Figure 4.17 Continued
"India" - Structure of Gestures, Page 6

Figure 4.17 Continued
Coltrane seems to use this area to establish the mode, contrasting long and short phrases. He also exhibits contrast in register as well, beginning this section in the higher register of the saxophone, dropping to the lower middle area before his climb to the highest area in Gestures 21 through 26—the first peak. There is an interesting balance in his treatment of this climax section. Notice how the noise is preceded and followed by areas of melody. Gestures 22 through 25 constitute the greater part of the peak, with Gesture 25 being the focal point within this section. The solo through the second peak is shown on Page 3. As is the case with the first peak, the second peak area is also preceded by melody. This melodic section, Gestures 37 through 40, is in turn preceded by an area of noise. Throughout his solos, Coltrane seems to be trying to strike a balance between the effect of his ideas. Peak #2 exhibits a symmetry nearly identical to that of Peak #1—melody introducing noise concluded by melody. Page 4 shows the conclusion of this solo, the music after the second peak. The listener may be aware of a kind of fusion of ideas at this point, a continual exploration of modality and non-melodic gestures. There doesn't seem to be any clear sense of closure in the solo, but rather a continual spinning off of ideas before Eric Dolphy begins his solo. An interesting event takes place in one of the basses towards the end of Coltrane's first solo, at Gesture 59. Until now, there has been no deviation from the G-D counterrhythmic drone played by the basses throughout most of "India." At this point, however, an accented low D is played, which provides an audible difference in the bass line. Although there seems to be no obvious structural relevance to the accented low D at this point in the music, it does become important at the end of Coltrane's second solo (to be explained later), and Gesture 59 marks its first
occurrence.

Coltrane's second solo is shown on Pages 5 and 6 of the Structure of Gestures chart. Eric Dolphy's 3½-minute solo ends with a clear sense of completion, giving Coltrane the cue to enter with the variation of his opening gesture. Recalling how Coltrane's first solo ends, with the relatively short durations of melody and noise, notice how his sections are expanded on Page 5. Gestures R-2 through R-6 combine several noise gestures, as do Gestures R-14 through R-18. Again note the balance as the melodic Gestures R-7 through R-13 are sandwiched in between the noise. The same is true in reverse in Gestures R-19 through R-28. Gestures R-29 through R-35 form Coltrane's third and final peak. Preceded again by a basically melodic section, this peak is understandably longer and audibly more extreme. The music following the peak resumes the use of smaller melodic/non-melodic sections. In Gesture 40, another low accented D is heard on the bass. This is the beginning of a series of low accented D notes, the final four of which are played prominently on four consecutive downbeats in R-42 and R-43. This is the cue for the *ti hai*, which follows exactly twelve bars later: the Indian drumming technique consisting of a short rhythmic pattern repeated three times, which signals the completion of the cycle or form. Elvin Jones' *ti hai* can be seen in Figure 4.18.\(^{31}\) In free jazz of this kind, where there are no set harmonic changes to provide the formal delineations, musical cues often suffice to guide the players through the musical events.\(^{32}\)

\(^{31}\)In an informal discussion with a group of colleagues regarding this moment in the music, no two of us had the same opinion on how best to notate Jones' *ti hai*. Figure 4.18 represents my hearing of the rhythmic placement.

\(^{32}\)The use of cues in "India" was verified by McCoy Tyner in my interview of October 15, 1993.
While Jones' tihai plainly cues the return of the head, which follows immediately, he in turn was cued by the four accented low Ds in the bass, which clarify both the downbeat and a period (of four bars) by which the ensemble can anticipate the tihai and therefore the head. After the head, which Coltrane embellishes almost jovially, the music unwinds with all the players contributing to the sense of music completion.

A few comments are in order regarding the remainder of the ensemble. Tyner's piano contribution to "India" is atypical in many respects, his role being primarily to supply the G-E-C-D motive (and variations of a G7 chord) as a thematic accompaniment and modal reinforcement. His chords are played exclusively in the instrument's mid-range, and their placement is rhythmically free and unpredictable in relationship to meter. The dynamic level is always quiet (partly the result of a poorly balanced mix of the recording), his tone warm and gentle, and for long stretches of time he lays out altogether, in order to allow more freedom for Coltrane to explore his ideas. His entrances in "India," there being no piano solo, were guided entirely by intuition.33

As the Structure of Gestures charts show, Tyner plays throughout the first five

33Interview, October 15, 1993.
gestures and head, dropping out during Coltrane's introductory solo prior to the repeat of
the head, when the piano comes in again for the final two bars. Tyner drops out entirely
during the extended melodic section (Page 2, Gestures 11 through 20) and the first peak,
perhaps waiting to see where Coltrane takes the solo. After the first peak, Tyner plays
during Gestures 28 through 34 (Page 3), then drops out again for the next melodic section
(Gestures 37 through 40) and the second peak, entering once more for Gestures 47
through 57 (Page 4). In both instances, the piano seems to help ground the music
thematically and modally after the extremes of the peak sections. In Coltrane's second
solo (Pages 5-6), Tyner plays through the first 10 gestures, and then breaks off until
Gesture R-28, at which point he enters and this time plays through the third peak, ending
after Gesture R-38. He comes in again with the return of the head, laying out during the
few solo bars of Gestures R-50 through R-52. During Eric Dolphy's bass clarinet solo,
Tyner accompanies him for the first forty seconds, then lays out until Dolphy begins to
increase tension in the solo, at which point Tyner enters once more, in what seems to be
another affirmation of the mode and theme. While it is pointless to second-guess the
product of intuition, there does seem to be a certain organic logic to Tyner's entrances and
exits throughout "India." Certainly the temperate clarity of the piano voicings offers a
distinct contrast to the clamor of much of the rest of the ensemble.

The role of the basses has already been discussed, albeit briefly. Both players are
deserving of more attention, particularly in light of their unusual role as doubled basses
in a jazz setting. It is unfortunate that the quality of the recording in context with the
texture of the music obscures the separation between the two instruments, since much of
the clarity is lost. Jimmie Garrison's and Reggie Workman's roles as "keepers of the mode," however is not lost, nor is their unique rhythmic interplay, which is reinforced by the drumming of Elvin Jones.

Much has been written about Jones' style of drumming.\textsuperscript{34} McCoy Tyner stated it well when he said, "Jones was born polyrhythmic."\textsuperscript{35} Certainly, his style contributed enormously to "India" (indeed, to all of Coltrane's music), in which energetic rhythmic pace and momentum are more aesthetically appropriate than metronomic accompaniment. Regarding Jones' playing on this piece, Ekkehard Jost comments that while Jones provides the beat, he makes an orientation toward "one" practically impossible due to the superimposing asymmetrical rhythmic flourishes.\textsuperscript{36} Kofsky attributes this characteristic to Jones' ability to promote rhythmic movement away from the beat, a result of the drummer's use of stasis in his patterns, as well as the tuning of the actual drums.\textsuperscript{37} Obviously, Jones is not a quiet drummer, nor is he one who allows much open space in his playing. Within the thick texture he provides, there seems to be a continual shifting in the layers of sound, the result no doubt of the superimposition of rhythmic pulses. He also seems to have the uncanny ability to anticipate the soloist, gauging the appropriate placement of a run, change of texture, or dynamic variation. In "India" he uses the ride


\textsuperscript{35}Interview, October 15, 1993.

\textsuperscript{36}Jost, \textit{Free Jazz}, p. 30.

cymbal almost constantly, making liberal use of his crash cymbals too. And hidden among his generally explosive approach to the instrument, there is a strong melodic sense evident in his use of the snare and toms, as if he were maintaining a dialogue with the other instruments.

The other link in the chain of this music is Eric Dolphy, whose gutsy bass clarinet supports Coltrane's soprano saxophone during the head, and whose solo connects those of Coltrane. Dolphy begins his solo with an immediate departure from the G-mixolydian mode; his use of a Bb throughout the first part of his solo (giving the hint of both D-minor and G-dorian), provides a different mood for his improvisation. His later use of Ab hints at the phrygian. Dolphy's sense of melody is generally quite angular, as demonstrated by the frequent intervallic skips in his runs. His ideas are conversational, with one phrase often sequenced logically upon another, and his sense of melodic pacing is consistent, well-articulated and deliberate; he tends to reserve fast glissandi and flurries for non-melodic effect rather than combine them with explicitly stated melody as Coltrane is prone to do. In his more free, non-melodic phrases, Dolphy often repeats and varies his ideas in short, choppy bursts until the thought has played itself out, at which point he may turn to a contrasting idea, repeating this process throughout the solo. He makes good use of the range and color of the bass clarinet, exploring the high region with wailing multiphonics, while reserving the unique character of the low register for melodic exploration, which Elvin Jones complements eloquently with rumbling low tom-tom accompaniment. His low-register melodies exploit the instrument's rich timbre with longer note values and tuneful phrases. There is a sense of spirited playfulness in
Dolphy's solo, which, along with his well-crafted sequences, compensates for what seems to be a lack of large-scale organization. In context of the whole piece, Dolphy's solo offers a distinctly different "voice" to that of Coltrane, one which is coherent and colorful.

With the music of "India," John Coltrane and his fellow musicians have experimented with some of the musical concepts of the country for which it is named, in a musical language unique to their genre. In so doing they achieved a quality of freshness, the result of the exploration of contrast, and the combination of seemingly opposing elements—melody and noise, the familiar and the exotic. Coltrane is one of two jazz musicians (the other being pianist Bill Evans) who in print is consistently credited with having the ability to control the many aspects of composition during improvisation, to maintain command of the details without losing grasp of the larger picture.

Thus far we have examined two contrasting works by two very different artists. Our attention now will turn to a solo work by pianist Cecil Taylor, whose style is widely divergent from that of Ornette Coleman or John Coltrane.
CHAPTER 5

Cecil Taylor: Indent - "Second Layer"

Since early in his career, Cecil Taylor has been regarded as the epitome of the jazz avant-gardist—an uncompromising, high strung and enigmatic personality whose art and philosophy are inextricably intertwined. In spite of early critical recognition of his talent, Taylor's career was plagued for many years by long periods of unemployment and lack of financial security. A 1961 article in Down Beat found three reasons for Taylor's lack of work at that time: his apparent lack of stylistic diversity (in other words, his unwillingness to play anything commercial), his excessively cerebral approach to playing, and his lack of acceptance within the jazz community.¹ Four years later, when Taylor had still only a handful of recordings to his credit, critic and author Nat Hentoff was still commenting on Taylor's sporadic public appearances, citing hostility of the critics, apathy of the audience, and skepticism of fellow musicians as the causes.² In the same article Taylor is quoted speaking philosophically of his career to date, stating that "...if the making of music is your over-all goal, the way you live becomes a kind of musical process."³ Writings on Taylor consistently mention his strident criticism of the musical


establishment (and often fellow musicians), his belief that jazz is art of the black community, and his recognition that his own music has its roots in the blues. He also expresses interest in "problems of sound" and textures, ideas that were challenging the classical avant-garde as well as other jazz artists, such as Ornette Coleman and John Coltrane. By virtue of his talent and tenacity (and with the commitment of a handful of like-minded fellow musicians), Taylor was beginning to be viewed as a major artist by the early 1970s. He held the first of several artist-in-residence positions at the University of Wisconsin in 1971, later serving at Antioch College in Ohio and Glassboro State College in New Jersey. In 1973 Taylor was awarded a Guggenheim Fellowship, and in 1977 the New England Conservatory awarded Taylor an honorary doctorate. By the late seventies, he was topping the list of avant-garde pianists in the jazz polls, an accomplishment which continues to the present. In 1988, he undertook his Berlin recording project, one of the largest recording efforts ever involving a living jazz artist (eleven CDs with numerous fellow musicians). Certainly, being named recipient of a coveted (and lucrative) MacArthur Foundation Fellowship in 1991 typifies the extent of his success. In his 1989 article "Instant Composing as Body Language," Ekkehard Jost aptly sums up Taylor's career:

. . . it has become clear that Cecil Taylor has been truer to himself and to his musical path than hardly any of his fellow combatants in that October Revolution of jazz. With Taylor there were no excursions into the more profitable idioms of Rock/Funk/Punk, no back-to-the-roots of jazz tradition, the invoking of which has so often only signified musical regression; there has been no move towards electrification, no digitalization, no picturesque exoticism. What has thoroughly changed is Taylor's approach to

---

performance; it has become more theatrical, accompanied by song and dance. But even this doesn't signify an altering of basic values--dance and theater have always greatly appealed to Taylor. Their inclusion into his appearances thus represents nothing more than his having prevailed over the restrictive conventions of normal concert routine (enter / sit down / play / stand up / bow / exit).5

Cecil Taylor's tremendous technical ability at the piano has been responsible, at least in part, for his success. He displays an exquisite clarity of articulation at phenomenal speeds, with precise definition of tonal and dynamic shading, brilliant rhythmic control, flawless pedaling, and extraordinary endurance. But technique is really only the vehicle for Taylor's musical language, and it is interesting to take note of other factors which have contributed to the development of his art. According to A. B. Spellman in Four Lives in the Bebop Business, both of Taylor's grandmothers were Native American6, and although this circumstance apparently exerted little direct formative influence on him, more than a casual suggestion of Native American ritual appears in some of his performances.7 Furthermore, awareness of Taylor's affinity for dance and theater may help the reader to understand his uniquely physical approach to playing--the antics, the gestures, the cavorting use of what dancers refer to as a "sense of space," and outrageous contrast between caressing and frenzied attack of the keyboard. He has


7See, for example, the work "Poles" from Burning Poles (Mystic Fire Video, VHS 76240, 1991). In "Poles," Taylor avoids use of the piano keyboard altogether, and instead uses the open instrument as a kind of altar around which his trance-like dance slowly unfolds. Taylor's methodical mumblings, supported by his fellow musicians' use of rattles and whistles, contribute to the ambiance of the performance. See also "Cun-Un-Un-Un-An" from Taylor's 1985 recording Winged Serpent (Soul Note SN 1089).
worked extensively with the dance community, the most celebrated collaboration occurring in 1979 with a series of performances featuring Taylor and Mikhail Baryshnikov. Taylor is also a poet, and has referred to poetry as "music in print." A recent publication entitled *Moment's Notice: Jazz in Poetry and Prose* features a twenty-two-page poem by Taylor, entitled *Garden* after his 1981 solo concert in Switzerland. Liner notes for *Indent* consist exclusively of a poem, which may have provoked Robert Palmer's literary analogy in his review of the work. In it he likens Taylor's sectionalization of musical material to paragraphs and punctuation. Palmer goes on to compare Taylor's methodology to that of author William Burroughs, whose style depicts sectional development of reiterative motifs, and whose approach involves "direct recording of certain areas of psychic process," an allusion no doubt to Taylor's self-proclaimed trance-like performing state. Taylor's philosophical approach to art and life are depicted in his comment: "To become a musician is one thing. To attempt to make music into poetry is something else."

Because of the somewhat exacting nature of Cecil Taylor's music--the density,

---

8In an interview with Robert D. Ruseh, *Jazztalk*, p. 50.


11Taylor's playing has also been compared to the painting of Jackson Pollock (see Dean, *New Structures*, pp. 179-180). While I find both the Burroughs and Pollock comparisons interesting and provocative, a detailed examination of the artists' styles is beyond the scope of this paper.

severity, and duration of the pieces—few listeners are willing to devote the time required to get beyond its technical display. But Taylor's music, particularly in the solo medium, exhibits clearly audible organization.\textsuperscript{13} Taylor has referred to his music as constructivist; of it he says, "The emphasis in each piece is on building a whole, totally integrated structure."\textsuperscript{14} In "Second Layer," those structural delineations are often made manifest by the presence of exposed silences which serve to offset the introduction of new material and other components, such as his use of variation, dynamic or textural contrast, rhythmic differentiation, tonal shading, motivic expansion, or change of register. Taylor uses an exhaustive array of conventional musical elements such as clusters,\textsuperscript{15} ostinati, glissandi, arpeggios, motives, parallel chords and octaves, contrapuntal devices such as inversion, contrast of articulation, etc. He also makes wide use of techniques which are more closely associated with avant-garde improvisation—open-palmed smashes, knuckle rolls, forearm and elbow attacks, stiff-fingered tremolos, etc.

Cecil Taylor's \textit{Indent} is a three-part improvised composition for piano, recorded in 1973 at Antioch College in Ohio, where Taylor was spending a year-long tenure as artist-in-residence. The work was recorded live, as Taylor's music often is; his dislike of

\textsuperscript{13}See Ekkehard Jost's article "Instant Composing as Body Language" for his insights into the differences between Taylor's solo and ensemble styles. Jost observes that Taylor's solo playing differs from his ensemble playing in three essential points: 1) Taylor's solo playing is rhythmically more free, involving greater variation of tempi, more use of rubato, fermati, etc.; 2) Taylor's solo playing is more tonally oriented; and 3) Taylor more greatly exploits dynamic shading in his solo playing than in his ensemble work (pp. 88-96).

\textsuperscript{14}Spellman, \textit{Four Lives in the Bebop Business}, p. 38.

\textsuperscript{15}See p. 91 of Ekkehard Jost's article "Instant Composing as Body Language," wherein he has identified and described four cluster types used by Taylor, including short cluster accents, mobile-clusters, static clusters, and cluster-tremolos.
the recording studio is well documented. *Indent* is divided into three movements—"First Layer," "Second Layer," and "Third Layer." "Second Layer," the subject of my discussion, is just over thirteen minutes long. Taylor's means of development in *Indent* is primarily linear. In this aspect he is not unlike Ornette Coleman; however, the concept of Coleman's motivic-chain-associations is greatly expanded with Taylor's method of associative development, in which he works and reworks ideas sequentially until they are exhausted, combining and abandoning material in continual forward motion, occasionally recalling an earlier idea. Using this process, Taylor fully exploits the piano's capacity for textural and registral expansion, variety of tone color, and percussive capability. Jost has described Taylor's method of development in terms of systematic stabilization of musical structure by repetition, with particular emphasis on call-and-response treatment, as in the following diagram:

\[ a-b-a'-b''-b'-a'-b''-c-c'' \text{ etc.}^{16} \]

I have elected to depict "Second Layer" of *Indent* according to a time line, which will list the musical events in their order of appearance.\(^{17}\) Within that framework, my method of description of the music is an expansion of Robert Palmer's literary analogy. I have divided the music into *paragraphs*, logical units classified by their subject matter, each of which contains a *topic*—the predominant musical idea. Most of the topics are also

---

\(^{16}\) Jost, "Instant Composing as Body Language," p. 92. While Jost does not identify the piece to which the example refers, he states that the process developed by Taylor originates with the "Plain" section of *Unit Structures* (1966).

\(^{17}\) Description of Taylor's music according to a time line has been done before. See Ekkehard Jost, *Free Jazz*, pp. 78-83, for his treatment of "Unit Structures," and Mark Gridley, *Jazz Styles: History and Analysis*, pp. 281-282 for his commentary on "Jitney #2."
developed, and some are preceded by introductory material. In total there are twelve such paragraphs, labeled A through L. Each paragraph is in turn subdivided numerically into sections (A-1, A-2, A-3, etc.). In most instances, the first section contains the topic; subsequent sections within each paragraph are typically developmental or transitional. I have also included a word of punctuation at the end of each paragraph, which should aid the listener in identifying points of demarcation between sections and paragraphs; a table describing the punctuation is supplied at the top of the time line. It should become obvious to the listener/reader upon the first hearing of "Second Layer" that any attempt to transcribe the music accurately into conventional notation would be futile, due to its density, speed, and rhythmic intricacy (only sections A-1 and part of A-2 will be provided). Taylor himself abandoned traditional notation, but in a manner unlike that associated with typical jazz-style chord symbols. Instead, he preferred the simple listing of pitch names on a page for the definition of motivic and thematic groups;\(^{18}\) sometimes figured-bass instructions were also included.\(^{19}\) In addition to my time line analysis, I will also expand on the idea of graphic representation, with which I have devised contrasting portrayals of three sections of the music, to be discussed later in the analysis. Finally, I will also address Taylor's poem, in effort to shed light on possible structural and aesthetic similarities between the poem and the music.

Before I begin the time line, I would like to provide two examples from the

\(^{18}\)According to Robert Reigle who worked with Taylor in a workshop setting in the late 1970s, Taylor would call out as many as twenty or more pitch names (while the musicians would frantically write them down, hoping not to omit any); the treatment of the pitches was then left to the musicians' own devices.

opening moments of "Second Layer." Figure 5.1 shows section A-1—the introductory music to the first topic, one of the few sections in the movement conducive to accurate transcription. It is provided as a brief example of how Taylor varies his material, at least in this instance. The music consists entirely of pitch-class B in the low registers of the piano, featured in five short descending phrases, divided by fermatas. Notice again how easy it would be to continue the literary analogy, calling these sentences; the fourth sentence duplicates the third sentence in pitch and rhythm, but with subtle differences in dynamic level and articulation. Throughout this short introduction, Taylor already deploys differentiation of tone color, pace, articulation, and tension—elements that are varied ad infinitum throughout this nearly fourteen-minute work. Section A-1 serves as a clear introduction to section A-2 and the first topic; it also functions as a pedal point in section A-2. The first topic is the F#-G-E-F motive, which is shown in Figure 5.2. (The topic is only part of section A-2, the entirety of which is described in the complete time line.) I have included a transcription of this topic because it provides the basis for much of the subsequent material. It may be of interest to point out Taylor's use here of the famous
Figure 5.2 "Second Layer" of *Indent*, topic from section A-2

B-A-C-H motive (in a retrograded version). The intervalllic character exhibited here can be heard throughout many of the motivic statements in this work; Taylor particularly exploits the semitone and the descending minor third. Also integral to the character of the topic is the repeated rhythmic figure, which is easily identifiable not only in this section, but throughout the remainder of the music. Following is the time line for "Second Layer" of *Indent*, after which will follow a discussion of some of the elements exhibited therein. (Due to the density and speed of the music, repeated listenings may be required in order for the listener to easily follow along with all of the section divisions.)

TIME LINE

NOTE: The following are intended to serve as a kind of punctuation guide, in effort to assist the listener/reader in the identification of the section divisions. They may be found in parentheses at the end of each section.

20Based on the German spelling (in which B=Bb and H=B), J. S. Bach used this theme in his *Art of Fugue*. Many other composers, from Schumann and Liszt to Piston, have used this motive.
Continuous Segue - elision with following music without sense of completion
Sectional Segue - elision with following music with sense of completion
Continuous Pause - pause (usually very brief) without a sense of completion
Stop - pause with a full sense of completion; register location may be included

0:00  PARAGRAPH "A" - Section A-1

Taylor begins in the low register of the piano, with a series of repeated motives
spanning descending octaves on pitch-class B. The texture is sparse in a medium
dynamic level which increases to the end, with clearly defined notes and rhythms in
free quadruple time (Stop).

0:11  Section A-2

In quadruple time, the first four measures form the first topic (F#-G-E-F)—the main
thematic area of the piece. After playing a LH octave on B, Taylor answers with a
RH bass-clef octave on F#; the "short-long" rhythmic motive (sixteenth-note pick-up
to eighth-note, followed by a rest) becomes a kind of signature which recurs
throughout the movement. He continues in this manner, introducing the pitches G,
E, and F-natural with the RH, all the while retaining the B-octave with the LH (see
Figure 5.2). This short section, where the first instance of Taylor's call-and-response
occurs, repeats in varied form three times; Taylor's method of variation primarily
involves the use of rapid octave tremolo with which the motives are lengthened and
elaborated. (Continuous Segue).

0:32  Section A-3

The F#-G-E-F pattern is gradually transformed into the new melodic fragment of F#-
G-F-D-C#-B-G#. Taylor achieves this transformation by additive means (F#, F#-G-
F#, F#-G-F, F#-G-F-D-C#-B, F#-G-F-D-C#-B-G#), lengthening and connecting the
motives with the rapid octave tremolo. In repeated stops and starts, thickening texture
and louder volume, the F#-G-F-D-C#-B-G# fragment is itself transformed when
Taylor clips the last two notes to form a descending B-G# motive. This descending
minor third is repeated five times before Taylor combines the fragments into a
rhythmically active and elaborate excursion of broken octaves which he takes up the
keyboard to a higher register. The texture and dynamic level increase with fewer
stops and starts as the intensity and register climbs (Stop, mid high-register).

0:54  PARAGRAPH "B" - Section B-1

This four-phrase section features light, clearly articulated eighth-note motives attacked
in bluesy grace-notes in the middle-upper treble clef. The open quality, slower tempo,
and quieter dynamic character are a marked contrast to the preceding music. The first two phrases (the second topic) are descending, and feature a repeated descending minor third on Db-Bb; the bass motives are both syncopated and animated and the phrases end on a low F in the bass clef. The second two ascending phrases answer and balance the first two, and use the tritone F-B, ending in the treble clef on E. Taylor's free use of elements from the original F#-G-E-F motive can be seen here in two ways: the melodic use of the descending minor third, and the phrase endings which end (in pitch class) a semitone apart--F in the bass clef, E in the treble (Continuous Pause). (See Figure 5.5 for a graphic representation of this section.)

1:13 Section B-2

This section features the previous section in varied form. Dynamic level is slightly greater, and the sense of pace is more irregular than in section B-1. Again the repeated descending Db-Bb motive is prominent in the descending phrases (Continuous Pause).

1:31 Section B-3

Two phrases comprised of descending LH tritones alternate with RH motivic clusters in a clear call-and-response pattern; syncopated chords with grace-note attacks answer the tritones/clusters. The music is very bluesy in this section, a result of exposed (almost Monkish) voicings of the mid-register chords and relaxed rhythmic treatment. The music is light and more open, with minimal variation between the phrases and no use of pedal (Sectional Segue).

1:43 Section B-4

Alternating LH/RH octaves in the same relaxed syncopated rhythm form a brief introduction to a variation of the preceding section. The melody of the octaves repeats twice, the first time nearly exact; the second repeat varies in the higher register, ending on F#. After the variation of the preceding section, the alternating octaves resume, beginning in the bass and climbing up the keyboard (Stop, high register).

2:03 PARAGRAPH "C" - Section C-1

The third topic is formed by four short phrases, all of which begin with ascending clusters in a lilting and almost tender mood--a rare occurrence for Cecil Taylor. The first phrase ends in a decisive manner on a high F; the subsequent phrases begin to blend together, and the fourth phrase recalls the syncopated octaves from section B-4. There is an increase in dramatic character as the section progresses (Continuous Pause).
2:20 Section C-2

This section features the music of the previous section in varied form with an increase in tempo and sense of forward motion. Taylor's playing takes on a restless and slightly agitated character, achieved by quicker attack and more rapid fluctuation of dynamic level (Sectional Segue).

2:33 Section C-3

Ascending from the low register, Taylor plays in thick rapid clusters which begin with the original rhythmic motive from paragraph A (the short-long pattern; see Figure 5.2 and section A-2). The broken phrases, in which the tritone F-B is prominent, rip repeatedly to the upper register. The music is filled with stops and starts which eventually evolve into raucous pulsating lines that cascade up and down the piano. The dynamic level and texture increase as the phrases are lengthened; at the same time the breaks between the motives and gestures become more sparse (Stop, low register).

3:07 PARAGRAPH "D" - Section D-1

The smashing clusters give way to alternating syncopated RH/LH chords, still in thick texture. These chords come together momentarily in parallel rhythm, after which they give way to ascending octave arpeggios that rise up the keyboard in the additive formation of another motive--the fourth topic (G#-Bb, G#-Bb-G#, G#-A-Bb). The arpeggios increase in dynamic level as the register rises (Stop).

3:19 Section D-2

An energetic pounding centered on a RH descending minor third (C-A) begins in fits and starts, rising from the lower mid-register to the high mid-register. Taylor thickens the texture by implementing an almost constant rolling of large blocks of notes, eventually settling on an ascending B-B-D motive repeated three times in the high register. The texture, drama, and dynamics increase with a loud cascade down the keyboard, followed by two halting upward gestures, after which the section concludes with a final smashing sweep up and down the keyboard (Continuous Segue).

3:41 PARAGRAPH "E" - Section E-1

Taylor pedals over the transition into this phrase, again contrasting the preceding music with LH/RH call-and-response patterns. This short phrase begins on Eb-Bb, and is more open, legato, and conversational, featuring a chattering RH melody and an upward high-register rip and pause at the end. The phrase repeats almost identically at a slightly diminished dynamic level (Continuous Pause).
3:50  Section E-2

A prominent repeating C#-D motive (the fifth topic) appears at mid-register, alternating with syncopated staccato cluster chords; this idea is broken off and answered with a LH broken-octave pattern (hinting at boogie-woogie) that evolves into variations of a C#-D-Eb-E motive. Each idea varies as the process repeats; during the seventh permutation of this process, the music breaks apart into a loud descending smash followed by one final LH octave pattern (Stop).

4:37  Section E-3

Taylor recalls the music of section E-1 (centered on Eb-Bb); while the music is no less active than in the previous section, a contrast is felt due to a decrease in density. The alternating LH/RH dialogue is expanded and transformed into repeated staccato notes in the LH at mid-register, with the RH cluster material repeatedly ripping upward. Taylor plays with the register of this idea by first adding an echo at a higher register, then settling at a high register before returning to the original register, moving again to the higher register, then returning to the original. Finally, the LH repeated notes expand to clusters that are followed by an aggressive descending handslapped run which is repeated and lengthened three times up and down the keyboard. The section ends with a short burst of upward high-range rips (Stop, high mid-register). (See Figure 5.6 for a graphic representation of this section.)

5:19  PARAGRAPH "F" - Section F-1

A syncopated Bb-Eb LH pattern (topic 6) exchanges impulses with an Eb-minorish RH (Eb-Bb-Db); the RH, which begins in single repeated note patterns, gives way to larger more energetic chords as the texture increases. A Gb-Ab-Eb motive appears, completing the black-note collection to which this music is confined. The pulsation is broken with an ascending slapped run, followed by a return to the rhythmic drive, which ends abruptly with a unison RH/LH chord (Stop, middle register).

5:44  PARAGRAPH "G" - Section G-1

In a slower, more deliberate tempo and lower dynamic level, Taylor presents a series of RH/LH unison chords containing a well-articulated and repeated melodic Ab-Db motive—the seventh topic. This ascending motive expands by additive means into a variation of Ab-Db-B-Ab, then into Ab-Db-B-Ab-Gb. These tunes are accompanied by a dissonant LH in the same rhythmic pattern. The phrases repeat and evolve several times (Sectional Segue).

5:57  Section G-2

A shortened version of the previous section is introduced with lower mid-register
chords, more muffled in tone. The section ends the way it began, concluding with a diminuendo in a gentle mood and clear cadence (Sectional Segue).

6:12 PARAGRAPH "H" - Section H-1

This section features a varied recap of the first topic from section A-2, but without the F-natural (the opening motive was F#-G-E-F). The F#-G-E tune is presented here in octaves, broken apart hocket-style up and down the keyboard. The irregular rhythmic character and short-long rhythmic motive are maintained; the phrases are elaborated as they repeat. The introduction of an Eb and jerky LH octaves forms a bridge to the next section (Sectional Segue).

6:38 Section H-2

The music is of a more exposed and static quality in this section, comprised of repeated notes (C# and B) which are developed into a nervous trill in octaves. The trill gives way to a broken Eb-Db motive (still in octaves), which is expanded for a short time to crashing LH octaves as the texture and volume increase (Continuous Segue).

6:59 Section H-3

Taylor uses the pedal and a lighter touch to create syncopated music with a jazzy, flitting feel and a sense of forward motion; a D#-B motive appears and repeats in the treble clef. Gradually, the lines evolve into a continuous wave of rapid hand-alternating slaps that move in light sweeps up and down the keyboard; Taylor maintains a moderate dynamic quality, focusing instead on the smooth transformation of density and volume. When the music settles into the upper half of the keyboard, accented LH octaves begin to appear, syncopated and rhythmic. These in turn give way to a rapid RH/LH pattern of alternating repeated clusters; the texture thins out as both hands stay in the upper register of the piano. Pointillistic accented LH notes begin to appear as the chattering continues. A low F-F-E-D motive emerges in broken octaves (Continuous Segue).

9:10 PARAGRAPH "I" - Section I-1

In an abrupt change of pitch-class (from white key to black key) and texture, a hint of topic 7 (section G-1) is introduced in choppy and halting spacing; a Bb is added to the Ab-Db motive. The initial increase in pulse and sharper attack again gives way to a smooth surface without rests or divisions. The music sustains itself until the section cadences with a brief pedaled chord played in LH/RH unison (Sectional Segue).
9:37 Section I-2

Taylor introduces a dramatic change in the character of the music here, creating an almost rhapsodic transitional bridge to the next section. Two short phrases are played in rubato rhythm; the hands are in unison. The first phrase (G-F#-C-B-D-C#) displays triplet activity, while the second phrase (C#-D-E-F#-C#) is a cadential reinforcement of the C#; the attack pattern of the second phrase is slightly arpeggiated. This is the shortest section of the movement, but one which fulfills a unifying role in its connection with the opening music (see Figure 5.4). (SectionalSegue).

9:43 Section I-3

This section briefly suggests (in retrograde form) the chattering and broken LH octaves (Eb-D-C#) of section E-2. Again, the rhythmic and dynamic treatment (gradually slower and softer) results in the transitional character of the music (SectionalSegue).

9:53 PARAGRAPH "J" - Section J-1

A light pattern of repeating grace-note clusters featuring C#-B emerges in the high register (topic 10); this is answered in the lower register in a smoothly pedaled phrase. The tone is subdued and the music reflective; once more, the rubato tempo and diminuendo suggest a transitional feel (Stop).

10:07 Section J-2

The previous section is repeated and expanded, with a slight increase in dramatic character (Stop).

10:23 Section J-3

A series of quiet, short, tension-filled ascending phrases are followed by high-register broken cluster chords, developed from the previous two sections. The music has a mysterious quality, the result of Taylor's use of abrupt diminuendo followed by slight pause with each event. Three motives appear: the descending minor third (F-D), the perfect fourth (F#-B), and a descending major third (C#-A). An increase in forward motion and tension leads to the next section (Stop, high mid-register).

10:50 PARAGRAPH "K" - Section K-1

In choppym patterns with well-defined rests, LH/RH unison chords (topic 11) begin in the lower register, followed by an answer in the treble. These chords are thickly voiced, melodic, and conversational, with no jagged edges, articulated with clean attacks and pronounced dynamic contrast (Stop).
11:03 Section K-2

With an increase in tension and dynamic quality, the previous section is varied and repeated. Taylor's attacks are hard and quick (Sectional Segue).

11:16 PARAGRAPH "L" - Section L-1

This free-flowing, transitional section begins with high-register repeated octaves on A, accompanied by sparse LH octaves on Ab-G-E. The rhythm is slow and free. The short phrase repeats, after which the harmonic area of A transfers up a whole step to B. Both hands then join in gently arpeggiated unison chords, dissonant and sensitive, quiet and impressionistic in character (Sectional Segue).

11:31 Section L-2

Taylor uses dry articulation in this section to establish a sense of momentum for the end of the movement. A brief statement of ascending tritone gestures introduces a series of aggressive chords featuring the short-long rhythmic motive from the first paragraph (topic 12). These stomping chords occur without elaboration at first, after which Taylor begins to add flourishes and rips onto the ends of the chords as they progress up the keyboard (Sectional Segue).

11:59 Section L-3

With a change of harmonic character, Taylor transforms this lighter melodic music (using the ascending minor third B-D) into a series of gentle upward rips which reverse into aggressive descending rips. A brief pointillistic excursion of ascending gestures leads to further boisterous cascades which segue immediately into the accented LH chords of the final section (Continuous Segue).

12:27 Section L-4

Pounding low register short-long (E-B/F-B) chords alternate with RH smashing waves up and down the keyboard. The smashing tremolo waves eventually thin in the upper register to a more transparent texture, followed by continuous waves of rapidly pulsating clusters. Two occurrences of the LH smashing chords are followed by a slight change in the surface texture, consisting of a more choppy feel (Continuous Pause).

13:22 Section L-4 (final 18")

The final assault begins with an aggressive burst of accented short-long chords in the LH, followed by a continuous cascade of roaring motion up and down the keyboard. Taylor maintains volume and forward push until the end. (See Figure 5.7 for a
While the time line provides a basis for the discussion about musical events in time, it does not readily disclose the structural components of a work. To further facilitate that aspect of our discussion, Figure 5.3 features a diagram of the proportional distribution of "Second Layer's" paragraphs and sections. Presenting in this manner, the structure of the piece can be observed. Taylor's method of development, as mentioned before, is associative. Large scale units--the paragraphs--divide musical events according to contrast, typically in rhythm, texture, or register. In all instances, Taylor brings a single musical event to the foreground--the topic. Sometimes the topic is preceded by
introductory material, and almost always it is developed or at least elaborated; hence the sectional divisions. The developmental sections are not necessarily limited to the topic material, nor do they always include topic material. In paragraph C, for example, the topic is a short passage of ascending clusters, carefully pedaled and shaped into a linear idea. The section immediately following the topic is a repeat of the topic section in varied form, but the subsequent development (section C-3) features an angry response to the gentle clusters of the topic. A cacophony of events ensues, each one triggering one response after another. The original topic may not be evident throughout the development of the section, but the chain of events is nevertheless logical. This process is repeated in varied form throughout the twelve paragraph divisions.

Several of the sections in "Second Layer" feature music of a transitional nature, as indicated by the shading in Figure 5.3. It is primarily due to its rhythmic behavior that I have defined the music as such. The level of rhythmic activity in Taylor's music is very high, with continuous pulsation exhibited in both regular and irregular metric divisions. The music takes on a transitional aspect not from the suggestion of fermatas, as seen in the introduction in Figure 5.1, but rather from the suggestion of ritardando, where the gradual slowing of the pulse interferes with Taylor's almost incessant sense of forward motion. It is interesting to observe that these transitional sections occur quite conventionally in regard to the duration of the entire piece, that is, in the second half of the music and from the point of recapitulation. (I hear the transitional Section G-2 as an introduction to the recap.) Whether this is a result of Taylor's classical training or subconscious adherence to this musical archetype is impossible to say. What can be
observed is the repeated use of a variety of transitional material throughout the sections which lead into the dramatic end of the work.

In regard to the aspect of pitch in "Second Layer," the scope and density of the music, combined with the absence of a score, prevent any large-scale conclusions; as can be seen from the time line, relatively few motivic and thematic elements are prominent enough to facilitate extraction. However, a few general observations can be made regarding those elements that are. As was mentioned earlier, Taylor exploits the intervallic quality of his opening material, particularly the semitone and minor third from the topic in section A-2, along with the short-long rhythmic motive (see Figure 5.2). The minor third is an element found in several sections of the music, including A-3, B-1, B-2, D-2, G-1, H-1, H-3, I-1, I-2, J-3, L-1, and L-3; it can be observed in isolated descending or ascending motivic form, as well as part of larger melodic groupings. Taylor's employment of semitone and stepwise activity can be observed in sections A-2, A-3, B-1, D-1, E-2, H-1, H-3, I-2, I-3, L-1, and L-4. He also uses the semitone as a unifying element between phrases. For example, in section B-1 the phrases end a semitone apart; this can also be seen in connection with sections B-4 and the following section C-1. In general, Taylor's choice of intervals depicts his affinity with the structure suggested by the original F#-G-E-F motive. Small intervals expanded by a semitone or tone are found in proximity, as in section J-3 where the minor third is followed by both a major third and perfect fourth. His adherence to these small intervals is a unifying element throughout the movement. Another important aspect of pitch in "Second Layer" can be seen in Taylor's use of pitch-class B. As can be seen in paragraph A, B is the most prominent
pitch early in the music. In fact, Taylor features pitch-class B throughout almost every section of the movement, with the notable exception of paragraphs E and F. At section E-1, the pitch structures begin to be shifted to the black notes on the piano, a movement which culminates in the exclusive use of Bb-Eb-Db-Gb-Ab in paragraph F. This shift is given additional emphasis by the length of paragraph E, which, with the exception of the concluding paragraph, is the longest in the movement. Its position at the near center of the movement, along with its duration, places further significance on the change of pitch emphasis here. Section G-1 reintroduces pitch-class B, which can be found throughout many of the following transitional sections; it also figures prominently in the final concluding sections in paragraph L. The importance of the recap in section H-1 is reinforced by the departure from the black-note region which precedes its return.

Of the transitional sections, section I-2 stands out in particular, and is worthy of mention. As can be seen from Figure 5.3, section I-2 is the shortest section of the movement. At just six seconds long, this brief section is highlighted not only by its brevity, but also by two significant characteristics. First, Taylor's use of the triplet figuration (found nowhere else in the movement) renders an almost fanfare-like quality to the music. Secondly, the pitches and shape of the triplets are directly drawn from section A-3, which contains the first development of the opening topic. Figure 5.4 shows excerpts from sections A-3 and I-2, along with a reduction of each; the similarities are obvious.

In spite of the freedom obviously displayed in "Second Layer" in aspects of rhythm and meter, motive and phrase structure, development, and contrast, there are
several aspects of the music which draw directly from the jazz and blues heritage. Taylor has received considerable criticism for his abandonment of swing, but in reality he draws upon the older traditions of ragtime, stride, boogie-woogie, and blues. Specifically, the ragtime and stride influence can be observed in Taylor's exuberant syncopation, his manner of staccato articulation, and his use of alternating left-hand/right-hand octaves. The broken octave performance seen in Taylor's left-hand work recalls the boogie-woogie style. The blues influence is exhibited profusely in "Second Layer" of Indent, and is evinced when the music is at its most transparent. The sliding grace notes and repeating riffs indicative of blues piano are particularly apparent in the right-hand motivic work. Elements of blues form have already been mentioned, and while Taylor's large-scale form has little in common with the small form of 12-bar blues, he does retain the elasticity of form and floridity of line for which the blues are known.

As mentioned earlier, I have elected to create graphic representations of several sections in "Second Layer" of Indent. (See Figures 5.5, 5.6, and 5.7 for sections B-1, E-3, and part of L-4 respectively.) My desire was to represent the sound of the music in a variety of depictions which upon reading would suggest specific sound events, and when
accompanied by listening to the music, could readily be compared to it. The two-dimensional graphic images depict shape, motion, hand usage, density, relative duration, dynamics, register, and texture for the sections represented. In no way do I mean to suggest that these representations are the only ways that this music could be rendered. Someone with real talent in graphic art (or a better computer program) could no doubt devise lovely and interesting portrayals. Still, I am confident that the listener can at least understand my process of representation and description, and that it will be of some benefit in providing a visual image for these few sections of the music. (I have used the Grand Staff to depict the range of the piano, but in no instance is any line or space to represent specific pitch; in this rendering, the range of the piano is actually compressed and should be thought of in general terms of high, middle, and low registers.)

![Diagram of music notation]

Figure 5.5 "Second Layer" of Indent, section B-1

---

Section B-1, as seen in Figure 5.5, is a nineteen-second section comprised of four different statements, the first two of which are the topic. The texture of the entire section is rather light, as is shown by the narrowness of the shapes; it is performed in a moderately slow tempo. The end of the second statement thins to a single line (to indicate a single piano line), and the subsequent phrases begin likewise. The topic statements are relatively quiet, hence the lighter grey shading. In addition to the shape, direction, and proportion of each statement, the listener will also hear slight breaks in the ascending statements, as is indicated by the breaks in the graphic lines.

Figure 5.6 shows Section E-3, a forty-three-second developmental section. Taylor's associative manner of development can be observed in aspects of shape and contrast, the slight variations between gestures, and the use of register. While the tempo of this section is only moderately rapid (quarter note = 132+-), the speed and level of activity gives the impression of a much faster pace. The music throughout is dominated by alternating RH/LH activity, with the exception of the cascades near the end. Taylor begins with a thinly-textured call-and-response gesture which evolves into a kind of "rolling" cluster in the middle register of the piano, as seen in the first system. The two ideas are connected by a brief transitional gesture, indicated by the unaccompanied open circles in the first system. This is one of the few instances where Taylor delivers a single line of notes; in this case, the gesture provides a momentary break in the incessant pace of the music. The rolling clusters evolve into a series of ascending images that can be seen shifting from the middle to high registers. Notice the variations in the images (I have dubbed them "rips") which are predominant in the second, third, and fourth systems.
The beginning of each image features a group of repeated notes that gradually evolves throughout the section, eventually developing into a fat cluster. Taylor finally answers the gesture with a loud smashing cascade, the result of pedaled open-palm or forearm
activity. This statement is in turn answered with a brief resumption of the upward rips, followed by another longer and denser stampede; these contrasting ideas are elaborated once more before the section comes to an abrupt end and a new topic is introduced.

Figure 5.7 depicts the final eighteen seconds of music in the movement, sound dominated by thick left-hand chords. The two-humped shape of the black image in the

![Figure 5.7 Final eighteen seconds of section L-4](image)

first system recollects the short-long rhythmic motive as seen in the opening statement of Section A-2 (Figure 5.2); by this point in the music the pace is exceedingly rapid. These graphic images also have a distinct volcanic quality, and although this was achieved quite by accident in the drawing process, the suggestion of a rumbling explosion and eruption is actually appropriate. Each chord is answered with a dense sound mass of general shape
and duration, and by the end of the section the texture seems to envelop the entire keyboard as the final four statements smash together in a frenzy of activity. If nothing else, the listener should be able to appreciate Taylor's sheer strength and athleticism, particularly in context with the rhythmic vitality demonstrated throughout this piece.

I would now like to turn to the poem *Indent*, as is printed at the end of this chapter. Taylor often includes poetry in his performances, sometimes presenting it in context with movement as well as music. He is not the only one to have pursued this practice—John Coltrane's *A Love Supreme* has already been discussed; Archie Shepp, Carla Bley, Sun Ra, and many others also have incorporated spoken word with their music. In explanation of the phenomenon as it developed in the 1960s, Michael J. Budds offers this:

.. jazz musicians, attempting to heighten the musical experience, chose to compound the artistic stimuli through additional means of creative communication. At least two strategies can be recognized: associating a poem with a particular jazz piece in the spirit of program music and delivering a poem in the course of a jazz performance. In the first instance, the listener was guided to consider specific thoughts and images. In the second, the musicians often specified an unequivocal meaning for individual compositions or performances.\(^{23}\)

Whether Taylor actually intended to "guide" the listener with his poem is a matter of speculation. In this instance, since the poem was not delivered during performance but rather included in liner note form with the recording, Taylor, in effect, leaves consideration of it up to the listener, who may or may not pay it much regard. It is my

\(^{22}\)According to the liner notes on the original 1973 LP release of *Indent* (Arista AL 1038), the poem was first published in 1965 in *Sound and Fury* magazine.

\(^{23}\)Budds, *Jazz in the Sixties*, pp. 113-114.
opinion, however, that the poem sheds light not only on the contrasting moods of the music, but on the structure as well. My comments on the poem are not intended to serve as literary criticism, but rather to offer a general observation and my subjective reaction to the work.

Like the music, the poem is in three layers (first layer at the left margin, second layer at the first indentation, third layer at the second indentation). Taylor works in short thoughts, the meaning of which is not always explicit. In many instances the alliteration of the lines seems to control their content. He moves rapidly from one idea to another in much the same way he presents his musical motives, sometimes developing the motif, then juxtaposing a contrasting thought. The subject of the poem is the African-American experience, and the varying tone is angry, whimsical, and often cryptic. Taylor touches on historical themes such as slavery, menial work, white supremacy, and poverty. Without attempting to explain the work line by line, I have identified specific themes which seem to predominate in each layer of the poem. The theme of the first layer seems to be that of failed democracy. This is most obvious in the second half of the poem, from the line "Nation's lost diplomacy" through the bitter "'Ah is so happy/Youse mah master" to the final three lines "Dry cell of money/has locked the minds/and cauterized hearts."

Taylor's pointedly bitter sense of humor seems to mock the dominant culture's miserable attempts at racial equality. The second layer of the poem carries the theme of its first line: "blue's history." "Carver's oil estranged" suggests how odd it is that one man's (George Washington Carver's) contributions can be embraced while the identity of his culture is overlooked and even scorned. In this layer of the poem, Taylor suggests the
extremes of the African-American experience, from the "scampering ass'n/pigtails stompin'" of children to the "back roads black/in night cesspools." The final layer of the poem pointedly alludes to the frightful entanglement of Christianity and white supremacy, with reference to the Klan, the long history of the slave trade, and the dominant culture's sense of unconsciousness, as suggested by the isolated lines "asleep" and "stranger."  

It is not my intention to offer a phrase by phrase comparison of the poem to the music. But just as there are larger interrelated themes at work in the poem, so are there in the music. I'd like to take a moment to briefly describe the character of the outer two layers of Indent. "First Layer" is a very melodic movement, with a repeating tune and rhythmic motive that are varied and shaped throughout. If "Second Layer" can be considered motive or "topic" oriented, then this layer is theme oriented. Taylor works here in larger units of development than in the subsequent movements, taking his time to unfold the ideas and playing with them in rising waves of sound. The rhythmic flow is moderate and relatively constant, lacking the ritardando transitional moments; the dynamic character is rather subdued, at least by Taylor standards. At one point, Taylor plays with the space between his ideas as they develop, briefly incorporating moments of silence as equal players. I consider "Third Layer" to be a logical marriage of the first two. "First

---

Layer" features the gradual development of single entities, "Second Layer" employs contrasting topics and partitioned motives, and "Third Layer" combines the two, resulting in a longer unfolding of a variety of motivic ideas, including many taken from the material in "Second Layer." The horizontal shape of the music in the final layer is more choppy, with waves that rise rapidly, building to great cascades of sound. Figure 5.8 provides a simple presentation of the properties of shape within the three layers.

![Diagram of Layers](image)

**Figure 5.8** Simplified properties of shape in *Indent*

In considering the relevance of the poem as it applies to the music, it is important to remember the fundamental difference between a written literary work and sound; the former is fixed in time, while the latter occurs only as a process through time. The difference between the two would seem to be even more pronounced in regard to an improvised composition, which is even more removed from written representation than traditional composed music. Nevertheless, the syntax of Cecil Taylor's poem appears to rely on the same devices that are apparent in the music—the process of association, the
contrast of surface detail, and the differentiation of pace. In so doing, it depicts the same improvisatory disposition as the music; as a result, Taylor's personal style becomes more apparent as the two are compared. The tone of the two is explicit—always active, sometimes sensitive, often biting, intractable, and relentless. On the surface one can observe the exploitation of contrast and the juxtaposition of thought and musical motif, inherent in small ideas which color and shape content, like waves on the surface of water. On a deeper level larger forms take control, like the current beneath an erratic surface. Taylor's personal background and his sense of identity can be superimposed on this structure, as can the history of the African-American experience.

---

**Indent (the poem)**

Whistle into night
Recognize exorcism
    blue's history.
Whittled whispers while
city technique wrung
    awakened needs
Spring cotton answer
    Recognition
    Carver's oil estranged
    outer earth's garments
    Scorched exclusivity
    Shining Bandanah
Thru ground mounds and
    honeysucklevine scraped
    dust rises. Noon dimples
    sweat titty.
Bugle brow browned
Indignation laments

Yellow childrens
    scampering ass'n
    pigtails stompin'
    rag-a-mom
    White crucifix
    White flame
    White God
    White hood
    White white
    White which
    Pains shame
    Call your'n
    Happiness born
    comin' onto
    Whitness
    Greased bolts
    Mud fields
    Hot stream
Stung stank
Stitch sanguine
Satiety sought
Supperstitious
Seraph
Sin sinning
Singing song
Set 4 centuries long

Mirror born color squared
difference excuse
mountain organ hill bill
tongue tastes
Tar flesh trampled seeds.

Nation's lost diplomacy
lost notions duplicity
Demagogic democracy
Damned dutiful
Darned cloth
blue serge white white
one someone shirt floptic
tank bat and "yeah bo"
I'ma Sentatah!
You just sing dance unseen
crophandler
food maker
lost nobles
chewed spit'n
grits shit and
molasses hot smellin'
teeth toothless
hyena smile

'Ah is so happy
Youse mah master
* ooh ooh ooh
Kick me again * gin
Prick Duster sperm
Ground life out

Chambers red
Redolent
Lao Vaudois
leaves bow
Swollen gulls mate
exigent whimpers
swimmers duck
rockfall legion's
asleep
where bonnets
bent whore's lost
puerility romps
unchided over
back roads black
in night cesspools
to constellations
stranger

Justice invisibly
impenetrable
lighted masks
calcimined mimes
ejaculate polyglot
systoles
Dry cell of money
has locked the minds
and cauterized hearts
CHAPTER 6
SUMMARY AND CONCLUSIONS

At the inception of this dissertation, my approach to the analyses of Ornette Coleman's "Lonely Women," John Coltrane's "India," and Cecil Taylor's *Indent*: "Second Layer" was conceived in the spirit of free jazz itself. Like these artists, I had ideas and techniques that I wished to explore; I wanted to be able to freely utilize my knowledge of the tradition (in my case, that of contemporary analysis) while reacting spontaneously to each new problem as it arose. My objectives were in place before my methods. My primary—and most general—objective was to look at a variety of free jazz music representing considerable stylistic diversity, to explore that music, and ultimately communicate my discoveries to the reader. To that end, I have examined these three works with genuine interest, and have developed immense respect for the talent and dedication with which these artists carried out their work. As the project progressed, my single objective expanded into a network of interrelated topics that were not only of interest but which became, in fact, essential to the understanding of the music. Specifically, in order to begin to understand free jazz, a broader knowledge of jazz in general became important, including something of its history, technique, and language; the society from which it came; the economic, social, and political factors which influenced that society; and what has been written in these regards. Social and cultural factors demanded exploration, particularly the subjects of economics, race, and the
political climate of the free jazz era. My observations can be summarized by author Jimmy Stewart who, in his "Introduction to Black Aesthetics in Music," suggested that revolutionary political implications, while perhaps not being explicit in the language of this generation of jazz musicians, were nevertheless implicit in practice.\(^1\) In my opinion, knowledge of the lives and ideologies of these artists is essential to the understanding of their music and how they fit into the jigsaw puzzle of jazz history, and it is my sincere wish that the reader was also enlightened by the exploration of these so-called "extra-musical" factors.

The development of my analytical methodology was defined by my objectives, and my intention was to devise a system (or systems) which would result not only in the satisfactory attainment of those objectives, but one which would do so in an interesting manner, both for myself and the reader. As the project unfolded, the process of analysis itself began to take a prominent position alongside that of the music. The question ever present in my mind was: Exactly what are the best ways to examine and write about these (and other) free jazz works? In *A Guide to Musical Analysis*, Nicholas Cook cautioned against analysis whose purpose it is to prove the validity of an analytical method rather than illuminate the music.\(^2\) In effort to avoid that problem, I resolved to examine each composition in its entirety, knowing full well that some attention to detail would perhaps be sacrificed in the process. Still, I hold the opinion that the excessive fragmentation of music in analysis is problematic, since it tends to encourage conclusions with more

---

\(^1\)Stewart, "Introduction to Black Aesthetics in Music," p. 95.

scientific than artistic relevance. Cook goes on to say that the emphasis on objectivity and impartiality may discourage personal involvement with the music, which he believes is the only sensible reason for anyone being interested in music in the first place. In this regard, my personal involvement was sustained by Ornette Coleman's, John Coltrane's, and Cecil Taylor's expression of connection to their culture; these artists, whether unwittingly or not, became icons of their age, and their creative impulses generated tremendous artistic and social influence. Jazz historian Leroy Ostransky believed that the analyst has the task of separating the artistic from the inartistic, the experimental from the commercial, and that the analyst should attempt to relate both technique and depth of feeling. Coleman's, Coltrane's, and Taylor's experimental natures, technical abilities, and emotional integrity were relatively easy to identify, and fortunately, history has already recognized them as artists.

It should be made clear that my perspective in the writing of *Analyzing Free Jazz* is from the point of view of an artist, not that of a theorist. The difference between the two perspectives is, in my opinion, that analysis by an artist is likely to be one which demonstrates a reaction to a work of art, while that of the theorist is likely to be an explanation of the work of art. Each approach is valid in its own right, but I again drew support for my perspective from Nicholas Cook in his contention that an *a priori* theory is not necessary when examining music, but rather some means of examination which is

---


4Ostransky, *Understanding Jazz*, p. 69.

appropriate to the particular music in question.\footnote{Cook, \textit{A Guide to Musical Analysis}, p. 208.} In \textit{Analyzing Free Jazz}, those means were developed in part as a result of my own experiences as a musician, a composer, and finally, as a student (in that order, since my personal experience has followed that order). As a musician, I have long considered what is important to me in terms of expression and emotion, individuality, and community. My knowledge of the purely physical aspects of musicianship has made me aware of the many ways in which art is both positively and negatively influenced by technique. My experience as a composer has enabled me to appreciate and recognize the logical presentation of ideas, the necessity for some kind of coherent form in which those ideas can come to fruition, and to (attempt to) explore the fundamental differences between craft and art. As a student, not only are one's technical and philosophical horizons enormously expanded, but one also becomes keenly aware of the extent to which one's art is influenced by others. All these things I have attempted to integrate productively into my analyses, both in the examination of the music, and in the development of the methodology with which I have examined it.

One aspect of the African-American artistic aesthetic is that emphasis is placed not on the art product or the \textit{thing} as it exists as an object, but rather on the procedure of becoming what it is.\footnote{Stewart, "Introduction to Black Aesthetics in Music," p. 84. Italicics by Stewart.} This idea was particularly intriguing to me in the consideration of these three artists. Ornette Coleman's unorthodox approach to instrumental technique and idiosyncratic treatment of notation, form, rhythm, meter, and ensemble are all indicative of the high regard for the actual process of music making. In the case of John Coltrane,
regard for the process is exhibited in his tendency to play long sets and his reputation of having had an almost incessant preoccupation with music, as well as his continual exploration of experimental processes. Cecil Taylor's most obvious affinity with the process of music-making is demonstrated by his almost exclusive production of music in the context of live performance. While the recording of music in the studio certainly does not preclude the notion of the process as art, Taylor's preference of the immediacy of the performer/audience experience is remarkable.

With this idea of the inherent value of the musical process in mind, I attempted to recognize the inner logic of each piece and to determine the most comfortable way to express it. In each instance, the final structural/formal sectionalization of the music came only after many repeated listenings and numerous attempts to discover the primary elements that defined each composition—methods of association, points of contrasts, contours and shapes, the natural patterns, phrases, gestures, motivic and rhythmic cells, etc. In the case of Ornette Coleman's "Lonely Woman," the shortest and most conventional of the three pieces, of prime importance was the accurate description of the treatment of rhythm within the music. Virtually every aspect of this music is influenced by rhythmic nuance, including phrase structure within the melody and the resulting delineation of form, melodic doubling within the ensemble, and Coleman's motivic development within the solo. Of particular interest is the ensemble's flexible treatment of rhythm and periodicity in context with fixed meter, the result of Coleman's concept of "harmolodic theory," which allows for the (attempted) equal treatment of all musical content. An explanation of the composer's "motivic chain-associations" also required
detailed attention, since it was this means of associative development in tandem with the rhythmic flexibility which produced not only his melodic material, but also its overall contour, the sense of tonal gravitation within the solo, as well as the formal framework. Coleman's distinctive instrumental tone is strongly influenced by the blues tradition, as seen particularly by the emphasis placed on the vocalization of the melodic line, an element which is not lost on bassist Charlie Haden, whose linear style of playing reinforced that of Ornette Coleman. Drummer Billy Higgins' use of timbre and texture also greatly contributed to the sense of melodic and rhythmic freedom in "Lonely Woman."

John Coltrane's "India," a work of much larger scope and complexity, presented a different set of challenges. While Coleman's methodology involved the discarding of vertical for horizontal improvisation, Coltrane undermined the chordal approach from within, by a systematic dissection and scattering of the individual chord. This tendency was verified by the identification of Coltrane's process of melodic expansion and contraction, with which he both maintained cohesiveness and facilitated variation. The identification of gesture-types assisted in the explanation of the composer's means of melodic production and its development. In turn, the use of graphic representation became valuable in the identification of gestural function, which is primarily based on the contrasting elements of melody and noise. The identification of Coltrane's use of contrast was integral to the definition of his formal structure in "India," which was associated with

---

extremes of dynamics, register, and emotion in the solos. Of the three pieces discussed in *Analyzing Free Jazz*, this work lent itself most beautifully to formal analysis, due to the compositional logic exhibited in Coltrane's assemblage of gesture. Of added interest was the extent to which Indian musical concept and technique influenced this music, in terms of both composition and performance. Coltrane's use of the mixolydian mode and treatment of his melodic material suggested his knowledge of and interest in the idea of Indian raga. The ensemble's free treatment of time contributed to the negation of stress normally associated with rhythm and meter, resulting in an "opening-up" of the form from within. Bassists Jimmy Garrison and Reggie Workman were key players in this function, as was drummer Elvin Jones whose multi-layered textures and use of polyrhythm defied the traditional time-keeping role. Pianist McCoy Tyner's contribution was centered on a simple but elegant connection to the mode. Bass clarinetist Eric Dolphy's solo style contrasted with that of Coltrane, with an emphasis on instrumental color and a varied treatment of modal resources.

The identification and logical presentation of the primary musical components of Cecil Taylor's *Indent*: "Second Layer" was particularly challenging, due to the work's duration, texture, absence of obvious formal design, lack of timbral diversity, and high degree of activity. This degree of activity is identified and defined by Roger T. Dean as the frequency with which a new sound is initiated in relation to time, in conjunction with

---

9The author understands the subjective nature inherent in this statement, however, a study and comparison of the two other versions of "India" (see Chapter 4) as well as Coleman's and Taylor's compositions have verified my opinion. While the later releases of "India" are certainly valuable in the historical sense, it is obvious why the original *Impressions* version was selected for the 1963 release; there a far greater sense of continuity in the ensemble, and Coltrane exhibits more control of his solo material.
the irregular placement of material in relation to metrical structure. Perhaps it is this essence of Taylor's performance which most challenges the traditional approach to analysis. A formal model of "Second Layer" came to light only after many repeated listenings, when particular sounds began to emerge. This I portrayed in a time line, which detailed a narrative description of Taylor's playing according to contrasting elements in texture, dynamics, register, and rhythm. Again, graphic representation played an important role in my depiction of the music, but not in the functional manner as in the Coltrane piece. Rather, the graphic images created for Indent: "Second Layer" were my own artistic responses (however simple) to what I heard in the music, created with the intention of portraying my reaction to the reader. Only very general observations could be made in regard to pitch, and these took the form of simple motivic and thematic definition. The meaningful analytical representation of this element in context of the density of such a large-scale work remains, in my mind, the single most problematic element, one which was not entirely resolved to my satisfaction. The inclusion of Cecil Taylor's poem with the music offered an element with which to consider the composer's intent. The poem's tone and associative manner of development mirrored that of the music, offering a valuable means for the comparison of multiple artistic factors.

Each of the three composers paid their own unique homage to the blues. In her essay "John Coltrane: A Re-Membering of Orpheus," Kimberly W. Benston suggests that Coltrane abandoned the established conventions in order to rediscover convention on a deeper level. The old language of the blues was asserted more energetically and more

---

10 Dean, New Structures. . ., p. 17.
primally in the outpouring of shout, screech, wail, and cry, in the uninhibited use of pitch and movement.\footnote{11} The same can be said for both Ornette Coleman and Cecil Taylor, although each voiced his connection to the blues with different means. As has already been mentioned, Coleman's production of tone and vocalization of line draw directly from the blues tradition. Taylor's connection, in addition to the thematic content of his poem, is most easily identified in his usage of blues-style gestures (particularly sliding "blue" notes), and the pianistic hommage paid to the ragtime and boogie-woogie styles of playing.

Probably the most satisfying result of my research has been the enthusiasm with which my work in progress has been received—by musicians, composers and lovers of jazz, musicologists, and scholars in many non-related fields. At this time, since the detailed analysis of complete works of free jazz is relatively uncharted territory, the enduring value of the tools of analysis used in Analyzing Free Jazz will be judged as others conduct their own attempts at the comprehensive examination of other free jazz works. Always endeavoring to fulfill the role of good musical analysis as stated by Nicholas Cook, that is, to be in some way both useful and enjoyable,\footnote{12} it is my hope that this modest contribution, from the point of view of the artist-in-analyst's-shoes (not always a comfortable fit), will challenge others to explore the resources in a new and fruitful manner, with the result being the promotion of knowledge and understanding which will benefit both art and scholarship alike.

\footnote{11}{Kimberly W. Benston, "John Coltrane: A Re-Membering of Orpheus," p. 423. Italics in the original.}

\footnote{12}{Cook, A Guide to Musical Analysis, p. 151.}
BIBLIOGRAPHY

Books


Kaufmann, pp. 406-411.


Transcription of head and Coltrane solos.


Articles/Essays

Baker, James. "Schenkerian Analysis in Post-Tonal Music." In Aspects of


Jazz, Vol. 3, No. 4 (Fall, 1979), 35. "Jazz and Ballet Meet."


**Recordings**


**Films**


APPENDIX A: INDIA

Transcription by Andrew White

* Gesture numbers

© Andrew's Musical Enterprises, Inc. 1973
(Unauthorized copies are illegal)
PREFACE TO THE COMPOSITIONS

The requirements for the Doctor of Musical Arts in Composition degree are twofold: 1) a research paper, and 2) two compositions. For purposes of research, the dissertation is entitled after the research paper. The compositions are included as appendices. The purpose of this Preface is to offer a word of explanation as to the nature of the compositions. In the case of both of my compositions, "Bleysphemous and Hadenistic" and "Sestina Kyrie," there is a definite link between my research into free jazz and the spirit in which the compositions were written. As was detailed in the final chapter of Analyzing Free Jazz, my work in composition also influenced my research.

"Bleysphemous and Hadenistic" (1992) was written for a jazz ensemble, the Dirty Dozen Brass Band of New Orleans, and reflects their exact instrumentation (2 tpt., sop.sax doubling on bari.sax., ten.sax., tbn., tba., 2 perc.). The title is a play on the names of Carla Bley and Charlie Haden, whose musical partnership has been very influential to me, particularly Haden's sense of melody and Bley's orchestrational ideas. Written at the same period of time as the research for Analyzing Free Jazz was taking place, the music was influenced by the artistry and many of the philosophical ideas of free jazz musicians and composers, especially Ornette Coleman's theory of harmolodics and the treatment of rhythm by both the Coleman and Coltrane ensembles. The music itself draws upon many free jazz ideas, and includes areas of free improvisation, ordered improvisation, and the superimposition of disparate musical elements (such as the simultaneous performance of
different metric values), in tandem with traditional writing. The piece begins with a fifteen-bar chorale, from which much of the pitch material for the work is derived. Sections B and C form the bases for many of the motivic and melodic ideas which unfold throughout the composition. The method of development is associative, that is, each new section is intended to be a result of what has come before. Within the structure of the entire work, areas of free or improvised music are alternated with areas of more traditional writing, and overall a large arch shape is constructed; the piece ends with a variation of the themes featured in the earlier sections. Duration of "Bleysphemous and Hadenistic" is approximately twenty-four minutes.

"Sestina Kyrie" (1994) is a setting of a poem by the Alaskan poet Carolyn Kremers--for soprano, three percussionists, and three-person speaking chorus. Although written in the modern musical idiom, it was also influenced by the free jazz research. This can be seen most prominently in the parts of the percussionists, who have been given considerable freedom in their treatment of rhythm, both in relationship to the soprano melodies and in relationship to the marked passage of time (in ten-second blocks as opposed to traditional measures and beats). The percussionists have also been allowed a few instances of improvisation. "Sestina Kyrie" is intended to convey a mood of ritualism and reverence--one which is influenced by the multicultural spirit of the text, in which aspects of both Native and Christian religious beliefs and practices are intertwined. The story expresses the spiritual queries of a Yup'ik Eskimo and her belief that even an old grandmother can be a shaman. The form of the piece is structured from the modified sestina form of the poem, which contains seven six-line verses. The speaking-chorus
performs in the spirit of the Greek chorus, commenting on the story as it is told by the vocalist. During the singing, the percussionists’ parts are relative to the vocal line, that is, their events are cued by specific words, or beginnings and ends of phrases, etc. During the interludes between verses, the percussionists are given considerable interpretive and rhythmic freedom within ten-second blocks of time. Duration of “Sestina Kyrie” is just under twenty minutes.
APPENDIX B: BLEYSPHEMOUS AND HADENISTIC

BLEYSPHEMOUS AND HADENISTIC

for

Two Trumpets in Bb
Bb Soprano Saxophone/Eb Baritone Saxophone
Bb Tenor Saxophone
Trombone
Tuba
Two Percussionists

by

Lynette Westendorf

Concert Score in C

Duration: approx. 24'
Percussion I

- snare drum (sn.dr.)
- tom-tom (tom.)
- suspended cymbal (cym.)
- cowbell
- sticks and mallets

Percussion II

- suspended cymbal (cym.)
- bass drum (bs.dr.)
- sticks and mallets

Transposed score and parts are available by arrangement through the composer:

Lynette Westendorf
6251-28th Avenue N.E.
Seattle, WA 98115
(206) 525-2706
Bleysphemous and Hadenistic

Lynette Westendorf

Tpt. I

Sopr. Sax.

Ten. Sax.

Thn.

Tuba

Perc. I

Perc. II

Tpt. II

Sopr. Sax.

Ten. Sax.

Thn.

Tuba

Perc. I

Perc. II

Ad libi freely in any register, using primarily these notes.
Begin with long notes, allowing ample space, gradually increasing in volume and intensity. Stop abruptly when the drum enters.

Begin 5" after Tuba.

Begin 10" after Tuba.
Straight rhythm. Breathe and rest as necessary, beginning each new attack with a short flutter tongue.
Ad lib. slowly at first, increasing in speed and intensity.
Ad lib in the spirit of what you have just played, gradually decreasing in texture and dynamic level. Fade away over the PERCUSSION part.

Ad lib in the spirit of what you have just played, gradually decreasing in texture and dynamic level. Fade away over the PERCUSSION part.

Ad lib in the spirit of what you have just played, gradually decreasing in texture and dynamic level. Fade away over the PERCUSSION part.

Ad lib in the spirit of what you have just played, gradually decreasing in texture and dynamic level. Fade away over the PERCUSSION part.

When all the horns are ad lib (approx. 30'), begin to play a slow march. Increase dynamic level with the trombone, and gradually fade away.
APPENDIX C: SESTINA KYRIE

SESTINA KYRIE

for
Soprano
Three Percussionists
and
Three-Person Speaking Chorus

by

Lynette Westendorf

Text by Carolyn Kremers

Duration: 19'15"
Soprano range

Percussion I

xylophone (xyl.)
timpani -D (timp.)
small triangle (tri.)
finger cymbals (f.cym.)
claves (cl.)
medium suspended cymbal (cym.)
log drum (lg.dr.)
glockenspiel (glock.)
wooden wind chimes (ch.)
bell tree (b.t.)
bass drum (bs.dr.)

Mallet abbreviations

soft beater (s.btr.)
soft mallet (s.mal.)
medium mallet (m.mal.)
hard mallet (h.mal.)
yarn mallet (y.mal.)
brushes (br.)
sticks (stks.)

Suggested stage setup

Percussion II

vibraphone (vbs.)
large suspended cymbal (cym.)
snare drum (sn.dr.)
maracas (mcs.)
temple blocks (tmp.blks.)
bell tree (b.t.)
tom-tom (tom.)

Percussion III

marimba (mar.)
skin drum (sk.dr.)
rainstick (rnstk.)
large suspended cymbal (cym.)
tambourine (tm.)
rattles/hooves (rat.)
Notes on Performance

Rhythm and notation

Vocal notation is based upon the quarter note equivalence rather than time signatures.

Percussion notation is based upon (1) ten-second time spans, or (2) quarter note equivalence, or (3) relative relationship to the vocal part. For this reason, the percussionists' parts include the vocal melodies. Unless exact rhythmic notation is supplied, entrances and durations are always relative to the vocal melody.

Accidentals apply to single notes only (unless otherwise indicated in the score); courtesy accidents are provided. Xylophone and glockenspiel are to be played as written.

Chorus

The three-person speaking chorus (designated #1-male, #2-female and #3-male) can be read from the soprano part. The lines to be spoken are written in parentheses. Instructions for dynamic levels and unison or non-unison entrances are supplied within small boxes located above the vocal staff.

Conductor's score and parts available by arrangement with the composer:

Lynette Westendorf
6251-28th Avenue N.E.
Seattle, WA 98115
(206) 525-2706
Sestina Kyrie

by Carolyn Kremers

She has never seen a real shaman,
but Mark says his grandmother was one,
and isn't it true that God
lives inside everything, even or especially (Lord have mercy)
inside a shaman? Christ have mercy. Piece
of bread, sip of wine, "God bless you all," says the priest.

Once a Presbyterian, neither has she known, before, a real priest.
A shaman
might be more exotic, but she likes the peace
inside this balding man, the one
who tells a joke right next to her at dinner with friends and then says, laughing, "Mercy,
yes, I'll have another piece of turkey. Praise God."

Everywhere, she hears Ellam Yua.
"Owner of the weather, spirit of the universe." God.
Not just inside the dusty wooden church
but over the whole, wild island that priests
used to tackle by dog team, Lord have mercy,
Christ have mercy. She can hear the island, like a shaman,
talking, especially when the priest and everyone--
elder, student, mother, father, wiggling fur-wreathed child--
extends a hand and murmurs, "Peace."

Something about that word, "Peace,"
electrifies fingers and, God,
it shoots up her bundled arm into the one
place that no person, not even a priest,
can really know or understand, a buried, shaman place,
Lord have mercy,

Christ have mercy.
And there's a peace
that reaches in, circles around, settles down,
shaman-like, as if there were a God.
The priest
blesses purple and yellow dyed tundra grass baskets, and people give

*
one dollar bills or quarters
   (when she remembers, she brings quarters, Lord have mercy).
Women in new calico qaspeqs sing an offering
   with that unpeaceful, screeching, scraping, shaman sound
heard in all God's Eskimo churches,
a screech she loves, doesn't imitate.
Slowly, with a Yup'ik echo, the priest
reminds everyone God is Love, God is Light, God is One. Which She is,

of course, and anyone
who has felt the rhythm (Lord have mercy, Christ have mercy)
and the power and the glory, with or without a priest,
of peace,
goodwill toward men and women, knows that God was inside
Mark's grandmother. And She is a real shaman.

© 1994 by Carolyn Kremers. Used by permission.
Voice

but Mark says his grandmather was one, and isn't it true that God

Perc. I

SN DR.

Perc. II

SN DR.

Perc. III

Perc. IV

Recit.

Voice

lives inside everything, even or especially inside a man?

Perc. I

SN DR.

Perc. II

SN DR.

Perc. III

Perc. IV

Vow. of bread, sip of wine, "God... bless you all."

Perc. I

SN DR.

Perc. II

SN DR.

Perc. III

Vow.
SKIN DRUM/CHORD
Free ad lib for 40-45°, beginning moderately loud and active, becoming quieter and more sparse in texture. Continue until vibraphone entrance.
Voice

Once a Fri-s by to-fi-nn.

Perc. 1

Vin.

TEMPLE BLOCKS

Perc. II

TXL.

(with vibes)

Perc. III

TXL.

(with voices)

Voice

set that has she knows before a real priest.

A shaman might be more esoteric.

Perc. 1

Vin.

MURICUS

Perc. II

TXL.

Perc. III

TXL.

but she likes the peace inside this balding man, the one who tells a joke.

Perc. 1

Vin.

Perc. III

(with voices)
Voice:

right next to her at dinner with friends and then says laughing. "Her

Perc. I:

Perc. II:

(granites on symbol)

Perc. III:

Voice:

yes, I'll have another piece of turkey.

Perc. I:

Perc. II:

Vibes:

Perc. III:

ALL INSTRUMENTS

Voice:

Gradually this to free of 3/4. on three pitches, any order and register.

Perc. I:

Perc. II:

Vibes:

Perc. III:

"Clocks" or 4/4, dreamy and sparse.

Gradually this to free of 3/4. on three pitches, any order and register.

(Mathetine)
Voice

Something about that word, "Peace," a...
The priest blesses purple and yellow-dyed red, orange, green, blue, and purple and people give one dollar bills or quarters.

(Crescendo, up, shaking, baskets of quarters) "Lord have mercy."

When five reams... here she brings grape... tears...

Bell tree

 человека

Snake drum (scares off, music)

Maxima

(dreamy, after chorus)

Clo.

Finger cymbals

Sn. Dr.

Mus.
the was saved —— heard in all God's Es-ki-me church- es

a breath she loves, does it trem.

Slowly, with a Tum-tum - o the priest re- minds ev'ry one

Voice

God is Love.

God is Light.

Cy- cil (w.mal.)

Bass Dru.

(feat. ring)

Bass Dru.

Sh. Dr.

Claves

Cy- cil (w.mal.)

(with Marimba)

(with Tom-Tum)
CHORUS (long-voicing, mm):  
'Lord have mercy,  
Christ have mercy."

...and to y. one who has felt the rhythm...

CHORUS (long-voicing, mm):  
almost whispered:  God  
will toward man and woman.

...and the power and the glory,  
with or without a priest of peace.

(after CHORUS)
Voice

Voices that God was in side Mark’sGrandmother. And she is a real ann.

Perc. 1

Perc. II

Perc. III

Fine
curriculum vitae

Lynette Westendorf

Background: Born: January 14, 1951; Twin Falls, Idaho
Graduated: Minidoka County High School (Rupert, Idaho), 1969
One son: Reuben Christopher Hart, born October 9, 1978

Education: B.M. (Theory and Composition), with distinction, University of New Mexico, 1988
M.M. (Composition), University of Washington, 1991
D.M.A. (Composition), University of Washington, 1994

Academic Honors and Activities:
University of New Mexico:
- Queen Elizabeth of Belgium Scholarship, 1988
- First Prize, Undergraduate Student Composition Competition, 1988-89
- Outstanding Senior Student in Music, 1988-89
- Accompanist, Concert Chorale, 1987-88
- Music Achievement Award, 1987
- Helen Woodward Scholarship, 1986
- Honorary Society: Phi Kappa Phi
  G.P.A.: 3.95

University of Washington:
- Bergsmo Fellowship, 1991
- Graduate Teaching Assistantship in Music Theory, 1989-91
- "Stravinsky and Ragtime" (paper), U.W. School of Music Research Festival, 1991; Graduate Student Colloquium Series, University of British Columbia, Vancouver, B.C., 1990
- Graduate Committee Chair: Graduate Student Colloquium Series, U.W., 1991
- Founding member: ProConArt Ensemble
  G.P.A.: 3.96

Recent Compositions: Sestina Kyrie (1994), Soprano, 3 Percussionists, 3-Person Speaking Chorus; text by Carolyn Kremers

Playground Piece (1993), Brass Quintet; commissioned by MusicAlaskaWomen Conference, Fairbanks, Alaska

Bleysphemous and Hadenistic (1992), 2 Trumpets, 3 Saxophones, Trombone, Tuba, 2 Percussionists
Modal Milonga (1992), Wind Ensemble; commissioned by Commodore Middle School Advanced Band, Bainbridge Island, Washington

The Right Madness on Skye (1990), SATB, Oboe/English Horn, String Quartet; text by Richard Hugo

Basslines (1989), Contrabass and Piano

Trapunto and the Nine Patch Chain (1989), Piano Solo

Hokule'a (1989), 2 Violins and Piano

Quartet for Strings (1988)

Philoxenia (1988), 2 Mandolins and Marimba

Verse for Seasons (1988), Mezzo-soprano, Flute/Alto Flute, Viola, Piano; text by Fujiwara Teika

Four Miniatures for Oboe, Bassoon, and Guitar (1988)

Boulders and Whiteclouds (1987), Brass Quintet; first-place in Undergraduate Student Composition Competition, U.N.M. Composers' Symposium

Chameleon (1987), Piano Solo

Fantasy for Flute and Piano (1984)

Symphony in G-Minor (1984); commissioned by the Magic Valley Symphony, Twin Falls, Idaho; co-winner of statewide composition competition

Gypsy (1983), Violin and Piano

Suite for a Rainbow (1982), 2 Flutes, Vibraphone, Piano, Contrabass, Percussion; commissioned by the Sun Valley Center for the Arts and Humanities

Tenatsali (1981), Flute/Piccolo, Violin, Cello, Guitar, Piano, Concertina; commissioned by the Sun Valley Center for the Arts and Humanities
Professional Societies: American Musicological Society
Broadcast Music, Inc.
International League of Women Composers
International Society for Jazz Research
Society for Music Theory, Inc.
Society of Composers, Inc.

Lynette Westendorf has been active in music and composition throughout the western states since the early 1970s. Her diverse experience includes: free-lance musician and singer/songwriter, piano teacher, theory tutor, accompanist, and pianist (1970-present); film and video composer and arranger (1978-1984), with commissions by Randall Morgan Associates (Twin Falls, Idaho), the Institute of the American West (Sun Valley, Idaho), and KGBL Television (Pocatello, Idaho); producer, technician, and editor (1978-1993) with the Sun Valley Center for the Arts and Humanities (Sun Valley, Idaho), the Northern Rockies Folk Festival (Hailey and Sun Valley, Idaho), Blaine County Schools (Hailey and Bellevue, Idaho), Idaho Chapter of the National Organization for Women, Idaho Commission on the Arts, and the MusicAlaskaWomen Conference (Fairbanks, Alaska). She has composed for dance and theater, recitals, conferences, and festivals; her works have been heard throughout the western United States, in Vancouver, B.C., and in Spain. Her husband Richard Hart is an ethno-historian whose area of expertise is the Zuni tribe of New Mexico; their son Reuben is a violinist and guitarist whose high school interests include marine science, orchestra, and language.